

W&M ScholarWorks

Undergraduate Research Awards

William & Mary Libraries

2022

Theology in African American Spirituals and White Protestant Hymnody: A Comparative Study

Justin Oei *William & Mary*

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.wm.edu/ugra Part of the African American Studies Commons, Africana Studies Commons, and the Ethnomusicology Commons

Recommended Citation

Oei, Justin, "Theology in African American Spirituals and White Protestant Hymnody: A Comparative Study" (2022). *Undergraduate Research Awards*. 6. https://scholarworks.wm.edu/ugra/6

This Research Paper is brought to you for free and open access by the William & Mary Libraries at W&M ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Undergraduate Research Awards by an authorized administrator of W&M ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact scholarworks@wm.edu.

Theology in African American Spirituals and White Protestant Hymnody

A Comparative Study

Justin Oei

Music 370: African-American Spiritual

May 2021

Introduction

Through all the sorrow of the Sorrow Songs there breathes a hope -a faith in the ultimate justice of things.¹ ~ W. E. B. du Bois, <u>The Souls of Black Folk</u>

The spiritual is one of the most significant windows into the religious experiences of Black Americans. This paper will analyze the theological content of the spiritual, and 19th/20th century Black religious practice more broadly, alongside that of contemporary white Protestant hymnody. Fundamentally, the African American Christian experience is based around the promise of liberation from oppression by the Messiah; it seeks justice for the downtrodden and a Kingdom of God based on equity.

I posit that, through a comparative analysis of selected Black spirituals and contemporaneous white hymnody, the spiritual's theological content will be more focused on liberation as expressed through the Bible, particularly the Hebrew Scriptures, and personal relationships with Jesus; while white Protestant hymnody will focus more on various abstract concepts of Christianity, such as the atonement (Jesus' dying on the cross for the sins of the world). Furthermore, this paper will also analyze the structural elements of several hymns from each tradition in order to demonstrate that the spiritual would be easily learned by enslaved persons who were illiterate as opposed to the strophic form of most 19th-century European and American hymns.²

¹ W. E. B. du Bois, *The Souls of Black Folk: With the Talented Tenth and the Souls of White Folk.* (New York: Penguin, 2017), 196.

² Notably, not all hymns at the time were published with music, particularly Richard Allen's seminal A Collection of Hymns and Spiritual Songs (1801).

A Brief Overview of Black Theology and African-American Christianity

The character of God in Black theology is perhaps expressed most clearly by James H. Evans, Jr.: "The two stubborn facts of African American Christian existence are that God has revealed Godself to the black community and that this revelation is inseparable from the historic struggle of black people for liberation."³ God is present in the African American tradition just as God was present to the Israelites in bringing them out of bondage in Egypt, and this became a significant focal point in the theology of liberation for the enslaved. This messianic hope is further developed in the Christological viewpoints in the Black church. In 1895, an African Methodist Episcopal bishop proclaimed, "I worship a Negro God. I believe God is a Negro."⁴ Therefore, God stands with God's people who are oppressed and, ultimately, comes to dwell among the lowly.

How one becomes a Christian, too, diverges between the white and black theological traditions. Peter Paris, a theologian from Princeton Theological Seminary, writes that "the enslaved Africans did not merely become Christians by embracing their owners' religion" and that they "construct[ed] an understanding of Jesus Christ as their spiritual ancestor which...is the highest honor that Africans can bestow on humans in gratitude for the goodness they had bequeathed to their people during their lifetime".⁵ In contrast, the formal identity of a Christian in mainline Protestant traditions is through the ritual of Baptism, rather than through an acceptance of Jesus as a spiritual ancestor; formation and acceptance of Jesus as Savior can come

³ James H. Evans, *We Have Been Believers: An African American Systematic Theology, Second Edition* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2012), 13.

⁴ H. L. Morehouse, "The Spirit and Policy of the American Baptist Home Mission Society, in its work for the colored people of the South." *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* 17 (1895): 414.

⁵ Peter J. Paris, "The Theologies of Black Folk in North America: Presidential Address to the American Theological Society, March, 2012." *Theology Today* 69, no. 4 (2012): 388.

later. Congregational record books from 18th-century Bruton Parish Church in Williamsburg, Virginia, show that numerous enslaved persons were (likely forcibly) baptized into the Church of England – the only legal colonial church and the faith tradition of their masters, including enslaved laborers owned by George Washington and the College of William and Mary. No sooner had the colonies split from English rule did free Blacks in Williamsburg establish the first independent Black church, still extant today as First Baptist Church, developing their own worship style independent from the liturgies of the Episcopal Church (the successor to the Church of England in North America).

Before proceeding, it is important to consider the role of sacred music in the development of a Black Christian experience. Historian Jemar Tisby notes that "enslaved people in the South adapted a practice from West Africa known as the 'ring shout.' Worshippers got in a circle and rotated counterclockwise as they sang, danced, and chanted."⁶ These ring shouts positioned the Black Christian experience as a syncretic tradition, using practices from the slaves' native lands while worshipping a God who had been imposed on them. In this tradition, the ring shout became a method by which common values were translated and a connection with their past cultural heritage of a home from which they were forcibly removed.⁷

Methodologies

This study will compare the textual and musical components of selected Black spirituals with selected examples of 19th Century American Protestant hymnody. Spirituals will be examined from collections such as the 1867 *Slave Songs of the United States*, edited by William

⁶ Jemar Tisby, *The Color of Compromise: The Truth About the American Church's Complicity in Racism* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2019), 44.

⁷ Richard Crawford, *America's Musical Life: A History* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2001), 418.

Francis Allen, Charles Pickard Ware, and Lucy McKim Garrison and Richard Allen's 1801 *A Collection of Hymns and Spiritual Songs* as a lens into 19th century Black worship music. White hymnody from the period will be excerpted primarily from mainline Protestant denominational materials. Finally, selections that appear in contemporary collections, such as *Lift Every Voice and Sing II* and the *African American Heritage Hymnal* will also be examined for two reasons. The first is to establish if there is a sense of longitudinal change between the older and newer variants of a spiritual. The second reason is due to practical reasons: hymnals of the 19th century contained fewer hymns and were produced in intentionally small sizes so people could keep the hymnal with them, rather than leaving them in the church from week to week as is customary at present.⁸

Ideally, all of the spirituals investigated would be present in both the nineteenth and twentieth- and twenty-first century collections. The reality is that, however, as worship styles evolve so too does the music used in worship.

Hymn	Author	Collections
Am I A Soldier of The Cross?	Isaac Watts	Allen 1801, AAHH
Ride On, King Jesus	Spiritual, unknown	Slave Songs, AAHH, LEVAS
Were You There?	Spiritual, unknown	Dett, AAHH, LEVAS, H82
Amazing Grace	John Newton	Shape Note, AAHH, LEVAS,
		H82
Come, Thou Fount of Every	Robert Robinson	Shape Note, H82, LEVAS,
Blessing		ААНН

The following hymns and spirituals will be analyzed in this paper:

Note: AAHH = African-American Heritage Hymnal; LEVAS = Lift Every Voice and Sing II; H82 = The Hymnal 1982; Shape Note = A Selection of Shape Note Folk Hymns (ed. David W. Music)

⁸ From the introduction to Richard Allen, *A Collection of Hymns and Spiritual Songs: from various authors* (1801; repr., A.M.E.C. Sunday School Union, 1987), ix-x.

Am I A Soldier of the Cross?

The hymn "Am I A Soldier of the Cross" by Isaac Watts is included as hymn XII in Richard Allen's *A Collection of Hymns and Spiritual Songs* and has remained a part of Protestant hymnody since. Allen's 1801 collection does not contain any musical notation, unlike more recent hymnals, and this hymn would not qualify as a spiritual due to its origins within the white evangelical movement. However, it is worthy of analysis because of its window into early American hymnodic practice.

The lyrics of "Am I a Soldier" refer to the idea of Christian militarism, which posits the Christian experience as a constant inner battle between good and evil within one's soul.⁹ However, from the lens of Black liberation theology, this also places the faithful in the lineage of the communion of saints – Allen's version contains the following: "Thy Saints in all this glorious war / shall conquer though they die,"¹⁰ a statement linking the struggles of the present to those of the past. Yet, the ideology of Christian militarism that this reflects posits that ultimately, the Church and the forces of good will triumph over Satan's forces of evil. In a Black perspective, this might represent the triumph of freedom over slavery – hence Allen's including it in the collection.

In the *African American Heritage Hymnal*, there are two musical settings: one is to the hymn tune *Arlington* by Thomas Arne; the other is in the "lined out" style common in African

⁹ Kristen Hanna, "History of Hymns: 'Am I a Soldier of the Cross,'" UMC Discipleship Ministries, The United Methodist Church, June 7, 2013. <u>https://www.umcdiscipleship.org/resources/history-of-hymns-am-i-a-soldier-of-the-cross</u>.

¹⁰ Allen, A Collection of Hymns, 21.

American churches.¹¹ This likely reflects how the hymn would have been sung in early 19th century AME churches with Allen's Hymnal.

Ride On, King Jesus

The spiritual "Ride On, King Jesus" appears under a different title, "No Man can Hinder Me", as no. 14 in the 1867 collection *Slave Songs of the United States*. Unlike "Am I a Soldier", there are multiple variants and textual changes among the different versions of this spiritual. Additionally, this spiritual features a refrain/verse form (antiphonal) structure, unlike "Am I a Soldier's" strophic form.

While most contemporary versions of this hymn begin the refrain with "Ride On, King Jesus", *Slave Songs* starts with "Walk in, Kind Jesus" instead. In the older variant, the lyrics focus on Jesus' miracles and His biblical role as a miracle worker, with the last verse focusing on Jesus' triumphal entry into Jerusalem on Palm Sunday.¹² If Jesus, as the enslaved's spiritual ancestor,¹³ could perform these miracles in the past, He could work another miracle for His children now: liberation from slavery. Furthermore, since Jesus recognized the human dignity of those who sought Him in the past, Jesus would also grant His faithful, no matter their status as free or slave, the same human dignity solely for being children of God.¹⁴

In a modern version (from the Episcopal Church's supplemental hymnal, *Lift Every Voice and Sing II*), the focus is on the triumphal entry into Jerusalem, using only the final verse of the version from *Slave Songs* and a stanza incorporating a verse from the book of Job (I know that

¹¹ African American Heritage Hymnal, 482-483.

¹² William Francis Allen, Charles Pickard Ware, and Lucy McKim Garrison, eds. *Slave Songs of the United States* (1867, repr., Dover Publications, 1995), 10-11.

¹³ Paris, 388.

¹⁴ Paris, Ibid., 390.

my Redeemer lives¹⁵...).¹⁶ Similarly, the *African American Heritage Hymnal* focuses on Jesus' triumphal entry, but uses a different verse referring to "that great getting up mornin'."¹⁷ Perhaps this adaptation was to accommodate the spiritual's role in congregate worship rather than as a work song.

Were You There?

"Were You There" recounts the Passion narrative from the Gospels, telling about various aspects of the Crucifixion of Jesus. In the Christian tradition, this episode is the focal point of the narrative of salvation; it is through dying on the Cross that Jesus atoned for the sins of the world and won victory over sin and, crucially, enslavement.¹⁸

Structurally, this spiritual lends itself well to the practice of 'lining-out', since the structure of each verse involves a good deal of repetition. For example:

Were you there when they crucified my Lord? Were you there when they crucified my Lord? Oh! Sometimes it causes me to tremble, tremble, tremble: Were you there when they crucified my Lord?¹⁹

R. Nathaniel Dett's arrangement of this spiritual begins each verse with a solo to 'line out' the hymn, invoking a certain event for meditation. Pioneer of Black theology James Cone writes that the singing of this spiritual was fundamentally a reminder; he states that "[Jesus'] death was a symbol of their suffering...when Jesus was nailed to the cross and the Romans pierced him in the

¹⁵ Job 19:25 NIV

¹⁶ *Lift Every Voice and Sing II*, 97.

¹⁷ African American Heritage Hymnal, 225.

¹⁸ Alister McGrath, *Christian Theology: An Introduction* (Hoboken: John Wiley & Sons, 2016), 251.

¹⁹ R. Nathaniel Dett, *Religious Folk Songs of the Negro: as sung at Hampton Institute* (1927, repr., Kessinger, n.d.), 106.

side, he was not alone; blacks suffered and died with him."²⁰ Not only that, but this created a self-identification of the enslaved with Jesus Himself. Just as Jesus suffered a humiliating death, the enslaved could find hope in the bleakest of circumstances.

We now turn to an analysis of two white hymns to hold in conversation with the analyses of the spirituals.

Amazing Grace

The wildly popular "Amazing Grace" is sung to one of the most well-known shape note hymn tunes, *New Britain*. This hymn's roots lie solidly in the anti-slavery tradition: its author, John Newton, was a former slave ship captain turned Church of England priest. This text and tune were first paired in 1835.²¹

This hymn does not treat a specific event like the spirituals examined above (particularly the miracles of Jesus or His Passion), but rather more abstract ideas about the Christian hope of eternity. The 1835 edition of the *Southern Harmony* includes the following verse:

*The Lord has promised good to me, His word my hope secures; He will my shield and portion be, as long as life endures.*²²

This stands in stark contrast to the rhetorically simpler, but more personal, expression of salvation in the spiritual "Were You There." Here, Newton states that Jesus has promised His

²⁰ James Cone, "Black Spirituals: A Theological Interpretation," in *Music and the Experience of God*, Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim, eds. Edinburgh: T&T Clark.

²¹ "Amazing Grace' — The story behind one of the best-loved songs of all time," Oregon Catholic Press, January 10, 2018. <u>https://www.ocp.org/en-us/blog/entry/amazing-grace</u>.

²² "New Britain," in A Selection of Shape-Note Folk Hymns: From Southern United States Tune Books, David W. Music, ed. Middleton: A-R Editions, 47.

blessing on those who turn to Him as Lord and Savior but emphasizes mere acceptance of Jesus over the identification with Him.

Come, Thou Fount of Every Blessing

The text of "Come, Thou Fount of Every Blessing" first appeared in 1759 and was paired with the hymn tune *Onley*, which first appeared in 1818, in the 1848 shape-note collection *The Hesperian Harp*.²³ This hymn contains one of the most direct biblical references of all of the hymns analyzed, found in the second stanza:

Here I'll raise my Ebenezer, hither by thy help I've come; And I hope by thy good pleasure, safely to arrive at home. Jesus sought me when a stranger, wandering from the fold of God; He, to rescue me from danger interposed his precious Blood.²⁴

The reference to Ebenezer refers to an episode in the judgeship of Samuel over ancient Israel, found in I Samuel 6. The Israelites have just been delivered by YHWH over the attacking Philistines; Samuel consecrates the stone – Ebenezer – as a monument in remembrance that "thus far the Lord has helped us."²⁵

Again, the focus here is more a theme of praise than emphasizing a personal identification with Jesus or the acts of God in the Bible (as opposed to, say, "Didn't My Lord Deliver Daniel?"). This is similar to "Amazing Grace" in that this hymn emphasizes submission to Jesus ("here's my heart, Lord, take and seal it, seal it for thy courts above"²⁶).

 ²³ "Onley," in A Selection of Shape-Note Folk Hymns: From Southern United States Tune Books, David W. Music, ed. Middleton: A-R Editions, xliii and 54.

²⁴ "Onley," 54.

²⁵ I Samuel 6:12, NRSV

²⁶ African American Heritage Hymnal, 175.

A Comparative Discussion of Hymnody

First, we can easily note that there are several similar aspects between the Black spirituals and the white hymns. Each of the hymns analyzed here lends itself well to the practice of "lining out" – a line of the hymn would be sung by a leader and then repeated by the whole congregation, obviating the need for worshippers to be able to read. Early American sacred music was primarily an aural tradition in this sense. Eileen Southern, in *The Music of Black Americans*, notes that the practice of lining out metrical psalms was practiced in white churches as well as Black churches; psalmody then became a form of catechesis for the enslaved. Southern also notes that the extant records of the Bray School in Williamsburg, Virginia indicate that enslaved Blacks were taught how to sing these metrical psalms as a means to teach an understanding of the Bible.²⁷

Fundamentally, the spirituals are far more *personal* than the corresponding white folk hymns. This reflects the Christology of the Black Church – Jesus Christ, the Messiah, came to dwell among the lowly; most fundamentally, He was *one of them*. This alludes to a passage from the prophet Isaiah in the Hebrew Scriptures:

Out of his anguish he shall see light; he shall find satisfaction through his knowledge. The righteous one, my servant, shall make many righteous, and he shall bear their iniquities. Therefore I will allot him a portion with the great, and he shall divide the spoil with the strong;

²⁷ Eileen Southern, *The Music of Black Americans* (New York: W.W. Norton, 1983), 30-31 and 38-39.

because he poured out himself to death,

and was numbered with the transgressors;

yet he bore the sin of many,

and made intercession for the transgressors.²⁸

Through this spiritual ancestry, the enslaved could identify as one of the redeemed – as the family of Christ, those who stood with Him are justified at the last day. Conversely, those who did harm to God's children (the slave owners) would suffer God's wrath.

Other than the single biblical reference in "Come, Thou Fount" the three white-authored hymns that were included in this study did not make explicit references to biblical passages. The spirituals, on the other hand, make ample reference to events that occurred in the collective spiritual memory of the Black church. For instance, "Were You There" is essentially a retelling of the Passion Gospel in which Jesus is crucified, nailed to the Tree (the Cross), pierced in the side, and laid in the tomb. The verses presented in Dett's collection are merely representative. The structure of the spiritual is such that additional verses could be interspersed (and variants of the hymn do indeed add other 'events' as additional verses).

The Role of Spirituals and Hymns in American Christianity

In both Black and white Christian contexts, communal singing plays an important role in worship. Walk into any American church service on Sunday morning, from a high church, Anglo-Catholic Episcopal service complete with incense and a full choir to a rural, Black Baptist church with a small congregation singing heartily, and music will undoubtedly be a focal point of the service. However, what differentiates music in a church from music in a concert setting is

²⁸ Isaiah 53:11-12, NRSV

that those who offer music during a worship service do not want to be perceived as performers. Their work is fundamentally meant to draw the congregation's attention to the worship of God rather than their own offerings of music.²⁹ At the same time, the utilization of music is more than an act of worship – it is fundamentally an expression of identity.

Spirituals and hymns differ from each other in the sense that spirituals emerged as "a uniquely African response to an institution that waged a systemic, though unsuccessful, onslaught onto the cultural legacy of Black people in America".³⁰ By blending music of their homelands with ostensibly Christian themes, enslaved Africans were able to create a space for resistance that was uniquely theirs, yet not one that would attract blowback from their enslavers. Indeed, James Cone says that "Black worship is essentially a spiritual experience of the truth of black life…the Spirit's presence authenticates their experience of freedom by empowering them with courage and strength to bear witness in their present existence".³¹

In a way, white-derived sacred music serves as a tool for oppression. Anglican theologian Gordon Graham, formerly of Princeton Theological Seminary, notes that "Classical' church music is complex and hence difficult. It requires skill and practice and is accordingly 'exclusive'".³² To fully participate, then, formal training is necessary – singing hymns and choral anthems in harmony requires the ability to read music and the ability to devote time to rehearse music outside of service times.³³ The spiritual tradition, on the other hand, was originally transmitted orally, not unlike the *jeli* tradition of West Africa. The *jeli* tradition emphasizes the

 ²⁹ Marcell Silva Steuernagel, *Church Music Through the Lens of Performance* (New York: Routledge, 2021), 3.
³⁰ Mellonee V. Burnim, "Conflict and Controversy in Black Religious Music," in *Readings in African American Church Music and Worship*, James Abbington, editor. Chicago: GIA Publications.

³¹ James H. Cone, "Sanctification, Liberation, and Black Worship." Theology Today 35, no. 2 (1978). 139.

³² Gordon Graham, "The Theology of Music in Church." Scottish Journal of Theology 58, no. 2 (2004). 140.

³³ Graham, Ibid.

practitioners as conservators of cultural memory, history, and genealogy,³⁴ and this is similar in how the spiritual expresses a Black theological heritage.

Questions for Further Research and Analysis

No one study can adequately address all of the theological questions that arise from the African American spiritual. As previously mentioned, the spiritual serves as a subversive theological response to the theology of their white oppressors. The question of natural theology – God's revelation of Godself through the world – comes to mind with respect to the coded language of several spirituals (*Steal Away, Wade in the Water*, and others). How has Black theology, as evidenced through the repertoire of spirituals, been influenced by nature – particularly, as researched by my colleague JaneAnne Stockton, in isolated communes such as the Georgia Sea Islands and the Great Dismal Swamp (northeastern North Carolina and southern Virginia)?

Additionally, worship in historically Black denominations has been studied for its significant para-musical contents and structures. This is addressed by Lawrence Levine in his seminal book, *Black Culture and Black Consciousness*, in quoting former slave Elizabeth Ross Hite:

We used to hide behind some bricks and hold church ourselves. You see, the Catholic preachers from France wouldn't let us shout, and the Lord done said [that] you gotta shout if you want to be saved. That's in the Bible.³⁵

³⁴ Lucy Duran, "Ngaraya: Women and Musical Mastery in Mali." *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies* 70, no. 3 (2007). 570.

³⁵ Lawrence W. Levine, Black Culture and Black Consciousness (New York: Oxford University Press), 41.

Further research into the practice of preparing prayers and sermons in historically Black churches likely would hearken back to the Afrocentric theology of the spiritual. By making these acts participatory – unlike the one-sided worship of the established mainline churches – these acts, too, were subversive.

Works Cited

- Allen, Richard. A Collection of Hymns and Spiritual Songs: from various authors. Nashville:A.M.E.C. Sunday School Union, 1987. Originally published 1801.
- Allen, William Francis, Charles P. Ware, and Lucy McKim Garrison, eds. *Slave Songs of the United States*. Mineola: Dover Publications, 1995.
- Boyer, Horace C., ed. *Lift Every Voice and Sing II: An African American Hymnal*. New York: Church Publishing Corporation, 1993.
- Burnim, Mellonee V. "Conflict and Controversy in Black Religious Music." In *Readings in African American Church Music and Worship*, James Abbington, ed. Chicago: GIA Publications.
- Carpenter, Dolores, and Nolan E. Williams, eds. *African American Heritage Hymnal*. Chicago: GIA Publications, 2005.
- Cone, James. "Black Spirituals: A Theological Interpretation." In *Music and the Experience of God*, Mary Collins, David Power, and Mellonee Burnim, eds. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1989.
- ----. "Sanctification, Liberation, and Black Worship." Theology Today 35, no. 2 (1978): 139-152.

Crawford, Richard. America's Musical Life: A History. New York: W.W. Norton, 2001.

- Dett, R. Nathaniel. *Religious Folk Songs of the Negro: As sung at Hampton Institute*. Kessinger Reprints, n.d. Originally published 1927 by G. Schirmer.
- Du Bois, William E. B. *The Souls of Black Folk: With the Talented Tenth and the Souls of White Folk.* New York: Penguin, 2017.
- Duran, Lucy. "Ngaraya: Women and Musical Mastery in Mali." *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London* 70, no. 3 (2007: 569-602.
- Evans, James H. We Have Been Believers: An African-American Systematic Theology, second edition. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2012.
- Graham, Gordon. "The Theology of Music in Church." *Scottish Journal of Theology* 58, no. 2 (2004): 139-145.

Levine, Lawrence W. Black Culture and Black Consciousness. New York: Oxford UP. 1977

McGrath, Alister. Christian Theology: An Introduction. Hoboken: John Wiley and Sons, 2016.

- Morehouse, H. L. The Spirit and Policy of the American Baptist Home Mission Society, in its work for the colored people of the South." *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* 17 (1895): 414.
- Music, David W., ed. A Selection of Shape-Note Folk Hymns: From Southern United States Tune Books. Middleton: A-R Editions, 2005.
- Paris, Peter J. "The Theologies of Black Folk in North America: Presidential Address to the American Theological Society, March, 2012." *Theology Today* 69, no. 4 (2012): 386-402.

Southern, Eileen. The Music of Black Americans. New York: W.W. Norton, 1983.

- Silva Steuernagel, Marcell. *Church Music through the Lens of Performance*. New York: Routledge, 2021.
- Tisby, Jemar. *The Color of Compromise: The Truth about the American Church's Complicity in Racism.* Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2019.