

2009

From Muslim to Christian Granada: Inventing a City's Past in Early Modern Spain

Lu Ann Homza
William & Mary

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.wm.edu/aspubs>

Recommended Citation

Homza, Lu Ann, From Muslim to Christian Granada: Inventing a City's Past in Early Modern Spain (2009).
American Historical Review, 114(4), 1156-1157.
10.1086/ahr.114.4.1156

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Arts and Sciences at W&M ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Arts & Sciences Articles by an authorized administrator of W&M ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact scholarworks@wm.edu.

for the peace and security of domesticity and waited patiently for the war to end.

In his fascinating final chapter Francis examines how the flyers came home after 1945. Young men, often straight from school or university, had been thrown into battle with little or no experience of normal life, and often found their return to domesticity difficult. Mining a rich seam of memoirs, popular fictions, plays, and films, Francis examines the adjustment of flyers to a peacetime world where their battle skills held little advantage.

Yet, as Francis suggests, even now, seventy years after the war's end, the romance of the wartime flyer shows little sign of diminishing; an outpouring of biographies, films, and memoirs continues to reinforce the legend. However, this is no sensational work out to debunk the story of the RAF in World War II, for Francis approaches his subjects with respect and admiration for their achievements. His book is a welcome and intellectually honest attempt to examine the image of the airmen in British popular culture of World War II.

MICHAEL PARIS

University of Central Lancashire

A. KATIE HARRIS. *From Muslim to Christian Granada: Inventing a City's Past in Early Modern Spain*. (The Johns Hopkins University Studies in Historical and Political Science.) Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press. 2007. Pp. xxi, 255. \$50.00.

Between 1588 and 1599, laborers and treasure-hunters in Granada found sacred relics that tied the city to the earliest Christians in Spain. Parchments in Arabic and Latin, particles of bone and handkerchiefs, and a sequence of lead books (*plomos*) told sixteenth-century Granadans a number of remarkable facts: that the Virgin Mary had spoken Arabic and toured Purgatory; that Granada's first bishop, St. Cecilio, was a deaf-mute Arab who had been cured by Jesus, mentored by St. James, and martyred in Granada in 56 C.E.; and that a revival of faith before the Apocalypse would be provoked by Arabs and their language. Profoundly syncretic in their blending of Christianity and Islam, the relics not only elevated the role of Arabs and Arabic within Christianity but implicitly tied Spain's *moriscos*—Muslims who had converted to Christianity, usually through coercion—to an honorable role in Christian salvation.

Controversy immediately ensued, with Granada's religious and social elite fiercely arguing for the relics' authenticity and other Spanish intellectuals opining equally adamantly that the discoveries were forgeries. The relics eventually were shipped to Rome for examination in 1642; forty years later, the papacy condemned them as the creation of Muslims whose aim was to undermine the Catholic faith. For modern readers, the irony of the relics is profound. The city of Granada was the center of the last Muslim kingdom in Spain, conquered by Ferdinand and Isabella in 1492: after that date, its Muslim inhabitants went from a relatively tol-

erated, catechized population to one that was converted by force in 1502, targeted by inquisitors and cultural proscriptions in the 1550s and 1560s, and forcibly resettled in other parts of Spain after the revolt of the Alpujarras in 1568–1570. Though the intentions behind the *plomos* and the other discoveries remain unknown, their content looks like a deliberate attempt to dignify a despised population of *moriscos* and to integrate Christians and *moriscos* into the earliest history of Spanish Catholicism. These relics challenged the religious history of a local place that was saturated with religious division. Tragically for the forgers and others who may have shared their hopes, the reception and promotion of the relics in Granada eliminated the *moriscos*' positive contribution to Christian history.

The history of the relics offers an intensely dramatic story. Up to now, scholarship on them has taken one of two directions: either measuring their theological orthodoxy in terms of Christianity and Islam, or examining them in the context of Christianization undertaken by the Tridentine church. In her graceful, subtle book, A. Katie Harris turns the subject to different ends and investigates the effect of the relics on civic identity, which she understands as a "symbolically constituted sense of belonging to a deep-rooted community" that nevertheless is multifaceted and subject to change (pp. xiv–xv). In five taut and thoughtful chapters, Harris lays out the early modern history of Granada and its religious turmoil, explains the fluidity of its elites, and traces the various ways in which the relics were received and turned to larger ends, either via the writing of local histories, the promotion of civic rituals, or the trumpeting of new sacred locales such as the Sacromonte, which lay outside the city walls and held the *plomos* found between 1595 and 1599. Harris proves without a doubt that the relics gave rise to a local, hagiographical history that in its most important form tied the martyrdom of St. Cecilio and his followers to the sufferings of contemporary Christians in the revolt of the Alpujarras. Here, sixteenth-century scholars were after repeating patterns and coherence: the discovery of the *plomos* allowed them to skip over centuries of Muslim dominance in favor of a purely Christian genealogy. The same quest for unity helped preachers treat the city as witnessing a cycle of conquests, first by St. Cecilio, then by Ferdinand and Isabella. And the relics' impact encouraged Granadans to expand their sense of the sacred outside the city walls, where, between 1621 and 1631, they created a monument that linked St. Cecilio, Mary Immaculate, and the city's identity.

Harris successfully illuminates the ways in which a specific geographical and historical context could spur particular intellectual and even emotional priorities, as Granadans deliberately pursued a Christian antiquity whose effects were felt across time, and purposely shut out the very *moriscos* who had given them the tools of their inspiration. Her investigation reinforces recent studies of the Tridentine reforms across Europe by demonstrating the ways in which local forces might challenge and correct the church. Small objections

could be made here and there. The role of Archbishop Castro y Quiñones in the relics' promotion deserves greater amplification, because he seems to have been the prime mover in their reception. Also it is risky to measure the popularity of specific saints through baptismal names when the total number of baptisms for any given year is not addressed. But this fine book will greatly interest all scholars of early modern Spain, Catholicism, and civic life.

LU ANN HOMZA
College of William and Mary

SCOTT K. TAYLOR. *Honor and Violence in Golden Age Spain*. New Haven: Yale University Press. 2008. Pp. xi, 307. \$55.00.

Scott K. Taylor's intriguing new book asserts that two phantoms haunt Anglo-American scholarly understanding of Spanish social history. The first is the legacy of literary scholars' studies of the so-called "honor plays" of Lope de Vega, Calderón de la Barca, and other luminaries of Spanish "Golden Age" drama. The second is a long tradition of twentieth-century English-language anthropological studies of the phenomenon of "honor" in Iberian societies. Together, according to Taylor, the literary and anthropological studies undergird a pervasive obsession with the supposed centrality of "honor"—and, as a corollary, the obligation to resort to violence to defend one's honor—as an organizing principle of Spanish society at all levels.

But, Taylor dares to ask, what if our traditional conceptions of honor's place in Spanish society are misguided? To conjure up and then exorcise the ghosts of Spain's supposed "honor code," this book puts the values and behaviors enacted on the Golden Age stage and codified in modern anthropological studies to the empirical test of seventeenth-century historical sources. Specifically, Taylor's analysis is based upon intensive study of the surviving records of 477 seventeenth-century Castilian criminal trials, ranging in date from 1600 to 1652, in which what Taylor terms the "rhetoric of honor" came into play. Of these cases, the majority (313) come from a remarkable cache of surviving trials pertaining to the central Castilian town of Yébenes, located along the busy Royal Road in the *montes* of Toledo. The remaining 164 cases come from locales across the crown of Castile, representing the associated trial records that survive alongside those of the royal "Good Friday Pardons" granted annually by the king to a certain number of convicted criminals. Taylor skillfully uses these sources to move the reader back and forth from the depth of insight into the workings of the rhetoric of honor in a specific town to the comparative breadth provided by the cases drawn from other cities and villages across Castile. Taylor divides his analysis into five thematic chapters, addressing in turn "The Duel," "Honor and the Law," "Men," "Women," and, finally, "Adultery and Violence."

Each chapter follows a parallel rhythm, opening with a vignette from one of the Golden Age "honor plays"

illustrating the "point of honor" in question in the chapter, followed by a lengthy discussion of how the ideal illustrated by the literary sources actually functioned at the popular level as revealed by the trial testimony. Throughout the analysis Taylor provides eloquent support for his thesis: "Honor was not a trap that forced early modern Spaniards to act in certain tragic and bloodthirsty ways. Instead, it was a tool, used equally by men and women to manage relations with their neighbors and maintain their place in the community" (p. 7). The closing paragraphs of each chapter then carry the question outside of the Iberian peninsula, surveying research in other areas of Europe to show that the use of the "rhetoric of honor" in seventeenth-century Spanish communities resembled rather than differed from that in analogous communities in early modern Italy, France, and England.

Carefully researched and engagingly written, Taylor's book speaks directly to an issue of pressing concern and current scholarly debate, appearing as it does on the heels of two other very recent studies addressing closely related issues. On the one hand, like Taylor, Ruth MacKay, in her 2006 study *"Lazy, Improvident People": Myth and Reality in the Writing of Spanish History*, contends that the supposed Spanish obsession with "honor" enshrined in the literary sources is misguided and readily dismissed by scholars who engage primary sources dealing with the day-to-day realities of early modern Spaniards of all classes. On the other hand, James Casey's 2007 book *Family and Community in Early Modern Spain: The Citizens of Granada, 1570–1739* asserts on the basis of extensive archival research that honor was an overpowering ideal that played a dominant role in shaping the choices made by early modern Spaniards, especially among the elite families who are the principal focus of his study. Taylor's richly textured study makes an exceptionally strong empirical case against the sorts of "honor-bound" conceptions of Spanish society epitomized by Casey's book.

DAVID COLEMAN
Eastern Kentucky University

ISABELLE ROHR. *The Spanish Right and the Jews, 1898–1945: Antisemitism and Opportunism*. (Cañada Blanch/Sussex Academic Studies on Contemporary Spain.) Brighton, England: Sussex Academic Press. 2007. Pp. xvii, 211. \$62.50.

In view of the centrality of the Judeo-Masonic-Bolshevik myth to the political culture of the Franco dictatorship, it is perhaps surprising that so little has been published on the subject in English. Isabelle Rohr approaches this neglected theme by scrutinizing the Jewish question in Spain, above all with regard to the extreme right, between the loss of Spain's last remaining colonies in 1898 and the end of World War II in 1945. By drawing on a range of diplomatic and newspaper sources, as well as the pioneering works in Spanish, she tackles the issue not only in light of the dominant political myths of the right but also in terms of Spain's