"Innocent and necessary": Music and dancing in the life of Robert Carter of Nomony Hall, 1728--1804

John R. Barden

College of William & Mary - Arts & Sciences

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.wm.edu/etd

Recommended Citation


https://dx.doi.org/doi:10.21220/s2-eexq-cm50
"INNOCENT AND NECESSARY":
MUSIC AND DANCING IN THE LIFE
OF ROBERT CARTER OF NOMONY HALL, 1728-1804

A Thesis
Presented to
The Faculty of the Department of History
The College of William and Mary in Virginia

In Partial Fulfillment
Of the Requirements for the Degree of
Master of Arts

by
John Randolph Barden
1983
APPROVAL SHEET

This thesis is submitted in partial fulfillment of
the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

John L. Axtell
Author

Approved, July 1983

James L. Axtell

John E. Selby

James S. Darling
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter/Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PREFACE</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER I. HIDDEN BEHIND A MASK, 1728-60</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER II. &quot;THE SCIENCE OF MUSICK,&quot; 1761-72</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER III. &quot;INDEFATIGABLE IN THE PRACTICE,&quot; 1772-77</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER IV. &quot;NO REVELING IN THE NEW JERUSALEM,&quot; 1778-90</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER V. &quot;I WILL SING WITH THE SPIRIT,&quot; 1791-1804</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABBREVIATIONS IN NOTES</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOTES</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VITA</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PREFACE

In 1893 historian Kate Mason Rowland counted "forty-six manuscript volumes of letter-books and ledgers...in which Robert Carter...photographed himself and the life of which he was a part for a period of over forty years." Nearly all of these letterbooks can be accounted for in public collections stretching from Boston, Massachusetts, to Durham, North Carolina. In addition, loose pieces of correspondence have been located in repositories as far away as San Marino, California, and Gloucestershire, England.

The librarians and staff assistants at these institutions have always shown an interest in this thesis and a great deal of patience, for which I extend my sincere thanks. Four people who deserve special recognition for their assistance are Mr. Waverly Winfree, Manuscripts Librarian, Virginia Historical Society; Mrs. Marian Kirven, Librarian, Swedenborg School of Religion; Miss Margaret Cook, Manuscripts Librarian, Swem Library, College of William and Mary; and Dr. John Ingram, Research Archivist, Colonial Williamsburg. In addition, Mr. J. S. Darling, Organist of Bruton Parish Church, and Mr. Peter W. Redstone, Conservator of Musical Instruments for Colonial Williamsburg, have contributed indispensable musicological advice.

I also gratefully acknowledge the support of this project by my supervisors, Mr. John Davis, Curator of Metals, and Mr. Graham Hood,

Chief Curator, Department of Collections, Colonial Williamsburg. Finally, I wish to thank Mr. Shomer Zwelling for his generous permission to quote from his lecture "Robert Carter of Nomoni Hall: Seasons of a Man's Life," and Ms. Nancy Carter Crump, who first introduced me to the papers of Robert Carter III.

In editing quotations taken directly from Carter's script, I have silently corrected the obvious misspellings which occasionally rendered words into nonsense. Most abbreviations have been expanded, and the letters "th" have been substituted for "y" in such words as "y^e", "y^n", and "y^t". Carter's capitalization and punctuation patterns have been followed as much as possible; in ambiguous cases, modern capitalization and punctuation rules have been followed. The spelling of his plantation "Nomony Hall" was the form most often used by Carter and his contemporaries.
ABSTRACT

Among the musically-oriented society of colonial Virginia, Robert Carter of Nomony Hall was notable for the intensity and extent of his involvement with that art. At a time when nearly all musical instruments had to be imported from England, Carter assembled an impressive collection, including a harpsichord, a chamber organ, a pianoforte, and the only glass harmonica known in Virginia. Not content with the role of performer, Carter maintained a long-running fascination with how his instruments worked, experimenting, researching and designing new actions which he hoped would lead to advances in that field.

Music in one form or another was a common subject in Carter's correspondence for over forty years. Yet by no means do all of these references reflect a constant attitude toward the art. Carter's musical point of view shifted radically during the course of his life, from intense periods of practice and experimentation to a lengthy antipathy toward secular music and instruments.

This study traces Carter's involvement with music through five broad periods in his life. 1) Although not much is known about Carter's early years, circumstances indicate that by the time he reached adulthood and left Virginia for a two-year sojourn in England he had already mastered the basics of music and dancing. 2) The years he lived in Williamsburg, 1761 to 1772, were characterized by the acquisition of instruments, experimentation, and the fellowship of several gentlemen musicians, including lieutenant governor Francis Fauquier, who shared Carter's "enlightened" ideas regarding music theory. 3) Following several personal crises, Carter and his family returned to Nomony Hall. Here, as tutor Philip Vickers Fithian's journal suggests, Carter's increased use of music as a means of solitary comfort and escape contrasted sharply with the conviviality of social life enjoyed by other members of his family among the Northern Neck gentry.

4) In 1778 Carter's conversion to the Baptist faith led him to renounce secular music and dispose of most of his instrument collection. 5) However, his subsequent discovery of the writings of theologian Emanuel Swedenborg in 1788 allowed him to rehabilitate his musical interests, including the rebuilding of his instrument collection following his removal to Baltimore in 1793. His role in the publication of the first American New Church (Swedenborgian) liturgy and hymnal was a strong indication of the synthesis he achieved between music and religion.
"INNOCENT AND NECESSARY":
MUSIC AND DANCING IN THE LIFE
OF ROBERT CARTER OF NOMONY HALL, 1728-1804

Photograph courtesy of Virginia Historical Society, Richmond.
CHAPTER I
HIDDEN BEHIND A MASK, 1728-60

In 1770 English music historian Charles Burney noted that "there is hardly a private family in a civilized nation without its flute, its fiddle, its harpsichord, or guitar."¹ In the British colony of Virginia, whose gentry certainly considered themselves civilized, the maxim was especially true. Musicmasters attended the children of wealthy planters and merchants, instructing the youngsters in the magic of turning black spots on a page into music. Meanwhile, adults entertained themselves and their friends with more polished performances or even small concerts. Professional musicians often accompanied the entertainment offered for ladies and gentlemen at operas, plays, and especially assemblies and balls, where rhythms and melodies were indispensable for dancing. As one traveler through Virginia discovered, women there were "immoderately fond" of their minuets, reels, country dances and jigs. "Indeed," he continued, "[dancing] is almost the only amusement they partake of."² This was an exaggeration, for many young ladies were also accomplished harpsichordists, guitarists and vocalists. The love of music was not limited to the upper classes. Small farmers, craftsmen and their families partook of it as leisure permitted. White indentured servants and black slaves were often noted for their proficiency on one instrument or another.³ Music permeated the activities of nearly all Virginians, so that Landon Carter, a wealthy but eccentric planter, was quite accurate in grumbling
that "from every house a constant tuting may be listned to upon one instru-
ment or another." 4

Among this musically-oriented society, Robert Carter of Nomony Hall
was notable for the intensity and extent of his involvement with the art
that has been called his "darling Amusement." 5 At a time when nearly all
musical instruments had to be imported from England, Carter assembled an
impressive collection, including a harpsichord, a chamber organ, a piano-
forte, and the only glass harmonica known in Virginia. Not content with
the role of performer, Carter maintained a long-running fascination with
how his instruments worked, experimenting, researching and designing new
actions which he hoped would lead to advances in "the science of Musick." 6

Yet Carter, like nearly all Virginia gentlemen, never considered
himself a professional musician. His primary occupation was planter,
owner of numerous plantations and master of hundreds of slaves. With
these resources he produced large quantities of tobacco and grain which
he shipped to England, Italy, Madeira, New York, and other American ports.
His plantations supported large facilities for milling, spinning and weav-
ing, blacksmithing, and other crafts. As owner of twenty percent of the
Baltimore Iron Works, Carter served as an early industrialist and retailer
of the iron the company produced. Before the Revolution, "the Councilor"
(as he was sometimes called) was an active member of the Governor's Coun-
cil, assisting in its legislative, executive and judicial duties.

Despite all these time-consuming activities, music in one form or
another was a common subject in Carter's correspondence for over forty
years. Yet by no means do all of these references reflect a constant
attitude toward the art. Carter's musical point of view shifted radic-
cally during the course of his life, from intense periods of practice
and experimentation to a lengthy antipathy toward secular music and instruments. The crises which sparked Carter's shifts in attitude have recently been explored by Shomer Zwelling, former research historian for the Colonial Williamsburg Foundation, in his lecture "Robert Carter of Nomoni Hall: Seasons of a Man's Life." Zwelling depicts Carter as a man filled and surrounded by tensions which arose from the conflict between a fading social order based on rigid class structure and the autocracy of the patriarch, and a new system founded on democracy and a more benign paternalism. Carter, like many men whose lives spanned the two orders, had to choose between adapting to the new system or dying with the old one.

Amid the numerous personal and external tensions which harried Carter's life, Zwelling has pinpointed five key events which also serve as milestones in Carter's relationship to music. 1) His trip to England in 1749, in addition to marking the end of his childhood before his assumption of adult obligations, also introduced him to the social uses of music and dancing on a truly grand scale. 2) His removal to Williamsburg in 1761 heralded the arrival of the sociable Councilor Carter, intimate friend and musical companion of the Governor, who found happiness in activity, whether for business or pleasure. 3) Twelve years later, after the deaths of two governors who were also good friends, Carter sensed that political conflict was imminent. He returned to his plantation at Nomomy, withdrawing not only from Williamsburg, but from his family as well. Often his musical instruments were the only companions he permitted.

4) After the outbreak of war in Virginia, Carter's search for peace and stability turned even farther inward. In 1777 he received a "most
gracious Illumination" from God which led to his association a year later with the Baptist church. To conform with his newly-adopted faith Carter abandoned his secular musical interests and spent the next decade disassembling his collection of instruments. Finally, in 1788 after his wife's death and his family's dispersal, Carter encountered the writings of the Swedish mystic Emanuel Swedenborg and became an important early supporter of this precursory movement of American transcendentalism.

Because Swedenborgian philosophy encouraged music both as a tool of worship and a means of artistic expression, Carter was able to synthesize two previously conflicting facets of his personality—the musician and the worshiper.

In addition to Carter's direct relationship to music, a number of his manuscripts and other pertinent papers shed light on the role music and dancing played in the society surrounding the Councilor. Often the counterpoint is striking, for it shows that, especially in his later years, Carter was not afraid to walk to what philosopher Henry David Thoreau called "the different drummer."

* * *

The details of Carter's early musical experiences have not survived. He was born in 1728, son of a member of the Governor's Council. His grandfather was Robert "King" Carter, land agent for Baron Fairfax, proprietor of the Northern Neck lying between the Potomac and Rappahannock Rivers. Through his position the "King" amassed a tremendous fortune in land which enabled him to leave each of his children remarkably wealthy. Young Robert's father died in 1732, followed by his grandfather a few months later. Until he attained his majority, the youngster's estate was held in trust by his father's three surviving brothers.
Robert's mother, the former Priscilla Churchill, soon remarried, and the lad spent several years in the home of his stepfather, Colonel John Lewis of Gloucester County. His lessons in music and dancing under itinerant masters probably began during this period. Certainly opportunities for instruction were greatly increased by Robert's entrance in July 1737 into the Grammar School at the College of William and Mary. Undoubtedly he participated in the dancing classes which had begun at the College under William Dering, a recent arrival from Philadelphia. In the Virginia Gazette Dering offered to teach dancing in the "newest French manner to all Gentlemen's sons on Fridays and Saturdays once in three weeks." Identification of Carter's musicmaster is less certain, though he probably pursued his lessons in this area as well.

Carter's activities between 1737 and 1749 are unknown. Presumably he continued his education at the College or under a private tutor. His musical skills probably developed a great deal during these years. Meanwhile, many hogsheads of tobacco bearing his mark were shipped to England. His estate prospered under the care of his three uncles.

In 1749 Carter came of age and received control of his patrimony. In June he sailed for England, ostensibly to continue his study of law at the Middle Temple. However, if his cousin John Page is to be believed, his two years' residence in London left Carter "inconceivably illiterate." He formed an intimate friendship with the Athawes family, a prominent mercantile house, and probably joined them in sampling the pleasures and luxuries of London life. In fact, Carter ruefully recalled these years as a period when "my gratifications exceeded my yearly income."

Although Londoners thrived on a social life heavily laced with music, including assemblies, balls, operas, concerts, and plays with interludes
of singing and dancing, the only surviving reminder of Carter's musical activities abroad is not a written but a painted document. In 1754, three years after his return to Virginia, Carter received a portrait of himself, which had been started in the studio of Thomas Hudson during his English sojourn. In this handsome painting, now in the collection of the Virginia Historical Society, Carter is depicted in a silk suit which from its style might have been tailored for a courtier of the 1630s. This was not unusual, for such antique garb was a conventional device of mid-eighteenth-century artists. However, the detail of Carter's costume proclaims it to be more than convention. As if to reveal the intention of his dress Carter bears in his left hand a crooked-nose, rouged-cheek mask. He had chosen to be portrayed in a masquerade costume.

Robert Carter was not the first Virginian to enjoy London masked balls. Thirty years earlier, William Byrd II attended numerous affairs dressed variously as a marquis, a running footman, or simply in a domino, or half-mask, and hood, which disguised the wearer's identity without conferring a new persona. The Virginia Gazette reported masquerades as part of its London news until the 1770s. The costumes described were often quite elaborate, and included some which incorporated musical elements, such as "a Jamaica Negro (not a Mungo) entertaining the Company with a Variety of Negro Songs, in the most natural and laughable Manner," and "a female Savoyard, with her Viol [hurdy-gurdy]," who "played upon her Instrument with great Delicacy, and sung to it (in French) with still greater." Although masquerade balls were occasions for tremendous conviviality and jollity, the central activity of the evening was dancing. Byrd noted French dances, including minuets, and country dances among his steps at various London assemblies. The music accompanying dances at
these occasions was often quite fine. One diarist at a 1767 ball found "four Violins, a Bass Viol, a Taber and Pipe, a Hautboy and French horn." 24

Carter carried his fascination with his London lifestyle back to Virginia when financial circumstances forced his return in June 1751. On July 4 of that year, John Blair of Williamsburg recorded in his diary: "I hear Mr. R. Carter intends to build and live at W[illiams]burgh and to persuade all the gent[lemen] he can to do so too." However, less than a week later Carter suffered an unexplained setback, for Blair noted, "Sad news of poor wretch'd Bob Carter. I hope he won't come to live in W[illiams]burgh." 25 Apparently, for all his high living in London, Carter did not make a favorable impression on upper-class Virginians such as Blair and his cousin Page.

Carter did not move to Williamsburg at that time, but retired to his main plantation, Nomony Hall in Westmoreland County. In 1754 he took as his wife Frances Tasker, daughter of the Honorable Benjamin Tasker, President of the Council of Maryland. This alliance brought Carter many assets, including a dowry and, through his wife's family, considerable influence in Maryland and England. Whether Mrs. Carter contributed any musical talent to the family is questionable, for she never showed a propensity for anything more ambitious than dancing. However, in 1756 she presented Carter with the first of seventeen children, many of whom would be trained in music.

In 1758 Carter followed in the footsteps of his father and grandfather by attaining a seat on the Governor's Council. He benefited not only from the honor accorded this position, but also from the opportunity of close acquaintance with the newly arrived lieutenant governor Francis Fauquier. The young councilor became an intimate friend of the governor,
and accompanied him on official trips to New York and Charles Town in the early 1760s. In return, the governor took a fatherly interest in Carter. John Page noted that his cousin's transformation from an "inconceivably illiterate" young man to a respectably well-informed government officer was partially due to the conversations he held with "our highly enlightened Governor." Carter never forgot his intention of moving to Williamsburg. As he returned to the capital for meetings of the Council he must have felt a recurrence of the excitement he had known as a young boy leaving the plantation for the Grammar School, an emotion somewhat akin to the thrill of his arrival in London. Drawn by his political duties and his desire to live near the center of Virginia's social and cultural activities, in 1761 Robert Carter gathered his wife, three children, and household about him and left Nomony Hall.
CHAPTER II
"THE SCIENCE OF MUSICK," 1761-72

Williamsburg in 1761 was the closest thing Virginia had to a city. Although not much larger than Norfolk in population or in economic importance, the capital assumed political and cultural airs which far outshone the port. As the home of the governor and the General Assembly when in session, Williamsburg reenacted the pageantry of the Court and Parliament on a smaller scale. As the seat of the College of William and Mary, the city attracted the intellectual elite of the colony. Since concentration of power often coincided with accumulation of wealth, the gentility of town life in Williamsburg could not be matched elsewhere in Virginia. In fact, only in Williamsburg could a Virginian snatch a taste of the political, social and cultural hubbub that was London.

Into this world Robert Carter brought himself and his family in 1761, to a house on Palace Street next door to the governor's residence. The two-story house was spacious enough for the family he brought: his wife Frances; two sons, Benjamin Tasker and Robert Bladen; and a daughter, Priscilla. However, the brood would grow rapidly during the Carters' eleven-year tenure; by 1772 seven daughters and one son would be born on Palace Street, five of whom would survive infancy.

Shomer Zwelling has described this Williamsburg period as Carter's "most worldly phase." It was a period of great activity in making money and political contacts. Carter's correspondence portrays him as a busy,
happy man who also enjoyed the fruits of his labor. Orders for expensive goods poured into his tobacco merchants' offices in London. In the midst of establishing the atmosphere of prosperity around him, Carter also assembled a collection of musical instruments, the variety and extent of which were not matched in any known eighteenth-century Virginia collection. It was this penchant for acquisition, and his scientific curiosity about the instruments he acquired, which characterized Carter's years in Williamsburg.

The first musical instrument to appear in Carter's possession was a single-manual harpsichord with two sets of strings tuned at eight-foot pitch. Its maker was Jacob Kirckman, one of the most renowned builders in London. The date Carter acquired the instrument is not known, but it was presumably before the summer of 1761, when he received a cover for it from Kirckman. Full-size harpsichords, though never as common as the less expensive spinets, were present in the colony. A double-manual example by Kirckman was sold in Williamsburg in 1768.

By that year, Carter's harpsichord was in need of repair. In September he requested his tobacco merchants, Edward Hunt and Son of London, to find an "artist" to experiment with using leather or metal instead of the traditional raven's quill to pluck the strings, since Carter found it an "Inconvenience" to cut the quill. Leather plectra (plucking devices) had been successfully used in some schools of harpsichord builders, though seldom by English makers. Metal plectra were never practically implemented, though they had been proposed in London as early as 1730. Carter closed his instructions by ordering a set of jacks, the vertical mechanisms which hold the quills, suggesting that broken jacks had perhaps rendered his instrument unplayable.
After the presumed repairs, the harpsichord continued to serve Carter and his family for many years. He ordered "1 Harpsicord tuning Fork to sound the note C" in May 1769 and "2 setts of harpsichord wire to be bought of Jacobus Kirkman, Harpsicord Maker" in January 1771. However, Carter was adding other, more exotic, instruments during this period.

In May 1764 Carter wrote to John M. Jordan, merchant of London:

Mr. Pelham of this Place is returned from New York. He heard on that journey Mr. B. Franklin of Philadelphia perform upon the Armonica. The Instrument pleased Pelham amazingly & by his advice I now apply to you to send me an Armonica (as played on by Miss Davies at the great Room in Spring Gardens), being the musical Glasses without Water: Formed into a complete Instrument, capable of Thorough-bass & never out of tune. Charles James of Purpoole-lane near Gray's Inn, London, is the only maker of the Armonica in England.... [The Glasses] must be packed with great care for if a Glass should be broke the Instrument will be rendered useless until the accident could be repaired from London.

The armonica, or harmonica, had become fashionable in Europe soon after Benjamin Franklin invented it in 1761 while on a London visit. Franklin took the idea of wine glasses tuned with various levels of water and instead suspended a series of glasses, tuned by size and thickness, on a horizontal rod; spinning the rod allowed the glasses to be sounded by the player's moistened fingers. The English public was charmed by the sound of Franklin's musical glasses. The inventor soon licensed Charles James to manufacture the instrument. Franklin presented an harmonica to virtuoso musician Marianne Davies, who in 1768 toured Europe with the instrument to wide acclaim. As the harmonica's popularity spread across the Continent, compositions for the musical glasses appeared from several pens, including that of Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart.

Peter Pelham, who communicated news of the harmonica to Carter, was a fixture in Williamsburg's small professional music community for over fifty years. Born in London and reared in Boston (he was step-brother to
the portraitist John Singleton Copley), Pelham achieved status as a musician in Charles Town, South Carolina, before arriving in Williamsburg around 1750. He served as organist at Bruton Parish Church for over forty years and advised Carter on a number of musical matters. Whether Pelham charged Carter for his advice, or offered his services out of friendship, is unknown. However, a balance of £ 4-12- 2 1/2 for unspecified goods or services is listed in Carter's account book to the credit of "Mr. Peter Pelham, Organist of Bruton parish" for June 2, 1772, approximately the time Carter and his family left Williamsburg.

Whether Carter received his "Glasses" in 1764 is uncertain. No further mention is made of the harmonica until March 1770, when Carter requested an unidentified correspondent to comment on the feasibility of setting four spindles to revolve at different rates, presumably to equalize the tone of the various glasses. Less than a month later Carter was billed by William Kennedy, a Williamsburg cabinetmaker, for "a Case for a Sett of musical Glasses with Spindles to Support them, and Sundry wheels for moving them." Carter's harmonica was in operation, but improvements or repairs were necessary almost immediately.

Rowland Hunt, son of the London merchant Edward Hunt, visited Carter in 1770 and apparently returned to England with some of the glasses for a Mr. Dobbs, either a London glass blower or retailer, to repair or replace. Carter acknowledged the receipt of "three musical glass-bowles" in October 1771, but he was disappointed that Dobbs "takes no notice of my information touching the similarity of sound in the glass & delph [i.e. delft] Bowles." As with the harpsichord plectra, Carter was experimenting with his musical instruments, and again with few chances of practical success. The porosity of the delft earthenware body would
not allow it to vibrate nearly as brilliantly as the glass bowl. Dobbs probably realized this more than either Carter or Rowland Hunt, who related:

At the time we procured the Glass Bowls from Mr. Dobbs we mentioned to him the sound of the Delph Bowls to which he gave no credit & he was so short with us that it was a doubt whether the glass bowls could be obtained from him.

Nonetheless, Carter's harmonica was put in working order and served him for many years.

About the same time Carter discovered the harmonica, the only one known in Virginia, he sought to buy an example of the most common instrument found in the colony—the violin. Estate inventories and newspaper advertisements show that violins or fiddles of varying quality were frequently owned and played by Virginians of all classes and races. The particular instrument Carter tried to acquire was already familiar to him. It had been the property of the Reverend Thomas Bacon of Maryland. In July 1768 Carter asked his brother-in-law Christopher Lowndes to arrange the purchase of the "Violin and Musick" from Bacon's widow. He specified, "I expect that all the parts of the Concertos, Sonatas and Songs be complete, that neither they nor the Fiddle be overrated." Carter perhaps remembered Bacon's violin from the minister's visit to Williamsburg in 1751 to raise funds for his charity working school. John Blair, in his diary, refers to Carter's presence in town, as well as Bacon and his violin: "[June 28, 1751] R. Carter arrived.... [July 16] Mr. Bacon &c dined here, we had fine musick.... [July 17] [Bacon] dined with Dr. Gilmer. Fine Violin." If this was the instrument Carter recalled and was trying to buy, he was not in luck. Lowndes replied that Mrs. Bacon had sold the violin, and continued, "The musick she has still in hand,
which she will dispose of, tho' I suppose the Gentleman [Carter] will not want one without the other." There is no record of Carter purchasing the remaining music.

On several occasions Carter tried to add another basic instrument to his collection: a German, or transverse, flute. This instrument had rapidly replaced the recorder, or common (English) flute as the primary woodwind of its day. Its popularity is reflected in the fact that when Carter requested "1 Complete Tutor for the German Flute" in October 1765, his London agent had at least five different volumes with this title to choose from. There is no evidence that Carter ever received the "2 small German Flutes" he sent for in 1765. He repeated the order in 1769 as an attachment to his specifications for a chamber organ, requesting that the flutes be silver-mounted and in unison pitch with the keyboard instrument. However, the organ was not immediately forthcoming, and his agents declined to send the flutes without it. Probably doubting that he would ever see the German flutes arrive from England, Carter purchased one from a local merchant in April 1770. Eighteen months later he received from the same firm which provided the organ "2 flutes tipt with Silver," endorsed by the phrase, "We doubt not but they will appear Sufficiently in their own recommendation."

Carter began his effort to secure a chamber organ in October 1769. He wrote to the firm of Hyndman and Lancaster, merchants in London:

Mr. Pelham who wrote the inclosed Direction recommends Mr. Thomas Griffin organ maker in Fenchurch-Street, and if you be not attached to another maker, be pleased to employ him with this caution that he first satisfy you that his price be reasonable— The organ described by Mr. Pelham is less compounded than the following one, which T-G—estimates at 50 Guineas, Viz.
Pelham's general directions were as follows:

The Case to be made of Deal [pine] & painted to resemble mahogany— as it is designed for a Chamber, its height must not exceed 8 or 9 feet; the width & depth to be determined by the space requisite for the pipes, which must be so capacious, that they be not crowded— Care be taken that a convenient place be allowed under the Keys to receive the knees of the performer— In Fashion & appearance it must represent a Book Case with folding doors, & without any sham front pipes but in their stead within the Doors let there be some neat fret work (painted as the Case) which will serve to conceal the pipes when the doors are open, & at the same time suffer a sufficient quantity of sound to escape; & therefore no lining of any sort can be allowed to this part of the Work; and therefore will be necessary that the top of the Case be so contrived, that it may be taken off with ease, & that the fret work also may let in & take out at pleasure— The compass of the Keys must include double G in the Bass & E in alt in the treble, which part of the work [the keyboard] must be finished in a neat & masterly manner— Two stops only are required & both to be stopped Diapason made of Wood, they must be unisons & in Concert pitch, to each of them must belong a slide or Register to open or shut the pipes in one Motion....

Two...Bellows...must be made for this Gentleman's Organ, whose satisfactions I have chiefly consulted in the pains I have taken about them; and pray let it be particularly noticed, that each of them [the bellows] must be finished with a handle as he purposes to employ a Servant to blow, whenever he uses the Organ, & therefore desires there be no contrivance to blow with the foot....

The Doors & every other part of the Case [except in front of the frets] must be lined with woollen Baize in order to reduce the sound to as great a degree of softness & distance as possible.

The rest of Pelham's directions were devoted to a discussion of the defects of organ bellows and his proposal to rectify them. He wrote:

I tuned two C's an Octave, & procured a perfect agreement between them, when the Bellows had parted with one third of their Wind; & when about half was exhausted the octave became imperfect; but before the wind was quite spent, the Notes agreed again— Now it is evident that this variation did not
arise from any change the pipes underwent, but from the different degrees of force with which the weight on the Bellows prest this air into them.

According to Pelham, the fault lay in the current method of constructing bellows, which consisted of two pieces of wood joined together at one end, as shown below:

Since the bellows were pumped up and down, the angle between the top and bottom pieces was constantly changing. As a result, Pelham claimed, the air pressure was not uniform, but was delivered to the pipes in "violent puffs," which not only prevented "clear tuning," but destroyed whatever melody was performed on the keys.

Pelham's remedy was to place the top and bottom of the bellows parallel to each other, the top being supported on four well-polished iron rods, as shown below:

As the top piece moved up and down on the rods, the bellows would deliver a "uniform regular degree of power," and "the business of tuning [would] be reduced to a greater degree of certainty."
In a response dated January 15, 1770, Thomas Griffin, the London organmaker to whom Pelham's criticisms and directions were addressed, said that the fault cited lay not in the bellows, but in the performer, who should keep the blowing mechanism at a uniform height, "not more than two or three degrees above the horizon nor two or three below it...by which means the Organ may be Tuned to as great perfection as required." Griffin acknowledged the ingenuity of Pelham's proposed remedy, and admitted that he himself had devised a similar scheme twenty-five years earlier, but had been dissuaded from executing it by "Eminent Mechanicks" who pointed out that the friction of the bellows on the iron bars would "occasion the whole Organ to Chatter." Griffin also criticized the design of the case,

for the Doors and the frett work front must be taken out when it is Tuned, and when shutt up will be out of Tune. And if Room Sufficient be allowed to prevent the Inconvenience I complain of, [that is, if the case is built large enough not to affect the speaking of the pipes] the size will be Enormous.

The real reason Griffin did not want to undertake the construction of Carter's organ was related in passing. He said, "I am retired from business, therefore cannot enter on anything Cappitall." In fact, Griffin was not an organ builder at all, but simply a procurer, buying instruments from London craftsmen and selling them at a profit. This man, a barber by trade with no musical qualifications, was retiring on the proceeds of a scheme he set up whereby he provided several parishes in London with organs and organists in return for a lifetime annuity. His goal was to convince Pelham, and therefore Carter, not to have an organ built to specifications, but to buy one from his remaining stock. In a note endorsed 1770, probably received the same time as the letter of January 15, 1770, Griffin said that he had ready one large organ in
a mahogany case, "fitt for the finest roome in this Kingdome or any other," and three chamber organs. 31

Carter was not satisfied with this solution. In a letter to Hyndman and Lancaster, dated July 11, 1770, he acquiesced to Griffin's greater experience regarding the bellows. However, concerning the size of the case and its effect on tuning the pipes, Carter said:

I wish [Griffin] had used a word more limited than enormous [sic], for if it means a Case about 9 feet high, 8 long & 5 wide, (or a lesser one) I rather have a Case of this dimension, than have a set of Pipes in a diminutive one abstracted of the power of expressing strongly forte & piano. Mr G- says that an Organ consisting of 2 rows of Pipes only is rather whimsical & that such an abridgement of that noble Instrument will render it less perfect--[no statement of this import can be found among the surviving letters of Griffin to Pelham or Carter.] When that matter was under contemplation I knew that several organs in America were useless, being too compounded for our Artists to repair--and a 2d consideration was that my Purse would not pay for a large complete organ and as [for] the little shrill Chamber-organs running up 1 or 2 octaves higher than E, in alt in the treble, I would not keep such a one in my House--32

Carter realized that Griffin was trying to pressure him into buying one of his stock instruments, and refused to be hoodwinked:

When I consider Mr. G's situation [I] think that there are many organ-makers in London who will speak more impartially than he has spoken of the new constructed organ & Bellows, & pray communicate the inclosed description of them to a skilful young builder & to an organist and if they shall be of opinion that the Idea is too limited to please a performer who desires to hear melody only--in that Case be pleased to enquire for an organ fit for a large Room, even buying one of Griffin's if the price could be negotiated.

This time Carter was not disappointed. On October 12, 1771, Ben Powell, a Williamsburg contractor, charged the Councilor with "Sundries of work by Mr. Lamb about your organ. 33 The letter which accompanied the instrument, dated London, May 18, 1771, was signed J: & J: Simpson (though Carter read this as T: & J: Simpson). The firm was that of
James and John Simpson, father and son, who were primarily makers of violins and flutes, but also served as music publishers and musical instrument retailers. Their violins were being imported into Yorktown, Virginia, in the late 1760s. The Simpsons probably did not make the organ, but only provided it. In 1787, when Carter was endeavoring to sell the instrument, he recalled Griffin as the builder. The maker's name evidently did not appear on the case.

According to their letter, the Simpsons saw to it that Pelham's directions were followed as fully as possible. One of the few exceptions was the construction of the bellows, which, they claimed, would "deliver the Wind in so regular a manner as to admit of its being tuned to the greatest nicety." Care was taken that the tone of the pipes "be soft & sweet." However, a mahogany case was substituted for the deal one specified in Pelham's directions, since "Deal being a soft Wood is very liable to Decay, & can never look half so well as Mahogany."

The decay of the instrument had been one of Carter's worries ever since his first investigation into chamber organs. In 1769 he had written Hyndman and Lancaster: "If furniture be stowed in a Vessel where the air is in a manner excluded the property of glue is greatly defeated in long voyages--and I would pay an extraordinary freight to have the organ put in a cool part." He repeated this injunction in 1770, but his warnings were in vain. In 1773, he wrote John Hyndman and Company, successors to Hyndman and Lancaster: "The Organ you sent to me was not made of seasoned wood, therefor that Instrument is Very defective."

Defective or not, the organ was usable, and was used. Each time Carter sent instructions regarding its construction, he requested music, chiefly "tunes or musical compositions regulated to the measure of the
new version of David's Psalms, for an Organ and a variety of Interludes, or voluntaries after the Stanzas—proper for each tune" and "approved Songs, either old or new in score—the Basses figured— The above music to be in manuscript, & to be revised by a Master of music." Simpson provided both of these selections. The approved songs were probably popular songs of the day, with annotations by a musicmaster to be used for keyboard instruction. The compositions relating to the psalms were harmonizations of common tunes used in singing psalter selections. Each arrangement contained interludes to be played between the stanzas and even between the lines of the psalm. The "new version" referred to the metrical edition published by Nahum Tate and Nicholas Brady in London, 1696, which was used in the Church of England service along with the "old version" of 1562. Collections of psalm interludes were published by John Blow and Daniel Purcell in the first half of the eighteenth century, and continued to appear as late as 1770.

When Carter ordered the psalm interludes and the "approved songs" he also ordered music to the currently popular opera, Love in a Village, only four years after its American premiere at Charles Town, South Carolina, and almost a year before its first Williamsburg performance. This music was very suitable for the last major musical instrument Carter acquired during his Williamsburg years: a pianoforte. Like the glass harmonica, this was an exotic instrument in Williamsburg in 1771. It was not a grand pianoforte, but a smaller square one, of the type invented by Johannes Zumpe of London around 1765. This instrument became popular in London after Johann Christian Bach, son of Johann Sebastian Bach, gave the first solo performance on one of Zumpe's instruments in 1768. By that time, Zumpe had so many orders to fill that the slack began to be
taken up by Johannes Pohlmann. In all likelihood, Carter's pianoforte was built by one of these two London instrument makers.\(^{46}\) In Virginia other pianofortes occasionally appeared after 1770: Thomas Jefferson ordered one in June 1771,\(^ {47}\) while Lord Dunmore, the last royal governor, abandoned one at the Governor's Palace when he fled in 1775.\(^ {48}\)

Since Carter acknowledged the receipt of the pianoforte and the three glass bowls from Mr. Dobbs at the same time, perhaps Rowland Hunt carried the order for the instrument with him on his return to England in 1770. Carter was not totally pleased with what he received:

> The Piano-Forte you sent to me is a fine-toned Instrument, but liable to the Exception made to all keyed Instruments by the late Doctor Smith, who removed that imperfection in his changeable Harpsichord. The Instrument makers of that class are very remiss, who have not adopted Smith's Improvement.\(^ {49}\)

The gentleman Carter referred to was Dr. Robert Smith, whose *Harmonics, or The Philosophy of Musical Sounds* was published in its second edition in 1759. Carter sought to borrow a copy of this book as early as March 1770 from the Reverend James Horrocks, President of the College of William and Mary.\(^ {50}\) Immediately afterward, Edward Hunt and Son were requested to ship a copy of the latest edition of "Doctor Smith's Harmonicks."\(^ {51}\) The volume was purchased from Benjamin White, a London bookseller, on July 21, 1770, and was probably in Carter's hands by the end of the year.\(^ {52}\)

The *Harmonics* was a close reflection of Robert Carter's musical tastes. It was the work of a Cambridge University mathematician who also experimented with musical instruments. The majority of the volume is a mathematical description of various harmonic principles.\(^ {53}\) One of its basic premises is that the twelve-tone musical scale most widely used in western Europe and America is not a perfect mathematical reality.
This is due to the fact that the sum of the musical parts is greater than
the whole, or, more specifically, the sum of the various intervals which
comprise a musical octave is slightly larger than the octave itself.
This is particularly troublesome in a keyboard instrument, which must be
tuned to a certain pitch for the duration of a performance. In standard
practice the octave is tuned to a harmonically perfect pitch and the
intervening intervals are "cheated" slightly to accommodate the mathemati-
cal irregularities. A great topic of discussion in the eighteenth century
was what method of tuning, or temperament, allowed music to be played in
the most keys (musical scales) with the fewest number of harmonic discor-
dances.

In his solution to these difficulties, Dr. Smith pointed out the
chief faults lying in the twelve-tone keyboard scale. In this scale each
black key was usually forced to serve as the sharp to the white note
below it as well as the flat to the white note above it. Harmonically
the sharp and the flat were not the same pitch, but most tuners of key-
board instruments compromised by tuning the black note somewhere in between
the two harmonic values, sharp and flat, usually closer to the value more
frequently used. The resulting discords, or false consonances, according
to Smith, made much music unplayable or, at least, unpleasant to hear. 54

Smith's solution was simple in theory: instead of one pitch for
each black note, make provisions for the note to sound flat or sharp.
Smith also made practical suggestions for implementing this change. Most
harpsichords of his day had at least two sets of strings at the same
pitch; Smith insisted that one string per note was sufficient, and that
the extra strings could be used for different harmonic pitches. He also
devised mechanisms which allowed the harpsichordist to play the black
notes at their sharp pitches or their flat pitches, or any combination of
the two. Smith showed ways to adapt this method to already existing
harpsichords, or to install an improved version of this mechanism in new
instruments during construction. 55

Smith's Harmonics was published several years before Zumpe invented
the English square pianoforte. However, the latter also addressed the
issue of imperfect intervals by the development of the enharmonic pianoforte,
wherein the black keys were divided into two halves, one half for
playing the flat value of a note, the other for playing sharp. 56 Smith
had seen harpsichords built in this manner, and found them cumbersome to
play. 57 However, on the standard Zumpe square pianofortes, the use of
two strings for most notes, as on the common harpsichord, made a type of
arrangement similar to the one Smith described easily imaginable. This
was the kind of instrument Carter wanted, but did not receive. 58

Carter continued to think highly of Doctor Smith and the Harmonics. In 1778 he sent the book by his son Robert Bladen to the Reverend James
Madison, Professor of Mathematics at the College of William and Mary, with
the recommendation: "I send Doctor Smiths Harmonics. It will afford Im-
provement & delight to all Algebraists, who have considered the Science
of Musick." 59 During the years Carter lived in Williamsburg, music for
him was as much science as art. It was a logical conclusion for a disci-
ple of the Enlightenment. His proposed experiments with the plectra on
his harpsichord, the bellows on his organ, the bowls of his harmonica,
and finally the temperament, or harmonic quality, of his pianoforte were
all products of a mind which saw that musical instruments were not only
to be played, they were to be "tinkered" with. Although the experimenta-
tion continued after Carter returned to Nomony Hall, it never again
achieved the intensity or the complexity of the Williamsburg period.

* * *

Robert Carter was not alone in his enjoyment of music. Eighteenth-century Virginians in general were quite aware of music's role in their lives as a means of personal enjoyment and as a form of social interaction, either through ensemble playing or group dancing. Children were introduced to music and dancing at an early age as part of their general education. Carter's youngsters were not unusual in receiving instruction from the age of nine by professional music and dancing masters.

The only one of Carter's children old enough in Williamsburg to receive extensive instruction in instrumental playing was his oldest son, Benjamin Tasker, commonly called Ben, who was under the tutelage of William Attwood from December 1769 to February 1771. This master defined the compass of his activities in a Virginia Gazette advertisement: "William Attwood Begs Leave to inform the Gentlemen of Williamsburg that he teaches the French Horn, Hautboy, and German Flute; and has, for that Purpose, rented a Room near the College." Evidently he instructed Ben on the German flute, since that was the instrument the lad played most proficiently at Nomony Hall.

Ben probably attended the musicmaster at his room near the College, since one of Attwood's receipts bears on its reverse President Horrocks's note to Carter concerning Smith's Harmonics. Attwood announced his intention to leave Virginia shortly after the Carters returned to Nomony Hall.

Ben was joined by his younger brothers and sisters for instruction under William Fearson, one of several local dancing masters. The oldest brother started his lessons in 1769 or 1770 and was soon joined by his sister Priscilla, often called Siller, and towards the end of 1770 by
their younger siblings Robert Bladen, or Bob, and Ann Tasker, or Nancy, who took to the dance floor just before her ninth birthday.65

Carter's papers do not record whether Fearson was as harsh a taskmaster as his counterpart at Nomony Hall, Francis Christian. Nevertheless, Fearson had a hard time keeping accompanists in tow. After advertising in September 1769 for "an orderly Negro or Mulatto man, who can play well on the violin," the dancing master announced on more than one occasion that his fiddler had fled. The first escape was made in August 1771 by Andrew Franks, a convict servant, who could "play well on the violin." In November 1773, Fearson searched for "the Negro Boy so well known in this City by the Name of Fiddler Billy."66 After the Carters left Williamsburg, Fearson began riding the plantation circuit, dying in 1777 "on the job" at Tuckahoe, the Randolph family home in Goochland County.67

* * *

Robert Carter also found music a useful means of social intercourse and interaction. As an accomplished amateur performer in a musically-aware society he took note of these talents and abilities in others. When Sir William Draper, a military commander who gained fame in the East Indies theater of the Seven Years' War, and his travelling companions stopped in Williamsburg in 1770 on their American tour, Carter noted their presence in town. He particularly commented on Sir Williams's niece, Mrs. Collins, who "sings masterly."68

Surprisingly enough, when Sir William Tryon, royal governor of North Carolina, and his wife visited Lord Botetourt, Virginia's governor, in June 1769, Carter reported only their reaction to the temperate weather, though Lady Tryon was a keyboard performer of some renown.69 The Councillor probably did not have an opportunity to hear her play, since, as
Anne Blair of Williamsburg reported to her sister Martha Braxton, the Lady "had unfortunately scall'd three of her fingers (I say unfortunately, for else she wou'd have play'd the Spinet)." 70

Carter's closest musical companions in Williamsburg frequented the large house next door--the Palace. For ten years, from 1758 to his death in 1768, Lieutenant-Governor Francis Fauquier gathered about him the best minds and finest performers of music Williamsburg had to offer. These included George Wythe, a prominent burgess and local attorney who also lived on Palace Street, and William Small, professor of mathematics at the College of William and Mary. Occasionally, the two gentlemen brought along their young protégé, Thomas Jefferson, who recalled the informal concerts at the Governor's Palace with fondness. 71 Carter, who by Fauquier's own admission was an intimate of his, often joined the musicians as harpsichordist. 72

These four men--Carter, Fauquier, Wythe and Small--had several common interests. Each was a leader, either in education, law, or government--a member of the colonial elite, as well as a student of the Enlightenment. Wythe and Small were both noted for scientific experimentation and Fauquier displayed a similar inclination. All three men were able to join Carter in his appreciation of "the science of Musick."

Fauquier was clearly the pivotal point of this group. His death in 1768 after a long, painful illness deeply grieved Carter, who eulogized him thus:

He acted in the publick, honourable office, which his superiours conferred on him, with grace & dignity. He was vigilant in government, moderate in power, & merciful where the rigour of justice could be dispensed with. 73

After his death the Governor's musical instruments, two violoncellos, a tenor violin of a size between a viola and a 'cello, several bows and a
number of miscellaneous pieces, were sent to Fauquier's son in London by the Councilor, one of the executors of his Virginia estate.  

Informal concerts were no longer held at the Palace. Carter was a close friend of the new governor, but Lord Botetourt exhibited no particular fondness for chamber music. Lord Dunmore, who arrived in Williamsburg in 1771, had at the Palace "3 Organs, a Harpsichord, a Piano-Forte, and other Musical Instruments," but Carter showed no inclination to make music, or have much correspondence of any type, with the Scottish nobleman. By 1769 he was once again concentrating on building his collection with instruments for his solitary performances, perhaps trying to restore his tranquillity of mind.  

By 1772, Carter had tired of his social and governmental roles in Williamsburg. He had watched two of his close friends, Fauquier and Botetourt, and four of his own children die. In May, Carter took his family and returned to his Northern Neck seat. Seven months later, cabinetmaker Benjamin Bucktrout, a former partner of William Kennedy, maker of the harmonica case, was employed to crate Carter's harpsichord and prepare it to be shipped to Nomony Hall. Bucktrout's qualifications for this task were revealed in his 1767 announcement that his shop made spinets and harpsichords, and in the fact that he repaired Carter's music stand before it left Williamsburg. Several of the Councilor's other instruments, including his harmonica and pianoforte, also went to Westmoreland County about this time. The organ, for the time being, was left standing in the vacant house on Palace Street.
CHAPTER III
"INDEFATIGABLE IN THE PRACTICE," 1772-77

After his departure from Williamsburg in 1772, Robert Carter took emotional refuge at Nomony Hall. In the city he had grieved over the deaths of his children and two close friends, Governors Fauquier and Botetourt. He was unsettled by rumors of radical political change which swept the capital. The social life which had thrilled him in London, he found, could not be recreated on a similar scale in Palace Street.\(^1\)

Carter longed for a more stable environment. Nomony Hall, founded by his father on land provided by his grandfather Robert "King" Carter, was his personal "kingdom." During his youth, the estate was a symbol of his patrimony and future independence. Now that he was master, surrounded by his family, servants and slaves, the beautiful plantation became a place to retrench and regain firmer control of his life, away from the vagaries and political intrigues which riddled Williamsburg. Yet Carter was not as socially and politically isolated as he may have liked.

Westmoreland County, which surrounded Nomony Hall, was the largest of the five counties on the lower Northern Neck. Serviced by two major rivers, the Rappahannock and the Potomac, as well as by numerous creeks, the Neck was well-designed for a tobacco economy. Merchant ships from London, Liverpool, Glasgow and other British ports sailed to the warehouse doors and emptied elegant, expensive manufactured goods in exchange for
the hogsheads they carried back. Fabulous wealth accumulated in the hands of Northern Neck gentry who held large tracts of land as well in remoter parts of the colony. The Tayloes at Mount Airy, the Lees at Stratford and Menokin, the Carters at Corotoman, Sabine Hall, Cleve, and Nomony Hall—these were only a few of the leading families. An extensive social network was maintained among them through lavish assemblies which lasted several days, meetings centering on regular events such as court days and church services, regattas and horse races, besides the more mundane daily visits between neighbors and business contacts. Although distances sometimes limited the frequency of social encounters, most inhabitants compensated by making these occasions as memorable as possible.

When Carter returned to Nomony Hall, he wanted to remove himself for a time from this milieu. His family, however—particularly his wife and older children—were eager to make new social contacts. This diversity of minds resulted in increased tension within the family. Such tension, compounded by numerous other emotions, underlay much of the behavior that Philip Fithian witnessed during the year he lived among the Carters.

* * *

The musical life of the Carter family went on as vigorously as it had in Williamsburg. Three months after their arrival in Westmoreland, Carter composed a letter to musician Charles Leonard:

My Eldest Daughter Priscilla desires to learn Music, and to practice upon the Keyed Instruments— The Child and my-self Beg the favour of you to Attend at this place, for the purposes mention'd Above, and that Miss may become your Scholar Immedi-ately— If you will Appoint a time & signify to me where you will then be, I will send a Chair to Wait on you, Accordingly.²

Sending the chair for Leonard was more an acknowledgement of his age (he was past seventy) than a respectful gesture towards his profession. A native of Germany, like several travelling music and dancing masters,
Leonard had strong ties to the Lee family at Stratford. In 1771 Philip Ludwell Lee wrote his brother William that

Your old Friend Mr. Leonard is here & playing finely. He looks ten years younger than he did when you saw him last, is full of spirits, very complaisant & good natured & plays much better. He seems to have rov'd 'til tired & has set him self down here.\textsuperscript{3}

Leonard's residence near Stratford put him in convenient proximity to Nomony Hall, but for some unknown reason Carter did not send his letter to the musicmaster.\textsuperscript{4} Perhaps he believed Leonard's "excellent but capricious" style of playing, which the \textit{Virginia Gazette} noted in its 1776 announcement of the violinist's death, was not a suitable model for his children's instruction.\textsuperscript{5}

In the spring of 1773 Carter asked Dr. John Witherspoon, president of the College of New Jersey at Princeton, to recommend a recent graduate of that institution as a tutor for his children.\textsuperscript{6} The young man eventually chosen for that position was Philip Vickers Fithian. A New Jersey native, Fithian came from a staunch Presbyterian background, which was not ameliorated by his studies at Nassau Hall from 1770 to his graduation in 1772.

Before the offer from Carter was extended, Fithian had been studying for the ministry. He did not put his theology books aside but continued his preparation during his tenure at Nomony Hall. It was with some hesitation that the spiritually-oriented Fithian left his friends and relations to enter the worldly environment of Virginia.\textsuperscript{7}

Any ascetism which was part of Fithian's personal belief system did not include a denial of the pleasures of music. He brought with him a considerable knowledge of the subject. He was an accomplished performer on the German flute, had received two years of vocal instruction, and took pleasure in music theory by transcribing the tunes of his friend James
Lyon, who published *Urania, or a choice collection of Psalm-Tunes, Anthems and Hymns* (1761), the first large-scale American hymnal. Fithian recalled a visit with Lyon: "I sung with him many of his Tunes & had much Conver­sation on music.... We spent the Evening with great satisfaction to me." Musically disposed, yet braced for the cultural shocks he expected to re­ceive in Virginia, Fithian proved the ideal commentator on Carter and his musical habits.

Almost immediately Fithian found that musical activities in the Carter household affected his duties as tutor. Certain musical requirements took precedence over schoolroom studies. One week after his arrival three of his eight scholars, namely Prissy, Nancy, and Bob, were called away to dancing school. Over the course of the next year, Fithian was obligated to release students at least thirteen times, an average of once every three weeks, to attend the instruction of Francis Christian, the dancing master. Christian appeared as a dance instructor in the late 1760s, when his circuit took in the children under George Washington's care at Mount Vernon. In 1773 and 1774, Christian's route carried him to Nomony Hall, Stratford, Hiccory Hill (the home of John Turberville, Carter's closest neighbor), Bushfield (John Augustine Washington), Chantilly (Richard Henry Lee) and The Cliffs (Moore Fauntleroy). On several occasions, dancing classes held at Nomony Hall permitted Fithian to view the rehearsal of an art so highly esteemed that the tutor remarked, "Virginians are of genuine Blood-- They will dance or die!"

The first session that Fithian attended, around the end of December, was typical of Christian's classes. "After Breakfast," the tutor wrote, we all retired into the Dancing-Room, & after the [seventeen] Scholars had their Lesson singly round Mr. Christian, very po­litely, requested me to step a Minuet; I excused myself how­ever, but signified my peculiar pleasure in the Accuracy of
their performance— There were several Minuets danced with 
great ease and propriety; after which the whole company joined 
in country-dances, and it was indeed beautiful to admiration, 
to see such a number of young persons, set off by dress to 
the best Advantage, moving easily, to the sound of well per­ 
formed Music, and with perfect regularity, tho' apparently in 
the utmost Disorder— The Dance continued til two, we dined 
at half after three— soon after Dinner we repaired to the 
Dancing-Room again; I observe in the course of the lessons, 
that Mr Christian is punctual, and rigid in his discipline, 
so strict that he struck two of the young Misses for a fault 
in the course of their performance, even in the presence of 
the Mother of one of them! And he rebuked one of the young 
Fellows so highly as to tell him he must alter his manner, 
which he had observed through the Course of the Dance, to be 
insolent, and wanton, or absent himself from the School— 
I thought this a sharp reproof, to a young Gentleman of seven­ 
teen, before a large number of Ladies....

When the candles were lighted we all repaired, for the last 
time, into the dancing Room; first each couple danced a Minuet; 
then all joined as before in the country Dances, these contin­ 
ued till half after Seven when Mr Christian retired.  

After the lessons, grownups and children joined in such games as "Button" 
and "Break the Popes Neck." Fithian noted: "Nothing is now to be heard 
of in conversation, but the Balls, the Fox-hunts, the fine entertain­ 
ments, and the good fellowship, which are to be exhibited at the approaching Christmas." On holiday occasions like these, youngsters had oppor­ 
tunities to put their instruction in dancing and deportment to good use.

The country dances Christian taught were stylized versions of Eng­ 
lish folk dances and were used at Court and in the palaces of the nobility 
in England. His scholars also performed lively reels, which became a 
legendary part of nineteenth-century Virginia balls. Christian's em­ 
phasis on the minuet was not unusual, since this figure usually opened 
every assembly, danced by a single couple. To be asked to step the open­ 
ing minuet was an honor. To dance it poorly was a disgrace. Returning 
from her lessons at Stratford in early January, Prissy reported that 
"Mr. Christian the Master danced several Minuets, prodigiously beautiful;
that Captain Grigg (Captain of an English Ship) danced a Minuet with her; that he hobled most dolefully, & that the whole Assembly laughed!"  

Priscilla's opinion of Captain Grigg evidently was justified. Nearly ten years later a young lady visiting the Turbervilles at Peccatone called the Captain "the most laughable creature I ever saw. They tell me I shall be highly diverted at the minuet he dances; and we intend to make him dance one tonight." The next day she made her report:

I don't think I ever laugh't so much in my life as I did last night at Captain Grigg's minuet. I wish you could see him. It is really the most ludicrous thing I ever saw; and what makes it more so is, he thinks he dances a most delightful one.

Even if Fithian had been naturally inclined toward dancing, such faux pas would probably have halted his attempts. On several occasions Christian entreated Fithian to dance, assuming he was the product of a "genteel" education. Fithian was always quick to decline, though he confided to his journal after one encounter:

I went to my Room not without Wishes that it had been a part of my Education to learn what I think is an innocent and an ornamental, and most certainly, in this province is a necessary qualification for a person to appear even decent in Company!

In light of so strong a statement, Christian's severity with his students was justified if they were to avoid embarrassment among their peers.

In addition to the seventeen scholars and their teacher, Christian's assembly was also a gathering place for several adults who accompanied their children to the dance and joined the young people in their evening games. The dancing lessons were organized as balls for children, and required almost as much hospitality from the hosts as parties for adults. The large number of visitors stretched household accommodations to the limit, with Fithian reporting that he and two youngsters shared his room
over the schoolhouse. Parents paid more for children's dancing lessons than the master's fee would indicate.

Nevertheless, Carter considered them of sufficient social merit for his children to devote a great deal of time and energy to the art. He once flogged his son Bob when the lad tried to escape a dancing lesson by way of a weak excuse. Carter and other parents realized that children learned more from the master than the correct movement of the feet. When Fithian noted the appearance of young ladies at these assemblies, he not only commented on the regularity of their steps, but also their bearing, their conversation and their interaction with their peers. In fact, these lessons were a major training ground for all types of social behavior in the eighteenth century. Christian not only produced dancers; he was also creating upper-class Virginians. Small wonder then that the Carter children described their assemblies as "large, genteel and agreeable."

As if Fithian did not lose enough time to Christian and his dances, the tutor also had to compete with John Stadler, the local musicmaster. Stadler, instead of Leonard, was the man Carter entrusted with the musical instruction of several of his children. His credentials were excellent: born in Germany, by 1764 he was playing concerts in Philadelphia with the leading musicians of that city. Two years later he was teaching the Custis children at Mount Vernon and attended there regularly until about 1771. In 1773 his circuit included Nomony Hall, Mount Airy, Sabine Hall, and undoubtedly a number of other plantations.

Stadler's list of scholars in the Carter household changed constantly. Carter noted in his daybook in December 1773 that he paid the musician "twenty guineas for teaching my son Benjamin & daughter Priscilla." Ben's instruction was probably a continuation of his German flute lessons
under Attwood. Prissy was learning how to play the harpsichord and the pianoforte. In March 1774, Fithian said, "Mr. Carter put Miss Fanny to learning the Notes"; the nine-year-old girl was also placed in Stadler's care.28

Stadler visited Nomony about once a month, his lessons generally lasting three days. During those periods Priscilla and any other students were excused from the classroom to attend the musicmaster. The young lady's fortepiano-playing was joined by her master's violin.29 When the instructions were finished Stadler entertained the entire family with performances on the flute, harpsichord, violin or glass harmonica, or with news of current events which he picked up on his circuit.30 His repertoire included "Church Tunes and Anthems" as well as songs and sonatas.31

Fithian developed an excellent rapport with the musician, who honored him by saying he played "a good Flute." Yet when Stadler picked up the flute and played, Fithian said, "The best Ben and I can do, is like Crows among Nightingales."32 Stadler's kindness deeply impressed the lonely tutor, who said, "I love this good German.... He has much simplicity & goodness of heart-- He performs extremely well-- He is kind & sociable with me--."33 When Fithian was preparing to return to New Jersey, he noted, "Good Mr Stadle[r] left us this morning. I took leave with great reluctance of this worthy Man, & do not expect to see him more!"34

Aside from the actual music lessons, Carter insisted that his daughters spend each Tuesday and Thursday morning and generally every evening practicing their respective instruments, Prissy the fortepiano and Nancy the guitar. During the evening sessions, the entire family had an opportunity to hear the students' progress.35 Prissy, thirteen years old, was only beginning to learn keyboard instruments, though, as Fithian noted in
January, "She has since I came made great advances" and "plays her tunes true and exceeding finely."36

Since Stadler was not well versed in playing the guitar, Nancy escaped his instruction and instead studied under her papa.37 Yet the young girl seemed to lack motivation, or, as Fithian thought, "She is not constant in her disposition, nor diligent nor attentive to her business." Her father had purchased her guitar with extra sets of strings in July from James Dick & Stewart & Company, a local merchant firm. She began her study of the instrument in December and, according to her tutor, understood the notes well.38 Carter paid special attention to her studies, writing out songs for her to memorize so as to sing and accompany herself.39 Yet, soon after she caused an uproar in the household by clipping off her eyebrows to satisfy a whim, Fithian recorded this dialogue between herself and her papa:

Call in Nancy to her Guitar, says the Colonel. In She minces slow & silent from her supper— She scratches her Instrument, after a long preparation, into the Air of 'Water parted from the Sea.' What, pray Miss Nancy, what bewitched you with a desire of clipping your Eye-Brows— The Genius of Woman shines forth in this little Girlish trick— pray Mr Fithian, was you ever taught Singing? Yes Sir, I attended two years— Had you any instructions for using the Shake [trill]--I am giving Nancy some Lessons but She is vastly indolent-- Nancy, play over and sing the Funeral Hymn-- Excuse me, Papa, I have lost the Verses-- Happy Soul, thy Days are ended,— Go on.

Whether due to her father's gentle chiding or some stronger method of persuasion applied out of Fithian's sight, Nancy's attitude was vastly improved the next day: "Well, Nancy, I have tuned your Guitar; you are to practice to Day with Priscilla, who is to play the Harpsichord, till twelve o Clock; You can repeat the Verses of the Funeral Hymn?-- I can Sir."40
The younger children displayed musical inclinations at this time, though they did not yet receive formal instruction. Fanny received her first lessons while Fithian was present. Her sisters, eight-year-old Betty and five-year-old Harriot, were too young to begin. Fithian noted that Betty and Fanny sang for him on occasion, but he was particularly impressed by "bold, fearless, noisy...lawless" Harriot, who seemed to have a Heart easily moved by the force of Music; She has learned many Tunes & can strike any Note, or Succession of Notes perfectly with the Flute or Harpsichord, and is never wearied with the sound of Music either vocal or Instrumental.*1

Carter's oldest son Ben was the closest of the children to Fithian in age and in temperament. Both of the young men played the German flute and Colonel Carter took advantage of their talent to organize small chamber concerts, perhaps as he remembered them from the Palace in Williamsburg. At the end of February, the Colonel gave Ben and Fithian the parts of an unidentified sonata to prepare on their flutes, with Carter to provide the thorough bass, or continuo, on the fortepiano. After a rehearsal, in which Carter delighted the tutor by noting the perfection with which he played his part, the "small concert" was ready. It went so well that Carter soon gave out another sonata to practice. Undoubtedly both were played for family members, but Fithian especially appreciated the reaction of Stadler who offered not only his "Approbation, but his praise."42

Despite Ben's proficiency on his instrument, very little could entice him to play when it did not suit him. At one point, Fithian arranged to pay Ben to either play his flute or read to him for twenty minutes after the tutor went to bed. This contract did not last long, for Ben soon complained of "the Labour, or Confinement of the Task," much to Fithian's annoyance.43
Ben's interest in dancing, however, extended beyond the steps Christian taught. Fithian was surprised one stormy night to see just how informal Ben and Harry Willis, a young cousin who lived at Nomony Hall, could be:

This Evening the Negroes collected themselves into the School-Room & began to play the Fiddle, & dance.... I went among them, Ben, & Harry were of the company-- Harry was dancing with his Coat off-- I dispersed them however immediately.44

The tutor soon found that this was not an isolated occurrence. Less than a week later he reported: "This Evening, in the School-Room...several Negroes & Ben, & Harry are playing on a Banjo & dancing!"45

Fithian was not surprised at the slaves' obvious interest in music, though he was shocked at Ben and Harry's disregard for social barriers. Indeed, a superficial glance at Virginia Gazette advertisements involving slaves would have told him that eighteenth-century blacks enjoyed making music and were quite proficient in the art.46 In some cases slaves held positions like that of John, Carter's waiting man, who occasionally played for the young white people to dance.47 This required John to have knowledge of a European musical instrument, probably the fiddle, and the dancing tunes then in vogue. On the other end of the spectrum, the dancing in the schoolhouse reflected the abilities and tastes of the field slaves rather than the house servants. Here non-European traditions were stronger. The dances may have been derived from their pre-American culture, as was their instrument, the banjo. Jonathan Boucher, formerly tutor to George Washington's stepson, described the banjo of the eighteenth century like this: "Its body was a large hollow gourd, with a long handle attached to it, strung with catgut, and played on with the fingers." An instrument resembling this description is shown in a late eighteenth-century
painting of slaves dancing on a South Carolina plantation, now exhibited
in the Abby Aldrich Rockefeller Folk Art Collection, Williamsburg, Virginia. With homemade instruments such as these, blacks in their own com-
pany made very different music from what they were called upon to play
for their masters' pleasures.

* * *

Without a doubt Robert Carter was the most enigmatic figure Fithian
encountered at Nomony Hall, though the young man often lauded the Colo-
nel's generosity and civility. As a devoted father, Carter took a very
personal interest in his children's musical educations. Yet he often
broke away from the family at key moments, such as at meal times. On
Christmas Day Fithian recalled: "While we supped Mr Carter as he often
does played on the Forte-Piano. He almost never sups." 49

Zwelling has described this withdrawal as an emotional continuation
of the physical flight from Williamsburg to Nomony Hall—Carter sought
to flee into himself. 50 Music proved one means of escape. Because Car-
ter's expertise on instruments far outstripped that of anyone else in his
family, he regarded his harpsichord, fortepiano, harmonica and guitar al-
most as the walls of a private garden where he could find solitude and
nurse the emotional bruises of the Williamsburg days from which he was
still recovering. Fithian could not help but notice the Colonel's profi-
ciency. "He has a good ear for Music," he said; "a vastly delicate
Taste; ...he himself also is indefatigable in the Practice." 51 The
tutor did not realize that practice not only made for perfection, but
also provided an excuse for solitude.

The sound of the glass harmonica charmed Fithian, who recalled the
first time he heard it:
The Notes are clear and inexpressibly Soft, they swell, and are inexpressibly grand; & either it is because the sounds are new, and therefore please me, or it is the most captivating Instrument I have Ever heard. The sounds very much resemble the human voice, and in my opinion they far exceed even the swelling Organ.52

Interestingly enough, while Carter used his favorite instrument to pacify his mind, virtuoso harmonica performers in Europe were experiencing nervous disorders which they blamed on "the irritating permanence of extremely high partials and the continuous contact of the sensitive fingers with the vibrating bowls."53

While Carter's predominant pattern was to enjoy his music by himself, he sometimes expressed strong desires to perform in chamber groups, as he had done in Williamsburg. The sonata which he played with Ben and Fithian was one notable occasion. The Colonel also enjoyed a friendly relationship with Stadler, and performed several times for or with the musicmaster.54 At one point Carter sought to facilitate the performance of chamber music by turning a vacant end of the schoolhouse into "a Concert-Room," as Fithian remembered,

to hold all his instruments of Music-- As he proposes to bring up from Williamsburg his Organ, & to remove the Harpsichord, Harmonica, Forte-piano, Guitar, Violin, & German-Flutes, & make it a place for Practice, as well as Entertainment.55

Most Virginians believed that exposure to music was a part of good breeding. Yet Carter's interest in his family's practice went beyond this. His close supervision of his children's musical educations, particularly Nancy's guitar lessons, was a manifestation of his desire to have well-trained musical companions as well as the paternalism which Zwelling sees exhibited time and time again during these years at Nomony Hall. At one point, Carter expressed his intention to leave his entire estate to his most capable child, who would then support his brothers
and sisters. He did not admit that the family would ever break up, even when the children were grown and he was dead. If such were the case, he would have musicians to accompany him to the end of his days. However, such a notion was far-fetched, even in patriarchal eighteenth-century Virginia.

Carter did not completely abandon his musical experiments. He still showed enthusiasm for his invention of a set of whistles, tuned to the various pitches in an octave, to be used for tuning his harpsichord and fortepiano. He ordered plates for drawing harpsichord wire to the proper thickness and also for drawing fine silver threads for wrapping steel wire to make his own bass guitar strings. However, experimentation was not as prevalent in Carter's musical activities as it had been earlier.

The types of music played in the Carter family were fairly evenly divided between secular and sacred, and were all of English or Continental derivation. The sonata which the Colonel, Fithian and Ben played was almost certainly an import, as was "Felton's Gavot," which was a popular transcription of the "Andante with variations" in the Concerto, Opus 1, Number 3, by the English composer William Felton. The "Trumpet Minuet" which Carter performed on the guitar could have been any one of several works by this name found in various English collections. "Water parted from the Sea" and "Infancy," which Carter played on the harmonica and Nancy on the guitar, were popular airs from Thomas Augustine Arne's 1762 opera Artaxerxes. The former was especially well-known, appearing in many printed song collections. It was also often copied into manuscript workbooks, most notably that of the Bolling family of Buckingham County, Virginia. Conceivably Carter could have been compiling his own music book, for Fithian recorded that the Colonel occasionally spent evenings
"transposing," or transcribing, music and that he had copied out "Infancy" for Nancy to memorize and perform. Carter owned a copy of John Frederick Lampe's *A Plain and Compendious Method of Teaching Thorough Bass, After the most Rational Manner* (London, 1737), which explained the rules for easy harmonization of tunes and provided enough background for Carter to undertake simple orchestrations of pieces for different instruments. As Fithian stated, Carter had "made great advances in the Theory, and Practice of music...which seems to be his darling Amusement." Yet Carter was not unaware of the lighter side of the musical world as expressed in the comedies of the English theater. He observed one afternoon to those seated at the dinner table "that many of the most just, & nervous [powerful] sentiments are contain'd in Songs & small Sketches of Poetry; but being attended with Frippery, Folly or Indecency they are many times look'd over." Perhaps Carter remembered some of the lines from *Love in a Village*, a pastiche with words by Isaac Bickerstaffe, a popular English comic librettist. For instance, the air "If Ever I'm Catched" described the hesitancy of a country squire to go to London to risk being captured by Cockneys and displayed as a freak. Although designed to pull laughs from the audience, this song revealed both the nastier side of London life and the provinciality of the English country gentry.

Few of these comic pieces appeared in Carter's music library, which tended to be more scholarly. In the same vein as Doctor Smith's *Harmonics* lay John Holden's *An Essay towards a Rational System of Music* (Glasgow, 1770), "a rare example of a systematic theory of music founded upon the Scottish school of commonsense philosophy." Carter ordered this esoteric work in October 1773, along with Charles Burney's *The Present State*
of Music in France and Italy (London, 1771). Burney had been a protégé both of the composer Arne and of the harpsichord-maker Kirckman. His tour of France and Italy was in preparation for writing a comprehensive history of music which was completed in four volumes in 1789. The Present State was an anecdotal account of the musical events Burney witnessed and the important personages he visited, as was its companion volume The Present State of Music in Germany, the Netherlands, and the United Provinces (London, 1773). Fithian browsed through the latter work in Carter's library, but thought it "more entertaining than really useful."

Fithian preferred the "collection of psalm-Tunes, Hymns, & Anthems set in four parts for the Voice" which Carter imported. The Colonel seemed "much taken with it & says we must learn & perform some of them in their several parts with our voices & with instruments." This book could have been any one of several books of this description published in England prior to 1774, or it may have been a manuscript volume corrected by a musicmaster, similar to the ones Carter received with his organ. In the Sibley Library of the Eastman School of Music is a music book which fits the latter description and has an oral history of ownership by Robert Carter. It contains thirty-six tunes in various meters assigned to specific psalms, followed by a "Te Deum," or hymn of praise. One of the settings, assigned to the 62d Psalm, is written in common meter with its melodic line in the tenor voice, a normal practice at that time. A transcription of this melody in modern notation reads as follows:
This tune, now known as "Windsor" or "Dundee," originally appeared in William Damon's four-part settings of the psalms (1591). However, a variation on this melody, "Coles Hill," appeared in Thomas Smith's compositions on The Psalms of David in Metre. New Translated... By William Barton (1706). Fithian recalled hearing Carter play a hymn tune called "Coles hill" on the fortepiano, which may have been the same tune.

Another melody heard at Nomony Hall was "Bedford," originally composed by William Wheall and published around 1723 in Francis Timbrell's Divine Music Scholar's Guide. Also a common meter tune, it was set to the 84th Psalm, and may well be assigned to that text in the Sibley Library manuscript.

Carter's interest in psalmody at this point in his life probably arose not from any deep spiritual motivation toward an established faith. He was trying to pacify his troubled mind with familiar sounds, including psalm-tunes which he had known since boyhood. Yet church music was changing as well.

In 1696 Nicholas Brady, the royal chaplain, and Nahum Tate, the poet laureate, published with royal approbation a "new version" of the psalter. This new metrical edition was used side by side with the 1562 "old version." Both were reprinted many times in England and America during the eighteenth century. Unfortunately, the introduction of a new psalter did not improve the traditional way of singing which combined an extraordinarily slow pace with no effort to maintain a uniform melodic line. Fithian was painfully aware of the unmusical character of psalming in Anglican and Presbyterian congregations. While travelling through North Carolina in 1775 he recorded how the clerk for the [Opecquan] Society... raises the tune and in the primitive genuine Presbyterian whine and roll, begins his
first note of the musick with a deep strained gutteral from
the last word of the reading, without any intermissions.
This, however, in these societies is universal.79

The clerk continued to bellow out each verse of the psalm, and whoever
in the congregation wished to respond screamed it back at him.

For many years a low literacy rate and lack of pew books among the
congregation hindered efforts to produce better music. Hidebound tradi-
tionalists also resisted attempts to steer away from the loud, ponderous
lining-out of the psalm. The method must have gotten the message of the
text across, or it would not have been so difficult to eradicate. How-
ever, the resulting cacophony of sound has been described as "discordant
heterophony," or bad sound and multiple melodies. 80

Two methods of reforming this noise were attempted, both of them
known to Carter. The first was an increase in the number of works
published which described the correct way to sing the psalms. The collect-
ion of four-part psalm-tunes and "the latest treatise or Instructory
on Psalmody" which Carter ordered soon after his return to Nomony Hall
were both products of this effort. 81 The second method was the introduc-
tion of trained voices, assisted by a singing master, to lead the large-
ly ill-trained and apathetic congregation in the musical elements of
worship. One Sunday in September, Fithian visited Yeocomoco Church, one
of two churches in Westmoreland County's Cople Parish, where he reported:

I was surprised when the Psalm begun, to hear a large Col-
lection of voices singing at the same time, from a Gallery,
entirely contrary to what I have seen befor in the Colony,
for it is seldom in the fullest Congregation's, that more
sing than the Clerk, & about two others! -- I am told that a
singing Master of good abilities has been among this society
lately & put them on the respectable Method which they, at
present pursue. 82

Though Carter's reaction to this church choir was not recorded, undoubtedly
he approved of their efforts to make the old psalm-tunes more harmonious.
Carter's knowledge of religious music was not limited to psalms. The hymns of such dissenting ministers as Isaac Watts and Charles Wesley were also known around Nomony Hall. When Larkin Randall, Carter's clerk, died in 1774, among his meager possessions was found "1 copy of Westly's Hymns," perhaps his *Hymns and Spiritual Songs* (1749). Wesley was also the source for "A Hymn for a dying Believer," or the "Funeral Hymn," which Colonel John Augustine Washington had passed on to Stadler, who in turn shared it with Carter and Fithian:

1st Happy Soul thy Days are ended,
    All thy mourning Days below,
    Go by Angel-Guards attended
    To the Sight of Jesus, go.

2d Waiting to recieve my Spirit,
    Lo thy Saviour stands above,
    Shews the purchase of his merit
    Reaches out the Crown of Love.

3d For the Joy he Sets before thee
    Bear a momentary pain,
    Die to live the Life of Glory
    Suffer, with thy Lord to reign.

Wesley's hymn was not intended to be morbid, but expressed the Methodist belief that perfection was not attainable until man was united through death with Christ. Although Carter's emotional religious experiences were still several years in the future, he considered the "Funeral Hymn" of sufficient interest to transcribe for his daughter Nancy to memorize. At times, perhaps in his self-imposed solitude, the more worldly part of his personality seemed to him either to be dying, or to need to die, so that its demise might bring on a better life.

* * * *

Although Robert Carter was probably the most proficient gentleman musician in his neighborhood, he did not live in a musical vacuum. Fithian's journal and other documents recorded the richness of musical life
on the Northern Neck, yet noted its weak points as well. The tutor pro-
vided an extensive description of one close neighbor, seventeen-year-old
Jenny Washington, daughter of Colonel John Augustine Washington of Bush-
field, which included the following notes:

She has but lately had opportunity of Instruction in Danc-
ing, yet She moves with propriety, when she dances a Minuet & without any Flirts or vulgar Capers, when She dances a Reel or Country-Dance: She plays well on the Harpsichord, & Spinet; understands the principles of Musick, & therefore per-
forms her Tunes in perfect time, a Neglect of which always makes music intolerable, but it is a fault almost universal among young Ladies in the practice; She sings likewise to her instrument, has a strong, full voice, & a well-judging Ear; but most of the Virginia-Girls think it labour quite suffi-
cient to thump the Keys of a Harpsichord into the air of a tune mechanically, & think it would be Slavery to submit to the Drudgery of acquiring Vocal Music.  

Fithian's harshness regarding the musical talents of young Virginia Ladies must be put into perspective, for he was always comparing them to his sweetheart in New Jersey, Elizabeth Beatty, and finding to his sur-
prise that the Virginia girls ran a very close second to Miss Beatty's charms. The thought that his heart might fall to a Virginian frightened Fithian, and he was often purposefully severe in his evaluations of the Ladies he met.

The catalogue of musical girls in the Northern Neck included the daughters of Colonel Philip Ludwell Lee of Stratford, who was also a noted musician and a close acquaintance of Charles Leonard. Lee employed an indentured servant named Charles Love, formerly an instrumentalist with the touring Hallam Company, who in 1757 ran away from Stratford carrying a bassoon by the well-known London maker Schuhart. Upon his death in 1776 Lee's probate inventory listed a surprisingly complete set of woodwinds, including two old flutes valued at one shilling, threepence, one bassoon and two hautboys [oboes] valued at forty shillings,
and two shagreen cases holding bassoon and hautboy reeds worth one shilling. Other branches of the Lee family were also musically represented. Fithian noted that thirteen-year-old Betsy Lee, probably a cousin of the family at Stratford, was "just begining to play the Spinet." The Tayloe family at Mount Airy in Richmond County showed almost as much interest in music as the Lees. On several occasions when Fithian visited that mansion, he found the daughters of Colonel John Tayloe playing "in good Taste" upon the harpsichord.

Tayloe's close neighbor, Colonel Landon Carter of Sabine Hall, Robert's uncle, several times recorded his eccentric antipathy for music and dancing in his diary. In May 1774 he reported that Christian's dancing in his neighborhood had ceased: "Young People may be sorry for it but I think School boys will be the better off for every three weeks is certainly too much time to lose two days at a time." Yet Fithian noted that his granddaughter Betsy "plays the Harpsichord extremely well, better I think than any young Lady I have seen in Virginia."

Betsy was undoubtedly a fine dancer as well. Fithian probably had numerous opportunities to watch her, as people gathered from all over the Northern Neck and beyond to attend a grand ball at one great house or another. These assemblies were, in a sense, larger versions of dancing classes, but much more crowded, vastly more elegant, and without the strictures of the dancing master. Fithian attended two such affairs. The first was a large party held in January at Lee Hall, the home of "Squire" Richard Lee. The tutor had received invitations to attend from both Colonel and Mrs. Carter, but declined on account of his inability to dance. Finally Mrs. Carter succeeded in persuading Fithian to escort her on the second day of the ball. He was overawed by the elegance of the
dinner, the ladies' dresses, and the variety of entertainment available to the guests, including gaming and the singing of "Liberty Songs" in which "six, eight, ten or more would put their Heads together and roar, & for the most part as unharmonious as an affronted [insult ?]." The list of dances performed differed little from those taught in Christian's classes:

About Seven the Ladies & Gentlemen begun to dance in the Ball Room--first Minuets one Round; Second Giggs; third Reels; And last of All Country-Dances; tho' they struck several Marches occasionally-- The Music was a French-Horn and two Violins.

Fithian noted that the wives of two clergymen who were present joined in the dancing, but that the clerics did not dance or game. Everything seemed to be going well until Fithian's self-esteem was struck at one of its weakest points. He told the story thus: "I was solicited to dance by several.... But George Lee [from Mount Pleasant, a young cousin of the host], with great Rudeness as tho' half drunk, asked me why I would come to the Ball & neither dance nor play Cards?" Rather than confessing that he did not know how to dance and his religious principles would not allow him to game, Fithian hotly retorted "that my Invitation to the Ball would Justify my Presence; & that he was ill qualified to direct my Behaviour who made so indifferent a Figure himself." The rest of the evening passed without incident and Fithian and Mrs. Carter left around eleven. Colonel Carter did not attend any part of the four-day event, though a number of his older children went.

The other large party Fithian attended was in August, following the Rappahannock boat-races on the river before Hobb's Hole, now called Tappahannock. Fithian's description of the ball was lengthy. He noted many personal details about the dancers--details which many other people at
the assembly would also have noticed, thus making this type of affair an important forum for social communication and commentary. Fithian saw all of the following:

The Ball Room—25 Ladies—40 Gentlemen—The Room very long, well-finished, airy & cool, & well-seated—two Fidlers—Mr. [Archibald] Ritche [a prominent local merchant] stalk'd about the Room. He was Director [of the ball] & appointed a sturdy two fisted Gentleman to open the Ball with Mrs Tayloe—He danced midling tho'. There were about six or eight married Ladies—At last Miss Ritche danced a Minuet with [blank]—She is a tall slim Girl, dances nimble & graceful—She was Ben Carters partner—Poor Girl She has had the third Day Ague for twelve months past, and has it yet She appeared in a blue Silk Gown; her Hair was done up neat, without powder, it is very Black & Set her to good Advantage—. Soon after he danced Miss Polly Edmundson—A Short pretty Stump of a Girl; She danced well, sung a Song with great applause, seemed to enter into the Spirit of the entertainment—A young Spark seemed to be fond of her; She seemed to be fond of him; they were both fond, & the Company saw it—He was Mr Ritche's Clerk, a limber, well dress'd, pretty-handsome Chap he was—The insinuating Rogue waited on her home, in close Hugg too, the Moment he left the Ball-Room—Miss Aphia Fantleroy [one of Christian's scholars] danced next, the best Dancer of the whole absolutely—And the finest Girl—Her head tho' was powdered white as Snow, & crap'd in the newest Taste—She is the Copy of the goddess of Modesty—Very handsome; she seemed to be loved by all her Acquaintances, and admir'd by every Stranger, Miss McCall—Miss Ford—Miss Brokenberry—Ball—Two of the younger Miss Ritche's—Miss Wade—They danced till half after two.95

* * *

By August it was almost time for Fithian to leave Nomony Hall and return to New Jersey. A junior classmate of his at Princeton, John Peck, agreed to succeed him, whom Fithian advised that "any young Gentleman travelling through [this] Colony...is presum'd to be acquainted with Dancing, Boxing, playing the Fiddle, & Small-Sword, & Cards."96 Peck arrived, and Fithian left Nomony Hall on October 20, 1774. Fifty-one weeks later, when the colonies were tensely fighting Britain with embargoes and associations before open war broke out, Fithian in a letter gently chided his former charge Nancy Carter:
No Dances, and but little music! You will begin to ask what is the world coming to?— No Tea, nor Gause, nor Paris-net, nor lawn, nor lace, nor Silks, nor Chintzes; Good Sirs—Good Sirs!— Well Nancy, in these hard times, I must want stocks, and you must want Caps— But you look best, when I recollect, in your Hair; you look ten thousand thousand times over the best without any Cap at all, so that in spight of me I shall be outdone. I want to know how you and the Guitar agree yet—

After Fithian's departure, musical life at Nomony Hall went on much the same. In December 1774 the organ in Williamsburg was packed into large deal cases and brought to Nomony Hall. While it was being reassembled, Carter took measurements of its windchest and noted them in his daybook, along with a detailed description of a common flute, or recorder, though he never mentioned owning or playing such an instrument. Less than a year later Carter's blacksmith forged a handle and a crank for the chamber organ, presumably replacements for lost articles.

Carter purchased fiddle strings in May 1775 from Dixon and Hunter, publishers of the Virginia Gazette in Williamsburg. In experimenting with these or other wires he noted that if two wires of equal dimensions, one rusty and the other clean, were set at equal lengths and tensions, then the rusty wire sounded sharper than the clean one. If the Colonel's experiment had any practical significance, he did not record it.

Christian and Stadler continued to attend the Carter children at Nomony Hall. Priscilla continued as Stadler's pupil for several years while three more Carter children—John Tasker, Frances and Betty Landon—were added to Christian's roster, even though he raised his fee from £5 to £6 per scholar.

Things seemed to proceed normally at Nomony Hall. Mrs. Carter gave birth twice in the years just after Fithian left. In 1775 a daughter named Judith lived barely a week; in 1777 a son George was born. Ben's health, always delicate, continued to decline, and Carter himself was
subject to illnesses and fits of fainting. Zwelling has pointed out that these periods of poor health, though real, may have been partially due to increasing family tensions, particularly since the war with Britain tended to isolate Nomony Hall and its inhabitants even more. 104

On June 12, 1777, while recovering from a smallpox inoculation, the feverish Carter received a "most gracious Illumination" from God, which was a major turning point in his life. 105 Yet when Carter found the key to the salvation of his soul, he renounced any secular application of the art which had been his "darling Amusement"—his music. The change was not immediate, but in the end it was unequivocal.
CHAPTER IV
"NO REVELING IN THE NEW JERUSALEM," 1778-90

When Robert Carter aligned himself with the Baptist faith fifteen months after his overwhelming religious experience, he joined a sect notorious for its belief that secular music and dancing were antithetical to a Christian way of life. Claiming no other source for their dogma than the Bible, the Baptists governed their lifestyles by a strict set of moral and social precepts, many of them unwritten but enforced by the authority of the congregation. The chief mode of discipline was excommunication, including denial of the sacrament of the "Lord's Supper," or communion.

The Baptists found the majority of converts among the lower classes, including slaves. Most upper-class whites viewed this evangelistic group with varying degrees of distrust. Landon Carter recorded in his diary that one of his overseers "had just been made a Christian by dipping [a Baptist trademark], and would not continue in my business but to convert my people [slaves]."¹ Such proselytizing frightened some whites who feared that their slaves would mistake the call to spiritual truth and freedom as a battle cry to actual rebellion. The Established Church belittled the new religion from the pulpit, calling it "whimsical Fancies or at most Religion grown to Wildness & Enthusiasm."² Sometimes unbelievers retaliated violently by breaking up Baptist meetings.³ More often, however, Virginia planters viewed the Baptists as a temporary annoyance
and ignored their calls for "ardent Pray'r; strong & constant faith, & an intire Banishment of Gaming, Dancing, & Sabbath-Day Diversions."  

The Baptists' aversion toward secular music sprang from their seventeenth-century theories of worship, which demanded total spontaneity. Set forms such as hymns, anthems, chants, even congregational psalms, smacked of "papist" ritual. Solo performances were occasionally used for the edification of the congregation, but were always unaccompanied, since "worship by machinery" was completely disdained. In England hymn-singing was not common among Baptists until the 1770s, after the Wesleyan revival had proven the hymn form to be an effective conveyer of religious emotion.  

American Baptists took up the singing of hymns more readily than their English counterparts. In 1742, when Baptists in Philadelphia adopted a Confession of Faith originally published by English Baptists at Westminster in 1689, they added an article which drew on scriptural passages to show that

singing the praises of God, is a holy Ordinance of Christ, and not a part of natural [man-made] religion, or a moral duty only; but that it is brought under divine institution, it being enjoined on the churches of Christ to sing psalms, hymns and spiritual songs; and that the whole church in their public assemblies, as well as private christians, ought to...sing God's praises according to the best light they have received.  

This published confession with its additional articles found widespread acceptance among Virginia Baptists. "A declaration of Faith and Practice" for Morattico Baptist Church, where Carter eventually became a member, included an article affirming the role of sacred music in worship. This article, the last of twelve in the declaration, was copied into the opening pages of the congregation's first minutebook, and stood beside iterations of such basic Baptist dogmas as the infallibility of Scripture and the resurrection of the dead. It read: "We also believe
that singing of Psalms, Hymns, and spiritual Songs vocally, is an ordinance of the Gospel to be performed by Believers; and that every one ought to be left to their liberty in using it." The last phrase was included for the mollification of the Separate Baptists, the more conservative branch of the denomination then active in Virginia. The Separates, in contrast to the Regular Baptists, refused to be strictly bound by any document except the Scriptures, and in 1783 accepted the 1742 Philadelphia Confession only with a proviso denying its absolute authority. For many years, the Separates and their descendants hesitated to reformulate their ideas concerning the use of non-spontaneous music in worship. Nevertheless, the 1742 Confession, with its article on the singing of psalms and hymns, became the basis of a union of Separate and Regular Baptists in Virginia in 1787.

The presence of spiritually-oriented music in the worship of Virginia Baptists as well as in their secular lives was recorded on numerous occasions. Robert Boyle C. Howell, an early Baptist historian, gave the following pattern of eighteenth-century worship services:

Seating themselves as they arrived, [the worshipers] invariably occupied the time until the services commenced in singing the songs of Zion.... These songs were numerous; not always composed in the highest style of poetry, but invariably eminently devotional; they generally had choruses attached; the tunes were for the most part easy and somewhat rapid; they were readily committed to memory; and the whole congregation joined in them most heartily; so that often when the minister arose to speak the whole assembly was all glowing with the warmest feelings of devotion, and eminently prepared to hear with benefit his heavenly message.

Henry Toler, a Baptist minister who benefited greatly by Carter's largesse, reported that he and his twenty-three companions sang themselves hoarse along the road to the 1783 Baptist convention which adopted the Philadelphia Confession. Elsewhere, Toler recalled group singing at
public worship services, including funerals, and at prayer services in private homes. Carter mentioned the singing of hymns at a funeral service led by Lewis Lunsford, founder and minister of the Morattico Church. He also related that "at our late public meetings Private members [laymen] gave out and sang hymns and spiritual songs," while exhorting non-members to examine their lives for signs of redemption and make some signal of resolution to serve God. The method of "giving out" or lining a hymn or song was not dissimilar to the method used by the Established Church's parish clerk in leading the congregational psalm. The leader sang each phrase of the hymn and waited for the people to echo it before proceeding. Since illiteracy and poverty were not uncommon traits among Baptist adherents, this method proved more effective than the use of individual songbooks. Widespread use of hymnals also evoked images of "papist" psalters and other liturgical devices which Baptists abhorred.

Although Baptists claimed to take their musical cues solely from the Bible, following the examples of both patriarchs and apostles, they also realized that group singing was an effective vehicle for provoking and directing the emotional catharsis necessary for a spiritual "experience." The use of hymns at the time of exhortation, as Carter described, was a means of maximizing the tensions created in the listeners by a fiery sermon. The effectiveness of spiritually-oriented music was not slight. Toler noted on several occasions the "effect" that songs and prayer had on his congregations.

The most spectacular incident of this nature to be found among Carter's papers occurred in April 1778, several months before Carter joined the Morattico congregation. In his daybook he noted:
Negro Sarah attended divine Worship here.... In the after­noon of this day Sarah went to Teaner's [Tina's] House. They began to sing Watt's Hymn xcviit-Book 2. Sarah began to shake before they got through the 1[st] Verse so that she was carried upon a Bed--& when laying down she desired Teaner to give out the LXii Hymn same Book-- Sarah continued quaking the greatest part of this Night.

The hymns which provoked this notable occurrence were found in Isaac Watts's Hymns and Spiritual Songs. Sarah's quaking began while she sang:

My heart, how dreadful hard it is!  
How heavy here it lyes;  
Heavy and cold within my breast,  
Just like a rock of ice!

Overwrought by her fear of dying in such an unrepentant state, she sought comfort in a hymn which offered hope of salvation to the sinner:

Hark! from the tombs a doleful sound,  
My ears attend the cry,  
"Ye living men, come view the ground,  
"Where you must shortly lye.

"Princes, this clay must be your bed,  
"In spite of all your tow'rs!  
"The tall, the wise, the rev'rend head,  
"Must lye as low as ours."

Great God! is this our certain doom?  
And are we still secure?  
Still walking downward to our tomb,  
And yet prepare no more?

Grant us the pow'r of quick'ning grace,  
To fit our souls to fly;  
Then, when we drop this dying flesh,  
We'll rise above the sky.

Ever since its first publication in 1707 Watts's Hymns and Spiritual Songs had found widespread use among dissenting sects. By 1784 it had gone through seventy-nine British and forty-eight American editions, often published and bound with the author's metrical versions of the Psalms. Carter's contact with these works began in December 1777, when he borrowed the hymns from a local lawyer, who later converted the loan to a gift. Over the next six years, Carter attempted to buy copies of
Watts's hymnal in Williamsburg, Annapolis, Baltimore and Philadelphia. Some of these requests were obviously reorders for goods not shipped, but Carter received at least six copies, probably for distribution to friends and family.\(^\text{18}\)

Watts's hymns were reedited and expanded in the late 1780s by John Rippon, a London Baptist minister, who published his own contributions to Watts's hymnal as a Selection of Hymns, intended for use as an appendix to the older volume.\(^\text{19}\) Carter ordered thirty-nine of these Selections, in bindings of varying quality, from Rippon in 1788, and sold most of them in 1790 to members of his congregation.\(^\text{20}\)

Carter was also probably familiar with the volume Hymns and Spiritual Songs Collected from the Works of Several Authors; In Three Books; I On Baptism; II On the Lord's Supper; III On Various Occasions, published by William Rind in Williamsburg in 1773.\(^\text{21}\) Apparently Rind took his work from a volume with an identical title published in Newport, Rhode Island, seven years earlier. In addition to introducing hymns by English Baptist composers, the compiler of this first American Baptist hymnal also reprinted large segments of Watts's Hymns and Spiritual Songs, including the author's notes and comments at the head of each hymn.\(^\text{22}\)

Hymns for the Baptist faith were being written as well as published in Virginia. John Leland, a minister who arrived from Massachusetts in 1775, wrote at least ten hymns, some of which were probably known to Carter, his friend and correspondent.\(^\text{23}\) Two of Leland's pieces appeared in a publication of hymns by Eleazar Clay, published in Richmond in 1793. This volume also included numerous songs from Watts's and Rippon's works.\(^\text{24}\)

In 1790 Leland estimated that in Virginia there were 18,000 Baptists organized in 202 churches.\(^\text{25}\) After temporarily resolving their sectarian differences, the Baptists were powerful enough to play an important role
in the campaign for disestablishing the Episcopal Church in the late 1780s. Having thus secured their foothold on the mortal world, they were ready to begin their march to heaven, singing as they went:

And that above we may be sure,  
When we come there, our part to know:  
Whilst we live here, at home and church,  
We'll practice singing oft below.  

* * *

According to many Baptists, mankind was put on earth not to dance, but to mourn for its lost innocence. Baptist prohibitions against dancing lasted much longer and were enforced more rigidly than any of their restrictions on vocal or instrumental music. In fact, disapproval of dancing runs strong in some Baptist congregations today.

The reasons given for this attitude were many. Baptist writers claimed that dancing was not healthy for the body or the mind since it offered no room for spiritual growth, and that devotees often became overly fond of the pastime to the detriment of their souls. Underlying these feelings was the belief that somehow the bodily gyrations and close physical contact in dancing would lead to more immoral conduct.

The congregation at Morattico took this threat quite seriously. Members such as Dorcas Gates, who ignored the counsel of her fellow Christians to desist from her unholy activities, found themselves excommunicated for "frequenting Dances & Disorderly Conduct."  

As Carter became more deeply involved with the Baptists, he too became convinced that the minuets and the country dances which he had indulged in were sinful acts. He outlined his new beliefs in a letter to Francis Christian written in June 1779:
My Daughters Betty L. Carter & Harriot Carter your former Scholars are not to attend you any longer— I myself and Wife are of opinion that Dancing is not a Christian qualification; that if there be no Evils in the act of dancing it is often productive of a Revel—and it is admitted by every denomination of Christians that there is no Revealing in the New Jerusalem.... If Mr. Christian should ever view Dancing with the Eye—I myself behold it—he will then see the propriety of this caution.

Carter realized that he was reversing himself completely by abhorring an activity which he had previously practiced and had encouraged his family and neighbors to enjoy. He ascribed this change to his conversion. He had exchanged his civil robes for the garb of the spiritual man. He tried to explain this attitude to Christian:

Perhaps you yourself and many may say that the notion mentioned above is trifling, for that the calling which is now censured is not contrary to the Law of this Commonwealth, and that you and many support their families thereby. I believe it would not be difficult to prove that in every civil Government customs are permitted which are in themselves sinful—hence then different denominations of Men acting by civil Permission must not infer that all their Vocations are allowable under the Authority of Gods written word.... The Cautioner submits such Convictions to his Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ—saying may his will be done.

Christian did not disappear immediately—there was still the bill to settle. Three months later Carter revealed that Bob, who had occasionally refused to attend dancing lessons in earlier years, now could not be persuaded to stop. Therefore Carter referred Christian to his son for payment of his portion of the account, "he entering himself your Scholar and not my Wife." Carter had detached himself completely from sinful dancing.

* * * *

Following the dancing master's dismissal Carter's severest reaction to secular music was his determined effort to divest himself of his entire collection of musical instruments. Between 1778 and 1789 every instrument
in his collection was offered for sale except the harmonica, and it had fallen into disuse.

His decision to abandon his secular musical activities revolved around his admission to the Baptist faith in September 1778. Baptists objected to the use of musical instruments not only in the church but in the home, because secular music, including all instrumental compositions and most non-spiritual songs, was easily put to "Carnal and Idolatrous purposes." The fact that such music was especially enjoyed and practiced by the Virginia gentry, who were also the backbone of the "decadent" Established Church, only served to confirm the dissenters' suspicions. The Baptists' aversion to secular music was not reversed in Carter's lifetime. In fact, warnings against the use of instruments in worship and at home continued to be issued by Baptist leaders until the second quarter of the nineteenth century. Adherence to this ban was expected of every believer, and Carter began to comply immediately after his admission to the Morattico congregation.

As late as July 1778 Carter showed no inclination to give up his musical practice. When a local doctor wished to examine Charles Burney's three volumes on the state of music in Europe, Carter lent them without comment. When Thomas Jefferson, who himself was building an impressive instrument collection, offered to buy Carter's chamber organ, the Colonel declined to sell:

You are pleased to Say that the practical part of musick afforded you much Entertainment and that you wanted an Organ. I have two daughters, who practice upon keyed instruments; their music Master did enter into the continental Service, who lately resigned his commission-- The Girls and Mrs. Carter are in expectation of Mr. Victors returning to his former calling.

John Victor, a Prussian officer in a Continental cavalry unit, had succeeded John Stadler as musicmaster to the Carter children after 1776,
when Stadler was called into service as a military engineer. Although Victor resided in Port Royal after leaving the army, his teaching circuit included Nomony, Fredericksburg, and Alexandria.

Carter's letter to Jefferson gave no hint of dissatisfaction with Victor's service as musicmaster, nor did it degrade the role of secular music in his family's life. Less than six months later, however, only three months after Carter's baptism, he sold his Kirckman harpsichord to the widow of Philip Ludwell Lee at Stratford. This instrument, which had formed the nucleus of Carter's collection, was exchanged for five hogsheads of tobacco. In reply to Mrs. Lee's request to inclose all music purchased with the instrument, Carter said he had received none. By this time the music room at Nomony Hall had fallen silent.

In 1785 Carter sought to reclaim a sum of money he had deposited in 1772 with Henry Hill, a Philadelphia wine merchant, to procure "Earthen Bowls" for his harmonica. This 1772 request had been a continuation of Carter's experiments substituting ceramic bowls for the harmonica's glass ones. Through Hill, Carter may have been in contact with the firm of Bonnin and Morris, the first American porcelain manufactory, which was in production in Philadelphia in the early 1770s. No earthen bowls ever came; by the mid-1780s Carter was bedeviled by a constant shortage of cash and called in all money due to him, no matter how small the sum.

Carter sought buyers for his musical instruments throughout Virginia and Maryland. In 1786 he instructed his clerk George Randell to enquire in Baltimore how much would be given for his German flutes and "a fine Stainer fiddle." The name Carter attached to the violin indicated that it was modeled on the work of Jacob Stainer, the celebrated seventeenth-century German violin maker.
The fiddle was finally sold for 1500 pounds of tobacco to Landon Carter, Junior, of Sabine Hall, grandson of Robert Carter III's uncle Landon. Robert did not let the instrument go without expressing a hope for its new owner's satisfaction: "I deliver to your Servant my Violin. I could have been glad that you would have come to this place and tried it before you became a purchaser—but as you have sent, I will not disappoint you."\(^{43}\)

Although Victor's hopes to continue as music instructor in the Carter household were dashed by the Colonel's conversion, Carter found the music-master a useful liaison between himself and potential buyers of his instruments. In November 1787 Carter told Victor he would part with his fortepiano for 12 guineas or his "Griffin" organ for 50 guineas, both prices exclusive of charges for packing and freight. As an incentive Victor was offered five guineas commission if he sold the organ and two guineas if he was successful with the fortepiano.\(^{44}\) The attribution of the organ to Griffin was probably due to the absence of the maker's name on the instrument itself, and Carter's misplacement of his correspondence with the Simpson firm from whom it was purchased. However, the organ builder's name was not the only detail he was to forget.

A year later Carter asked Victor to oversee the repair and disposition of more instruments:

There is no person in this Neighbourhood who I think can repair musical instruments. Therefore I beg the favor of you to receive one belonging to me, and employ some person to repair the same. And whatever you may think reasonable I will pay it—and after the Guittar is rendered serviceable you will be pleased to recommend it as far as it deserves and Sell the same for whatever you may think it worth.

I take the Liberty also to deliver to you one Concert German Flute, having 3 Middle pieces and mounted with Silver, which you will dispose of if any purchaser should apply to you— I have no remembrance of the price, for I
imported that with several other flutes and the shop Note is now Mislaid— However I would agree to take 2 Guineas— but if I should meet with the Shop Notes I will then inform you of the price.45

From his other correspondence and from surviving documents it is evident that Carter was a stickler for preserving and organizing his business papers. Thus, it was unusual for him to misplace a receipt such as a London shop note. This flute, imported with the organ from Simpson in 1771, was an elaborate example with three corps de rechange, or center pieces. Each corps was a different length, which altered the instrument's pitch and allowed the performer to easily adjust to the key or pitch of his accompanying players. Nevertheless, Carter lacked the information necessary to insure that he recovered his full investment on the piece.

The fortepiano was not sold, though Victor examined it for Colonel Francis Lightfoot Lee of Menokin, and reported that

it is well worth 10 guineas— There is a...1/2 sett of strings now upon the instrument— also a Sett of H[arpsichor]d Strings & one stand— these to be included— But Mr. Carter informs me he is not to be chargeable... with any repairs that may be made to the F- Piano.46

On the same day Carter delivered to Victor "brass strings for the forte piano."47 Given Carter's continuing interest in Doctor Smith's Harmonics, the pianoforte was probably half-strung so that each hammer struck only one wire, as Smith recommended, rather than the usual two. Whether Carter had further overhauled the pianoforte in experimenting with variable pitch, as Smith had done with the harpsichord, Victor did not say. However, Carter's insistence that he would not pay for repairs could have meant that he was afraid the instrument was not readily playable, perhaps as a result of his tinkering. Lee may have feared the same thing, since he did not purchase the instrument.
There was no shortage of would-be buyers for Carter's chamber organ. After Jefferson expressed his interest in the instrument in 1778, Carter was approached in 1786 by his own cousin, Sarah Nicholas Norton, wife of the prominent Winchester merchant John Hatley Norton. She wrote Carter that her "fondness for keyed Musical Instruments Continues so as to be a performer now," and that three of her daughters "are Musically inclined and they do play." Carter responded: "It is almost 9 years Since I practised--and then I discovered no fault in my Organ-- It has been occasionally opened and played on during that time yea very lately, and I know of no defect therein." The price he asked for the instrument was 60 guineas, excluding packing and freight. Carter had conveniently forgotten his earlier complaints to his London agent about the poor quality of wood used in the organ, which left it "Very defective." However, no bargain was struck with Mrs. Norton, who lived barely a year after receiving her cousin's letter.

Soon afterward Carter reached his first agreement with Victor concerning the sale of his organ and fortepiano. Several months passed without results. In December 1787 Victor informed Carter that Captain William Augustine Washington would give his bond for fifty guineas, the selling price of the organ, to be paid on January 1, 1789. Carter agreed that it would be delivered upon execution of the bond. In April 1788 Carter wrote Captain Washington's cousin Bushrod concerning the delivery of the instrument:

The Organ is not movable as it now stands, and, if I remem-ber, the Pipes alone were packed in two Cases--The doors, Top peice and sundry movable boards in a 3d Case-- the Bellows and Lower part containing keys &c was packed in a large Chest, and I cannot agree to deliver unless the parts are separated, and carefully packed, partly in the manner as mentioned above.
Though Carter had not used the organ regularly in more than nine years, and apparently agreed with his Baptist companions that secular music was a worldly vice, he was concerned that the instrument would be well cared for, and that its new owner would be satisfied with his purchase. These were precisely the reasons why he wanted Landon Carter, Jr., to try out his violin before purchasing it. Although Carter was not a practitioner of secular music at this point, he was also not an iconoclast, destroying the vestiges of his musical past, nor was he neglectful of the intrinsic value of the instruments he still possessed.

Two days after Carter's response to Bushrod Washington, the Colonel received a letter from Captain Washington's mother, Ann, who requested that the organ be carried to her residence at Bushfield aboard the large flatboat she provided. Carter patiently replied that the instrument was not movable as one piece, but must be disassembled and packed. The organ was left untouched for several months, the only mention of it being Carter's instruction in September to William A. Washington to pay John Victor his five-guinea commission, deducting it from his bond.

At the end of March 1789, after the Northern Neck and its Potomac tributaries had thawed, plans were finalized to move the chamber organ by water. Victor arrived at Nomony Hall on March 29; Carter noted that "under his direction & inspection we have taken down the pipes & Carcass of the Organ, and are packing." Carter made arrangements for his schooner to pick up the boxes at Nomony after loading some furniture which was to be carried from the Washington home at Blenheim to Bushfield. On April 19, Carter drew up an account with William A. Washington for his expenses in moving the organ. The three crates required for safe transport were constructed from 250 feet of planking and 400 nails. The total
cost of packing and hauling the instrument was £ 2- 2-10. The next day Carter gave the captain of his schooner the following direction: "I expect you will receive 3 Cases marked No 1-2-3. They contain an Organ, which Cases you will Land in the Storehouses where Mrs. Hannah Washington's goods are Stored and you will advise Capt. Wm. Washington thereof."

Carter had finished his dispersal of the finest musical instrument collection in eighteenth-century Virginia.

* * *

Robert Carter never expressed any regret over his decision to part with his musical instruments, though in light of his later renewed interests in secular music such an emotion would have been understandable. Even before the violin and the chamber organ left his possession, Carter discovered the religious writings of Baron Emanuel Swedenborg, a Swedish noble and mystic. These writings, and the theology built on them, eventually provided a new forum for Carter's musical activities in Baltimore and allowed him to synthesize a new relationship between secular and sacred music.

By 1790 Carter's ties with the Baptist faith were weak, and his denial of the virtues of secular music had already been partially revoked. His mentions of the art were few but positive. Once again he and his family began to take pleasure in music, though their practice was always tempered by the belief that sonatas and songs were useful exercises only as long as they did not deter the soul from its holier goals. Nevertheless, the groundwork was laid for the restoration of secular music to a position of moderate esteem in the Carter household. On a November day in 1790 when the Colonel expected a visit from his son-in-law John James
Maud, he wrote: "I have laid out a German flute containing five pieces, also Handels Opera [Works] for the Flute in two volumes, which I hope will afford you some entertainment."
CHAPTER V

"I WILL SING WITH THE SPIRIT," 1791-1804

Early in January 1788 Robert Carter made a large marginal note in his Journal: "SWEDENBORG." He explained that he had been introduced to the works of Baron Emanuel Swedenborg by one of his Philadelphia correspondents. Carter was fascinated by the Swedish mystic's writings and launched a drive to gain information and contacts among his followers.

Swedenborg, born in 1688 to a noble Swedish family, began his career as an author of scientific treatises. In 1744, however, the Baron experienced an illumination in which he claimed to communicate directly with God and the world of spirits. He reported periodic visions from that time until his death in 1772. The information and insights he derived from these visions were written down in Latin in a series of monographs. These works became a second body of scripture for the Baron's disciples, who constituted the Church of the New Jerusalem.

Swedenborg's theology was outlined in the liturgical confession of faith published by the New Jerusalem Church. Like all major branches of the Christian faith, the Swedenborgians rejected evil actions in favor of good deeds which were prompted by and pleased God. They believed in the authority of the Bible, but supplemented it with Swedenborg's writings, which claimed to reveal correspondences between the physical events described in the Scriptures and various celestial and spiritual truths. Unlike most Christians, Swedenborgians affirmed that God was a united deity and denied the existence of any form of Trinity. Therefore, they
did not believe that Jesus Christ was the Son of God, but God himself who came to save the human race. The Baron's most unorthodox teaching was that the Last Judgment foretold in the Revelation of St. John had taken place on June 19, 1770. The Second Coming of Christ which was supposed to occur at the same time had not been a physical visit, but a spiritual one. Because the Church now operated under this new dispensation, death was not an end to life, but merely a transcendence to the higher plane of the spiritual world.  

Swedenborg's teachings were adopted by small groups of English people centered in London and Manchester in the late 1770s and early 1780s. One of the leaders of the London group was a printer, Robert Hindmarsh, who undertook to publish on a large scale English translations of Swedenborg's writings. His first volumes were printed in 1784 for a group of worshipers he had organized the previous year. By 1790 over twenty volumes had been published, and Hindmarsh used them to send the Baron's words across the Atlantic. Readers of Swedenborg appeared in Philadelphia, Boston, Baltimore, and other places.

Early in 1791 Carter received a shipment of books from Hindmarsh which included nearly all of the available translations of Swedenborg's works. Near the top of the shipping list were four volumes of the Arcana Coelestia: or Heavenly Mysteries contained in the Sacred Scriptures..., which Hindmarsh had begun to publish in 1784. This work was a verse-by-verse analysis of the Bible, in which Swedenborg, enlightened by his visions, explained the celestial and spiritual senses which corresponded with the physical details recorded in the Scriptures.

When Carter perused this volume he probably noticed Swedenborg's use of music and musical instruments as correspondences for spiritual and
celestial truths. These relationships were most fully expounded in several paragraphs analyzing Genesis 4:21: "And his brother's name was Jubal; he was the father of such as play upon the harp and the organ." As throughout the Arcana, Swedenborg believed the verse had many interpretations besides the literal one. "[For] this is the Word of the Lord," he said, "and...it would be destitute of life, if nothing more were implied than that Jubal was the father of such as play upon the harp and the organ; for to know this merely would be useless."^5

The Baron believed that each musical instrument represented a different spiritual or celestial virtue. Similar instruments, such as all stringed instruments, represented similar virtues. Harps, therefore, being stringed instruments, signified "spiritual truth," while the organ, which is more akin to a wind instrument, denoted "spiritual good."^6 Swedenborg saw nothing odd in drawing these analogies, for he felt it was exactly these truths which God intended to be found in the Scriptures. After citing a long list of musical instruments appearing in the Bible, he said, "Let no one believe that so many different instruments would have been here mentioned, unless each had a distinct signification."^7

If Carter got lost in the complexities of "spiritual good" and "spiritual truth," perhaps he more easily appreciated Swedenborg's explanation of the use of music in worshiping God. The mystic wrote: "The cause of [music] is that all celestial joy produces gladness of heart, testified by the singing, and afterwards by the stringed instruments, which at the same time exalted and imitated the singing." Therefore, accompanied songs resulted from a union of celestial joy which stirred the heart, and spiritual joy which moved the voice and the strings.\(^8\)
While Baptists viewed secular music as the work of the Devil, Swedenborg believed that music and most other sensual pleasures derived their delight from God. "The sweetness of music and singing," he explained, was only an external manifestation of internal affections, which "all derive their delight from the good and the true, and the good and the true derive theirs from charity and faith, and these come from the Lord, consequently from the very essential Life." He completely rejected asceticism as a denial of the pleasures God provided for mankind. Carter must have read this as a declaration of freedom from the restrictions he had imposed on himself for the previous twelve years.

Worshipers in the New Jerusalem Church lost few opportunities to raise their voices in praising God. Alexander Dickie Galt, a medical student from Williamsburg, visited the Church's London chapel, where he reported, "The prayers and hymns were sublime." In worship meetings with the small Swedenborgian congregation in Baltimore, Carter frequently noted the inclusion of hymns of praise. Occasionally he led the song, drawing from the stanzas of the Reverend Mr. Joseph Proud.

Proud's hymns accompanied the third edition of the liturgy of the New Church, published in London in 1790. The author was a former Baptist minister who joined the Swedenborgians in 1788. His collection of hymns, which numbered over three hundred, was written in under three months and was designed to satisfy the worship needs of the London congregation. In his introduction to the hymns contained in the liturgy, Proud explained that few of the hymns written by evangelical writers such as Watts and Rippon were appropriate for use by the New Church, since they emphasized their belief in the Trinity and abounded with petitions and prayers unworthy for public singing. The minister noted that Swedenborg had
called his followers to partake of the Sacraments with "much diligence and attention." Proud asked that congregational hymns and songs be accorded the same treatment in the New Church. In addition to being an important part of divine worship, Proud hoped his hymns would entertain the reader, relieve anxiety in hours of temptation and prove an instructive volume for children and servants.

The hymnal of the New Church had a format similar to Watts's Hymns and Spiritual Songs and the 1764 Baptist hymnal of the same title. The stanzas were organized topically according to their use in the worship service or their doctrinal theme. Each hymn was headed by a note giving a description of its content or related scriptural passage. The English Swedenborgians highly approved of Proud's efforts, and a convention of the New Jerusalem Church held in April 1790 enthusiastically recommended the use of the liturgy and hymnal.

Carter received two copies of the liturgy and hymnal in his 1791 shipment of publications from Hindmarsh. He quickly shared the volume with his Swedenborgian friends in Baltimore and beyond. To Francis Bailey, a Philadelphia printer and reader of Swedenborg, he wrote:

I now inform you that a few of the writings of Baron E- S- are here [in Baltimore]; that 7 Persons in town are attentive Readers of said Books, all of whom admire the Doctrines as taught therein-- I have communicated to these new acquaintances a Liturgy recommended to be used by the N- J- Church, containing also a number of Hymns.... The wish of the People mentioned above be that the said Liturgy & Hymns be Reprinted in America-- I desire to know your opinion touching their Request-- If it may be done consistently--I will take 50 Copies thereof-- If an American addition [sic] be advisable I apprehend that a Preface thereto be proper--also, some few alterations.

The changes Carter wished to make were substitutions of American governmental titles for their English counterparts in the prayers requesting God's blessings on the secular government. Before Bailey had a
chance to reply, however, Carter had gone home to Nomony Hall, and was being petitioned by the Baltimore Swedenborgians to contribute money towards publishing the liturgy and hymnal in Maryland. Christian Kramer, who spearheaded this drive, wrote Carter late in 1791: "Here are two young Gentlemen, Samuel & John Adams, Brethren, that are reading the Works of E. Swedenborg who have a Printing-Office, and offer to print one thousand Copies of the [liturgy and hymnal] at their own Expence." Kramer amended their offer with the suggestion that Carter underwrite the full costs of the enterprise and donate the profits to Hindmarsh's London Society. He went on to say that the brothers were somewhat short of cash at that time. However, if Carter would advance money for the paper and a copy of the book to be reproduced, "they will begin it immediately, and finish it with all Dispatch."16

The Adams brothers were sons of a Wilmington, Delaware, printer who had set up a subsidiary press in Baltimore in 1789. They advertised that their operation was large enough to do "Book-work," and to prove it they produced several volumes of sermons, memoirs and other works.17 Undoubtedly they were qualified to print the hymnal and liturgy without difficulty. Nevertheless, Carter did not feel he was free to respond until he had heard from Bailey.18

The reply from the Philadelphia printer soon came to hand, in which Bailey commented: "I shall be equally well pleased to see an edition from a Press at Baltimore, as from my own, and your generous Subscription for 50 Copies may be an incentive to the Printers there to undertake the publication." Regarding Carter's proposal for a preface to the American edition, Bailey replied that it would be best if it came from Carter's own hand.19
Early in March 1792 Carter sent a copy of the hymnal and liturgy to Kramer with an order to call on one of his merchant friends, George Presstman, for the quantity of paper needed for one thousand copies. Among the instructions Carter included:

At the head of each Hymn & Doxology [place] initial Letters expressive of the different metres & where the poetry is accommodated to neither Long short nor common metre Note the syllables of such in each Line & refer to melody to Psalms of the like metres. This copy has no Table to find out any Hymn by the 1st line of it. I propose such a Table be added & that there be a certain Character set at each Line to represent each measure of the poetry.20

As Carter requested, the meter of each hymn was set above the verses. Most of them fell into one of three rhythmic patterns: common meter (syllables per line: 8.6.8.6), long meter (8.8.8.8), or short meter (6.6.8.6). The majority of contemporary hymn tunes fit one of these patterns and could be used with any text whose rhythm matched.

"Particular" hymns which did not match any of these basic meters were probably associated with a specific melody. Several of these designated tunes were mentioned by name. "The God of Abraham's Praise," assigned to a group of three hymns in the liturgy, was based on a traditional Anglo-Jewish evening song transcribed by cantor Meyer Lyon for a London pamphlet around 1770.21 "The Shepherd of Israel Tune" may have accompanied the text by Philip Doddridge "Shepherd of Israel, bend Thine ear," first published in 1755.22 The "Trumpet Tune, or 148th Psalm Metre" used for ten of Proud's hymns matched the rhythm of the Tate and Brady version of that psalm. The most familiar setting of this text was composed by John Darwall for the New Universal Psalmodist (1770).23 Similarly the "149th Psalm Tune" may have been taken from Tate and Brady's A Supplement to the New Version of the Psalms (1708), where that psalm's most popular setting (now known as "Hanover") made its first appearance.24
Carter's concerns over meter and melody pointed out in a small way the differences between himself and Joseph Proud. Proud was chiefly concerned with setting down the doctrines of the New Church in poetic form and did not indicate what tunes to use with his verses. As shown by the controversy over the different ways of singing the psalms in the Established Church and the Baptists' hesitancy to include Watts's hymns in their services, the majority of worshipers in most congregations were slow to accept unfamiliar music. Carter, the musician, realized that unless Proud's hymns were made easily singable by the use of familiar psalm tunes and other melodies, they would never become a major part of the worship of the New Church. By tying each new hymn to old tunes, Carter increased the chances of the liturgy's ready acceptance. The resulting volume bore strong resemblances to Watts's *Hymns and Spiritual Songs*, the most popular hymnal of its day.

The Adams brothers soon acknowledged the receipt of Carter's copy of the liturgy and calculated the cost of printing and binding to be £250. The group of worshipers meeting in Baltimore agreed to this price, and sent Kramer and one of the printers to Presstman to get money for the paper. The merchant expressed his regret that his circumstances would not allow him to advance money on Carter's account at that time. Therefore the printers were forced to send to Carter for 250 to 300 dollars before any volumes could come off the press.²⁵ Carter sent three hundred dollars to the printers, and enclosed the preface he had written for the fourth edition of the *Liturgy for the New Church*.²⁶

In contrast to his Baptist views, which did not permit the use of set prayers, Carter wrote that an established liturgy was a protection for the doctrines of the New Church and a "powerful guard against the Introduction of any Heresy." He continued:
It is expected that the use of a proper Formula, in public Worship, has a tendency to implant in the Minds of Children and Young People true Ideas of the One object of Divine Adoration, to familiarize them with the Word of God and His Holy Commandments, and thus to lay the foundation of their future Spiritual Life on Christ alone, who is the Rock of Ages.

Carter based his defense of congregational music on the Scriptures, telling his readers:

It is...said, 'I will pray with the Spirit, and I will sing with the Spirit [I Corinthians 14:15].' Without Scruple, at public and social Worship, all use Psalms and Hymns; which undoubtedly are Forms of human Composition.

Several months passed before Carter received word of the liturgy's completion. James Wilmer, the minister of the New Church congregation in Baltimore, advised him: "Your supplement to the preface is highly acceptable, and wisely calculated to remove prejudice." Carter awaited the new publication eagerly and informed his correspondents of its impending appearance. Finally in August the printers informed him that the books had been ready some time. Carter wrote the four men who composed the governing committee of the Baltimore congregation and asked them to superintend the sale of the liturgies. For himself he requested twenty-five copies to be sent to Nomony Hall, plus presentation copies for his son George, then in school in Philadelphia, and his daughter Julia, who was living in Baltimore.

Wilmer soon wrote Carter: "The Prayer Book of the New Church is out, and getting into circulation. Prejudices appear much to subside." This was good news for the Swedenborgians, who had received much verbal abuse in the Baltimore press and from the pulpits of the more established churches, particularly the Methodists. The church committee wrote Carter that his wishes had been complied with and that his copies should soon reach him. In addition, thirty copies had been sent to New Church
readers in Bedford, Pennsylvania, and plans were being laid to sell the liturgy in Baltimore bookstores. By early 1793 copies of the volume had spread up and down the Atlantic coast. Carter recommended the liturgy to anyone inquiring about Swedenborg's doctrines. Complimentary copies were sent to President George Washington and to the Governor of Georgia, who received fifty. Francis Bailey also acted as a distributor of the work, and Carter instructed his son George to apply to the Philadelphia printer for copies.

By his contributions to the printing of the first American edition of the New Church's hymnal, Robert Carter was able for the first time to unite his devotion to God and his love for music in a single, significant effort. In his youth and at Williamsburg, he emphasized secular music, despite his friendship with Peter Pelham, the church organist. Not until his return to Nomony Hall did he begin to search for religious fulfillment. However, the generally poor quality of church music in the rural parishes of the Northern Neck, as testified by Fithian, disappointed him. Later, the antipathy of the Baptists toward secular and instrumental music caused him to reject what had been his "darling amusement." Finally, after learning of Swedenborg's positive attitudes toward the use of music and musical instruments in the worship of God, Carter slowly began to rehabilitate his love for that art and used his talents to contribute to the musical life of the Church of the New Jerusalem.

Soon after the new liturgy and hymnal was completed, Carter left Nomony Hall and took up permanent residence in Baltimore. His ties with the home of his forefathers were rapidly broken. He had freed his slaves, nearly five hundred of them, in 1792, and was devising a method of turning
all of his estate over to his children which he accomplished in 1795. Meanwhile, he desired the spiritual support of fellow Swedenborgians, which was unobtainable in Virginia. The first Sunday after arriving in Maryland, Carter attended New Church services in a schoolhouse located in the suburb of Logtown. Seven other worshipers attended. The next Sunday fifteen men were present, who joined in singing a hymn led by the schoolmaster. Three weeks later, it was Carter who gave out the hymn and prayed. Passages from Swedenborg's works were also read. The pattern of worship established in these early services continued for several years.

After Carter moved to Baltimore he took control of the distribution of the liturgy, receiving 653 copies in December 1794 from Thomas Clayland, successor to the Adams brothers. Carter immediately began to consign copies to Baltimore booksellers, and probably distributed them outside the city as well. By 1796 supplies of the hymnal and prayerbook were running low. Carter asked the Adams brothers, who had returned to Wilmington following their father's death, to pay a balance of $170.66 for 268 copies that had never been received. Upon retabulating his lists a month later, Carter found that he was missing only 121 copies, a claim which he continued to press as late as 1802.

The liturgy and hymnal remained in use for many years, and Carter received requests to have it reprinted. The excellent quality of music produced by the Baltimore Swedenborgian church in the 1790s has been noted by historians of that city. Carter's efforts in establishing this high standard were not underestimated by his contemporaries, one of whom wrote: "The Hymn Books you gave has [sic] contributed much to Further the great Work."
Baltimore, the metropolis which Robert Carter adopted as his new home in 1794 bore few similarities to the city of Williamsburg which he had left more than twenty years earlier. Williamsburg had been created artificially as the capital of Virginia. Its lifeblood, with a few exceptions, was the plantation gentry who used the city as a convenient stopping place while they conducted their governmental duties. Having no major natural ports and no ready access to the developing frontier, its commercial sector fled to Norfolk, Richmond, and Fredericksburg as soon as the legislature moved away.

On the other hand, Baltimore was quite young in 1794 and growing at a phenomenal rate. The city's main occupation was the commerce of goods, a trade which had been captured from Annapolis and Philadelphia years earlier. Situated at the head of the Chesapeake Bay, Baltimore was the hub of a network of roads which reached northward into central Pennsylvania and westward toward the Allegheny Mountains. Compared to the brashness of Baltimore, Williamsburg at its busiest was relatively staid. Baltimore's social elite was not drawn from the ranks of the prominent colonial families but from the merchants who hustled a wide variety of goods on the docks, buying and selling everything the young nation needed in order to develop. By 1790 Baltimore had vaulted into position as the fourth largest city in the nation. 43

Though Baltimoreans always kept one finger on the pulse of the economy, they partook of the more graceful aspects of life as well. The city boasted numerous assembly rooms where the latest dances were taught by European-trained masters. Outdoor evening entertainments at Jalland's Gardens were accompanied by brilliant illuminations, fine music, and elaborate tea parties. 44 Baltimore's role as a major port encouraged an
influx of talented German musicians, who appreciated the city's proximity to German-speaking central Pennsylvania, as well as French performers and masters fleeing from revolution in their homeland and slave insurrections in San Domingo. In fact, Baltimoreans were quite satisfied with their standards of music and dancing, leading one newspaper editor to remark: "To every lover of music, it must be pleasing to observe public Concerts reviving with a spirit and liberality that do credit to the professors and amateurs of this place."45

Although surrounded by more opportunities for musicmaking than he had known since his days in Williamsburg, Carter did not immediately join in, though once again he ensured that his children received adequate training. Even before his move to the city, Carter directed that his daughter Julia, who was living in the Presstman household, should "be taught to play upon the Guittar, & ...Psalmody by Gammut, so as really to understand the Fundamentals of Music, & that she may sing and play the different parts, namely, Bass, Tenor & Treble."46 To her brother George, then studying in Philadelphia, he wrote:

Some late improvements have been made on the Guittar. Make enquire [sic] of the persons who play on that Instrument & know whether the alteration is a real improvement; and if the Guittar with the late alteration should be recommended then purchase one of said Guittars & send it to your Sister.47

Although the English guitar, a type of cittern, had been popular since the middle of the eighteenth century, the improvements Carter referred to had not been implemented until the 1780s. In order to protect the performer's fingernails from the constant plucking of the strings, makers often added "Smith's Patent Box." This device was mounted on the front of the guitar, and used hammers to strike the strings when the box's keys were pressed. A later development concealed the striking mechanism
inside the guitar's body, and produced a haunting tone when played.48

Several months later Carter conspired with George's professor to steer his son's musical applications into a path the young man had not anticipated or desired. The tutor, Samuel Jones, wrote from Philadelphia that George

also talks of wanting Money to buy a Guittar, which as it is a Womanish Instrument, & of but little consequence without being accompanied with a good Voice, I can't say but I have some demur about it. If he wanted a German Flute or a Violin, I should not hesitate a moment.49

Rather than defend an instrument he himself had played in years past and on which he had instructed his daughter, Carter wholeheartedly concurred. In his reply to Jones, he repeated his instructions to send a guitar to Julia in Baltimore, "she having a voice & retains Melody," and further directed: "As to George Carter's practising on a Musical Instrument, I disapprove thereof, which Disapprobation I lately expressed to him—and then I recommended Singing, so as to take either first, Tenor, or Bass part."50 George acquiesced and delayed his musical education. Three years later he respectfully told his father:

With the advice & consent of Dr. Jones I have applied myself to the study of the French language & a little music. I shall omit to tell my improvement in either, but appeal to your superior knowledge in both to determine what progress I could have made with but 3 months application.51

Soon after Carter arrived in Baltimore in May 1793, Julia was placed under the instruction of George Kalkbrenner, a musician who had organized several benefit performances for impoverished French émigré performers.52 Although these charity concerts were often followed by large assemblies, Carter showed no inclination to return to the dance floor, nor did he encourage his children to learn the new quadrilles and cotillions. His only mention of the art in his later years was in a collection of his
religious notes. Under the title "Remarks on Dancing" Carter cited three biblical instances in which dancing was associated with evil and immoral acts. Apparently Carter felt it was best to avoid any circumstance which might lead to "reveling."

In 1795, after eighteen years spent in disassembling his musical instrument collection, Carter took a new interest in secular music. In December he employed Andrew Ficke, a musical instrument maker, "to make some small repairs to our Forte-Piano and [tune] the same." Apparently this was the same instrument which Carter had purchased in 1771. The same day he paid four guineas to Joseph Carr for "one Pastorala--Musical-Instrument," and purchased "Instructions for the Sticado Pastorale" the next day.54

Joseph Carr's music store at Number 6, North Gay Street, was the first shop of its type in Baltimore, concentrating not on musical instruction, but offering, as his advertisement said, "a large and general assortment of well seasoned grand and square Piano Fortes, wind and stringed Musical Instruments, printed Music, and every other article in the Musical business."55 With his sons, Benjamin and Thomas, the Carr chain of publishing houses and music stores spread to Philadelphia and New York. In later years Benjamin gained fame through his compositions, publications, and his work with the Philadelphia musical community.56

The instrument which Carr sold Carter was an unusual one indeed. One of the best descriptions of the sticcado-pastorale came from Carter's own hand. Nearly two years after he purchased the instrument, probably in an attempt to replace broken glasses, Carter composed a letter to an unknown Philadelphia correspondent:

It is expected that you have seen a musical Instrument called the glass Pastorale. If such Glasses be cast within
your reach, and there be a Tuner also, Be pleased to procure 32 glasses, they to make two octaves & one fifth, Sharps & Flatts included. The first or lowest C—say about 9 1/2 Inches long by 3 eighths of an Inch broad. G, in Alt—say about 3 1/2 Inches long by 2 1/2 eighths of an Inch broad. The Dimentions of the two Glasses mentioned above form the Beginning & End.— The intermediate 30 Glasses are to dimin­ish in equal proportion, both in length & width.57

The sticcado-pastorale was a type of glass dulcimer or xylophone. The glasses were laid in order by pitch in a case which supported the pieces at either end. The performer tapped the centers of the glasses with knobs made of ivory, wood and leather, which allowed him to vary the tone by hitting the glass with a different section of the knob. As one observer noted, "It is very soft music indeed."58

Carter was instantly reminded of his glass harmonica, and on the same day of his purchase wrote his son John Tasker at Nomony Hall:

If the pleasant weather should continue it is expected that Vessels from your Parts will be running from thence to this town all the winter and in that Case I desire that my Harmoni­ca or Musical Glasses be carefully put up & sent here. I appre­hend that one or more of the Glasses are not on the Iron-spin­dle; pray seek for such Glasses & send the whole thereof— Your Sisters here frequently call for Forte-Piano & Guittar Strings. I left a parcel of each in [the] Desk, Glass doors, standing in Library.59

Apparently Julia continued her guitar lessons, while she and her sister Sophia made use of the recently renovated pianoforte. Three months later Carter impatiently repeated his requests to his agent at Nomony. His closing statement was a profound indication of the synthesis he had reached between his musical aspirations and his new religious principles: "Our family here being Practitioners, we considering [sic] the Science of Music to be both innocent and really necessary."60

* * *

Carter's interactions with the Baltimore musical community cannot be easily documented. Only one piece of evidence survived to indicate
that he took any part in the concerts and assemblies frequently presented in the city. That evidence was a list in Carter's handwriting, copied into his letterbook under the heading: "Baltimore Musical Society, Proceedings from the 1st December 1798. Cash received for 1/2 year."61

The names under this heading were generally not those of musicians but of prominent merchants and their clerks. These were the same men who peppered the Baltimore daily newspapers throughout this period with advertisements offering a multitude of goods. Among the few exceptions to this commercially oriented group were John B. Bernabeu and a Mr. Grill, Spanish and Danish consuls, respectively. The only members of this list with obvious musical connections were Joseph Carr, who maintained his music store on North Gay Street, and Richard Curson, Jr. Curson often served as manager for concerts and assemblies, and may have held the position of organist at St. Paul's Church.62 If Carter's "Baltimore Musical Society" was ever a viable body, it was the first such organization in the history of that city.

Most of Carter's discernable musical activity continued to revolve around his collection of instruments. In 1799 or 1800 he noted that "2 feet 9 1/2 Inches" was the "length of the Bridge [molding] fronting the Key's of the Large Piano-forte."63 Whether his reference to the "Large" pianoforte was an indication that he had more than one such instrument toward the end of his life cannot be proven. Baltimore boasted a number of pianoforte makers in the early nineteenth century, while other dealers imported instruments from England and Germany.

One instrument maker to whom Carter turned for assistance was William Harper, who set up his shop in North Frederick Street early in 1802. In August, Carter wrote:
Having re-considered the state of the Forte-Piano to be left at your Shop... I now direct that the Plan to lift the Hammers be pursued; that the present set of Keys be used; that the Peice whereon the Hammers are fastened be moveable according to example; that no part, in this Repair, is to be entire [sic] New except the Hammers, they to be New— I do condemn the present manner used to lift Hammers—say wire with wood heads screwed thereon.  

Once again Carter displayed his love for the unusual and the experimental. His pianoforte, which was over thirty years old by this time, had proven unsatisfactory from Carter's first acquaintance with it in 1771. Fascinated by Dr. Smith's *Harmonics* and his proposal for a harpsichord in which the temperament was easily adjustable, Carter began to tinker with his pianoforte to achieve the same result. Through the years at Nomony Hall when Prissy was receiving lessons on the instrument, Carter continued his adaptations. By 1788 the pianoforte was single-strung, as Smith recommended for all instruments, and in a somewhat uncertain state of repair. Nevertheless, Carter kept it in his possession, carried it to Baltimore in 1793 and put it to use again. Yet he still felt the urge to experiment on it.

The alterations Carter wished Harper to perform were relatively major. By altering the mechanism which lifted the hammers, Harper was changing the entire action. The hammer-rail along which the hammers were fastened by vellum hinges was to be made moveable. Then the hammers could slide back and forth along an axis perpendicular to the strings. This allowed the performer to transpose a piece of music up or down the scale by moving the hammer-rail backwards or forwards.

Carter mentioned that Harper had an example of such a pianoforte. This may have been only a diagram, but conceivably could have indicated the presence of a pianoforte constructed with a transposing capability. These instruments were rare except in Germany, where the partnership of
Spaeth and Schmahl in Regensburg produced several. German musicians and instrument makers were common in Baltimore by 1800, and Nicholas Tschudy, a nephew of the famous London harpsichord maker Burkhat Shudi, imported German pianofortes into the city as early as 1793.  

Carter's proposal was not a fulfillment of Smith's plan, which called for changes in temperament, or the relationships between the notes of a scale. Harper's improvements only allowed the scale as a whole to be moved up or down. In order to achieve a variety of temperaments without retuning, a square pianoforte needed the capability for each hammer to be adjusted backwards or forwards apart from its neighbors, which was not possible. As with many of his experiments on instruments, Carter had been pursuing an impracticality for many years.

Robert Carter may not have been disappointed in his failure to find his ideal pianoforte. His instruments had given him much pleasure over the years. Although he had spent the middle part of his life denying himself the consolations of instrumental music, the infusion of Swedenborg's philosophy on the art allowed Carter to come full circle, combining his love for what Fithian had called his "darling amusement" with his search for God's favor. Until his death in 1804, his beliefs on music and the other arts echoed the observations of the New Jersey tutor and the writings of the Swedish mystic. Two years before Carter died, he wrote his young granddaughter:

Human nature calls for tuition, more than every living Creature besides—for unless we are taught the useful arts we cannot be conspicuous in Society, for nature solely will not qualify us to instruct others. I do ascert that we must obtain knowledge to be respected in natural as well as spiritual Things.
ABBREVIATIONS USED IN NOTES

C. f. p.  
Carter family papers, 1651-1861

CW  
Research Library, Colonial Williamsburg

Db  
Daybook

Duke  
Robert Carter Papers, William R. Perkins Library, Duke University, Durham, North Carolina

Lb  
Letterbook

LC  
The Papers of Robert Carter, 1759-1804, Manuscripts Division, Library of Congress, Washington

MHS  
Maryland Historical Society, Baltimore

New Grove  

RC III  
Robert Carter III (1728-1804)

SSR  
Robert Carter Papers, Swedenborg School of Religion, Newton, Massachusetts

Va. Gaz.  
Virginia Gazette, 1739-66

Va. Gaz. (R)  
Virginia Gazette, published by Rind, 1766-74

Va. Gaz. (P & D)  
Virginia Gazette, published by Purdie & Dixon, 1766-74

Va. Gaz. (D & H)  
Virginia Gazette, published by Dixon & Hunter, 1775-78

Va. Gaz. (Purdie)  
Virginia Gazette, published by Purdie, 1775-79

VHS  
Virginia Historical Society, Richmond

W & M  
Earl Gregg Swem Library, College of William and Mary, Williamsburg

Wb  
Wastebook
NOTES

Chapter I


3 Advertisements in the *Virginia Gazette* often attested to the musical abilities of slaves and indentured servants who had either run away or were being offered for sale; see Mary Goodwin, "Musical Instruments in Eighteenth Century Virginia" (Unpublished research report, Research Department, Colonial Williamsburg, July 1953), pp. i-lix, passim.


5 See Chapter III, p. 43.


7 Shomer Zwelling, "Robert Carter of Nomoni Hall: Seasons of a Man's Life" (Paper read at The Colonial Williamsburg Research Department Community Lecture Series on Colonial American History: Research in Progress, Botetourt Theater, College of William and Mary, Williamsburg, Apr. 15, 1982), p. 5.


13 Details of Carter's early life may be found in Louis Morton, *Robert Carter of Nomini Hall* (Williamsburg: Colonial Williamsburg, 1941), pp. 31-61.
Chapter II

1 Zwelling, pp. 6-7.

2 RC III to Edward Hunt & Son, Sept. 1, 1768, RC III Lb(1764-68), pp. 113-16, CW.
[Notes to pages 11-14]

3 RC III to [James Concannon & Co.], [Summer, 1761], RC III Lb(1761-64), p. 15, CW.


5 RC III to Edward Hunt & Son, Sept. 1, 1768.

6 Boalch, p. 10.

7 RC III to Edward Hunt & Son, May 1, 1769, RC III Lb(1769), p. 19, CW; RC III to Edward Hunt & Sons, Jan. 25, 1771, Lb(1771), pp. 11-13, RC III Papers, VHS.

8 RC III to John M. Jordan, May 23, 1764, RC III Lb(1764-68), pp. 4-5, CW.


11 RC III's account with Peter Pelham, June 2, 1772, Ledger(1759-99), fol. 21, LC.

12 RC III to unidentified correspondent, Mar. 19, 1770, C. f. p., Sect. 22 [Mss 1, C2468, a145-149], VHS. The author acknowledges the assistance of Jay Gaynor, Curator of Mechanical Arts, Colonial Williamsburg, who diagramed this scheme from Carter's letter.

13 William Kennedy's account with RC III, Apr. 4, 1770, C. f. p., Sect. 23 [Mss 1, C2468, a1039-1120], VHS.

14 Rowland Hunt to RC III, Dec. 15, 1770, Tench Tilghman Papers, MHS.

15 RC III to Thomas & Rowland Hunt, Oct. 24, 1771, Lb(1771), pp. 45-46, RC III Papers, VHS.

16 Information on the relative sounding properties of glass and tin-glazed earthenware (delft) was provided by John C. Austin, Curator of Ceramics and Glass, Colonial Williamsburg.

17 Thomas & Rowland Hunt to RC III, Feb. 29, 1772, Tench Tilghman Papers, MHS.

18 RC III to Christopher Lowndes, July 31, 1768, RC III Lb(1764-68), pp. 103-6, CW.

20 Christopher Lowndes to RC III, Aug. 29, 1768, C. f. p., Sect. 22 [Mss 1, C2468, a565-573], VHS.


22 RC III to Hyndman & Lancaster, Oct. 5, 1769, RC III Lb(1769), pp. 34-35, CW.

23 Hyndman & Lancaster to RC III, Jan. 22, 1770, C. f. p., Sect. 22 [Mss 1, C2468, a955-958], VHS.

24 Robert Walker's charges to RC III, Apr. 19, 1770, C. f. p., Sect. 23 [Mss 1, C2468, a1039-1120], VHS.

25 J. & J. Simpson to RC III, May 18, 1771, C. f. p., Sect. 22 [Mss 1, C2468, a974], VHS.

26 RC III to Hyndman & Lancaster, Oct. 5, 1769.

27 Peter Pelham's "Directions to be observed on making an Organ," RC III Lb(1769), pp. 35-39, CW.

28 Thomas Griffin to [Peter Pelham], Jan. 15, 1770, C. f. p., Sect. 22 [Mss 1, C2468, a408], VHS.

29 Ibid.


31 Thomas Griffin to Peter Pelham, supplement, [Jan. 15, 1770], C. f. p., Sect. 84 [Mss 1, C2468, a2467], VHS.

32 RC III to Hyndman & Lancaster, July 11, 1770, Lb(1770), pp. 15-17, RC III Papers, VHS.

33 Ben Powell's account with RC III, Oct. 12, 1771, C. f. p., Sect. 23 [Mss 1, C2468, a1121-1199], VHS.

34 New Grove, s. v. "Simpson, John."

35 Goodwin, p. xlix.


37 J. & J. Simpson to RC III, May 18, 1771.

38 RC III to Hyndman & Lancaster, Oct. 5, 1769.

39 RC III to Hyndman & Lancaster, July 11, 1770.

41. RC III to Hyndman & Lancaster, July 11, 1770.

42. J. & J. Simpson to RC III, May 18, 1771.


44. RC III to Hyndman & Lancaster, July 11, 1770; John W. Molnar, Songs from the Williamsburg Theatre (Williamsburg: Colonial Williamsburg, 1972), pp. 147, 213-14.

45. The alterations described in Chapter V, pp. 86-88, indicate that Carter's instrument was a square pianoforte, not a grand.

46. New Grove, s. v. "Pianoforte."


49. RC III to Thomas & Rowland Hunt, Oct. 24, 1771.

50. James Horrocks to RC III, on reverse of William Attwood's receipt to RC III, Mar. 29, 1770, C. f. p., Sect. 23 [Mss 1, C2468, a1039-1120], VHS.

51. RC III to Edward Hunt & Son, Apr. 3, 1770, Lb(1770), pp. 5-7, RC III Papers, VHS.

52. Benjamin White's bill to Edward Hunt & Son for RC III, July 21, 1770, C. f. p., Sect. 23 [Mss 1, C2468, a1039-1120], VHS.


54. Ibid., p. 168.

55. Ibid., pp. 168-86, passim.


57. Smith, p. xvi; New Grove, s. v. "Enharmonic keyboard."

58. See Chapter V, p. 88.

Chapter III


3 Philip Ludwell Lee to William Lee, July 25, 1771, Lee family papers, 1638-1867, Sect. 106 [Mss 1, L51, f252], VHS.


5 Va. Gaz. (Purdie), Sept. 20, 1776.


7 Fithian to Elizabeth Beatty, Aug. 17, 1773, Aug. 31, 1773, printed in Journal, pp. 8-9, 10-11.


9 Ibid., Nov. 4, 1773, p. 21.


12 Ibid., Dec. 18, 1773, pp. 33-34.

13 Ibid.

14 Ibid., p. 243 (note 71).

15 Ibid., June 24, 1774, p. 125.

16 Ibid., Jan. 8, 1774, pp. 51-52.


18 Fithian, Dec. 17, 1773, Journal, p. 33

19 Ibid., Dec. 18, 1773, pp. 33-34.

20 Ibid., Dec. 19, 1773, p. 35.

21 Ibid., Aug. 5, 1774, p. 156.

22 Ibid., June 24, 1774, pp. 123-25.

23 Ibid., Sept. 17, 1774, p. 191.

24 Benson, p. 71.


27 RC III's entry, Dec. 8, 1773, *Db*(1773), p. 45, Box 64, Tucker-Coleman Collection, W & M.


30 Ibid., Dec. 7, 1773, Mar. 18, 1774, June 15, 1774, Aug. 11-12, 1774, Sept. 9, 1774, Oct. 11, 1774, pp. 28, 82, 121, 158, 187, 203.

31 Ibid., June 15, 1774, Aug. 12, 1774, pp. 121, 158.

32 Ibid., Mar. 18, 1774, p. 82.

33 Ibid., July 12, 1774, p. 138.

34 Ibid., Oct. 13, 1774, p. 204.


37 Ibid., Mar. 17, 1774, p. 79.


40 Ibid., July 6-7, 1774, pp. 132-33.

41 Ibid., Jan. 4, 1774, p. 49.

42 Ibid., Feb. 24-28, 1774, Mar. 5, 1774, Mar. 9, 1774, Mar. 18, 1774, pp. 68-69, 71, 75, 82.

43 Ibid., Feb. 16, 1774, Mar. 15, 1774, pp. 65, 78.

44 Ibid., Jan. 30, 1774, pp. 61-62.


46 Goodwin, pp. i-lix, passim.
47 Fithian, Mar. 30, 1774, June 13, 1774, Journal, pp. 88, 120.
48 New Grove, s. v. "Banjo."
50 Zwelling, pp. 9-10.
52 Ibid., Dec. 22, 1773, p. 37.
53 New Grove, s. v. "Musical glasses."
54 Fithian, Mar. 18, 1774, Aug. 11, 1774, Journal, pp. 82, 158.
55 Ibid., Jan. 7, 1774, p. 51.
56 Zwelling, p. 12.
61 Ibid., Dec. 22, 1773, Mar. 5, 1774, July 6, 1774, pp. 37, 71, 132.
62 Molnar, p. 67.
63 Fithian, Jan. 4, 1774, Mar. 5, 1774, Journal, pp. 47, 71.
64 A copy of Lampe's Method bearing Carter's case-shelf label is now deposited in the Research Library, Colonial Williamsburg.
66 Ibid., Mar. 5, 1774, p. 71.
68 New Grove, s. v. "Holden, John."
70 New Grove, s. v. "Burney, Charles."
72 Ibid., June 27, 1774, p. 127.
New Grove, s. v. "Psalmody."

Louise Goldberg, Rare Books Librarian, Sibley Music Library, Eastman School of Music, Rochester, New York, to the author, Mar. 11, 1983. Enclosed with this letter were photocopies of the index of psalms and the setting of the 62nd Psalm ("Windsor"). The full volume was not available for study.


Nicholas Brady and Nahum Tate, A New Version of the Psalms of David Fitted to the Tunes used in Churches (London: Jacob Ilive, 1739). The King's order-in-council (Dec. 3, 1696) authorizing the psalter's use is printed opposite the title page.


New Grove, s. v. "Psalmody," "Psalms, metrical."


"Inventory of...the estate of Mr. Larkin Randall, deceased," Dec. 24, 1774, Lb 2(1774-75):162-64, Duke.


Molnar, pp. 58, 206.

Inventory of the Estate of Philip Ludwell Lee, Mar. 20, 1776, Westmoreland County (Va.) Court, Records (Inventories, etc., No. 6), 1776-90, p. 174, microfilm.

Fithian, June 24, 1774, Journal, p. 125.

Ibid., Apr. 7, 1774, Aug. 2, 1774, pp. 95, 152.
Chapter IV

1. Landon Carter, July 13, 1776, Diary, 2:1056-57.

2. Fithian, Mar. 6, 1774, Journal, pp. 72-73.


7. Rappahannock Association (Va.), Morattico Baptist Church, Records 1778-1844, pp. [2-3], photocopy, Virginia Baptist Historical Society, Richmond.
Lumpkin, p. 353.


Henry Toler, date uncertain, Diary, 1782-83, n. p., W & M. Volume is not paged and dates are irregular.


RC III to Asa Hunt, Nov. 17, 1788, Lb 8(1787-89):229-30, Duke. This practice, usually known as the "invitation," is common among Baptist churches today.

Toler, circa May 9, 1783, Diary, n. p., W & M.

RC III's entry, Apr. 21, 1778, Db 15(1778):17, Duke.

Isaac Watts, Hymns and Spiritual Songs in Three Books (Glasgow: David Niven, 1786), pp. 245, 213.


Arthur L. Stevenson, The Story of Southern Hymnology (Salem, Va.: Published by the author, 1931), p. 1. The only known surviving copy of the 1773 Hymnal, listed in the collection of the Virginia Baptist Historical Society, currently cannot be located.

Hymns and Spiritual Songs, collected From the Works of several Authors (Newport, R. I.: Samuel Hall, 1766).

Eleazar Clay, comp., *Hymns and Spiritual Songs, Selected from Several Approved Authors...Recommended by the Baptist General Committee of Virginia* (Richmond: John Dixon, [1793]).


*Hymns and Spiritual Songs* (Newport, 1766), pp. 182-83.

Elizabeth Gault Hudson, "The Baptist Church and Baptist Society in the Rappahannock Area as Depicted in Association and Church Records, 1770-1870" (M. A. thesis, College of William and Mary, 1955), p. 54.

Ibid.

Rappahannock Asso., Morattico Baptist Church, Records, p. 27.


Ibid.

RC III to Francis Christian, Sept. 22, 1779, Lb 3(pt. 3: 1777-80): 146, Duke; Francis Christian's receipt to RC III, Sept. 29, 1779, C. f. p., Sect. 23 [Mss 1, C2468, a1415-1425], VHS.

Hudson, pp. 49-51.


RC III's entry, Apr. 26, 1777, Db 14(1776-78):[63], Duke; Benson, pp. 70, 74-75.

Benson, pp. 65-66.


Zwelling, p. 22.

Chapter V

1RC III's entry, Jan. 25, 1788, Journal (1784-89), n. p., LC.

The Liturgy of the New Church, signified by The New Jerusalem in the Revelation. Together with The Forms for the Administration of Baptism
and the Holy Supper: and A Catechism for the Use of the New Church. Also,
Hymns and Spiritual Songs, By the Rev. Mr. Joseph Proud, Minister of the

3 Marguerite Beck Block, The New Church in the New World (1932; re­

4 Robert Hindmarsh to RC III, Dec. 30, 1790, SSR.

5 Emanuel Swedenborg, Arcana Coelestia; The Heavenly Arcana contained
in The Holy Scriptures or Word of the Lord Unfolded, Beginning with the
lishing Society, 1870-73), 1:140.

6 Ibid.

7 Ibid., 1:142.

8 Ibid., 1:139-40.

9 Ibid., 1:387-89.

10 Alexander Dickie Galt, July 15, 1793, Diary (1792-93), Galt family
papers, W & M.

11 RC III's entries, May 26, 1793, June 2, 1793, June 23, 1793, Db
18(1793):15-16, 20, 37, Duke; RC III's entries, June 15, 1794, Aug, 3,
1794, Aug. 10, 1794, Aug. 24, 1794, Feb. 22, 1795, Mar. 15, 1795, Wb
(1794-95), pp. 61-62, 78, 79, 82, 124, 133, LC.

12 The Liturgy of the New Church, 4th ed., pp. xxxiii, xc.

13 RC III to Francis Bailey, Nov. 29, 1791, SSR.

14 Ibid.

15 RC III to Christian Kramer, Mar. 5, 1792, SSR.

16 Christian Kramer to RC III, Dec. 27, 1791, SSR.

17 Joseph Towne Wheeler, The Maryland Press 1777-1790 (Baltimore:
Maryland Historical Society, 1938), p. 72; A. Rachel Minick, A History of
Printing in Maryland, 1791-1800, with a Bibliography of Works Printed in
the State During the Period (Baltimore: Enoch Pratt Free Library, 1949),
pp. 116-17.

18 RC III to Christian Kramer, Jan. 16, 1792, SSR.

19 Francis Bailey to RC III, Jan. 7, 1792, SSR.

20 RC III to Christian Kramer, Mar. 5, 1792.

21 The Hymnal 1940 Companion, p. 188.
[Notes for pages 76-81]

22 Julian, 2:1054.
23 The Hymnal 1940 Companion, p. 352.
24 Barkley, pp. 84-85.
25 Samuel & John Adams to RC III, Mar. 22, 1792, SSR.
26 RC III to Samuel & John Adams, Apr. 14, 1792; Samuel & John Adams's receipt to RC III, Apr. 27, 1792, SSR.
27 The Liturgy of the New Church, 4th ed., pp. xii-xiii.
28 James Wilmer to RC III, May 8, 1792, SSR.
29 RC III to Bryan Fairfax, July 17, 1792, SSR.
30 RC III to H. Didier, J, Mickle, Wm. Cooper & J. Boyer, Sept. 1, 1792, SSR.
31 James Wilmer to RC III, Sept. 22, 1792.
32 Block, p. 89.
33 Henry Didier to RC III, Sept. 23, 1792, SSR.
34 RC III to Elisha White, Mar. 2, 1793, RC III to Philip Merry, Mar. 30, 1793, SSR.
35 James Wilmer to RC III, Feb. 5, 1793, Henry Didier to RC III, Feb. 10, 1793, SSR.
36 RC III to George Carter, Oct. 29, 1792, SSR.
37 Zwelling, p. 31.
39 RC III's entries, Dec. 18, 1794, Dec. 29, 1794, Wb(1794-95), pp. 107, 115-16, LC.
42 Joseph Leigh to RC III, Apr. 30, 1798, Letters Received (1791-98), LC.
43 An excellent study of Baltimore's economic history during this period is Gary Lawson Browne, Baltimore in the Nation, 1789-1861 (Chapel

44 The Baltimore Daily Repository, Aug. 8, 1793.


49 Samuel Jones to RC III, Aug. 6, 1792, C. f. p., Sect. 22 [Mss 1, C2468, a491-497], VHS.

50 RC III to Samuel Jones, Oct. 29, 1792, SSR.

51 George Carter to RC III, July 20, 1795, C. f. p., Sect. 22 [Mss 1, C2468, a278-285], VHS.


53 RC III's "Remarks on Dancing," Feb. 1794, SSR.


56 New Grove, s. v. "Carr, Benjamin," "Carr, Joseph."

57 RC III to unidentified correspondent, Aug. 28, 1797, Lb(1797-99), pp. 6-7, LC. "Never sent," according to Carter's index.


59 RC III to John Tasker Carter, Dec. 30, 1795, Lb(1794-96), pp. 176-77, LC.

60 RC III to Benjamin Dawson, Mar. 28, 1796, SSR.


Wilson Allen to RC III, Dec. 6, 1799, C. f. p., Sect. 22 [Mss 1, C2468, al51], VHS.

RC III to William Harper, Aug. 18, 1802, Lb(1800-5), pp. 194-95, LC.

Assistance in interpreting Carter's instructions to Harper was provided by Peter W. Redstone, Conservator of Musical Instruments, Colonial Williamsburg.

Information on Spaeth and Schmahl was also provided by Mr. Redstone. The Baltimore Daily Repository, June 28, 1793.

RC III to Sarah Jekyll Jones, July 23, 1802, Lb(1800-5), pp. 191-92, LC.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Manuscript Sources


Carter family papers, 1651-1861. Sections 22, 23, 84. Virginia Historical Society, Richmond.

Carter Papers. Earl Gregg Swem Library, College of William and Mary, Williamsburg.


Toler, Henry. Diary, 1782-83. Earl Gregg Swem Library, College of William and Mary, Williamsburg.

Westmoreland County (Va.) Court. Records (Inventories, etc., No. 6), 1776-90. Microfilm.

Printed Primary Sources

The Baltimore Daily Repository, 1793.


Brady, Nicholas, and Nahum Tate. A New Version of the Psalms of David Fitted to the Tunes used in Churches. London: Jacob Ilive, 1739.


Clay, Eleazar, compiler. Hymns and Spiritual Songs, Selected from Several Approved Authors...Recommended by the Baptist General Committee of Virginia. Richmond: John Dixon, [1793].

The Federal Gazette and Baltimore Daily Advertiser, 1798.

The Federal Intelligencer and Baltimore Daily Gazette, 1795.


Hymns and Spiritual Songs, collected From the Works of several Authors. Newport, R. I.: Samuel Hall, 1766.


Lampe, John Frederick. A Plain and Compendious Method of Teaching Thorough Bass, After the most Rational Manner. London: Printed for J. Wilcox, [1737].


The Liturgy of the New Church, signified by The New Jerusalem in the Revelation. Together with The Forms for the Administration of Baptism and the Holy Supper: and A Catechism for the Use of the New Church. Also, Hymns and Spiritual Songs, By the Rev. Mr. Joseph Proud, Minister of the New Church. 4th ed. Baltimore: Samuel & John Adams, 1792.


Virginia Gazette, 1739-66.

Virginia Gazette, published by Rind, 1766-74.

Virginia Gazette, published by Purdie and Dixon, 1766-74.

Virginia Gazette, published by Dixon and Hunter, 1775-78.

Virginia Gazette, published by Purdie, 1775-79.


Secondary Sources


VITA

John Randolph Barden


Since July 1981, the author has served as Fellow to the Curator of Metals in the Department of Collections, Colonial Williamsburg.