

#### **W&M ScholarWorks**

Dissertations, Theses, and Masters Projects

Theses, Dissertations, & Master Projects

2004

The impact of cognitive development on White school counselor interns' perspectives and perceived competencies for addressing the needs of African-American students

Tammi F. Milliken
William & Mary - School of Education

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.wm.edu/etd

Part of the African American Studies Commons, Ethnic Studies Commons, and the Student Counseling and Personnel Services Commons

#### **Recommended Citation**

Milliken, Tammi F., "The impact of cognitive development on White school counselor interns' perspectives and perceived competencies for addressing the needs of African-American students" (2004). *Dissertations, Theses, and Masters Projects.* William & Mary. Paper 1550154135. https://dx.doi.org/doi:10.25774/w4-3fjd-py02

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Theses, Dissertations, & Master Projects at W&M ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dissertations, Theses, and Masters Projects by an authorized administrator of W&M ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact scholarworks@wm.edu.

# THE IMPACT OF COGNITIVE DEVELOPMENT ON WHITE SCHOOL COUNSELOR INTERNS' PERSPECTIVES AND PERCEIVED COMPETENCIES FOR ADDRESSING THE NEEDS OF AFRICAN AMERICAN STUDENTS

A Dissertation

Presented to

The Faculty of the School of Education

The College of William and Mary in Virginia

In Partial Fulfillment

Of the Requirements for the Degree

Doctor of Philosophy

by

Tammi F. Milliken

May, 2004

### THE IMPACT OF COGNITIVE DEVELOPMENT ON WHITE SCHOOL COUNSELOR INTERNS' PERSPECTIVES AND PERCEIVED COMPETENCIES FOR ADDRESSING THE NEEDS OF AFRICAN AMERICAN STUDENTS

by

Tammi F. Milliken

Approved May, 2004 by

Victoria A. Foster, Ed.D.

Chairperson of Doctoral Committee

Charles R. McAdams, Ed.D.

Thomas J. Ward, Ph.D.

Edward S. Neukrug, Ed.D.

#### Acknowledgments

It is with much excitement that I write these acknowledgments for it means that one amazingly arduous yet growth producing chapter of my life is coming to an end and another awaits my turning of the pages. As I reflect on the past few years of my doctoral studies, I feel compelled to thank several individuals who inspired me in different ways throughout this process. Dr. Victoria Foster, Chair of my dissertation committee, innumerable times I benefitted from your nurturing, empathic, unbiased manner that is combined with charisma, drive, and intellect. I strive to possess these characteristics, and thank you for modeling them with poise. I will always remember with appreciation the support you provided throughout my pregnancies and the never-failing belief in me that I can succeed as a counselor educator. You are truly my mentor and my friend. Dr. Rip McAdams, you are probably unaware of the profound impact you had on my experience at William and Mary. During my first semester, you recognized my dissonance and responded by offering me encouragement and sharing personal experiences of being a first year doc student. That support truly helped to normalize my anxiety and inspired me to trudge ahead. I'm not certain that I could have survived that first semester without your kind empathy, and I have always welcomed your reflections in relation to my set backs and achievements ever since. Dr. Tom Ward, your statistical expertise housed in a down to earth persona made advanced stats bearable! I thank you for your availability to address my many questions throughout the data analysis. And finally, Dr. Ed Neukrug, my thanks to you are endless. I sincerely appreciate your never-ending support of my academic and professional endeavors. It is doubtful that I would be here today without your belief in my abilities seven years ago as I began my journey in to the field of counseling. I am indebted to your generosity in allowing me to publish, present, and teach with you. I am ever appreciative of your responsiveness to questions, ruminations, and quandaries. Most significantly, I am grateful for your friendship. I look forward to watching our children grow up together.

#### Dedication

I must address with appreciation those who have supported me personally. To them, this document is dedicated. My mother, Carol Furman, is the consummate caretaker. Thank you Mother, for lovingly caring for Noah while I have been consumed by this process. The selfsacrifice you have made to help me reach my goals is meritorious, and your celebration of my successes along the way have boosted my self-esteem and provided me with the impetus to continue through this process. No one wanted me to obtain this doctorate more than my father, Eric Wm Furman II. Thank you Daddy, for continuously encouraging me for as long as I can remember to strive for excellence and achieve my goals. I love you for your quiet depth of caring. My sister, Candy Furman, is the most energetic and passionate person I know. Had I a fraction of your tenacity, this dissertation would have been completed in half the time it took! Through our experiences, lengthy reflective discussions, and mutual support, I have grown as a person and as a counselor. Thank you for this, and may it never cease. To my father-in-law, Jess Milliken, the philosopher, I thank you for guiding me toward the light. I aim to possess your generosity of spirit and passion for humanity. To my mother-in-law, Ilse Milliken, I thank you endlessly for your understanding and insight. Your nurturing, perceptive, and dynamic manner is the glue that binds this family. And to my amazing husband, best friend, soul mate and confidant, Brian Milliken, I thank you for your unconditional love and support. I realize that you have altered your dreams and goals in order for me to obtain mine, and for this I am humbled and indebted. I promise that it is your turn now! You must know that I could not have survived this process without your incredible ability to help me put my work aside and enjoy life on occasion. You make me laugh. You make me play. You make me endure. I am proud to be your wife and I love you forever. Finally, to my son Noah, you are truly the most important thing that I have ever done in life. Thank you for opening my eyes to what really matters. I wonder what else you have in store for me. And to our unborn baby, what a blessing you will be. A new chapter begins...

#### **Table of Contents**

| Acknowledgements   | iii   |
|--|---|
| Dedication   | iv  |
| List of Tables   | viii  |
| Abstract   | ix  |
| Chapter 1: Introduction  | 2   |
| Description of the Problem   | 2   |
| Racial and Cultural Demographics of the Country                    | 2   |
| The Complex Job of the School Counselor                            | 4   |
| The Unique Needs of African American Students                      | 6   |
| Justification for the Study  | 6   |
| Current Counselor Training Approaches                              | 6   |
| Prevailing Social and Educational Deficits                         | 8   |
| The Need for Improved Multicultural Counselor Training             | 8   |
| Theoretical Rationale  | 11  |
| Cognitive Developmental Theory                                     | teres of the same |
| Moral Developmental Domain   | 15  |
| Purpose of the Study   | 17  |
| Definition of Terms.   | 18  |
| Method.  | 19  |
| Limitations of the Study   | 19  |
| Ethical Considerations.  | 20  |
| Summary  | 20  |
|  | 2.0   |
| Chapter 2: Literature Review                                       | 22  |
| Introduction.  | 22  |
| White School Counselor Challenges.                                 | 22  |
| JobDemands   | 22  |
|  |   |
| Challenging Social and Educational Issues Affecting Students       | 25  |
| The Challenge of Working With Diverse Students                     | 27  |
| Specific Challenges in Working With African American Students      | 27  |
| The Unique Needs of African American students                      | 31  |
| Current Multicultural Training Approaches for School Counselors    | 35  |
| Standardized requirements  | 35  |
| Current Multicultural Counselor Training Focus                     | 36  |
| Limitations of the Current School Counselor Multicultural Training | 40  |
| Achievement Gap  | 40  |
| Prevailing Social Issues Impacting African American Students       | 43  |
| School Counseling Effectiveness                                    | 47  |
| Consideration of School Counselors' Individual Characteristics     | 49  |
| Cognitive Developmental Theory                                     | 49  |
| Moral Development Theory   | 55  |

| Summary   | 66  |
|---|-----|
| Chapter 3: Research Methodology                           | 68  |
| Introduction  | 68  |
| Population and Sample                                     | 68  |
| Data Collection   | 69  |
| Method  | 69  |
| Data Handling Procedure                                   | 72  |
| Instrumentation   | 72  |
| Informed Consent Form                                     | 72  |
| Demographic Information Form                              | 73  |
| Defining Issues Test-2                                    | 73  |
| New Racism Scale  | 76  |
| Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Survey-R | 78  |
| Research Design   | 79  |
| Research Hypotheses                                       | 80  |
| Data Analysis   | 81  |
| Ethical Considerations                                    | 82  |
| Summary   | 82  |
| Chapter 4: Analysis of Results                            | 84  |
| Introduction  | 84  |
| Sampling Procedures                                       | 84  |
| Descriptive Data  | 84  |
| Demographics  | 84  |
| Racial Attitudes  | 89  |
| Multicultural Competence                                  | 90  |
| Moral Development   | 90  |
| Review of Hypotheses                                      | 92  |
| Hypothesis 1  | 92  |
| Hypothesis 2  | 92  |
| Hypothesis 3  | 92  |
| Hypothesis 4  | 93  |
| Hypothesis 5  | 93  |
| Hypothesis 6  | 94  |
| Chapter 5: Discussion and Conclusions                     | 95  |
| Introduction  | 95  |
| Rationale   | 95  |
| Discussion of Major Research Findings                     | 97  |
| Hypothesis 1  | 97  |
| Hypothesis 2  | 102 |
| Hypothesis 3  | 104 |

| Hypothesis 4                        | 106                           |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Hypothesis 5                        | 108                           |
| Hypothesis 6                        | present<br>present<br>present |
| Discussion of Additional Findings   | 112                           |
| Limitations of the Study            | 115                           |
| Research Design                     | 115                           |
| Sampling                            | 116                           |
| Instrumentation                     | 117                           |
| Implications                        | 120                           |
| Recommendations for Future Research | 130                           |
| Conclusion                          | 137                           |
| References                          | 139                           |
| Appendices                          | 162                           |

#### List of Tables

| 4  | Levels and Stages of Moral Development   | ******  | 57 |
|----|--|---------|----|
| 2. | Total Sample by Gender, Age and Race     |         | 86 |
| 3. | Demographics of White Participants       |         | 87 |
| 4. | Descriptive Statistics for NRS, MCCTS-R, | and DIT | 91 |

## THE IMPACT OF COGNITIVE DEVELOPMENT ON WHITE SCHOOL COUNSELOR INTERNS'

#### PERSPECTIVES AND PERCEIVED COMPETENCIES

#### FOR ADDRESSING THE NEEDS OF AFRICAN AMERICAN STUDENTS

#### Abstract

The purpose of this study was to explore the relationship between White school counselor interns' attained levels of moral development and their racial attitudes and perceived competencies for addressing the needs of African American students. Cognitive development, specifically the theory of moral development, was used as the theoretical rationale for the study. The participants consisted of 53 White school counselor interns in South Eastern United States who completed an informed consent form, a demographic survey, the Defining Issues Test-2 (DIT-2), the New Racism Scale (NRS), and the Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Survey-Revised (MCCTS-R) during regularly scheduled group supervision sessions. The design consisted of descriptive and multivariate correlational analyses on the DIT-2, NRS and MCCTS-R. Descriptive statistics determined means, standard deviations, and modes for the obtained data, and correlational analyses were employed to determine relationships between the variables.

White school counselor interns with higher moral judgment scores were found to be significantly more tolerant than those at lower levels of moral development. Furthermore, those who were more tolerant also perceived themselves to have greater multicultural counseling competence. In addition, those with more multicultural training both perceived themselves to be more competent counseling diverse students and held more tolerant views about African

Americans.

The results from this research provide a greater understanding of cognitive developmental theory and may potentially contribute to improved pedagogy for multicultural counselor education and more effective multicultural school counseling practices. Specifically, the findings illuminate the need to apply educational strategies in multicultural courses that promote cognitive development for school counselor trainees. Additional suggestions for replicating and extending the current study are provided.

#### TAMMI F. MILLIKEN

DEPARTMENT OF COUNSELOR EDUCATION IN THE SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

THE COLLEGE OF WILLIAM AND MARY IN VIRGINIA

The Impact of Cognitive Development on White School Counselor Interns'

Perspectives and Perceived Competencies

for Addressing the Needs of African American Students

#### Chapter One

#### Introduction

The topic under investigation in this study pertains to the influence of levels of moral development on White school counselor interns' racial attitudes and perceived multicultural competencies for addressing the needs of African American students. This chapter provides an overview of the pertinent issues related to this topic, including the country's racial and cultural demographics, challenges facing school counselors, the unique needs of African American students, current counselor training approaches, and African American students' prevailing social and educational problems. Additionally, the cognitive developmental paradigm is introduced as a framework for understanding individual differences in adults' conceptualization of multicultural counseling, and a summary of the study's framework is provided. Chapter two offers a selected review of relevant literature while chapter three describes the research design. Chapter four states the results of the study and chapter five provides a discussion of the results as well as implications for future research.

#### Description of the Problem

Racial and Cultural Demographics of the Country

The United States is considered to have the most cultural diversity of any country in the world (Whitfield, 1994). In fact, the U.S. Department of Commerce (2002) projects that by 2050, minorities will make up approximately 50% of the U.S. population. It is speculated that the African American population will increase from 12% to 16% while the White population is expected to decrease from 72% to 53%. Currently, in the state of Virginia where the present study was conducted, 20% of the population is African American while only 5% is Asian and 4%

is Hispanic. Richmond, Maryland, and the District of Columbia are of the top ten areas in the country with the highest percentage of African Americans. In fact, 75% of African Americans residing in the United States live in the South and North East (U.S. Department of Commerce, 2002). The U.S. Department of Commerce (2002) also found that two-thirds of African American women are currently having children as compared to less than half of White women. Unfortunately, despite African American's population growth, their socioeconomic status remains bleak.

Compared to 11% of Whites, 22% of African Americans currently live below the poverty level and 36% participate in welfare programming. Many therefore, reside in government subsidized housing (U.S. Department of Commerce, 2002). Schools which serve these communities are typically over-represented by African American students, and with the possible adoption of a voucher system which is designed to provide between \$2,500 and \$5,000 to parents of school-aged children for use toward the cost of tuition at private schools, it is likely that schools will become even further segregated (Anti-Defamation League, 2002). According to the Anti-Defamation League (2002), voucher supplements rarely cover private school tuition costs in totality; therefore the program fails to benefit individuals unable to come up with the funds to make up the difference. Consequently, attendees at private schools would consist primarily of wealthy and middle-class students, while public schools, being over-represented by African Americans, would have even less funding to teach the poor students.

Today, the majority of school counselors are White (Herring, 1997; Sandhu, 2001). In fact, Constantine and Gainor (2001) found 89.8% of their sample of 108 school counselors who were members of the American School Counselor Association (ASCA) was White and only

4.6% were African American. In a more recent study using a national sample of school counselors who hold membership with ASCA, Lambie (2002) found that only 6.7% of the 225 respondents were African American as compared to 87.6% being White. This also means that the majority of school counselor interns are White. In a study conducted by Herring (1998), 83.5% of the 85 school counselor trainees that volunteered from six universities were White. More recently, Constantine (2002) surveyed school counselor interns from the Midwestern and Northeastern United States and 90% of the 99 participants were White. Considering African Americans are the second largest racial group among enrolled students in the nation's schools (Lee, 1995), it stands to reason that White counselors and White counselor interns are likely to interact with African American students, particularly in schools serving subsidized housing communities.

#### The Complex Job of the School Counselor

Meeting the needs of students, and specifically African American students is not an easy task in light of the daunting challenges that face school counselors today. Specifically, school counselors must now contend with higher student enrollment, greater counselor case-loads, expectation for increased accountability, changing demographics in our nation, and a considerable number of social issues impacting today's children (Kesler, 1990; Rubenstein & Zager, 1995; Stickel, 1991). Their job entails designing comprehensive skills-based educational and prevention programs that address the needs of all students; providing individual counseling to address personal problems and crises; consulting with parents, teachers, administrators, and community agencies; conducting thorough evaluations of their services to show accountability; and keeping complete records of all services provided (Sears, 1993). School counselors are also

typically responsible for non-counseling functions such as scheduling classes for students, proctoring tests, and monitoring the halls, which interfere with their primary role of delivering direct services to students (Burnham & Jackson, 2000; Stickel, 1991).

As if this multitude of tasks is not enough, it is also essential that school counselors are prepared to deal with a host of critical social issues affecting students today. It is not uncommon for school counselors to see students who are abusing drugs, pregnant, violent, physically abused, suicidal, committing crimes, and/or failing in school (Gerler, 1991; Rubenstein & Zager, 1995; Sears, 1993). Furthermore, in an effort to seek independence and autonomy, many adolescents are resistant to counseling and may present in a hostile manner, thus complicating the school counselor's ability to effectively intervene (Hanna, Hanna, & Keys, 1999; Walsh, 1993). All of these specific job responsibilities and student issues must be handled differently based on the students' cultural identity (Gerler, 1991; Lee, 1995). Multiculturalism poses formidable challenges to the school counselor who must adapt traditional counseling strategies to suit the needs of diverse students and who must collaborate with all involved in the school system to promote cultural understanding (Gerler, 1991; Sanchez, 1995).

Directly related to the current study, school counselors must vary their perspective when working with African American students. Specifically, it is important that White school counselor interns combat their own racism, learn to appreciate African American culture, and remain empathic despite African American students' mistrust of the dominant culture (Baruth & Manning, 2000; Bolton-Brownlee, 1987; Constantine, 2002; Kiselica, 1998; Watkins, Terrell, Terrell, & Miller, 1989). White school counselors have the additional challenge of addressing the unique social and educational hurdles facing African American students (Kiselica, 1998).

The Unique Needs of African American Students

In order to best address their clients' needs, it is essential that White school counselors are cognizant of the unique social and educational issues of African American students. Because of a history of oppression in this country, African Americans are faced with challenges that others are not (Lee, 1982). Studies have shown that African American students often have difficulty developing a strong self-concept, vocational goals, social skills, a work ethic, study skills, and test-taking skills (Lee, 1982; Parker & McDavis, 1989). This may contribute to the achievement gap that currently exists between African American students and White students (Campbell & Dahir, 1997; Haycock, Jerald, & Huang, 2001; U.S Department of Education/No Child Left Behind, 2001; U.S. Department of Commerce, 2000). Unequal opportunities which often result in failure frequently lead to frustration which may be manifested in behavioral problems, drug abuse, crime, and academic underachievement. Lee (1982) has suggested that African American students are not inadequate, but instead are victims of a faulty system.

In contrast to the dominant culture's belief in independence, African Americans typically value connectedness with family and community (Markstrom-Adams & Adams, 1995). Thus, African American students need school counselors to recognize this quality and modify interventions to incorporate group interaction and social support. Additionally, African American students need White school counselors to be empathic to their past history, current issues, and resulting unique needs (Kiselica, 1998; Locke, 1989; Sandhu, 2001).

Justification for the Study

Current Counselor Training Approaches

In order to prepare counselors to work effectively with diversity, course work in multicultural counseling is required of counselor training programs accredited by the Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs [CACREP] (CACREP, 2002; Neukrug, 2003). While CACREP (2002) lists multicultural issues as a common core area to address in counselor education, it does not specify topics to cover within the area or methods for imparting the information. School counseling programs that are CACREP accredited typically subscribe to multicultural training standards delineated in the American School Counseling Association (ASCA) code of ethics (ASCA, 2002) and the National Standards for School Counselors (Campbell & Dahir, 1997), as well as the Multicultural Counseling Competencies developed by the Association of Multicultural Counseling and Development [AMCD] (Arredondo, 1999). The focus of these requirements tends to be primarily informational and skills based. Informational approaches typically address counselor self-awareness and cultural awareness, while skills based approaches focus on specific multicultural techniques and interventions. Self-awareness includes the exploration of one's own culture, as well as one's values, biases, and beliefs. Knowledge about diverse others includes information about different culture's beliefs, values, traditions, history and oppression. Culturally appropriate skills are those that consider the unique needs of an individual based on the situation and his or her culture, and include appropriate communication skills and interventions (Arredondo, 1999; Baruth & Manning, 2000; Midgette & Meggert, 1991; Sanchez, 1995; Wittmer, 1992). These multicultural training standards were developed to address racism and oppression and are directed primarily at White counselors working with minority clients (Arredondo, 1999). The format in which the information and skills are taught often consists of discussion, reading assignments, lecture,

expectation for self-disclosure, didactic presentations, objective assessments, and submersion exercises (Arredondo, 1999; Herring, 1997; Midgette & Meggert, 1991).

Prevailing Social and Educational Deficits Affecting African American Students

Despite the current emphasis on multiculturalism in counselor training approaches, it is evident that practicing school counselors continue to be deficit in meeting the needs of African American students and quelling these students' barriers to achievement. School counseling interventions have been found to be less effective for African American students than for White students (Georges, 1997; Lapan, Gysbers, & Sun, 1997; Lee & Ekstrom, 1987). African American students score lower on achievement tests, are less proficient in reading and math, graduate from high school at a lower rate, and take less advanced course work than White students (Caldas & Bankston, 1997; U.S. Department of Education/No Child Left Behind, 2001; U.S. Department of Commerce, 2000). African American students get unfairly suspended, get inappropriately passed from one grade to the next, are excessively overrepresented in special education and underrepresented in gifted classes, drop-out of school, and live in poverty more often than Whites (Clark, Petras, & Kellam, 2000; Indiana Educational Policy Center, 20000; Thomas B. Fordham Foundation, 1999; U.S. Department of Commerce, 2000).

The Need for Improved Multicultural Counselor Training Approaches

Considering the difficulties experienced by many African American students both socially and educationally, it is apparent that the current methods of preparing school counselors to address their unique issues are insufficient. As described above, the primary topics addressed in multicultural education include knowledge, skill, and awareness, and the methods used to teach these topics include lectures, submersion exercises, discussions, reading assignments,

expectation for self-disclosure, didactic presentations, and objective assessments. Research has revealed the ineffectiveness of traditional skills-based models of instruction and supervision for various professional disciplines at promoting the ability to sort through complicated interactions and select the appropriate technique to use with diverse students (Evans & Foster, 2000; Glassberg & Sprinthall, 1980; Sprinthall & Bernier, 1979; Oja & Sprinthall, 1978; Rest, 1986). The current study assumed that the problem is not what is being taught, but how knowledge, skill, and awareness are being taught. The researcher posed that the pedagogy of multicultural education for White school counselor trainees needs revision. Current teaching methods characteristically seem to lack a focus on the individual characteristics of the counseling student. These include such things as one's level of cognitive development, need for structured learning environments, preferred style of learning, degree of flexibility in situations, and tolerance of ambiguity. These characteristics vary from person to person, thus impacting their conceptualization of multicultural knowledge, awareness and skill in different ways. For example, an individual requiring a highly structured learning environment may need concrete examples of African American characteristics, extensive instructor guidance through selfexploration, and frequent practice using clearly defined culturally sensitive skills. On the other hand, an individual requiring a much less structured learning environment may benefit most from independent research and participant observation of African American characteristics, instructor support of personal introspection and self-exploration, and freedom to try a variety of culturally appropriate counseling skills in a thoughtful and purposeful manner. Consequently, one standardized format for teaching may not suit every learner's needs (Harvey, Hunt, & Schroder, 1961). With greater recognition of counselor interns' individual characteristics and focus on their

levels of development, counselor training programs may be able to modify their approaches to directly address these individual characteristics, promote development, and thus better prepare White school counselor trainees to meet the needs of African American students once they enter the profession. Cognitive developmental theory provides a framework to do just this. As opposed to the other individual characteristics mentioned previously, cognitive development is a standalone theory that encompasses the other individual characteristics. It provides a thorough description of individuals at different stages of development and offers a model for promoting growth to higher stages. Many studies have substantiated the connection between counselor behavior and cognitive development showing that counselors at higher levels of development perform more effectively (Duckett & Ryden, 1994; Holloway & Wampold, 1986; Hunt, 1975; Loevinger, 1977; Labouvie-Vief, Hakim-Larson, & Hobart, 1987; Peace, 1995). Specifically related to multicultural counseling, cognitive development addresses perspective taking, critical thinking, and openness to conflicting perspectives, all of which are necessary for sensitivity to issues of diversity and culturally sensitive counseling (Adams, 2002; Hoare, 1991; Vogt, 1997). Vogt (1997) described a link between cognitive development and tolerance for others stating that higher conceptual levels are needed to reject stereotypes that have been learned through socialization and to recognize the broad social consequences of oppression and discrimination. However, up to this point, no empirical research had been conducted on the link between White school counselor interns' cognitive development and their racial attitudes and perceived competencies for addressing the needs of African American students. The present study intended to substantiate that White school counselor interns at higher levels of cognitive complexity have fewer racist attitudes and greater cultural awareness, self-awareness, and multicultural skill

usage, thus better enabling them to provide effective services to African American students.

White school counselor interns were used in the current study not only because they are tomorrow's school counselors, but also because they are exposed to both current counselor training practices and to the practice of counseling in the school setting.

#### Theoretical Rationale

Cognitive Developmental Theory

Cognitive developmental theory describes the ways in which individuals make meaning of experience based on different thought processes. It consists of various stage theories across several domains of development including Piaget's (1963) cognitive development, Hunt's (1971) conceptual development, Kohlberg's (1975) moral development, and Loevinger's (1987) ego development. One of the three basic assumptions stemming from this theory is that individuals' behavior is positively correlated with their level of psychological complexity (Sprinthall & Mosher, 1978). The second assumption states that higher levels of development equate to greater complexity and more adaptive functioning (Borders, 1998; Kohlberg, 1984). In numerous studies, it has been found that counselors functioning at higher levels of cognitive development are less prejudicial, more empathic and more autonomous, exhibit greater flexibility in counseling techniques, and have greater self-awareness (Brendel, Kolbert, & Foster, 2002; Davidson, 1976). The third assumption is that development occurs throughout the lifetime and can be stimulated through deliberate educational strategies (Manners & Durkin, 2000).

In addition to these assumptions, cognitive developmental theory consists of a number of basic tenets including the following:

1. Cognitive development progresses through stages, and each stage signifies a qualitatively

- different way in which to make meaning of experience. An individual at one stage will experience an event in a very different manner from an individual at another stage.
- 2. Individuals' current developmental stage signifies their preferred manner of making meaning of experience. It is the best way that they know of organizing their thoughts about the world around them and it causes the least amount of disequilibrium.
- 3. Individuals are defined by the stage they use most frequently, but do not function solely in one stage at any given time. Depending on the situation, individuals may function at one stage higher or one stage lower than their preferred, modal stage.
- 4. Individuals have an innate drive to develop. They intrinsically work toward making meaning of their experiences.
- 5. Stage development is sequential and hierarchical. Each stage builds upon the last and the higher the stage the better one is able to function in the world.
- 6. Movement through stages is from less complex to more complex and is invariant and irreversible. It is unidirectional, and stages cannot be skipped. Moreover, individuals do not regress to less complex levels once they have achieved a higher level.
- 7. An individual's behavior is a function of both cognitive complexity and experience (B = f {P, E}). A significant relationship exists between level of development and behavior.
- 8. Growth results from an interaction between a person and the environment. It does not occur automatically.
- 9. Cognitive development results in both physiological and psychological changes. As the brain grows, it has more capacity for assimilating and accommodating new information, but physical growth alone is not enough to stimulate psychological growth. Experience is

also needed.

- 10. Cognitive development is universal across gender and culture. There appear to be no sex differences in development, and stage growth has been found to occur in all cultures.
- 11. Cognitive development is domain specific. Domains are major aspects of human functioning which include thinking, judging, feeling, relating, conceptualizing, and understanding. It is possible to develop in one domain and not another, therefore stage growth is not generalizable across all domains (Dewey, 1963; Harvey, Hunt, & Schroder, 1961; Kohlberg, 1984; Snarey, 1985; Sprinthall, 1978; Sprinthall & Collins, 1984).

The process of development includes both assimilation and accommodation. When individuals encounter new information, they attempt to assimilate it by fitting the information into already existing schemata. If this is not possible, it causes the individual to experience disequilibrium and it is then necessary to accommodate the information by altering existing schema or creating new schema (Piaget, 1963). The conditions required for growth include the use of constructive mismatching in which development is stimulated by applying interventions that are one stage more advanced than where an individual is currently functioning, and by using deliberate psychological education (DPE). A DPE includes providing a significant role-taking experience, guided reflection, balance between the experience and reflection, balance between support and challenge, and continuity (Gielen, 1992).

The therapeutic frame of reference for cognitive developmental theory is that those at lower levels of development have greater difficulty comprehending the abstract (Reiman, Thies-Sprinthall, & Sprinthall, 1993). The theory's view of pathology is that individuals become nonadaptive when their current level of development is not sufficient at enabling them to

function effectively in the environment. Pathology also results from decalage in which individuals experiencing high levels of stress or overwhelming situations become stuck in their current stage thus prematurely halting development (Foster & Sprinthall, 1992). Cognitive developmental theory's therapeutic objective is to determine at which level of development an individual is currently functioning, constructively mismatch interventions and promote growth. The role of the therapist varies based on the client's level of development. For those functioning at lower stages, the therapist needs to be structured and direct, whereas the therapist should be non-directive and unstructured with those at higher stages. The role of the therapist is also to act as a pacer by constructively mismatching interventions (Brendel, Kolbert & Foster, 2002; Foster & McAdams, 1998; Hunt, 1971; Reiman, Thies-Sprinthall, & Sprinthall, 1993).

As stated in the last assumption described above, there are many domains encompassed in cognitive developmental theory, but due to its focus on moral reasoning and just behavior at the macro level (Gielen, 1992; Rest, 1994; Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau, & Thoma, 1999; Thoma, 1994), Kohlberg's theory describing the domain of moral development was chosen for the current study. Not only does the theory address interpersonal relationships between individuals, but it also addresses cooperation at a society level, specifically between diverse ethnic groups (Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau, & Thoma, 1999), thus making it particularly relevant to White school counselor interns working with African American students. It is further appropriate for the population under study because of the traits in an individual it aims to develop. Specifically, moral development emphasizes promoting growth to develop healthy, respectful relationships, uphold ethical behavior, honor the values of others, and support the equality of all human beings (Kegan, 1982). Kohlberg (1974) stated that tolerance is a fortunate by-product of moral

development. Specifically, those at higher levels of moral development hold more tolerant beliefs, attitudes and values. Further, higher stages of moral meaning-making correspond with valuing others, empathy, fairness, respect and flexibility, whereas lower levels are associated with inferiorization, antipathy, dogmatism, and rigidity (Blum, 2002; Kohlberg, 1974; Vogt, 1997).

#### Moral Developmental Domain

Lawrence Kohlberg's theory of moral development describes the cognitive processes of individuals at different levels of development when confronted with moral dilemmas (Rest & Narvaez, 1994). Each of six stages delineated in the theory represents a qualitatively different way to conceptualize social justice, and progression through the stages results from interactions with the environment in a social context (Hayes, 1994). Each stage builds upon the last so that advancement through stages equates to more sophisticated methods of making moral judgments; thus, higher is better. Individuals' moral meaning-making progressively advances toward a basis in universal principles of human rights (Kohlberg, 1975). Studies that included both male and female subjects of all age ranges from Eastern and Western countries and from urban and rural societies with various socioeconomic statuses found the stages of moral development to exist (Gielen, 1992; Snarey, 1985).

Additionally, levels of moral reasoning have been found to be positively correlated with moral behavior (Blasi, 1980; Thoma, 1985). Rest (1986) developed a model describing the link between moral judgment and moral behavior. In this model, he stated that there are four interactive psychological components necessary for moral behavior to occur. These include the following: empathy in order to understand how one's actions affect others; ethical reasoning in

order to decide which is the most moral action to take; moral motivation to determine whether morality is of greater importance over other values in a particular situation; and moral character to gauge one's ego strength, perseverance, courage and conviction to follow through with the moral behavior. Individuals functioning at higher levels of moral development have been found to behave less prejudicially. Davidson (1976) discovered that children at lower levels of moral development made more prejudicial remarks, particularly about African Americans, than did those at higher levels. Because a counselor behaving prejudicially can cause harm to minority clients (Ridley, 1995), it may be important to promote moral growth in White school counselor trainees in order to prevent further repression of African American students. Teachers at higher moral stages have also been found to be better able to utilize more innovative teaching practices in the classroom (McKibbon & Joyce, 1981). From these results, it may be possible to assume that White school counselor interns at higher levels of moral development would be more likely to vary their counseling techniques to be more suitable for African American students. Those at higher stages of moral development more often base their reasoning on principles that value human rights and discourage dogmatism (Vogt, 1997). They are better able to appreciate multiple cultural frameworks as a result of being able to shift from rigid to flexible thinking (Vogt, 1997). Moreover, those at higher stages of moral development were more likely to be social advocates in the community. In a review of 28 research studies, Thoma & Rest (1986) found that those with relatively low scores on the Defining Issues Test (DIT) of moral development were more likely to be cheaters and delinquents, whereas those with higher scores were more likely to be conscientious objectors and social justice leaders. White school counselor interns at higher levels of moral development may be more likely to engage in advocacy efforts so necessary for African

American student achievement. Considering these findings, it became necessary to examine

White school counselor interns' levels of moral development as they relate to the counselor

interns' racial attitudes and perceived competencies for addressing the needs of African

American students in order to substantiate the need for educational strategies that promote the

development of trainees.

#### Purpose of the Study

The purpose of the current study was to explore the relationship between White school counselor interns' attained levels of cognitive development and their racial attitudes and perceived multicultural competencies for meeting the needs of African American students. It was proposed that those at higher levels of moral development will have more positive racial attitudes and perceive themselves to use more appropriate counseling strategies when working with African American students. Based on the results from this study, more cognitively complex White school counselor interns should be better able to apply the multicultural skills, knowledge, and awareness needed when working with African American students. The study's results illuminate the need to apply educational strategies in multicultural courses that promote cognitive development for school counselor trainees.

Specifically, the purpose of the current study was to answer the following questions:

- 1. Is there a relationship between White school counselor interns' stage of moral development and racial attitudes toward multicultural others?
- 2. Is there a relationship between White school counselor interns' stage of moral development and their perceived multicultural counseling competency?
- 3. Is there a difference between White school counselor interns' gender and their levels of

- moral development, racial attitudes, and perceived multicultural counseling competency?
- 4. Is there a difference between White school counselor interns' levels of moral development, racial attitudes, and perceived multicultural counseling competency who are members of professional organizations from those who are not?
- 5. Is there a difference between racial attitudes and perceived multicultural competence?
- 6. Is there a difference between perceived multicultural counseling competence and amount of multicultural training?
- 7. What is the modal stage of moral development among White school counselor interns?

  Definition of Terms

White School Counselor Intern: An individual of Caucasian descent currently fulfilling the practical requirements of CACREP accredited Master's degree programs in school counseling by conducting supervised counseling at the elementary, middle and/or secondary school level.

White School Counselor: An individual of Caucasian descent with a Master's degree in school counseling who practices as a professional at the elementary, middle and/or secondary school level.

African American Student: An American Black of African descent (with origin in any of the black race groups of Africa) (U.S. Department of Commerce, 2002) who is a pupil at an elementary, middle or secondary school.

Moral Development: A theory developed by Lawrence Kohlberg that describes the way in which individuals think about issues of social justice, ethics and fairness at six different, hierarchical stages with higher stages indicating a principled perspective.

Racial Attitude: One's feelings with regard to the favorableness of people of color that are

characteristically acquired through observational learning, are typically not influenced by verbal persuasion, and often correspond to one's behavior (LaFleur, Rowe, & Leach, 2002).

Tolerance: Beliefs, attitudes and behaviors that do not discriminate against others' rights despite differences in culture or ethnicity, and aim to promote harmony and understanding in society.

Tolerance requires an acceptance of diversity and a commitment to promote equality and peace (Vogt, 1997).

#### Method

A correlational study examining the relationship between White school counselor interns' moral development levels, racial attitudes, and perceived multicultural counseling competence was conducted. The sample consisted of 57 school counselor interns from several CACREP accredited institutions in Southeastern United States. Data was collected during regularly scheduled group supervision sessions using the Defining Issues Test-2, the New Racism Scale, and the Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Survey-Revised. The obtained data was analyzed using descriptive and multivariate correlational analyses to determine the direction and magnitude of the relationship between the measures (Gall, Borg, & Gall, 1996).

#### Limitations of the Study

The following limitations existed for this study:

- 1. The school counselor interns who chose to participate in the study may have been significantly different from those who opted not to participate.
- Since the population used in the study came from a limited number of training programs
  in Southeast United States, the results may not be generalizable to all school counselor
  interns in the country.

- 3. The results may have been impacted by the participants' desire to respond to the instruments in a socially acceptable manner.
- 4. Due to the nature of the study, it was impossible to control for all extraneous variables, therefore the results may have been impacted by variables other than moral development, bias and perceived competency.
- 5. The results may have been impacted by decalage in which respondents may have appeared to be functioning at a lower stage than where they were actually functioning due to the sensitivity of the topic under investigation.

#### **Ethical Considerations**

In accordance with Section E of the American Counseling Association Ethical Code (1995), the following precautions were considered in protecting the welfare of the participants. Endorsement to conduct the study was obtained from the researcher's dissertation chair and committee. Further, the researcher secured approval by the Human Subjects Board of the College of William and Mary prior to collecting data. All participants were informed of the purpose of the research and were asked to sign informed consent forms. Additionally, participants were told that they may opt out of the study at any time without penalty.

#### Summary

This chapter provided a general description of the problem of White school counselors adequately meeting the needs of African American students. Justification for the current study was established by examining current counselor training approaches and the prevailing social and educational issues that impact African American students despite these approaches. It was indicated that cognitive development and specifically moral development may significantly

impact White school counselor interns' approach with African American students. The theoretical basis was explained, the purpose and hypotheses stated, definition of terms provided, description of sample given, data gathering procedures described, and the limitations and ethical considerations were explored. Chapter two reviews the pertinent literature related to the problem and the theoretical rationale.

#### Chapter Two

#### Review of the Literature

#### Introduction

This chapter reviews pertinent literature addressing the following four points: 1) the issues pertaining to White school counselors and counselor interns meeting the needs of African American students in the schools, 2) current school counselor multicultural training approaches, 3) the limitations of these preparatory approaches, and 4) an alternative response. Cognitive developmental theory and specifically, moral development is presented, and literature exploring the connection between counselor behaviors and levels of personal growth is examined. Finally, the significance of assessing White school counselor interns' stages of moral development in relation to their racial attitudes and perceived competencies for addressing the needs of African American students is explored.

White School Counselor Challenges In Meeting the Needs of African American Students

White school counselors must meet the needs of African American students in the schools despite the daunting challenges with which they are faced in meeting these needs. It is important to recognize both the demands inherent in the school counselor's job as well as the unique needs of African American students in order to understand just how challenging this task can be. Following is a review of the literature pertaining to these issues.

#### Job Demands

With higher student enrollment, greater counselor case-loads, expectation for increased accountability, changing demographics in our nation, and challenging social issues impacting today's children, the school counselor's job is increasingly complex and demanding (Kesler,

1990; Rubenstein & Zager, 1995; Stickel, 1991). In fact, Sears and Navins (1983) surveyed 240 school counselors who attended two conferences in Ohio and found that 65% rated their job as moderately to very stressful. Participants were asked to complete a demographic questionnaire and rate how stressful they felt their job to be on a five-point likert scale from 1= not at all stressful to 5 = extremely stressful. Using the same scale, participants were then asked to rate how stressful they found 40 specific school counselor duties to be. The results indicated that the most stressful duties were work overload, and conflicting and ambiguous roles. The authors provided no information pertaining to the validity and reliability of the scales used, and the sample used in this study may not be representative of all school counselors across the country. Nonetheless, the results do provide insight into what seems to be the overwhelming nature of the occupation. Concurring with these results, Stickel (1991) surveyed 147 rural school counselors using the Maslach Burnout Inventory and the Minnesota Satisfaction Questionnaire. Results indicated that the greater the case-load, the higher the incidence of burnout among school counselors. It is necessary to note that since the sample used was from rural school districts, the results may not be transferable to counselor interns in other settings. However, since the results are similar to those found by others studying burnout among school counselors in various settings (Burnham & Jackson, 2000; Mercer, 1981; Sears and Navins, 1983) it may be possible to assume that the results are generalizable.

Already stressed by the amount of work they are expected to conduct, the school counselor role has become increasingly multifaceted as illustrated by Sears (1993) in her description of school counselor responsibilities. This description of school counselor roles is described more recently in American School Counselor Association (ASCA) National Model

(ASCA, 2003). Specifically, it is necessary for counselors to design comprehensive skills-based programs to address all students. These programs should promote students' personal, educational and career development. Counselors must actively participate in the implementation of these programs by allocating time for classroom guidance and small group sessions as well as teacher training. In addition, counselors must allow time for providing individual counseling to students to address personal problems and crises. They must consult with parents, teachers, administrators, and community agencies in order to provide the most holistic interventions for students, while at the same time recruiting and collaborating with outside agency efforts. In order to ensure that students' needs are being met, it is necessary for counselors to manage the school counseling program by overseeing program implementation, conducting thorough evaluations of their services to show accountability, and revising ineffective services. School counselors must also make the time to keep thorough records of the types of services provided and to whom they are provided (ASCA, 2003; Sears, 1993).

The roles of the school counselor described by Sears (1993) and the National Model (ASCA, 2003) focus primarily on tasks directly related to counseling and student development. Unfortunately, many school counselors are unable to avoid administrative and non-counseling tasks which contribute to their already overwhelming workload (Stickel, 1991). Specifically, these duties include the following: scheduling, record keeping, managing transcripts, supervising school clubs, monitoring halls, restrooms and lunch periods, policing the loading/unloading of busses, proctoring tests, and overseeing report-card distribution. It is not surprising that these tasks interfere with school counselors' abilities to address the many real challenges facing their young clients (Burnham & Jackson, 2000).

Challenging Social and Educational Issues Affecting Students

The literature discussed thus far has provided insight into the overwhelming and demanding job description of the school counselor, but has not addressed specific challenges related to working with today's students. In order to understand how difficult the school counselor's job is, it is necessary to recognize the daunting social and educational demands affecting students today. It is not uncommon for counselors to be faced with students who are pregnant, dying from gunshot wounds, dropping out of school, and committing suicide (Sears, 1993). Rubenstein and Zager (1995) found that one fourth of adolescents are at risk of substance abuse, crime, unprotected sex, and/or academic failure. And while it is imperative that these students receive counseling to prevent and remediate these problems, due to a desire to seek independence and autonomy, it is not uncommon for adolescents to present in a defensive, resistant, and even defiant manner, thus interfering with the counselor's attempts at establishing a positive therapeutic relationship (Hanna, Hanna, & Keys, 1999; Walsh, 1993). School counselors must be prepared to deal with these problems.

Gerler (1991) described a number of additional issues counselors must face when working with today's students. Included are changes in the structure of families. The traditional family is virtually an anomaly. In its place are divorced, single-parent, same sex, and blended families (Carter & McGoldrick, 1999; Walsh, 1993). Counselors must be able to revise traditional approaches, which are typically based on the traditional nuclear family, in order to help students develop properly in these new family configurations (Rose & Rose, 1992; Walsh, 1993). Another pertinent issue is the prevalence of child abuse and neglect (Green & Keys, 2001). Counselors need to offer physical and sexual abuse prevention groups to parents, provide

individual counseling to student victims of abuse, educate teachers about warning signs of abuse, maintain contacts with community agencies that may assist with abuse cases, and advocate for victims rights (Gerler, 1991). A third issue facing school counselors is drug abuse (Gerler, 1991; Sears, 1993). Even as early as elementary school, students are experimenting with drugs, and even more students are exposed to addiction at home (Green & Keys, 2001). Counselors must provide prevention and intervention to these students (Gerler, 1991). School counselors are also becoming more involved with students in special education (Lofaro, 1982; Strohmer, Biggs, Haase & Purcell, 1983). There is a demand for counselors to assist in developing a supportive educational environment for these students and their parents. Through consultation, counselors can assist teachers in providing appropriate support to students with disabilities and their parents as well (Gerler, 1991; Seligman, 1983; Seligman & Darling, 1989). The changing demographics of the work force create new challenges for school counselors as well (Gerler, 1991). As women and minorities are afforded greater career opportunities, it is necessary to assist them in expanding their career aspirations and preparing for the demands of work (Muller, 2000; Whiston, Sexton & Lasoff, 1998). It is also crucial that school counselors advocate for continued improvement in equality for women and minorities in the work force (Muller, 2000).

Eurther impacting educational and career success are advancements in technology (Bleuer & Walz, 1983). School counselors must acquire technological competence in order to keep up with current trends, integrate technology in counseling services, and appropriately address the affects of technological advances on student learning and development (Gerler, 1991). Promoting student achievement is an important expectation for school counselors who must collaborate with teachers, administration, and parents to combat absenteeism, lack of motivation, procrastination,

27

behavior problems, and other variables which impede students' achievement (Baker & Gerler, 2001; Borders & Drury, 1992; Gerler, 1991; Lee, 1993; Praport, 1993; Wirth-Bond, Coyne & Adams, 1991). Student achievement is also affected by students' relations with others.

Counselors must assist students in acquiring the skills for developing healthy relationships with teachers, peers, and parents. Positive relationship skills will help to bridge gaps between cultures in our society (Diver-Stamnes, 1991; Gerler, 1991; Verduyn, Lord & Forrest, 1990).

The Challenge of Working With Diverse Students

Learning to work with diverse students and promote tolerance in the schools is another challenge (Baruth & Manning, 2003; Gerler,1991; Herring, 1997; Kalyanpur & Harry, 1999; Lee, 1995). Each social and educational issue confronting counselors as described above, including student achievement, technology, career opportunity, drug abuse, child abuse, and family structure, must be perceived and handled differently when viewed through differing cultural lenses (Herring, 1997; Kalyanpur & Harry, 1999; Lee, 1995). Counselors are required to adapt traditional counseling strategies to suit the needs of diverse students and must collaborate with all involved in the school system to promote cultural understanding (Kalyanpur & Harry, 1999; Sanchez, 1995). Additionally, school counselors must vary curriculum, assessment instruments, and interventions in order to best meet the needs of diverse students (Sanchez, 1995).

Specific Challenges in Working With African American Students

School counselors are faced with specific challenges in relation to counseling African American students. They must be willing to work through their own racism, both intentional and unintentional, and come to appreciate African American culture in order to be an effective counselor (Carter & McGoldrick, 1999; Bolton-Brownlee, 1987). Carter and McGoldrick (1999)

emphasize the need for counselors to be aware of the historical, social, political, developmental and cultural issues that impact diverse clients. This awareness is said to contribute to multicultural counseling competence. Constantine (2002) surveyed 99 school counselor trainees from universities in the Midwestern and Northeastern United States with regard to the impact of racism on multicultural counseling competence. Comparisons were made from results of the New Racism Scale (NRS) and the Multicultural Counseling Knowledge and Awareness Scale (MCKA). The NRS measures Whites' perception of African Americans and was found to have a Cronbach's Alpha of .70. The MCKA is a self-perceived measurement of multicultural counseling competence and was found to have an overall Cronbach's Alpha of .83. The results showed a significant inverse relationship between scores on the NRS and MCKA, thus those who had negative attitudes toward African Americans also reported less multicultural counseling competence.

This study had two primary limitations. Because the sample was chosen from a specific region of the U.S. the results may not be generalizable to all school counselors. In addition, the self-report nature of the study may have resulted in participants responses to be based on their perceptions of their ability rather than their actual multicultural counseling competence.

However, these limitations do not disqualify the benefits of the research. The study shows the importance of addressing and working through racism in order to provide the optimum care for students. If racist attitudes exist, it is likely that interventions will be harmful, or at the very least, African American students may be further misunderstood and scorned. On the other hand, those who are tolerant and have greater multicultural counseling competence are likely to better understand and relate to the diverse issues of African American students.

Having been raised in a racist society, many African American students react negatively to White counselors. In the face of defensiveness and resistance, White counselors need to remain empathic by understanding the social reasons for the behavior (Kiselica, 1998). Due to cultural mistrust which has resulted from oppression by the dominant culture, it is not uncommon for African Americans to mistrust Whites (Kiselica, 1998). Watkins, Terrell, Terrell, and Miller (1989) conducted a study to determine how mistrust impacts African Americans' perception of White counselors' credibility and ability to help them solve their problems, as well as the extent of their willingness to seek counseling from White counselors. The researchers had 60 African American males and 60 African American females from a Northeastern African American college volunteer to participate in their study. The average age of the participants was 19.1 years. Each participant completed the *Background Information Questionnaire* (BIQ), the *Cultural Mistrust Inventory* (CMI), the *Counselor Effectiveness Rating Scale* (CERS), the *Personal Problem Inventory* (PPI), the *Willingness to See the Counselor* (WSC) item, and manipulation check items.

The BIQ is a general demographic form used to obtain information about the participants. The CMI is a 48 item inventory which measures African Americans' mistrust of Whites.

Individuals rate each item on a 7-point likert scale ranging from 1 = strongly agree to 7 = strongly disagree. High scores correspond to a considerable mistrust of Whites. Test-retest reliability has been found to be .82. The CERS consists of ten items to measure counselor credibility. Items are rated using a 7-point semantic differential scale that ranges from 1 = bad to 7 = good. High scores indicate greater counselor credibility. The scale has been found to have a reliability coefficient of .90. The PPI was used in the study to assess participants' perceptions of how well

they felt the counselor could help them with each of 20 problems typical of college students. Items were rated on a six-point likert scale ranging from 1 = very doubtful to 6 = very confident. High ratings indicated confidence in the counselor's abilities. No information was provided on this inventory's reliability or validity. The WSC consists of one item which asks participants to rate their willingness to see the counselor on a six-point scale from 1 = very unwilling to 6 = verywilling. Willingness to see the counselor is indicated by high scores. No information was provided on this item's reliability or validity. There were two manipulation check items. In order to ensure that the participants in both of the experimental groups could place themselves in the role of a client, the first manipulation question asked participants to rate how well they could identify with the client in the presented problems on a six-point likert scale from very difficult (1) to very easy (6). The results indicated that all participants were able to relate to the client to an equal degree. To ensure that the participants in each experimental group were clear about the race of the counselor described to them in the study, the second manipulation question asked the participants to indicate the race of the counselor from the following five options: White, African American, Hispanic, Asian, other, or unspecified. Despite the fact that 7% checked the incorrect race, all participants' data was included in the final analysis.

The individuals participated in the study over the course of two sessions. During the first, they completed the BIQ and the CMI. During the second, the participants were separated into two experimental groups. One of the experimental groups was read a description of a White professional counselor and the other experimental group was read a description of a Black professional counselor. They were then asked to complete the remaining questionnaires. The results showed that African Americans rated as highly mistrustful on the CMI considered White

counselors to be less credible and less able to help them with their problems than African American counselors.

The fact that the study used college students' perceptions of client experiences rather than actual clients is a limitation for generalizing these results to the actual counseling forum.

Additionally, the study focused on professional counseling psychologists rather than school counselors, thus further limiting the transferability of the findings. Finally, since no validity and reliability ratings were provided for the PPI and the WSC, results from these inventories may not be trustworthy. Nonetheless, the study sheds light on the potential impact of mistrust on the White counselor/African American client relationship. School counselors must face the challenge to be sensitive to an ingrained level of mistrust for Whites that many African American students may harbor and they must be aware of how this mistrust could negatively affect interventions. By showing understanding and respect for the different mannerisms, speech, cultural perspectives, and regard for school and achievement of African American students, school counselors are much more likely to gain their trust (Baruth & Manning, 2000). In addition to recognizing the challenges inherent in working with African American students, school counselors must also understand their distinct characteristics and needs in order to provide the most effective services (Kiselica, 1998).

The Unique Needs of African American students

As a result of historic social forces that impact their lives (i.e. slavery, segregation, KKK, economic struggles), and the negative effects of racism, both intentional and unintentional,

African American students are faced with hurdles that other students are not. Parker and

McDavis (1989) conducted a needs assessment of African American elementary school students

from an urban inner city locale by interviewing various counselors, teachers, administrators and students in the community's predominantly African American elementary schools. The results of the interviews indicated that the African American students present with problems in the following areas: self-concept, vocational goals, social skills, work ethic, study skills, and testtaking skills. The authors suggested addressing these issues using culturally sensitive strategies such as the use of small, homogenous groups. They stated that unless these needs are dealt with at an early age, many African American students will experience difficulties achieving academically, socially and professionally as adults. A significant limitation to this study is that specifics pertaining to interview structure and data analysis were not delineated. As well, the data retrieved was from one community and focused on one age group. Thus, it may not be generalizable to all African American students in the U.S. On the other hand, the results provide insight into the specific needs of African American students, and should be considered when developing guidance curricula. While yet another challenge for school counselors, the results lend credence to the importance of addressing African American students' problems early on in order to provide them with the skills necessary for future success (Lee, 1995; Parker and McDavis, 1989).

Many authors (Baruth & Manning, 2003; Howard-Hamilton & Behar-Horenstein, 1995; Lee, 1995; Lee, 1982; Locke, 1989; Muller, 2000; Parker & McDavis, 1989; Utsey, Ponterotto, Reynolds, & Cancelli, 2000) have detailed some of the specific needs of African American students. They concur that the impact of social forces, negative self-identity, and a non-supportive educational system often results in poor achievement among African American students. Currently, the effects of these issues impact African American students' ability to

33

pursue vocational interests. Poor academic achievement, economic difficulties, lack of positive role models and unequal job opportunities inhibit the career development process of African American students. Traditional career counseling techniques do not take into account the social pressures impacting African Americans, and thus are insufficient in addressing the specific issues mentioned above. It is not unusual for these obstacles to dissuade African American students from succeeding. The limitations and frustrations may be manifested in high levels of stress, behavioral problems, drug abuse, crime, and failure, which often result in a perception of these students as being inadequate rather than victims of a faulty system. African American students need counselors not only to address their individual needs but to advocate for systemic change (Baruth & Manning, 2003; Lee, 1995; Sanchez, 1995).

Day-Vines (in press) described conflicting roles as an additional unique challenge faced by many African American students. African Americans may define themselves as part of mainstream America, a minority, and/or of African descent. African American students learn to value the mainstream American belief in independence, upward mobility, and commercial trends broadcasted in the media. Additionally, they recognize their identity as a minority with a history of oppression and impacted by white privilege and racism. Finally, many African American students learn to honor their culture through celebration of Kwanza, display of cultural artifacts in the home, and through stories of their heritage told by elders in the family. These three roles may be in conflict at times, thus causing role confusion. For example, an African American student who pursues academic achievement may be viewed as "acting white" and thus ostracized from his/her same-race peer group. This is likely to cause inner turmoil for the student. African American students need counselors who can help them to negotiate these three roles in order to

develop healthy self identities (Day-Vines, in press).

Because their communities provide a valuable support system, one way in which to address African American students' specific needs is through group counseling. According to Lee (1982), "...peer group interaction is an important means of both social identification and emotional support for the African American child" (p. 95). Maturity and development of the African American student is more likely to be defined through familial connection, collectivism, and allegiance to others, versus individualism that is revered in the dominant American culture (Markstrom-Adams & Adams, 1995; Paniagua, 1994). School counselors must challenge themselves to be aware of cultural characteristics such as this and learn to utilize them in counseling interventions.

Central to the needs of African American students is an empathic school counselor who is able to recognize the impact of an oppressive past and an ambivalent present (Kiselica, 1998; Locke, 1989; Sandhu, 2001). Empathy enables counselors to understand the underlying reasons for abrasive or offish behavior, and helps them to refrain from responding in a defensive or angry manner (Kiselica, 1998). Without empathy, it is unlikely that school counselors will be able to establish a trusting relationship, remain non-judgmental, and be responsive to their specific needs (Pederson, 1990; Wittmer, 1992). It has even been found that, "empathy is a greater source of effect than race in perceived rapport" (p. 91; Banks, 1972). In fact, as far back as 1972, Banks found that even African American clients who typically preferred African American counselors chose an empathic White counselor over a non-empathic African American counselor. In order for White school counselors to best help African American students to develop the skills necessary to address these issues both in and out of school, it is essential that White school

counselors be cognizant of these unique social and educational issues that face African American students.

Simply knowing what the unique needs of African American students are and the challenges inherent in working with the population may not be enough. School counselors must be adequately prepared to face the challenges of meeting the needs of African American students. Current multicultural counseling training approaches tend to be educational and didactic in nature. Trainee preparation focuses on self-awareness, cultural awareness, and skill development. Many of the standardized multicultural training requirements focus on these areas of preparation as well. A discussion of their overall utility will follow.

Current Multicultural Training Approaches for School Counselors

Standardized requirements

Today, school counselor training programs accredited by the Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP) are required to include course work pertaining to multicultural counseling (CACREP, 2002). Specifically, instructors must address current trends in diversity issues, characteristics of multicultural groups, attitudes and behaviors associated with diverse groups, and specific multicultural counseling strategies (CACREP, 2002). Prior to the establishment of this accrediting board, it was left up to the individual counseling programs to decide whether or not to address multicultural issues. While the establishment of these standards is a step in the right direction, CACREP does not clearly delineate how social and cultural issues are to be taught (Neukrug, 1999), and as a result, programs vary greatly. Some designate a specific course to multicultural training while others infuse it into course work throughout the program of study.

It is not uncommon for CACREP accredited programs to subscribe to ethical standards for multicultural counseling that have been established by the American School Counseling Association (ASCA). According to ASCA's ethical standards, school counselors are expected to respect all counselees and to provide nonprejudicial services to all students (ASCA, 2002). Therefore, school counselors are expected to provide appropriate cross-cultural and multicultural services to those with diverse backgrounds (Herring, 1998; Herring, 1997). Professional school counselors who are members of ASCA are also ethically obligated to abide by these standards (ASCA, 2002).

In addition to ethical standards for practice, the American School Counseling Association endorsed the establishment of the National Standards for School Counselors (American School Counseling Association, 2003; Campbell & Dahir, 1997). These standards provide further support for competent multicultural school counseling by emphasizing the importance of addressing *all* students' academic, social, and career development. Further, the standards have as a primary goal, the reduction of the achievement gap that exists between African American and White students (American School Counseling Association, 2003; Campbell & Dahir, 1997). When considering CACREP standards, ASCA's ethical code, and the National Standards for School Counselors, it is obvious that multicultural competence is expected for practicing school counselors. However, these documents do not address approaches to multicultural training. Following is a review of articles addressing the current focus and procedures for preparing school counselors to counsel diverse students.

Current Multicultural Counselor Training Focus

Multicultural Counseling Competencies have been developed by the Association of

Multicultural Counseling and Development (AMCD) (Arredondo, 1999). They specifically address counselor attitudes, knowledge and skills applied to each of the following three areas: 1) "counselor awareness of own cultural values and biases," 2) "counselor awareness of client's worldview," and 3) "culturally appropriate intervention strategies" (on-line; AMCD, 2002). While it is not required that counselors follow these standards, they do specify the minimum criteria necessary for counselors to provide appropriate multicultural interventions with clients (Neukrug, 1999). These competencies seem to form the basis for most counselor training programs.

Focusing specifically on counselor self-awareness, Herring (1998) conducted a qualitative research study to determine the impact of self-awareness on multicultural counseling competency in school counselor trainees. Participants in the study included 85 master's level school counseling students in the internship phase of their training from six different universities in Arkansas and South Carolina. Using a questionnaire, the participants were asked to respond to the following three open-ended questions: 1) "What, in your opinion, are two of the most important goals multicultural counseling should seek to accomplish?", 2) "What do you identify as multicultural practices that you have observed or used in your internship?", and 3) "When you think about multicultural counseling, what are two questions you would like answered before you begin counseling, and what are your concerns about the implementation of multicultural practices?" Students completed the questionnaire during one internship meeting. A concept formation approach was used to analyze the data. Responses were classified by key words, and categories were developed. These categories were further reduced, and themes related to the three questions emerged.

For the first question, the greatest percent of participants (34%) stated that the most important goal for multicultural counseling was gaining knowledge about diverse others while 25% specified the importance of the role of the counselor. This included counselor awareness of values and unbiased counseling of diverse others. Another 24% of the participants indicated affective characteristics including respect and tolerance as the most important goal for multicultural counseling. The most common responses (39%) for question two in reference to multicultural practices observed or used during internship, were related to direct counselor activities which require specific multicultural skill while 31% described content practices such as cultural awareness activities. For the third question pertaining to questions and concerns trainees had prior to beginning multicultural counseling, answers were either skill based (47%) or selffocused (53%). Skill based questions pertained to multicultural counseling strategies and resources while self-focused concerns addressed issues of power, bias, and acculturation. These results indicate that the aims of multicultural counseling for the participants in this study are diverse. There was considerable disparity in the results which shows how variant the trainees' multicultural education experiences were. In response to the results, Herring (1998) suggests the need for a unified model for teaching multicultural counseling. He also emphasized the need to assess students' multicultural development throughout their program of study. Consequently, individual differences may be recognized and addressed appropriately. Aside from the threat to generalizability posed by not using a national sample, the information provided in this study enables counselor educators to recognize not only specific topics and issues to address that would benefit trainees' professional development but also the need to vary educational strategies to best match trainees' individual differences.

Specific models of multicultural counselor training have emerged as well (Pederson, 1988; Sue and Sue, 1990). As with the multicultural standards and competencies, each of these models stresses the importance of self-awareness, knowledge about diverse others, and culturally appropriate skills. Self-awareness includes the exploration of one's own culture, as well as one's values, biases, and beliefs. Knowledge about diverse others includes information about different culture's beliefs, values, traditions, history and oppression. Culturally appropriate skills are those that consider the unique needs of an individual based on the situation and his or her culture, and include appropriate communication skills and interventions (Arredondo, 1999; Baruth & Manning, 2000; Midgette & Meggert, 1991; Sanchez, 1995; Wittmer, 1992). One such model developed by Wittmer (1992) uses the acronym ASK to address Awareness of self and others, Skills that are sensitive to multicultural groups (communication skills in particular), and Knowledge of different cultures.

Based on teaching experience, extensive reading, and personal experiences, Kiselica (1998) emphasized the need for self-exploration to address both White racism and cultural encapsulation (having an ethnocentric perception of the world in which cultural variations are disregarded) in order to avoid stereotyping, misunderstanding clients, and seeing only the dominant worldview as legitimate. It may be possible to challenge White racism and cultural encapsulation through exploration of one's own culture, the cultures of others, and plenty of processing (Locke, 1989). Herring (1997) emphasizes the importance of teaching counselors the most appropriate skills for working with African American students. He suggests teaching crosscultural communication skills, avenues for effective advocacy, appropriate use of assessment measures, and competent use of counseling theory. Beckett and Dungee-Anderson (1996)

emphasize the importance of awareness, knowledge and skill. They developed an eight-step model for increasing helping professionals' ability to communicate with minority populations. The steps include the following: 1) acknowledging cultural differences, 2) knowing oneself, 3) knowing other cultures, 4) identifying and valuing differences, 5) identifying and avoiding stereotypes, 6) empathizing with persons from other cultures, 7) adapting rather than adopting, and 8) acquiring recovery skills.

It is puzzling that despite these types of preparatory approaches, school counselors still are not adequately meeting the needs of African American students. In fact, school counseling has recently been found to be less effective for African American students than it is for White students, an achievement gap persists between Whites and African Americans, and detrimental social issues for African American students still prevail (see next section).

Limitations of the Current School Counselor Multicultural Training Approaches

\*Achievement Gap\*\*

Presently in the United States, an achievement gap exists between White students and African American students (Adams & Singh, 1998; Armor, 1997; Baruth & Manning, 2000; U.S. Department of Education, 2001). The U.S. Department of Education's No Child Left Behind (2001) initiative reported that in 2000, 40% of White fourth graders were at or above proficient in reading as compared to only 12% of African American fourth graders. As for math, 35% of White fourth graders were at or above proficient in 2000 compared to 5% of their African American peers. The initiative stated that low expectations of teachers and staff contribute to this achievement gap (U.S. Department of Education/No Child Left Behind, 2001). Haycock, Jerald, and Huang (2001) analyzed data from the National Assessment of Educational Progress

(commonly known as "the Nation's report Card"), and found that by the end of fourth grade, African American students were, on average, two years behind White students. By the end of eighth grade, African American's were found to be approximately three years behind their White peers, and by the end of twelfth grade, African American students were found to be an astonishing four years behind White students. Ten percent fewer African American's graduate from high school and 10% fewer graduate from college than White students (U.S. Department of Commerce, 2002). "Nationally, African American boys score lower than any other group on standardized tests and are three times more likely than their Caucasian American counterparts to be misplaced in special education or classes for slow learners. They are retained in grade more than their Caucasian American classmates, particularly at the elementary level" (p.185, Rodney, Rodney, Crafter, & Mupier, 1999). African American's are repeatedly overrepresented in special education and restrictive learning environments yet underrepresented in gifted and talented programming (Indiana Education Policy Center, 2000). In 1990, African Americans accounted for 16% of the public school population in America but 35% of those classified with mild mental retardation. This discrepancy is greater than for any other minority group (Indiana Education Policy Center, 2000).

Additionally, research has shown that the presence of African American students in a school negatively impacts all students' achievement (Caldas & Bankston, 1997). In fact, Bankston and Caldas (1996) conducted a study to determine whether or not the presence of African Americans in schools impacted individual achievement. They assessed the achievement test scores on the Graduation Exit Examination (GEE) of 42,041 tenth grade students in Louisiana. A multivariate regression analysis was conducted on the data. Their results showed

that the presence of African Americans in the schools had a significant negative impact on all students' achievement test scores, even when controlling for socioeconomic factors including referrals for acting out and being of low income. Being African American was found to be related to underachievement, and schools with a high concentration of African American students were the most likely to have underachieving individuals; particularly underachieving African American students. The results indicate that African American students are most negatively impacted by schools with a high minority concentration. This problem is perpetuated due to African Americans being isolated by school districts that are frequently determined by residential boundaries that commonly segregate a community. Thus, African American students typically go to school with other African American students while White students go to schools dominated by White students. Since schools serving minorities frequently lack the resources and support needed for academic success (Caldas & Bankston, 1997), Bankston and Caldas (1996) suggest the need for redistribution to establish the optimal percentage of Whites and minorities at schools in order to increase African American's achievement while not reducing White's achievement. Until greater efforts are taken to either desegregate schools or provide more funding and support to schools attended primarily by minorities, counselors must seek ways to help African American students improve upon their achievement scores particularly within high minority concentration schools.

While no specific data was provided on the validity and reliability of the GEE, the author claimed that the test has gone through a rigorous validation process including numerous revisions. As of now, no predictive validity tests have been conducted. Not having data to confirm the GEE's validity and reliability is a limitation of this study. Without data supporting

43

the achievement test, one hesitates to assume its worth. As well, despite the fact that a tremendous sample was used, it is difficult to generalize the results to all students since the sample came from only one state. Nonetheless, the results of the study show that, despite their current efforts, school counselors have been unsuccessful at invoking equality in academic outcomes for African American students. Because the National standards for School Counselors (ASCA, 2003; Campbell & Dahir, 1997) have clearly stated that a primary goal for school counseling is to reduce the current achievement gap, it can be deduced from the data presented above that they have not been successful at meeting this goal. It is also important for counselors to recognize that the social issues which continue to affect African American students have not abated as a result of current counseling practices.

Prevailing Social Issues Impacting African American Students

The U.S. Department of Commerce (2000) indicates that individuals with no high school diploma are two times more likely to require welfare. When considering the achievement gap between African Americans and Whites and the high levels of drop-out and expulsion among African American students, it is no surprise that they make up the majority of those in need of assistance. At 36%, African Americans represent the highest percentage of individuals in poverty. As indicated by data from the U.S. Department of Education, "Poor and minority children usually go to the worst schools, have less expected of them, are taught by less knowledgeable teachers, and have the least amount of power to alter bad situations" (p. 2; Thomas B. Fordham Foundation, 1999). Frequently, African American students are passed from grade to grade never having learned how to read (Thomas B. Fordham Foundation, 1999).

It is also not uncommon for African American students to be suspended at a much higher

rate than White students (Clark, Petras, and Kellam, 2000; Skiba, Michael, Nardo & Pederson, 2000; U.S. Department of Education: Civil Rights Office, 2000). In fact, The U.S. Department of Education: Civil Rights Office collects data annually on rates of suspension based on various demographic characteristics including race using the Office of Civil Rights Elementary and Secondary School Survey (OCR E&S Survey). In 2000, data was collected from 14,681 public school districts. The results indicated that African American students represent 17% of the public school population but 32% of all suspensions. Specifically in Virginia, students with out of school suspension are greater than two times more likely to be African American than White, and greater than three times more likely to be African American than White in D.C. Considering current research which shows that suspension is positively correlated with later troubles such as delinquency, dropping-out, and substance abuse, alternative interventions should be sought (Greenberg & Bumbarger, 1999; NASP, 2002).

Clark, Petras, and Kellam (2000) conducted a study of the rates of suspension for African American female students. The sample consisted of 1,084 elementary school students in the Baltimore MD region. Of those students, 328 had been suspended. This subsample had 120 girls (34.8%), and 87% of them were African American. The results indicate that more African American females are suspended than are White females. Although, it should be noted that the racial demographics of the 1,084 students was not delineated, therefore, it is difficult to assume that the subsample of girls was disproportionately represented by African Americans.

The results also showed that African American students were described as more disrespectful and more aggressive than their White peers despite not having been rated by their teachers as highly aggressive on the Authority Acceptance Scale. It is unclear whether these

45

results indicate that African American girls behave more aggressively than expected by their teachers or whether they are mislabeled as aggressive because they are African American.

Nonetheless, the results do illuminate the need for school counselors to find more effective means for helping African American students develop better anger management skills.

Additionally, the results may be used by school counselors to address school faculty and staff by helping them to dispel inappropriate assumptions about the aggressiveness of African American students and develop more appropriate interventions than suspension.

Further evidence of the disproportionality between African Americans and Whites related to school suspension was documented by the Indiana Education Policy Center (Skiba, Michael, Nardo & Peterson, 2000). As part of a grant received by the Office of Special Education Programs, Department of Education, data was retrieved from the disciplinary records for the 1994-95 school year of all 11,001 middle school students from a large Midwestern school district serving over 50,000 students. African American students accounted for 56% of the sample and Whites accounted for 42%. The disciplinary records were coded, and the researchers compared the differences between out of school suspension rates and expulsion rates as well as reasons for the disciplinary actions for African Americans and Whites. Based on Reschly's (1997) criterion for judging disproportionality, a disproportionate representation is considered to exist when, "its proportion in the target classification (e.g. suspension) exceeds its representation in the population by 10% of that representation" (p. 3; Skiba, Michael, Nardo & Peterson, 2000). This 10% of the population proportion was used to determine whether or not disproportionality existed in the data set between African American and White students. Additionally, analysis of covariance was used to determine whether or not socioeconomic status as determined by the use

of free or reduced lunch minimized the mean difference between rates of suspension for African American and White students. Finally, discriminant analysis was used to differentiate the types of disciplinary actions committed by African Americans and Whites that resulted in referrals to the principal.

The results indicated that African American students were referred to the principal for infractions and suspended two times more often than were Whites. Furthermore, the results indicated that African Americans were disproportionately overrepresented in referrals (+11.1%) and in suspensions (+13.5%) while Whites were underrepresented (respectively: -7.3%; -9.1%). Most shocking is the discrepancy between African Americans and Whites who were expelled. African Americans represented 80.9% of expulsions while Whites represented 17%. African Americans were grossly overrrepresented (+24.9%) while Whites were extremely underrepresented (-25.0%). Socioeconomic status was not found to significantly alter the mean differences in disciplinary measures based on race. Finally, "Black students in this sample appear to be referred to the office for infractions that are both less serious and more subjective in their interpretation than White students. White students were significantly more likely than Black students to be referred to the office for smoking, leaving without permission, vandalism, and obsene language. Black students were more likely to be referred for disrespect, excessive noise, threat, and loitering" (p. 13; Skiba, Michael, Nardo & Peterson, 2000). The researchers concluded that the disproportionality in rates of suspension appear to be due more to bias and discrimination than to the idea that African American students are simply bigger troublemakers than their White counterparts. For example, African American's physical, active communication styles may be interpreted as combative or threatening by those who accept stereotypes or have a

47

culturally encapsulated worldview. It seems then, what is needed is teacher training in cultural values, norms and attributes (such as differences in communication styles) to enable them to use culturally competent classroom management strategies and teaching methods (Skiba, Michael, Nardo & Peterson, 2000). Because the sample used was from one school district in Indiana, its generalizability may be limited, however, the results are consistent with other research examining the disproportionality between African Americans and Whites who have been suspended.

Moreover, this was the first empirical examination of discriminatory treatment of African American students pertaining to school suspension. More research is needed to cross-reference these results. Nonetheless, the results lend credence to the need to address racial disparity in educational systems. Perhaps school counselors can play a key role in doing so.

School Counseling Effectiveness

Developmental school counseling programs have been found to be less effective for African American students than for White students. Lapan, Gysbers, and Sun (1997) studied the impact of counseling on students' grades, feelings of preparation for graduation, and positive feelings toward school. Counselor duties were assessed by analyzing data from the Mississippi School Improvement Program (MSIP), which is used for Mississippi's public schools' accreditation process. The duties of 434 school counselors (92% White) were assessed. Additionally, 22,964 students, 11% of which were minorities, completed the Secondary Student Questionnaire. When the data was disaggregated, results indicated that African American students felt inadequately informed of post secondary options and that they had difficulty establishing a relationship with their counselors significantly more often than did White students. Furthermore, the analysis of the MSIP indicated that African American students were more

frequently tracked into non-college preparatory course work, were seen by a counselor less frequently, and had a lower rate of return to see the counselor than their White peers. Similarly, by using data from the National Education Longitudinal Study of dropout behavior of 16,749 sophomores in 1990 and of the same students as seniors in 1992, Georges (1997) found that, "...access to academic counseling is positive for Hispanics and Whites, [but] such access has a negative impact for Blacks on the decision to dropout throughout middle school and high school " (p. 1). These results were found despite the fact that African Americans were seen by the school counselors equally as often as White students. It is suggested that the relationship between African American students and counselors be examined to understand why counseling has a negative impact on dropout behavior for this population (Georges, 1997).

While Georges (1997) found that African American and White students were seen at the same frequency by the school counselors, Lee and Ekstrom (1987) found otherwise. Using data from the National Longitudinal Database: High School and Beyond, they found that school counselors devoted more of their time to middle and upper income White students who were college bound than to low income and minority students. However, since many low income and minority students do not have parents who have attended college and can provide first hand advice about the admissions process and financial aid, they would benefit most from counseling. Overall, minority students in general report feeling misunderstood by White counselors more frequently than those from the dominant culture (Sue, 1990). In light of the high percentage of underachieving African American students, it can be inferred that these students are not benefitting from counseling approaches in which school counselors are currently trained (Green & Keys, 2001). More research is needed on the link between school counselor training and

multicultural counseling competence.

Specifically, studies have shown that counselor interns at higher levels of cognitive development perform more effectively (Brendel, Kolbert & Foster, 2002). Furthermore, those functioning at higher levels of development have been found to be more accepting of others' views and less prejudicial (Hoare, 1991). Although it stands to reason that this would apply to school counselor interns working with African American students, up to this point there was no empirical research to support such a claim. This study provides an increased understanding of the relationship between cognitive developmental stages and counselor trainees' racial attitudes and perceived multicultural competence as it pertains to White school counselor interns working with African American students. And since school counselor interns are exposed to both current counselor training approaches and the actual practice of school counseling, the results may be used to enhance both school counselor preparation and performance. White school counselor trainees exposed to pedagogy designed to promote development may be more proficient at implementing knowledge, awareness and skill as it applies to diverse others when they become professionals in the field of school counseling.

Consideration of School Counselors' Individual Characteristics

Cognitive Developmental Theory

Cognitive Developmental theory stresses the importance of helping individuals enhance their meaning-making systems in order to achieve a better person-environment match. The theory consists of various stage theories including Piaget's theory of cognitive growth, Kohlberg's theory of moral development, Loevinger's ego development theory, and Harvey, Hunt and Schroeder's conceptual development theory (Kegan, 1982). The central constructs of the theory

stem from research conducted by these stage theorists who came to similar conclusions (Sprinthall, 1978). Stages within each domain represent an individual's current style of comprehending the environment. Each stage signifies a qualitatively different way in which to make meaning of experience. An individual's behavior correlates with his/her level of development, and those at higher levels are better able to adapt to their environment. Individuals have an innate drive to develop and growth occurs throughout the lifetime. Progression through stages is affected by interactions between the person and the environment, and change involves both physiological as well as psychological transformations. Progression through the stages is linear, and the cognitive developmental sequence is essentially invariant and irreversible (Foster, & McAdams, 1998; Sprinthall, 1978; Sprinthall, Peace, & Kennington, 1999).

Cognitive developmental growth equates to higher level abstract processing (Foster, & McAdams, 1998; Sprinthall, 1978; Sprinthall, Peace, & Kennington, 1999). Those functioning at higher cognitive developmental levels are better able to use complex reasoning and adaptive behavior. Thus, specifically related to counseling, advanced levels of cognitive development have been associated with, "greater empathic communication, greater autonomy, more flexible counseling and teaching methods, valuing cultural diversity, decision-making in accord with democratic principles of equity and fairness, and greater self-knowledge and awareness" (p. 5; Brendel, Kolbert, and Foster, 2002). Particularly relevant to White counselor interns working with African American students, cognitive complexity has been found to be related to individuals' degrees of bias, stereotyping, and multicultural counseling competence (Dumont & Lecomte, 1987; Faust, 1986; Holloway & Wampold, 1986; Rock, Bransford, Maisto, & Morey, 1987). Those functioning at higher levels of cognitive development typically exhibit less racist

behavior and have fewer anti-African American feelings (Sidanius, Pratto & Bobo, 1996).

Furthermore, cognitive development is universal across gender and culture. There appear to be no sex differences in development, and stage growth has been found to occur in all cultures (Snarey, 1985; Sprinthall, 1978).

Hoare (1991) described those at higher levels of cognitive development as having a developed inclusive, relational identity that frees them from the desire to deprive others of their identity. Those functioning at higher levels value the norms of their group, yet accept that others have valid values of their own and that each identity perspective is meaningful and legitimate within its social or cultural context. They move beyond prejudice to an ethic of care, connectedness and interrelationship- all of which are antithetical to prejudicial behavior. On the other hand, those at lower levels of cognitive development were described as needing to be aligned with their social group and thus rejecting of others outside of their group. Prejudice becomes a core aspect of this perspective (Hoare, 1991).

Also addressing the link between cognitive development and prejudice, Vogt (1997) stated that those functioning at lower levels of development lack the intellectual capacity to reject the stereotypes learned through socialization experiences. He stated that advanced levels of development are necessary to imagine the broad social consequences of one's actions. Those functioning at higher levels are typically less dogmatic; they are able to take the perspective of the minority despite the fact that it is not the norm. Furthermore, those with greater cognitive complexity typically feel less threatened by diverse groups because, being more tolerant of ambiguity, they have the ability to assess real or imagined danger (Vogt, 1997). Moreover, Vogt (1997) explained that tolerance requires higher level processing in order to monitor one's

52

reaction to feelings. For example, an individual may feel inconvenienced by affirmative action but be able to interpose a second feeling (empathy) to override the initial feeling and thus respond in a tolerant manner.

Adams (2002) described the link between cognitive development and issues of diversity by examining the impact of a social and cultural diversity course on 165 undergraduate resident assistants (RA's) at the University of Massachusetts. The participants completed the Scale of Intellectual Development to ascertain level of development prior to taking the course and again after completing the course in order to gauge developmental gains. Resident assistants were chosen for this study because, in addition to the course, they were exposed to an array of social justice dilemmas on the job in the dormitories. The results indicated that the RA's experienced significant developmental gains as a result of the course and their job functions. Nearly three quarters of the participants moved from being more dualistic in their thinking to becoming solid multiplistic thinkers. At this level of development, individuals are able to take multiple perspectives, use critical thinking, and exhibit openness to conflicting perspectives, all of which are necessary for sensitivity to diversity issues and multicultural others (Adams, 2002). Because the sample was limited to RA's at one university, the results may not be generalizable. Furthermore, it is difficult to assume that the social diversity course and exposure to dilemmas on the job could account exclusively for the developmental gains achieved by the participants. However, the results illuminate the benefits of advanced levels of development on sensitivity to social diversity, and thus, the importance of pedagogy that incorporates strategies to promote development.

In order to promote growth, it is necessary to determine one's current stage of functioning

so as to "constructively mismatch" interventions. The constructive mismatch consists of utilizing strategies that are no more than one developmental stage higher than where the individual is currently functioning in order to challenge her/him to think at the higher level, thus promoting growth (Foster, & McAdams, 1998; Sprinthall, Peace, & Kennington, 1999).

Pertaining to cognitive development and its impact on multicultural competency and White identity development, Steward, Boatwright, Sauer, Baden, and Jackson (1995) examined the relationships between levels on Perry's scheme of intellectual development, White racial identity scale scores, and self-reported multicultural counseling competence. The White Racial Identity Attitude Scale (WRIAS), which consists of 50 items that assess five stages of White racial identity was used to assess participants' racial identity. Each question was rated using a five-point likert scale from 1 = strongly disagree to 5 = strongly agree. Coefficient Alpha reliabilities range from .18 to .75 on the subscales of the WRIAS. To assess cognitive development, the Scale of Intellectual Development (SID) was completed. This scale, which is based on Perry's scheme of intellectual development, consists of 115 questions which are answered using a 4-point likert scale ranging from 1 = strongly agree to 4 = strongly disagree. The questions determine an individual's level of development. The possible levels are: 1) Dualism, 2) Relativism, 3) Commitment, and 4) Empathy. Cronbach's alpha coefficients have been found to be .81, .70, .76, and .73 for the respective levels. The Multicultural Awareness Knowledge and Skills Survey (MAKSS) was used to determine individuals' self-reported multicultural counseling competence. Using a four-point likert scale where 4 = strongly disagree and 1 = strongly agree, participants responded to 60 questions. Cronbach's alpha reliability coefficients for the three scales have been found to be as follows: Awareness = .75, Knowledge =

54

.90, and Skills = .96 (D'Andrea, Daniels, & Heck, 1991). The researchers hypothesized that there would be a positive correlation between individuals' levels of cognitive complexity, their White racial identity statuses, and their multicultural counseling competence. A total of 92 White graduate students participated in the study. A stepwise multiple regression analysis indicated a significant positive correlation between cognitive development, self-reported multicultural counseling competence, and White racial identity. Those at higher levels of cognitive complexity reported more multicultural counseling competence and had higher racial identity scale scores. The results from this study suggest that counselors at higher levels of intellectual development may be more capable of meeting the needs of diverse clients than those at lower levels. Consequently, counselor education curricula which currently focuses on multicultural awareness, knowledge and skills may be more successful at impacting White counselor interns' racial identity and multicultural competence by also addressing the cognitive development of the trainees.

A primary limitation of this study is its sample. Since the participants were counseling graduate students from one institution, the results may not be transferable to all school counseling interns. An additional limitation is its choice of cognitive developmental domains. Since development is domain specific, rather than considering intellectual development, it may have been more appropriate to use a domain such as that of Kohlberg's moral development which has been used to address multicultural counseling in the past (Vogt, 1997; Evans & Foster, 2000). There are many domains encompassed in cognitive developmental theory, but due to its focus on moral reasoning and just behavior on a society-wide level (Gielen, 1992; Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau & Thoma, 1999; Rest, 1994; Thoma, 1994), school counselor diversity education should

utilize Kohlberg's theory of moral development. According to Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau & Thoma (1999) moral development moves beyond one-on-one interpersonal relationships to a consideration of societal cooperation, and in particular, cooperation among diverse ethnic groups. It is particularly relevant to White school counselor interns working with African American students because it is specifically concerned with nondiscriminatory work practices and equality in education (Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau & Thoma, 1999). Further making it suited to White school counselor interns working with African American students are the traits in an individual it aims to develop. Specifically, moral development emphasizes promoting growth to enhance interpersonal relationships, foster just behavior, augment respect of others' values, and promulgate the equality of all human beings (Kegan, 1982). Its relevance to the current study seems to be captured in the following quote by Kohlberg: "Equal respect for human dignity seems to me the essence of justice" (p. 13; Kohlberg, pub 1992).

## Moral Development Theory

Lawrence Kohlberg attested that individuals at different stages of functioning use different cognitive processes to judge whether something is right or wrong (Rest, & Narvaez, 1994). After years of studies, Kohlberg discovered that moral meaning making falls into three distinct levels and that each level contains two stages (Kohlberg, 1976). The three levels are as follows: Preconventional- Level 1, Conventional- Level 2, and Postconventional- Level 3.

Kohlberg (1976) found that most children below the age of nine function within the Preconventional level while the majority of adults function at the Conventional level. Only a small amount of adults reach the Postconventional level, and only after age 20 if at all. Even studies which included both male and female subjects of all age ranges from Eastern and Western

countries and from urban and rural societies with various socioeconomic statuses found the stages of moral development to exist (Gielen, 1992; Rest, 1986; Snarey, 1985). Rest (1986) reviewed 56 studies of moral reasoning that included over 6000 subjects and found no significant differences between males and females who had participated. Additionally, Snarey (1985) reviewed 45 studies conducted in 27 countries that used Kohlberg's model of moral development and found each of the stages to exist in all of the countries. Furthermore, when averaging the mean stage for a country, the United States never ranked first in any age division, indicating that the US is not misrepresented as superior by the measurement instruments. Critics of the theory of moral development argue that the six stage model is too constrictive and that additional stages should be considered. The Neo-Kohlbergian perspective, which modified Kohlberg's theory to address some of its weaknesses, describes a 7<sup>th</sup> stage beyond cognitions that addresses spirituality. Research is needed to justify its existence (Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau & Thoma, 1999). This will not be an easy task since so few adults achieve even stage six. It has been difficult to validate its existence, not to mention stages beyond six (Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau & Thoma, 1999). However, in keeping with core developmental assumptions, the stages are invariant, irreversible, and given the appropriate environment and experiences, achievable by all, though this is seldom done (Gielen, 1992; Kohlberg, 1975). In fact, stage six is not included in the most recent edition of Kohlberg's Moral Judgement Interview Standard Issue Scoring which is frequently used to measure moral development (Gielen & Lei, 1992).

The theory of moral development originally adopted a hard stage model in which growth is stepwise rather than continuous. Each stage is a structured whole that is subsumed by succeeding stages as growth occurs. In other words, all of the features of a stage appear at once,

and an individual maintains the knowledge learned at one stage and builds upon that knowledge as she/he moves to a subsequent stage (Gielen, 1992; Kohlberg, 1975). This has been perceived as a limitation to the theory, thus a more recent Neo-Kohlbergian perspective has espoused a soft stage model in which moral development is viewed as a gradual increase where knowledge is obtained in overlapping waves (Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau & Thoma, 1999). Having greater knowledge about a situation enables individuals to better adapt, thus "higher is better" (Foster & McAdams, 1998).

The theory of moral development describes modes of thinking about interpersonal conflict situations (Gielen, 1992). Moral development progresses toward a commitment to universal moral principles (Kohlberg, 1976). The following table depicts the levels and stages of moral development:

Table 1

Levels and Stages of Moral Development

| Stage                     | Reason to do what's right | Perspective                           |  |
|---------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------------------|--|
| Level 1: Preconventional  |                           |                                       |  |
| Stage 1: Heteronomous     | do right or get           | "might makes right," no role-taking,  |  |
| Morality                  | punished                  | egocentric                            |  |
| Stage 2: Individualism,   | do right to get           | "let's make a deal," realize other's  |  |
| Instrumental purpose, and | something out of it       | perspective but only care to meet own |  |

| exchange                                | одинительности подпосной од под од о | needs, individualistic                    |  |
|---|---|---|--|
| Level 2: Conventional                   |   |   |  |
| Stage 3: Mutual interpersonal           | do right to fit in  | "good boy, bad boy," recognize            |  |
| expectations, relationships,            |   | group's perspective and act               |  |
| and interpersonal conformity            |   | accordingly, individual in relation       |  |
|   |   | with others                               |  |
| Stage 4: social system and              | do right because it's   | "law and order," recognize                |  |
| conscience                              | the law   | perspective of entire system, act to      |  |
|   |   | maintain order                            |  |
| Level 3: Postconventional or Principled |   |   |  |
| Stage 5: Social contract,               | do right to protest all   | "how will my choice effect others,"       |  |
| individual rights                       | people's rights   | uphold life and liberty regardless of     |  |
|   |   | majority opinion                          |  |
| Stage 6: Universal ethical              | do right for the good   | "act in accordance with moral             |  |
| principles                              | of mankind  | principles at all costs," respect for the |  |
|   |   | dignity of human beings as individual     |  |
|   |   | persons                                   |  |

<sup>\*</sup> adapted from Kegan, (1982), p. 52

In stage one of the first level, individuals have an egocentric view. Their decision to do that which is right is based on avoidance of punishment. They are unable to recognize the impact

that their actions have on others, nor do they recognize that others have differing opinions from their own. In stage two, individuals begin to see that there are varying perspectives, but the goal is still to have one's own needs met. It is not unusual for individuals at this stage to make equal exchanges with others in order to ensure that they get what they want. Actions are motivated by how the individuals will personally benefit from them. As they move into stage three they also enter level two. At stage three, individuals are motivated by collective conformity. Judgments about behavior are based on shared expectations. They are strongly influenced by the opinions of others, and will put their interests aside to remain loyal to the group. At this stage, individuals adopt a "we and them" attitude toward racial thinking. Empathy and connectedness is inhibited by this focus on differentness (Blum, 2002). Racial separatism and oppression is perpetuated by inequality in social, political, educational, and civic forums which are both the cause and consequence of residential, occupational and social segregation (Blum, 2002). A systemic perspective is not yet taken until they enter stage four. In stage four, individuals are able to recognize that the viewpoint of the group may be in opposition to that of the entire system and that it is important to follow the system's perspective in order to maintain order in society. Individuals at this stage feel that laws are in place for a reason and thus should be followed. Level three is entered when individuals move into stage five. At this stage, it is assumed that a system's rules protect the welfare of others, thus it is important to follow the law. However, if the law violates the rights of individuals, life and liberty takes precedence over the majority rule. Due to an ability to recognize both the legal and moral perspectives, individuals at this stage may find it difficult to integrate the two when they are in conflict. It has been said that tolerance for diversity is a level three, stage five phenomenon (Vogt, 1997). While rarely achieved, those at

stage six choose morality over all else. They are committed to their ethical principles of justice, and feel a responsibility to value and respect all human beings. Ghandi and Jesus are often equated with stage six of moral development (Gielen, 1992; Kegan, 1982; Rest & Narvaez, 1994). Those at level three value racial harmony and racial equality while devaluing racial hierarchy (Blum, 2002). Whites at higher levels of moral development are able to recognize and take responsibility for White privilege and respond to the disadvantaged with empathy (Blum, 2002). Critics of the theory argue that there is not one absolute principle that all people can agree on. Recognizing the validity of this statement, Neo-Kohlbergian's view principled reasoning as the construction of the collective moral point's-of-view of each person in a group, thus there is no one universality but rather an ideal principle for a social group (Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau & Thoma, 1999). Those able to make moral judgements at higher stages are more likely to recognize how their choices will affect others, to act in humanitarian ways, and to consider the good of mankind. This is much desired over the judgements of those at lower levels who may base their decisions on what they may obtain from their choice or how they may best fit-in to the crowd (Kegan, 1982; Gielen, 1992).

Prior to the present research, no studies had been conducted specifically linking Moral development to White school counselor interns working with African American students.

Nonetheless, it has been related to other areas of counseling and various diversity issues, and it is possible to relate these studies to the current investigation. Specifically, Gielen (1992) examined the results of research that reviewed literature pertaining to measures of moral reasoning on the Defining Issues Test and subsequent moral action. The literature showed that those at higher levels of moral development were more likely to resist social pressure and exhibit altruistic

behavior, while those at lower levels were more likely to cheat and perform delinquent actions (Blasi, 1980; Thoma & Rest, 1986). Moreover, those at higher stages of moral development were more likely to be social advocates in the community. In a review of 28 research studies, Thoma & Rest (1986) found that cheaters and delinquents were more likely to receive relatively low scores on the Defining Issues Test (DIT) of moral development, whereas conscientious objectors and social justice leaders were more likely to receive high scores. Similarly, Patterson (1979) found that higher levels of moral reasoning in children equated to increased support for free speech. White school counselor interns at higher levels of moral development may also be more likely to engage in advocacy efforts so necessary for African American student achievement. Gielen (1992) stated that, "all in all, the reviews of Blasi (1980), Jennings, Kilkenny, and Kohlberg (1983), and Thoma and Rest (1986), provide consistent support for the supposition that moral reasoning and moral action are interrelated" (p. 57). These studies also lend support to the earlier mentioned notion that "higher is better." Considering these findings, it became necessary to examine White school counselor interns' levels of moral development as they relate to the counselor interns' racial attitudes and perceived multicultural competencies for addressing the needs of African American students. White school counselor interns who reason at higher levels of moral development are more likely to act for the good of African American students despite the fact that conflicting cultural values exist, because "when people make moral decisions in situations of conflict, their reasoning frequently refers to normative rules and principles, welfare consequences for the various people in conflict with each other, the search for fair solutions, the balancing of perspectives, and the search for personal and group harmony" (p. 24; Gielen, 1992).

Pertaining to teacher behaviors, McKibbon and Joyce (1981) found moral development

scores to be significantly correlated with ability to utilize innovative practices in the classroom. Those functioning at higher moral developmental stages were better able to adapt and generalize new teaching materials to the classroom than were those at lower levels. Thus, it is likely that White school counselor interns at higher moral levels will also be more willing and able to adapt their counseling styles and techniques to best match their African American students' needs rather than following prescribed/standard ways of counseling that may be counter-productive for this population.

Particularly relevant to the current study, Davidson (1976) conducted research to see if prejudice is related to moral development. She obtained a sample of 176 children between the ages of 7 and 12 from both city and suburban populations. Of the sample, 133 children were White, 15 were Jewish, 23 were African American, and 5 were Asian. In order to measure prejudice, the participants, in groups of four, played a board game called "Comments." The object of the game is to reach "home" by tossing a dice and moving a game piece across spaces on the board according to the number on the dice. Spaces are color coded to represent various ethnic groups, and upon landing on a space, it necessary to make a comment about the corresponding diverse group. The participants were encouraged to state anything about the group that they wished, and as the game progressed and inhibitions lessened, comments typically became less censored. For example, in the beginning when landing on a square representing African American's, a typical comment was, "[they] have kinky hair," but as the game progressed, comments were made such as, "Black's are dirty."

Later, the students were interviewed. They were asked for their reaction to specific positive and negative comments that were made by various students during the game. To

measure moral development, Kohlberg's Measure of Moral Maturity interview was used. Specifically, dilemmas 3, 4 and 10 were presented to the participants who were asked to respond to the dilemmas, and their answers were thoroughly probed by the interviewer. Test-retest reliability coefficients have been found to range from .80 to .90 for this instrument. The interviews were scored by two raters who had interrater agreement of .78. The results showed that regardless of age, children at lower moral stages made more negative and prejudicial comments. Specifically, "35% of the comments were negative toward a racial or ethnic group at Moral Stage 1, 19% at Stage 2, 11% at Stage 3, and 6% at Stage 4" (p. 1261). Additionally, the results showed that the most prejudicial remarks made were against African Americans.

The reliability of the results was strengthened by the fact that the researcher was a counseling psychologist, social studies consultant, and camp director in the community and was considered a positive and friendly individual to most of the participants. Since interviews pertaining to sensitive topics were used, her familiarity to the children was an important factor contributing to the reliability of the results. Had she been perceived as unaccepting, the children may have felt less comfortable answering her questions truthfully. Although the study was done 26 years ago, its results shed light on the need for White counselor interns working with African American students to function at higher levels of moral development in order to minimize prejudicial behavior.

While the previously described studies focused on comparing those at different levels of development, Foster and McAdams (1998) actually stimulated stage growth. They conducted a study of 35 child care counselor supervisors in a residential treatment program to assess the impact of developmental growth on job performance and satisfaction. They successfully

stimulated stage growth as indicated by comparing pre-test results to post-test results on the Defining Issues Test and the Moral Judgement Interview. Growth occurred as result of appropriate educational strategies applied through Deliberate Psychological Education (DPE). In DPE programs, individuals are provided with role-taking experiences and guided reflection, as well as a combination of support and challenge, and action and reflection in a balanced and continuous manner (Brendel, Kolbert, & Foster, 2002; Foster & McAdams, 1998; Sprinthall, Peace, & Kennington, 1999). The researchers varied their instructional approach based on each participant's stage of development. Specifically, for those functioning at lower stages, they used concrete examples, immediate reinforcement, and short assignments, whereas those functioning at higher stages received abstract examples, varying reinforcement, and long-term assignments. Working as supervisors at residential treatment programs provided a challenging role-taking experience for the participants. They were also expected to explore moral dilemmas occurring at their jobs by discussing the situations, making value judgments, and then processing their reasoning. Guided reflection was also provided through feedback on journal entries which were kept by participants throughout the study. The demands of their jobs in conjunction with the matched instructional approaches, discussions and journaling provided a balance between action and reflection, and challenge and support while the consistent meetings over the course of 12 weeks provided continuity to the experience. Overall, as a result of this DPE, participants significantly improved on the Defining Issues Test and the Moral Judgment Interview. Additionally, participants rated the program as highly effective, felt more satisfied with their jobs, and developed additional supervisory skills. Given that higher is better, it is probable that the gains in moral judgment resulted in the participants' improvements at their job. White school counselor interns functioning at higher levels of development might similarly find greater job satisfaction and improved skill usage which would positively impact their ability to work with African American students.

Related to school counseling, Peace (1995) applied a DPE program over the course of two semesters to prepare 12 experienced school counselors to mentor novice school counselors. To fulfill the role-taking component of the DPE, experienced counselors supervised either a counselor trainee, beginning counselor, or a colleague interested in refreshing skills. The participants met for three hours each week for supervision of supervision, to review counseling skills, and to go over assignments such as readings and journal entries. This met the guided reflection component of the program. The class allowed ample time for processing which provided a balance between the supervision experience and reflection. The challenging supervisory experience was balanced through support in class and through written responses to the journal entries. Finally, continuity was ensured since the DPE was carried out over the course of two semesters. Compared to pre-assessments of both moral and conceptual development, postassessment results indicated significant gains. Furthermore, the experienced counselors improved their supervisory skills, counseling skills and confidence. Overall, moral and conceptual development contributed to their competency as counselors and mentors. Since only 12 school counselors from North Carolina participated in the program, one must hesitate to generalize the results. However, since they replicate findings from other studies employing a DPE model, it is possible to assume that the model has reliability. African American students would likely benefit from a DPE program aimed at promoting the moral development of White school counselor trainees.

Growth in the moral domain enables counselors to better recognize how their judgments affect others, to act in humanitarian ways, and to make wise ethical and moral decisions (Evans & Foster, 2000). Because "higher is better," White school counselor interns at higher levels of cognitive complexity should have greater cultural awareness, self-awareness, and multicultural skill usage. It is further believed that school counselor interns functioning at higher levels of moral development will exhibit less bias and more tolerance and empathy with African American students. And since development has been found to be invariant and irreversible, the interns will be able to transfer this inclusive, flexible, and tolerant perspective to the professional realm of school counseling, thus emphasizing the need for school counselor education programs to focus on developmental growth (Rest, & Narvaez, 1994). Because the impact of moral development on White school counselor interns' perspectives and perceived competencies for counseling African American students had not been substantiated, the present study was conducted to verify the link between moral development of White school counselor interns and their racial attitudes and perceived multicultural competencies for addressing the needs of African American students.

#### Summary

This chapter provided a review of the literature describing the challenges faced by school counselors which include meeting specific job demands, addressing social and educational issues impacting today's students, serving an ever increasingly diverse student population, and specifically addressing the needs of African American students. Literature was explored pertaining to the unique needs of African American students, and current school counselor multicultural training approaches to meet these needs were discussed. In particular, CACREP requirements, ASCA's ethical standards, the National Standards for School Counselors, and

AMCD's Multicultural Counseling Competencies were reviewed. Each one emphasizes the importance of addressing awareness, knowledge, and skill as they relate to multicultural counseling. The limitations to these educational approaches were then explored, for despite the current methods, prevailing social deficits exist for African American students. These include a significant achievement gap between African Americans and Whites, multiple social issues, and ineffective counseling interventions. Cognitive development was presented as an individual characteristic that significantly impacts school counselor interns' competency with African American students. Specifically, the domain of moral development was chosen for the current study. Both cognitive developmental theory and the moral developmental domain were outlined, and research pertaining to their link to counseling was reviewed.

The following chapter presents the study's research design and methodology. The population is described, proposed data gathering procedures explained and instrumentation discussed. As well, the research hypotheses are delineated and the data analyses specified.

# Chapter Three

### Research Methodology

#### Introduction

The purpose of this chapter is to describe the design and methodology used in the study. Included are the following: population, sample, data gathering procedures, instrumentation, research design, hypotheses, and data analyses. As well, specific ethical considerations are discussed.

## Population and Sample

The study's target population was White school counselor trainees interning at the elementary, middle and secondary school levels. The sample was derived from an accessible population of school counselor interns enrolled in seven graduate school counseling programs in Virginia and Washington, D.C. The program locales range from being large urban areas to small rural communities, thus consisting of a wide range of socioeconomic diversity. Since the researcher was conducting a correlational study, it was necessary to have a minimum sample of 30 (Gall, Borg & Gall, 1996). The sample in the present study consisted of 67 interns and, of these, 57 participated. Nine of the remaining 10 were absent on the day that the researcher was present to collect data, and one chose not to participate. Only data obtained from White school counselor interns was used in the data analysis. Of the 57 participants, four identified themselves as of another ethnicity than White. Specifically, three were African American and one was Asian. The sample of 53 included in the final analysis consisted of four male and 49 female White school counselor trainees interning at the elementary, middle and secondary school levels.

### Data Collection

#### Method

Prior to data collection, the researcher conducted a pilot of the study using 19 community counselor interns during group supervision at the College of William and Mary. This was done to practice the administration of the Defining Issues Test-2 (DIT-2), and to obtain feedback about the New Racism Scale. Because completion of the DIT-2 involves multiple steps, the researcher ensured adequate delineation of the procedures by rehearsing the directions and obtaining feedback which was then applied when appropriate. Specifically, one intern stated that he had a tendency when ranking his top four arguments, to record the number he rated an item rather than the item number itself. Several other students agreed that this was an easy mistake to make, so the researcher in subsequent administrations, made clear to the participants that it was necessary to record the item number of the argument that they wished to rank and not the number corresponding to how they ranked that item.

Due to the straightforwardness of the questions on the New Racism Scale pertaining to White's racial attitudes toward African Americans, the researcher wanted to gauge participants' reactions to the instrument and modify her introduction to the administration of the test based on feedback received. During the pilot, two of the 19 students expressed feeling affronted by the questions, therefore the researcher decided to emphasize both on the Informed Consent Form and verbally to the participants following their completion of the study that she was available to address any questions or concerns. Additionally, the researcher decided to inform the faculty supervisors of the intern participants to be prepared to address discomfort resulting from participation in the study. Also, the researcher elected to administer the study in person at each

participating school's group supervision session in order to be present if she needed to address any concerns about the study or instrumentation. As a result of the pilot, it was also determined that the researcher should read aloud the directions for completing the New Racism Scale and stress to the participants that they should be aware of the range of responses available to them following each question. It was worded in this way in order to avoid leading the interns yet help them be aware that they have the option to completely disagree with a question. Finally, it was decided that the researcher should preface the administration of the study by stating that it is difficult to meet the needs of all clients and that she was simply looking for differing perspectives about working with diverse clients. Further, she opted to stress that there were no right or wrong answers because differences are good, and that it was most important that participants answer as honestly as possible so that the results could be used to structure multicultural training for school counselors in the future. By following the changes made to the administration of the study as a result of the pilot, not one participant during the actual data collection voiced any discomfort to the researcher.

In order to secure my population, via e-mail, contact was made with the faculty supervisors of the school counselor interns at each of the seven schools included in the study. Messages included a synopsis of the study, a description of each instrument, and a plea for their support to conduct the study in person during one of their regularly scheduled group supervision sessions. Once permission was granted, the researcher again contacted each supervisor to schedule the data collection. Over the course of two months, the researcher attended a group supervision session at each of the seven schools. The same format was followed for every administration. To begin, the researcher introduced herself as a doctoral student of counselor

education at the College of William and Mary completing her dissertation which was examining the impact of cognitive development on multicultural counseling in the schools. She explained that her interest in the topic stemmed from her experiences working as a school counselor for several years. Next, the study's procedures were discussed, and the participants were informed of their rights as volunteers. In particular, the confidentiality of their responses was stressed. They were further told of a drawing for two \$25.00 gift certificates to The Outback Restaurant and Barnes and Noble Bookstore that they would be eligible for by participating. Following, test packets that included Informed Consent forms, a Demographic survey, a Defining Issues Test-2 (DIT-2), and a form that combined the New Racism Scale and Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Scale-Revised were distributed along with #2 pencils. Each instrument was separated with a piece of colored construction paper, and the participants were asked not to look beyond the instrument they were currently working on. Prior to having the participants begin, the researcher stressed the above mentioned preface (that there were no right or wrong answers to the questions, that she was simply looking at differences in perspectives, and that it was most important that the participants be committed to providing honest responses because she intended to use the results to structure school counselor training in the future). The respondents were then asked to open their folders and were asked to read thoroughly the Informed Consent Form, sign both copies, turn one in to me, and put the other aside for their own records. They were then asked not to place their name on any of the remaining forms. Next they were given time to complete the Demographic Form, and when all were done, the researcher read the directions to the DIT-2. When all had completed the DIT-2 the participants were asked to turn to the final survey, which combined the New Racism Scale and Multicultural Counseling

Competence and Training Survey-Revised, and be aware of the range of responses available to them for each question. Once everyone had finished, the researcher asked that they close their instruments in their folders and the completed test packets were collected. The respondents were thanked for their participation, told that they may access the results on Dissertation Abstracts in several months, and provided with contact information if they had any questions or concerns. Finally, names, phone numbers and e-mail addresses were collected for the drawing.

# Data Handling Procedure

The hard data was carefully stored in a secure file cabinet based on coding categories. No one had access to the data other than the researcher. Neither did anyone other than the researcher have access to the computer used to enter the data. Backup disks were stored in the secure file cabinet along with the hard data.

#### Instrumentation

Five instruments were used to collect necessary information for completing this study.

Specifically, they are as follows: 1) informed consent form, 2) demographic information form, 3)

Defining Issues Test-2, 4) New Racism Scale, and 5) Multicultural Counseling Competence and

Training Scale-Revised.

## Informed Consent Form

The informed consent form summarized the study's procedures, explained the activities that were requested of the participants, and described how the results of the study were to be used. It also informed the participants of their right to withdraw from the study at any time. Space was provided for individuals to sign and date the form if they agreed to participate. Two copies were given; one copy was returned to the researcher and the participant for his/her records kept

the other.

# Demographic Information Form

A demographic information form was used to obtain information about the participants including the following: 1) age, 2) gender, 3) race, 4) degrees attained 5) status in current program 6) years of experience as a school counselor, 7) school level (elementary, middle, secondary, or combination) currently interning in, 8) whether or not they had taken a course in multicultural counseling and if so, how many, 9) membership in professional organizations and 10) preferred theoretical framework. Through use of a numeric coding system, a participant's demographic form was matched with his/her DIT-2, MCCTS-R, and NRS. The information derived from the form was used to determine the impact of these specific demographic variables on moral development, White racial consciousness, and perceived multicultural counseling competence.

## Defining Issues Test-2

The Defining Issues Test (DIT), developed by Rest (1979), is an objective multiple choice, computer scored instrument to assess one's moral development. Twelve arguments that represent different stages of moral development are presented for each of three political and three moral dilemmas. Rather than using the developers' ideas about what adequately represented each stage, the twelve arguments were derived from statements made by hundreds of individuals in the Kohlbergian Moral Judgment Interviews. As a result, the statements more accurately reflect actual moral thinking at the various stages (Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau & Thoma, 1999).

Respondents are asked to read a dilemma and rate the importance of the accompanying arguments on a five point likert scale ranging from 1 (of no importance) to 5 (of great

74

importance). Next, respondents must select and rank order the top four arguments that they feel are most relevant (Rest, 1986). Respondents rate and rank as highly important the arguments that best fit their preferred schemas for making moral judgments, thus it is possible to ascertain the level at which respondents most readily make moral decisions.

When scoring the DIT, the argument given the most relevance receives four points, the next most important argument is given three points, the next is given two points and the least important receives one point. Based on the ranking of items, each dilemma is given a score that corresponds to Kohlberg's stages 2, 3, 4, 5a, 5b and 6. It is then possible to determine in which one of three developmental indices these scores tend to cluster (Bebeau & Thoma, 2003). Items clustered around stages two and three represent the Personal Interest developmental index. When making moral decisions from this schema, individuals consider personal gain and maintaining approval. Items clustered around stage four correspond to the Maintaining Norms developmental index and represent those who feel committed to upholding the law when making moral decisions. Finally, those with items clustered around stages five and six fit into the Postconventional developmental index. Moral decisions from this schema are based on due process and human rights. These developmental indices were established through confirmatory factor analysis of a sample of more than 44,000 participants conducted by Rest, Thoma & Edwards (1997). Reliability estimates were computed for each of the three schema scores using a sample of 495 professional students (Bebeau, Rodriguez & Maeda, 2002). Coefficient alpha was found to be .61 for the Personal Interests developmental index, .73 for the Maintaining Norms index, and .74 for the Postconventional schema scores.

To determine individuals' preferred use of principled reasoning in decision making, a P-

index is calculated by adding the total number of points at stages 5a, 5b and 6. These stages are combined because they all represent Postconventional moral thinking (Bebeau & Thoma, 2003). The score is then presented as a percentage ranging from 0 to 95 (high percentage = higher levels of moral development) (Rest, 1986). The P score is the most widely used index of the DIT (Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau & Thoma, 1999). Principled reasoning is detected more frequently on the DIT than on the MJI because it requires less articulation ability. Since participants select responses from a list that is provided on the DIT, less verbal skill is needed than on the MJI in which participants must produce their own answers (Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau & Thoma, 1999). Critics have claimed that the method of responding to questions on the DIT may result in an overestimation of development. However, manipulation check items have been included to assess participant reliability. Specifically, an M score is calculated to determine the extent to which respondents endorse pretentious yet meaningless statements and a Consistency Check identifies random responses. If scores on either of these subscales exceed the cutoff, the participant's responses to the DIT are invalidated (Rest, 1986; Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau & Thoma, 1999).

Reliability and validity have been repeatedly established for the DIT. Longitudinal studies in which respondents are retested on the DIT have consistently shown stage advancement with effect sizes of .80 thus reflecting construct validity (Davison, 1979; Rest, 1998; Rest, 1986; Rest, 1979). When correlated with Kohlberg's Moral Judgement Interview, the DIT's concurrent validity averages .50 and has been found to be as high as .70 (Davison, 1979; Rest, 1979). Significant positive correlations have been found repeatedly between DIT scores and both prosocial behavior and desirable professional decision making (Rest & Narvaez, 1994). Support

for divergent validity has also been found. The DIT has not been found to correlate significantly with personality, social desirability, attitudes, and values measures (Rest, 1998). Both internal reliability and test-retest correlations have been found to be in the high .70's and .80's (Rest, 1986). Because the DIT is scored objectively, interrater reliability is inconsequential. Finally, the DIT has been found to be equally valid for both males and females (Center for the Study of Ethical Development, 2002). However, when slight differences have been found, they have been in favor of females (Rest & Narvaez, 1994).

Rest, Narvaez, Thoma, and Bebeau (1999) created a new version of the DIT called the DIT-2. It is, "more updated, shorter, has clearer instructions, purges fewer subjects for bogus data, and is slightly more powerful on validity criteria" (Bebeau & Thoma, 2003). At .79, the DIT-2's correlation with the DIT is almost as strong as the DIT's test-retest reliability which, as mentioned previously, have been found to be in the high .70's and .80's. The DIT-2 substantiated that it is possible to replicate the DIT. DIT-2 consists of five modern dilemmas and is scored in the same manner as the original DIT (Center for the Study of Ethical Development, 2002). As stated above, the DIT has well-documented validity and reliability, and it is frequently used in developmental research. Since the DIT-2 is a reliable replication of the DIT, it was used in the current study.

#### New Racism Scale

The New Racism Scale (NRS) was developed by Jacobson (1985) to address modern forms of racism in the United States. New racism reflects attitudes about symbolic issues such as affirmative action, public welfare, and busing. The scale consists of questions derived from a national poll of racial attitudes that White's hold toward African Americans conducted by Louis

Harris and Associates at the National Conference of Christians and Jews in 1978 (Jacobson, 1985). Items selected from the poll were those that most closely resembled items used previously by McConahay (1982) to measure symbolic racism. The New Racism Scale is an updated version of McConahay's Modern Racism Scale (Utsey, McCarthy, Eubanks, & Adrian, 2002). Factor analyses and computations of Cronbach's alpha resulted in a seven item scale with a Cronbach's alpha of .70. Participants respond to questions such as, "It's been said that if black children all went to school with white children, the education of white children would suffer. The reason given is that the black children would hold back the white children. Do you believe that or not?" The scale scores range from 7 to 26 with high scores corresponding to an endorsement of racist attitudes. In order to condense the material presented to the counselor interns, the New Racism Scale was combined with the Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Scale-Revised, thus, the researcher reversed the direction of the scale scores on the NRS for consistency between the two instruments, so in the present study, high scores on the NRS corresponded to tolerant attitudes. In addition, the term "black" on the NRS was changed to "African American" to reflect more current language to describe individuals of African descent living in America. More recent studies that used the NRS found reliability measures ranging from .60 to .70 (Constantine & Gushue, 2003; Silvestri & Richardson, 2001; Utsey, McCarthy, Eubanks, & Adrian, 2002). Pope Davis and Ottavi (1994) conducted a correlational study to compare the NRS to other related variables, and found the NRS to have convergent validity. Jacobson (1985) found the NRS to be significantly related to attitudes toward affirmative action programs (p<.001) which was described as one of the symbolic issues that elicit new racism (McConahay, 1982). Additionally, aversion toward African Americans, as indicated by a personal intimacy index and a stereotype

scale, was found to account for 53% of the variability in the NRS (Jacobson, 1985). Due to it's acceptable reliability, focus on symbolic racism, and conciseness, the NRS was chosen for the current study. Furthermore, the NRS has been previously used with school counselor trainees. Constantine (2002) investigated the relationship between racial attitudes, prior multicultural coursework, and White racial identity attitudes to multicultural counseling competence. She used the NRS to measure racial attitudes, the White Racial Identity Attitude Scale (WRAIS) to measure racial development of the White participants, and the Multicultural Counseling Knowledge and Awareness Scale (MCKAS) to measure multicultural counseling competence. The results showed that those with higher NRS scores and thus possessing more racist attitudes also reported less multicultural counseling competence.

Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Scale-Revised

79

high for factors 1, 2, and 5, and moderate for factors 3 and 4 (Holcomb-McCoy, 2000; Holcomb-McCoy & Myers, 1999). No statistically significant differences were found between males and females who have completed the survey (Holcomb-McCoy, 2000; Holcomb-McCoy & Myers, 1999). Holcomb-McCoy (2001) modified the MCCTS to be geared toward practicing school counselors. Wording and phrases were altered to reflect the language used in the school setting. For example, the word "client" was changed to "student." The modified instrument was piloted on three experienced, diverse school counselors who found the scale to be reflective of the school counselor culture.

More recently, the MCCTS has been revised. The new MCCTS-R was developed after further testing and analysis of the original MCCTS modified for school counselors. Holcomb-McCoy and Day-Vines (in press) surveyed practicing school counselors who were members of the American School Counselor Association. They received a total of 209 usable surveys. A principal components factor analysis of the survey items was conducted, and four factors were found to emerge. This four factor model differs from the original five factor model by eliminating the Racial Identity Development factor. The items from the original fifth factor were found to load on the Knowledge factor in the updated study. The four factors accounted for 62.5% of the common variance, and Cronbach alpha coefficients for internal consistency for each factor were as follows: 1) Multicultural Knowledge = .95; 2) Multicultural terminology = .97; 3) Multicultural Awareness = .83; and 4) Multicultural Skill = .74. Due to its strong reliability and focus on school counselors' perceived multicultural counseling competencies, the MCCTS-R modified for school counselors was used in the current study.

#### Research Design

The purpose of this study was to determine the relationship between White school counselor interns' moral development as measured by the Defining Issues Test-2, racial attitudes as measured by the New Racism Scale, and perceived multicultural counseling competence as measured by the Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Survey-Revised. The design consisted of descriptive and multivariate correlational analyses on the DIT-2, NRS and MCCTS-R. Descriptive statistics were conducted to determine means, standard deviations, and modes for the obtained data, and correlational analyses were employed to determine relationships between the variables. According to Gall, Borg, and Gall (1996), "multiple regression is used to determine the correlation between a criterion variable and a combination of two or more predictor variables" (p. 434), therefore it was used in the current study to determine the relationship between the criterion variable of moral development, and the predictor variables of participants' racial attitudes and perceived multicultural counseling competence. Additionally, age, professional membership and multicultural training may impact the analyses, therefore these influence variables were also analyzed using analysis of variance (ANOVA) to, "determine whether the differences between mean scores are statistically significant" (p. 510; Gall, Borg & Gall, 1996). While multiple regression is unable to establish causality, it does provide information about the statistical significance and strength of relationships between variables (Gall, Borg, & Gall, 1996; Jaeger, 1993).

#### Research Hypotheses

Hypothesis 1: There will be a significant positive correlation between school counselor interns' level of moral development as measured by the Defining Issues Test-2 (DIT-2) and racial attitudes as measured by the New Racism Scale (NRS).

Hypothesis 2: There will be a significant positive correlation between school counselor interns' level of moral development as measured by the Defining Issues Test-2 (DIT-2) and their perceived multicultural counseling competence as measured by the Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Survey-Revised (MCCTS-R).

Hypothesis 3: There will be a significant positive correlation between school counselor interns' racial attitudes as measured by the New Racism Scale (NRS) and perceived multicultural counseling competence as measured by the Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Survey-Revised (MCCS).

Hypothesis 4: There will be a significant positive correlation between school counselor interns' moral development as measured by the DIT-2 and the following specific demographic characteristics: 1) age and 2) professional membership.

Hypothesis 5: There will be a significant positive correlation between multicultural competence as measured by the MCCTS-R and amount of multicultural training as indicated on the Demographic Form.

Hypothesis 6: There will be no significant correlation between White school counselor interns' moral development as measured by the DIT-2, racial attitudes as measured by the NRS, perceived multicultural counseling competence as measured by the MCCTS-R and White school counselor interns' gender.

## Data Analysis

The hypotheses were tested using Pearson product-moment correlation coefficients

(Pearson r) and analysis of variance (ANOVA). Analysis of variance and Pearson r provided information about the magnitude of the relationships between levels of moral development, racial

attitudes, and specific demographic information. Alpha was set at .05 for establishing statistical significance. When significance was determined from the ANOVA, follow-up post hoc tests were conducted to specify which variables were significantly impacting each other. According to Gall, Borg, and Gall (1996), analysis of variance and Pearson r are two of the most frequently used statistical analyses.

#### **Ethical Considerations**

In accordance with Section E of the American Counseling Association Ethical Code (1995), the Human Subjects Board of the College of William and Mary, and the researcher's dissertation chair and committee, the following precautions were considered in protecting the welfare of the participants. A thorough explanation of the study's procedures were provided and written informed consent was retrieved from each volunteer. It was emphasized that participation was strictly voluntary, and that individuals could remove themselves from the study at any time. Sound instrumentation was used in an appropriate manner and scored and interpreted by qualified individuals. Confidentiality of results was ensured through use of coding on all instrumentation and data. None of the research material contained identifying information that could be traced to anyone in particular. Upon completion, results of the study were made available to the participants.

#### Summary

The preceding chapter described the research design and methodology used in conducting the study. Subsequently, it is apparent that there is a need for White school counselor interns to adequately serve African American students. The present research design tested the possibility that White school counselor interns functioning at higher levels of moral development exhibit

more positive racial attitudes and have greater perceived competence at meeting the needs of African American students. The results may be used to impact counselor education and to improve school counseling services for African American students.

### **Chapter Four**

## Analysis of Results

#### Introduction

As stated previously, the purpose of the present study was to examine the impact of cognitive development on White school counselor interns' racial attitudes and perceived multicultural competence when counseling African American students. This chapter describes the results of the study. First, the sampling procedures are presented. Then, an overview of the demographics of the sample is described. Finally, the data analyses for the research hypotheses are provided.

## Sampling Procedures

During the months of November and December 2003, the researcher attended group supervision sessions at seven counselor education programs in the Southeastern United States. A total of 67 school counselor trainees from these institutions were completing their internship requirements and attending group supervision during this time. School counselor intern participants were asked to complete an Informed Consent Form, Demographic Form, the Defining Issues Test-2 (DIT-2), and an instrument that combined the New Racism Scale and Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Survey-Revised.

## Descriptive Data

# Demographics

Of the 67 school counselor trainees completing their internships and attending group supervision during the Fall semester of 2003 at the seven institutions included in the study, 57 participated in the current study for a survey completion rate of 85.1%. Nine of the remaining

85

trainees who did not participate were absent on the day in which the study was administered and one opted out of the study. The survey instruments were fully completed by 100% of the participants.

As reported in Table 2, 91.2% (52) of the respondents were females and 8.8% (5) were males. Also, while the ages of participants ranged from 20-50, 63.2% (36) were between the ages of 20 and 30. Pertaining to race, 93.0% (53) of the sample consisted of White trainees. Of these 53 participants, 49 (92.5%) were females and 4 (7.5%) were males, and 35 (66.0%) were between the ages of 20 and 30. These 53 White respondents were included in the correlational analyses.

All of the 53 White participants (100.0%) were interns at various school levels at the time the survey was conducted. Specifically, the majority of the sample was interning at the elementary level (29; 54.7%), while 9 (17.0%) were at the middle school level, 9 (17.0%) were at the high school level, 3 (5.7%) were interning at both the elementary and middle levels, 1 (1.9%) was at both the middle and high school levels and 2 (3.8%) were at both the elementary and high school levels. Most of this sample had no experience as a professional school counselor (81.1%), however, 10 (18.9%) White participants reported having a range of .25 to 3 years of experience.

Pertaining to multicultural course work, 12 (22.6%) of the 53 respondents had not yet taken a multicultural course, 7 (13.2%) were currently enrolled in one, and 34 (64.2%) had completed coursework in multicultural issues in counseling. Of the 41 interns who were either currently enrolled or had completed multicultural coursework, the majority (39; 95.1%) had just one course specifically addressing multicultural issues. Finally, most (47; 88.7%) of the White interns were members of professional organizations. Table 3 presents the demographics of this

sample.

Table 2

Total Sample by Gender, Age and Race (N=57)

| Gender  | ANNUAR DATA DATA DATA DATA DATA DATA DATA DA |   |  |  |
|---------|--|---|--|--|
| 3. A. I |  | in a construction of the state | e Angler unsurregunding jagradussassas programma (A. 1941). 1944 under Additione en gr |  |
| Male    |  | 5   | 8.8  |  |
| Female  |  | 52  | 91.2   |  |
| Total   |  | 57  | 100  |  |
| Age     |  |   |  |  |
| 20-30   |  | 36  | 63.2   |  |
| 30-40   |  | 13  | 22.8   |  |
| 40-50   |  | 8   | 14.0   |  |
| Total   |  | 57  | 100  |  |
| Race    |  |   |  |  |
| Asian   |  | 1   | 1.8  |  |
| Africa  | n American                                   | 3 · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·   | 5.3  |  |
| White   |  | 53  | 93.0   |  |
| Total   |  | 57  | 100  |  |

Table 3 Demographics of White Participants (N=53)

|      |                      | Frequency  | Percent  |  |
|------|----------------------|--|--|--|
| Gend | ler                  | om mycennycz szenktowiecznecznie wywietkielne fient <sub>wiec</sub> e wakowe understaktach telescor w e we w | vas eraanaservortumussakon ostakon võitakkortasel ostasi ostasta kortasel ostasi ostasi ostasi ostasi ostasi o | anno de la companya d |
|      | Male                 | 4  | 7.5  |  |
|      | Female               | 49   | 92.5   |  |
|      | Total                | 53   | 100  |  |
| Age  |                      |  |  |  |
|      | 20-30                | 35   | 66.0   |  |
|      | 30-40                | 10   | 18.9   |  |
|      | 40-50                | 8  | 15.1   |  |
|      | Total                | 53   | 100  |  |
| Scho | ol Level Interning   |  |  |  |
|      | Elementary           | 29   | 54.7   |  |
|      | Middle               | 9  | 17.0   |  |
|      | High                 | 9  | 17.0   |  |
|      | Combined Elem/Middle | 3  | 5.7  |  |
|      | Combined Middle/High | 1  | 1.9  |  |
|      | Combined Elem/High   | 2  | 3.8  |  |
|      | Total                | 53   | 100  |  |

| Years | Experience | as | a | School Counselor |  |
|-------|------------|----|---|------------------|--|
|       | .00        |    |   |                  |  |

|        | .00                                 | 43            | 81.         | - Parameter - Para |
|--------|-------------------------------------|---------------|-------------|--|
|        | .25                                 | 2             | 3.          | .8   |
|        | 50                                  | 2             | 3.          | .8   |
|        | 1.00                                | 2             | 3.          | 8  |
|        | 2.00                                | 2             | 3.          | 8  |
|        | 2.50                                | 1             | <b>1000</b> | 9  |
|        | 3.00                                | 1             | 1.          | 9  |
|        | Total                               | 53,           | 100         |  |
| Multio | cultural Coursework                 |               |             |  |
|        | None                                | 12            | 22.         | 6  |
|        | Currently Enrolled                  | 7             | 13.         | 2  |
|        | Completed                           | 34            | 64.         | 2  |
|        | Total                               | 53            | 100         |  |
| Numb   | er of Courses Taken if Enrolled/Com | pleted (N=41) |             |  |
|        | 1.00                                | 39            | 95.         | Table 1  |
|        | 2.00                                | quand<br>d    | 2.          | 4  |
| . *    | 3.00                                | 4             | 2.          | 4  |
|        | Total                               | 4 10          | 100         |  |

#### Racial Attitudes

Racial attitudes were measured using the New Racism Scale (NRS). As stated in Chapter 3, scores on the NRS range from 7 to 26 with high scores corresponding with tolerant racial attitudes. Participants' scores in the current study ranged from 15 to 23 with the mean being 19.7 (SD=1.96). While no norm data has been systematically computed for the NRS, the researcher found a mean of 12.60 when averaging the calculated means from four previous studies that utilized the NRS (Carter, Helms, & Juby, 2004; Constantine, 2002; Constantine & Gushue, 2003; Utsey, McCarthy, Eubanks, & Adrian, 2002) The mean in the present study is quite a bit higher. The coefficient alpha for reliability in the present study was .557. For five of the seven questions on the NRS, the majority of the participants (74.0%) most frequently selected the items reflecting the most tolerant views. For the remaining two items, which address (1) hiring practices and (2) admissions practices, the majority of the respondents (62.3%) selected the second most intolerant items. To compare scores on the NRS of those who had not yet had any multicultural coursework, those currently enrolled in a multicultural course, and those who had completed multicultural coursework, a One-Way Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) was conducted. The ANOVA results were significant, and a follow-up Tukey post-hoc test indicated that respondents who had not yet taken a multicultural course scored significantly lower on the NRS than did those who had completed multicultural coursework (mean difference = -1.61; F (2, 50) = 3.41, p = .035), thus supporting research indicating that coursework focusing on multicultural issues in counseling increases students' tolerance levels toward diverse others (Constantine, 2002). Interestingly, a follow-up Tukey test of the ANOVA results comparing scores of respondents who were between the ages of 20 and 30, 30 and 40, and 40 and 50 indicated that participants

9(

between the ages of 20 and 30 obtained significantly higher scores than participants between the ages of 40 and 50 (mean difference = 2.4; F (2, 50) = 6.24, p = .004), thus suggesting that younger interns possess more tolerant views about African Americans.

## Multicultural Competence

Perceived multicultural competence was measured using the Multicultural Counseling

Competence and Training Survey-Revised (MCCTS-R). Scores may range from 30 to 120, and
like the NRS, higher scores indicate greater perceived multicultural counseling competence. In
the present study, respondents' scores ranged from 53 to 107 with a mean of 83.2 (SD=12.80).

Means were also obtained for the four factors underlying the multicultural counseling
competence items on the MCCTS-R described in Chapter 3. A mean score of 46.8 (SD=10.31)

was obtained for the 19 items loading on the Multicultural Knowledge factor. The four items on
the Multicultural Terminology factor had a mean of 13.4 (SD=2.30). The Multicultural

Awareness factor also consisted of four items and had a mean of 13.4 (SD=2.17). Finally, the
Multicultural Skill factor consisted of three items with a mean score of 9.6 (SD=1.47). Full-scale
scores were used in the present study because the researcher was interested in examining overall
self-perceived multicultural competence. The reliability coefficient for the survey was .932.

There was no significant correlation between the MCCTS-R and age (r = -.073, p = .604).

Moral Development

The construct of moral development was measured using the Defining Issues Test-2 (DIT-2). Reliability checks were conducted on the completed instruments and subsequently, all of the data was considered reliable and was included in the analysis. Specifically, all of the respondents showed rate-and-rank consistency, endorsed fewer than 10 meaningless items (M

score), did not have a significant amount of missing data, gave at least two different ratings to the 12 items on at least four of the stories, and selected different items in their rankings. The Principled Reasoning score (P score) is the most commonly used assessment of moral judgment development on the DIT-2 and thus was used in the current investigation. This score may range from 0 to 95. Scores in the present study ranged from 6 to 72 with a mean of 41.6 (SD=13.14). Norms for the DIT-2 were generated by Bebeau, Maeda, and Tichy-Reese (2003) from an analysis of 10,870 completed tests. They reported a mean P score of 41.1 (SD=15.77) for respondents who had either attained or were working on a Masters degree. The P scores for the Masters students in the current study are virtually identical to the norm group for their educational level. Summary statistics with regard to each instrument are presented in Table 4.

Table 4

Descriptive Statistics for NRS, MCCTS-R, and DIT

| Instrument    | N  | Mean | SD    | Minimum<br>Score | Maximum<br>Score |
|---------------|----|------|-------|------------------|------------------|
| NRS           | 53 | 19.7 | 1.96  | 15               | 23               |
| MCCTS-R       | 53 | 83.2 | 12.80 | 53               | 107              |
| DIT (P score) | 53 | 41.6 | 13.14 | 6                | 72               |

## Review of Hypotheses

## Hypothesis 1:

There will be a significant positive correlation between school counselor interns' level of moral development as measured by the Defining Issues Test-2 (DIT-2) and racial attitudes as measured by the New Racism Scale (NRS).

A significant positive correlation at the .05 alpha level was found between Principled Reasoning scores (P scores) on the DIT-2 and scores on the NRS (r = .288, p = .036) thus supporting the hypothesis. The coefficient of determination ( $r^2 = .288^2$ ) equaled .08, indicating that the DIT-2 P score (moral judgment development) and the NRS (racial attitudes) have 8.0% of their variance in common.

### Hypothesis 2:

There will be a significant positive correlation between school counselor interns' level of moral development as measured by the Defining Issues Test-2 (DIT-2) and their perceived multicultural counseling competence as measured by the Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Survey-Revised (MCCTS-R).

A significant positive correlation at the .05 alpha level was not found between P scores on the DIT-2 and MCCTS-R scores (r = -.027, p = .845). The second hypothesis was not confirmed by the findings. No relationship between the variables was established.

## Hypothesis 3:

There will be a significant positive correlation between school counselor interns' racial attitudes as measured by the New Racism Scale (NRS) and perceived multicultural counseling competence as measured by the Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Survey-

Revised (MCCS).

The results yielded a Pearson Correlation coefficient of .276 (p = .046) which was statistically significant at the .05 level, thus only modestly supporting the hypothesis. The coefficient of determination ( $r^2 = .276^2$ ) equaled .076, indicating that the NRS (racial attitudes) and the MCCTS-R (perceived multicultural competence) have 7.6% of their variance in common.

# Hypothesis 4:

There will be a significant positive correlation between school counselor interns' moral development as measured by the DIT-2 and the following specific demographic characteristics:

1) age and 2) professional membership.

In opposition to previous research, there was no significant correlation between DIT-2 P scores and age (r = -.013, p = .927). Neither was a significant correlation found between DIT-2 P scores and professional membership (r = .046, p = .741). These results did not support the hypothesis.

### Hypothesis 5:

There will be a significant positive correlation between multicultural competence as measured by the MCCTS-R and amount of multicultural training as indicated on the Demographic Form.

A One-Way Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) was used to compare scores on the MCCTS-R of those who had not yet had any multicultural coursework, those currently enrolled in a multicultural course, and those who had completed multicultural coursework. A follow-up Tukey test indicated a significant difference between those who had taken multicultural coursework and

those who had not. Congruent with previous research (Constantine & Yeh, 2001), a mean difference of -10.02 (F (2, 50) = 3.07, p = .049) on the MCCTS-R indicated that those having taken coursework focusing on issues of diversity in counseling perceived themselves to be more multiculturally competent.

### Hypothesis 6:

There will be no significant correlation between White school counselor interns' moral development as measured by the DIT-2, racial attitudes as measured by the NRS, perceived multicultural counseling competence as measured by the MCCTS-R and White school counselor interns' gender.

Consistent with past research, no significant correlations were found between gender and moral judgment development scores (r = .003, p = .983). The results of an Independent Samples t-test for equality of means indicated that the male P score mean of 41.50 (SD=7.72) did not differ significantly from the female P score mean of 41.65 (SD=13.54) (t (51) = -.022, p = 983). As hypothesized, there was also no significant correlation between racial attitudes and males and females (r = .024, p = .867). The results of an Independent Samples t-test for equality of means indicated that the male NRS mean of 19.50 (SD= 2.08) did not differ significantly from the female NRS mean score of 19.67 (SD=1.97) (t (51) = -.169, p = .867). Finally, there were no significant correlations between male and female scores on the MCCTS-R (r = .145, p = .301). The results of an Independent Samples t-test for equality of means indicated that the male MCCTS-R mean score of 76.75 (SD=3.86) did not differ significantly from the female MCCTS-R mean score of 83.69 (SD=13.15) (t (51) = -1.044, p = .301). The hypothesis was confirmed by these findings.

## **Chapter Five**

#### Discussion and Conclusions

#### Introduction

This chapter includes an overview of the study's rationale, and a comprehensive review of the results presented in Chapter 4. The study's major research findings are compared to previous related studies, and a discussion of possible reasons for convergent and divergent results ensues. Limitations of the study are explored and implications from the findings are posed. Finally, ideas are suggested for future research linking cognitive development to White school counselor interns' efficacy in meeting the needs of African American students.

#### Rationale

This study was conducted to assess the relationship between moral development and White school counselor interns' racial attitudes and perceived multicultural competency when counseling African American students. Currently, only Whites outnumber African Americans in public schools (Lee, 1995), and the majority of school counselors and interns are White (Herring, 1998; Sandhu, 2001). It stands to reason that White school counselor trainees will be counseling African American students with an ethical obligation to provide adequate services. School counselor training approaches, which emphasize the need for multicultural competency, are not adequately preparing school counselors to address the needs of African American students as evidenced in multiple studies looking at the current status of these students. School counseling interventions have been found to be less effective for African American students (Georges, 1997; Lapan, Gysbers, & Sun, 1997; Lee & Ekstrom, 1987). African American students score lower on achievement tests, are less proficient in reading and math, graduate from high school at a lower

rate, and take less advanced course work than White students (Caldas & Bankston, 1997; U.S. Department of Education/No Child Left Behind, 2001; U.S. Department of Commerce, 2000). African American students get unfairly suspended, are inappropriately passed from one grade to the next, are excessively overrepresented in special education and underrepresented in gifted classes, drop-out of school, and live in poverty more often than Whites (Clark, Petras, & Kellam, 2000; Indiana Educational Policy Center, 20000; Thomas B. Fordham Foundation, 1999; U.S. Department of Commerce, 2000).

The pedagogy of multicultural training for school counselors needs revision, and based on previous research linking cognitive development to counselors' efficacy with diverse populations (Adams, 2002; Brendel, Kolbert, & Foster, 2002; Hoare, 1991; Vogt, 1997), the researcher proposed programmatic reformation to incorporate methodology designed to promote moral development. Although the literature reviewed in Chapter 3 substantiated a link between moral development and various areas of counseling and ethnic tolerance, no empirical research had been conducted on the link between White school counselor interns' moral development and their racial attitudes and perceived competencies for addressing the needs of African American students. The current study was designed to confirm this relationship in order to substantiate the need for educational strategies that promote the development of trainees.

This exploratory study consisted of a sample of 57 school counselor interns from several counselor education institutions in Southeastern United States. Data was collected during regularly scheduled group supervision sessions using an Informed Consent Form, a Demographic Form, the Defining Issues Test-2, the New Racism Scale, and the Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Survey-Revised. Of the 57 participants, 53 were White and their data

97

was analyzed using descriptive and multivariate correlational analyses to determine the direction and magnitude of the relationship between the measures (Gall, Borg, & Gall, 1996). The results were presented in Chapter 4, and following is a discussion of the research findings pertaining to the hypotheses.

## Discussion of Major Research Findings

# Hypothesis 1

The first hypothesis correctly assumed that a significant positive correlation would be found between White school counselor interns' levels of moral development as measured by the Defining Issues Test-2 (DIT-2) and racial attitudes as measured by the New Racism Scale (NRS). The Principled reasoning score (P-score) on the DIT-2 indicates levels of moral judgment development and was used in the comparative analyses. Scores on the NRS specifically address respondents' attitudes toward African Americans. In the present study, those with higher P-scores received scores reflecting significantly greater tolerance toward diversity on the NRS (r = .288). Based on Cohen's (1988) convention for interpreting effect sizes for correlational analyses, an r of .10 is small, .30 is medium and .50 is large. The fact that the first hypothesis approached a medium effect size should not be taken lightly considering the nature of the research being conducted. For research using t-tests or z-tests, Cohen (1977) determined that an effect size of .20 is small, .50 is medium and .80 and above is large for research. However Haase, Waechter, and Solomon (1982) examined the average effect sizes found in counseling psychology research by comparing the significant results of 11,044 studies published in issues of the *Journal of* Counseling Psychology, and deemed that the typical strength of association found in behavioral sciences research using all types of analyses is .29. This is comparable to the present finding. The strength of the correlation is well within the norm for social sciences research and specifically, correlational investigations.

The finding from the first hypothesis is also similar to previous studies linking moral judgment development to moral behavior and attitudes. Specifically, Thoma and Rest (1986) analyzed the results of 30 studies that assessed the correlation between P-scores on the DIT and such things as delinquency, cheating, willingness to cooperate with others, and participation as a conscientious objector. Consistently, significant correlations were found to be in the .30 range. Similar Pearson correlation coefficients were found by Blasi (1980) in 58 of the 74 studies he reviewed that established a significant link between moral reasoning and issues of morality such as honesty, altruism, social conformity and cheating. Finally, Polovy (1980) investigated the correlation between DIT P-scores and various personality characteristics measured by the California Personality Index (CPI). Specifically related to the current study, a significant correlation coefficient of .32 was found between tolerance and principled reasoning for a sample of 230 high school students. Post conventional reasoning has also been found to correlate significantly with support for minority rights, the Equal Rights Amendment, and social welfare (Letchworth & McGee, 1981; Lonky, Reihman, & Serlin, 1981).

The relationship found between moral judgment development and racial attitudes is also consistent with Kohlberg's stage model in which higher is better. In other words, those functioning at higher levels of development are better able to adapt in the environment. They use more complex thought processes, are more flexible and more tolerant of ambiguity as opposed to those functioning at lower levels. Specifically, White school counselor interns at the preconventional level, in which moral judgments stem from fear of punishment and meeting

one's own needs, would likely have an ethnocentric world view and be unable to understand the perspectives of diverse others. Preconventional reasoning may result in interns seeking to punish those different from themselves through acts of racism. Having an individualistic perspective, these White school counselor interns may choose to scorn socioeconomic initiatives to assist African Americans out of fear that these initiatives will rob them of opportunities. It is likely that interns at the preconventional level would adopt very rigid counseling techniques that they would have difficulty adapting to suit a diverse student population. Due to difficulty being able to perspective take and intolerance of ambiguity, it is unlikely that they would be able to empathize with African Americans, which has been found to be the key for developing a therapeutic relationship with these students (Kiselica, 1998; Locke, 1989; Sandhu, 2001). Finally, school counselor interns at the preconventional level may avoid interacting with African Americans due to fearing the unknown, which perhaps could have contributed to the results found by Lee and Ekstrom (1987) who reported that school counselors devoted more of their time to middle and upper income White students who were college bound than to low income and minority students. Those at the conventional level may also choose to focus on middle and upper income White students because they feel most comfortable relating to these students and, as a result, have mutual interpersonal expectations.

Those functioning at the conventional level could begin to recognize the varying perspectives of African Americans and the inequities that exist in our society, however they would likely be consumed with maintaining the norms of the majority or with supporting their behavior by firmly upholding the law or standards of our society. It is likely that interns from this level would either intentionally adopt a dogmatic counseling approach in which they expect

100

minorities to assimilate to the ways of the majority culture, or they would unintentionally facilitate ethnocentric counseling techniques assuming that they apply to everyone. The harm in these perspectives is that normal behaviors for African American students may be misinterpreted as pathological, disruptive or abnormal, and many students who should be systemically supported by the school counselor to remain in academic classrooms, instead get suspended, placed in special education, or pushed through school (Skiba, Michael, Nardo & Peterson, 2000; Thomas B. Fordham Foundation, 1999; U.S. Department of Education: Civil Rights Office, 2000). A biased and discriminatory perspective of African Americans may stem from conventional reasoning in which school counselor interns would likely consider their culture's norms to be superior to others'. They may also be less tolerant of changing laws and standards to better serve the minority since the existing jurisprudence appears to be adequately maintaining order for the majority in society.

Several pivotal studies described in chapter three seem to illustrate school counselor behavior at Kohlberg's preconventional and conventional levels. Specifically, Skiba, Michael, Nardo & Peterson (2000) concluded that the disproportionality in rates of suspension appear to be due more to bias and discrimination than to the idea that African American students are simply bigger troublemakers than their White counterparts. It is suggested that African Americans' physical, active communication styles may be interpreted as combative or threatening by those who accept stereotypes or have a culturally encapsulated worldview. Also, Lapan, Gysbers, and Sun (1997) studied the impact of counseling on students' grades, feelings of preparation for graduation, and positive feelings toward school and found that African American students felt inadequately informed of post secondary options, had difficulty establishing a

relationship with their counselors significantly more often than did White students, were more frequently tracked into non-college preparatory course work, were seen by a counselor less frequently, and had a lower rate of return to see the counselor than their White peers. The behaviors described in these studies are conducive with the above description of White school counselor interns reasoning through a fearful, individualistic perspective (preconventional level) or a conforming, rule oriented perspective (conventional level).

Conversely, Vogt (1997) described tolerance as a postconventional concept. The current finding, that White school counselor interns reasoning from this Principled level embrace more tolerant racial attitudes, lends further support for Vogt's perspective and Kohlberg's theory. These interns may be able to imagine the broad social consequences of a biased educational system and ethnocentric counseling approaches. At this level, they are less dogmatic, better able to perspective-take and have much more tolerance for ambiguity, and thus avoid pathologizing the normal behavior of African American students. Consequently, they would likely be willing to adapt counseling strategies to best address the needs of minority students. Furthermore, as was addressed in the NRS, they are more tolerant of the inconveniences of such social institutions as affirmative action, likely understanding not only the reason for its existence, but also the need for it. Further, they would likely be able to regulate their emotional defensiveness toward a resistant African American student by instead attending to their cognitive knowledge of the reasons for the resistance. Similarly, White school counselor interns at the post-conventional level would be able to reject stereotypes and make accurate appraisals of danger, thus minimizing their unrealistic fears and improving their ability to show empathy and establish therapeutic relationships with their African American students.

## Hypothesis 2

The second hypothesis assumed that a significant positive correlation would exist between moral judgment development and perceived multicultural competence; however this was not supported by the results. No relationship was established between the participants' Pscores on the DIT-2 and their scores on the MCCTS-R. While the link between moral development and perceived multicultural competence had not previously been tested, past research significantly linking moral reasoning to ethnic tolerance, and moral reasoning to counseling competence led the present researcher to deduce that the second hypothesis would be validated. As discussed earlier, those at higher levels of development have been found to be more tolerant (Polovy, 1980) and more effective as counselors (Brendel, Kolbert & Foster, 2002). However, the lack of significance may be attributed to several issues. First, since the MCCTS-R assesses respondents' perceptions of competency rather than their actual competence, scores may in fact be a reflection of one's ability to self-assess rather than an appraisal of the quality of one's multicultural counseling awareness, knowledge or skill. If this is the case, research indicates that those at higher levels of cognitive development are better able to self-evaluate than are those at lower levels (Kagen, 1986; Wilsman, 1979; Zakharova, 1990). Specifically, Kagen (1986) assessed the perceived teaching competency of 60 teacher trainees and found that those at higher levels of development held more rigorous standards for their teaching performance, and thus gave more critical self-evaluations than did those at lower levels of development. White school counselor interns at higher levels of development may have been able to critique their abilities more accurately than those at lower levels of moral development when completing the MCCTS-R. They may have been better able to recognize their limitations and been more aware of areas

for growth and improvement. As a result, those with lower P-scores may have overestimated their competencies and those with higher P-scores may have reported a more realistic assessment of their competencies, thus resulting in a difference in scores that was not significant.

A richer understanding of the link between self-perceptions and cognitive development may be achieved through the domain of ego development. Loevinger's (1976) theory of ego development describes the evolvement of interpersonal relationships. It provides a schema for conceptualizing how the self, others and the environment are perceived and interpreted. Like moral development, the ego develops hierarchically through stages. In relation to self-assessment, individuals in the lower stages of ego development (Impulsive stage [E2] through Conformist stage [E4]) are less able to accurately self-assess. They typically confound their own perspectives with the perspectives of others. However, as individuals move into the Self Aware stage (E5), they begin to gain awareness of themselves as separate from others and thus begin to gain insight into their own motivations. As individuals approach the Autonomous stage (E8), they become better able to accurately self assess. They are more critical of themselves as they recognize both the strengths and limitations of their thoughts, beliefs and actions.

Applied to the current study, those at lower levels of ego development would be unable to accurately perceive their multicultural competency on the MCCTS-R. It is likely that these individuals would respond in a socially desirable manner as a result of seeing themselves in a socially desirable way, thus inflating their scores. On the other hand, those at higher levels of ego development would recognize their strengths and limitations as applied to multicultural counseling, and would likely produce accurate ratings of their competency on the MCCTS-R.

Research examining the link between ego development and self-perception instruments as well

as live performance ratings of actual competence would be needed to substantiate this possibility.

Another possible reason for the lack of significant findings may be related to the experience level of the interns. All participants were completing their internship requirements for fulfillment of their masters degree in school counseling, thus all of the participants were exposed to students in the school setting. However, the majority of the participants (n = 43) had no previous counseling experience and therefore had only been practicing supervised school counseling for approximately 3 months. With such limited experience, it is unlikely that many of the participants would consider themselves competent counselors in any particular area. Therefore, despite developmental differences, the perceived competency levels of the interns may have been similarly low. Differences may have been found if the population had been experienced school counselors.

A third possible reason for the non-significant finding may be due to measurement error. The MCCTS-R is a relatively new instrument that has only been utilized in counseling research by its developer prior to the current study. The survey was chosen presently because it specifically addresses school counselors' perceptions of their multicultural competency, however while the instrument has been found to be reliable, further assessment of its validity and reliability should be conducted to ensure that it is a sound instrument. Another more established instrument revised to address school counselor interns may have yielded significant results. This instrument's limitations are further discussed under the following section entitled, "Limitations of the Study."

Hypothesis 3

The significant results for the third hypothesis indicated that interns possessing more

tolerant racial attitudes also perceive themselves as more multiculturally competent. It should be noted that the correlation between racial attitudes and perceived multicultural competence was just moderate by traditional standards. However, since the Pearson correlation coefficient of .276 approached .30, its effect size can be considered typical for social sciences research. This finding was consistent with previous research that has found a significant correlation between racial attitudes and either real or perceived multicultural competency (Constantine, 2001; Constantine, 2002; Constantine & Gushue, 2003). In a pivotal study described at length in chapter two, Constantine (2002), using the NRS, found that, "higher levels of racism were correlated with lower levels of self-reported multicultural counseling competence" (p. 162) in school counselor trainees. The results from both previous research and the current study have great implications for the practice of school counseling. Those who harbor racist attitudes may not perceive themselves to be as multicultural competent as those with a tolerant worldview because they may be resistant to obtaining knowledge about diverse others, uninvested in becoming more selfaware of feelings and values in relation to others, and dispassionate about learning and applying culturally appropriate skills. As a result, the potential for African American students to be adequately counseled becomes significantly compromised. In fact, an uninformed, racist, defensive school counselor could potentially jeopardize the academic, personal/social and career development of minority students. In light of these results, it becomes necessary to ensure that school counselor preparation includes diversity training specifically to promote tolerance as a means to induce multicultural competence. It is interesting to note that while there was no significant correlation between perceived competency and cognitive development, there was a significant correlation between moral reasoning and racial attitudes, and between racial attitudes

and perceived competency. "Racial attitudes" seems to be the link interconnecting the three constructs. Based on these results, this link lends credence to the need for multicultural counselor training that is aimed at promoting cognitive development, which in turn is likely to promote tolerance in trainees, which should result in a commitment to become more multiculturally competent. Further research utilizing path analysis would be needed to confirm this postulation. 

Hypothesis 4

The fourth hypothesis addressed the relationship between P-scores on the DIT-2, and age and membership in professional organizations. In contrast to previous research, no significant correlation was found between participants' moral judgment development and their age. The limited variability in respondents' ages may have reduced the probability of identifying statistically significant relationships between the variables. In fact, the majority (66%) of the White school counselor interns were between the ages of 20 and 30, and all of the participants were between the ages of 20 and 50. Previous research has found significant differences in moral development based on age when examining a much more heterogenous subject pool than was used in the current study. For example, Colby, Kohlberg, Gibbs and Lieberman (1983) published results from a 20 year longitudinal study conducted by the Kohlberg Group in which individuals were found to progress through the stages of moral development in an invariant and hierarchical manner. The participants were at significantly higher stages of development when they were in their 40's as opposed to when they were in their teens. From a 10- year longitudinal study of scores on the DIT, Rest (1986) found similar gains in development with children and teens scoring significantly lower than adults. However, when looking specifically at developmental differences in adults, it may be more telling to consider educational levels. Rest (1994) stated:

...education is a far more powerful predictor of moral judgment development than merely chronological age, per se. The general trend is that as long as subjects continue in formal education, their DIT scores tend to gain; but when subjects stop their formal education, then their DIT scores plateau. Consequently, if you wanted to predict the DIT scores of adults, you would do best by knowing their education level, not age or gender (p.15).

Since all of the participants in the present study were at the same educational level (masters degree), it is not surprising that their P-scores would not differ significantly by age. The mean P-score (41.6) for the White school counselor interns who participated in the current research was, in fact, virtually identical to the mean P-score (41.1) of those with a masters degree who were included in a study to generate normative data for the DIT-2 (Bebeau, Maeda, & Tichy-Reese, 2003).

The relationship between moral reasoning and professional membership had not previously been studied, thus making the second part of the hypothesis exploratory in nature. No significant difference in moral reasoning was found between those who were members of professional organizations and those who were not. Since it is not mandatory for school counselor interns to become members of an organization such as the American Counseling Association, it was believed that those at higher levels of development would be more invested in their professional development, more committed to giving back to the field and more dedicated to staying current with trends in the profession, and thus would join professional organizations as a means to achieve these things.

The lack of significant findings may be contributable to several issues. First, the majority (47; 88.7%) of the participants were members of professional organizations, and this group

homogeneity may have limited the ability to detect significant difference. The academic environment greatly encourages professional membership, perhaps explaining the high number of interns who were members of organizations at the time the study was conducted. As opposed to the previously mentioned reasons for joining professional organizations, some students may have chosen membership as a way to conform to the norm within their program, to please faculty, or for solely self-serving purposes such as boosting one's resume. These behaviors are more conducive to those functioning at lower levels of development, but since the Demographic questionnaire did not ask respondents to explain why they had joined professional organizations, it is impossible to determine the members' reasoning. Another reason for lack of significant difference may have been financially based. Membership to organizations is often costly, and being students, some of the non-members in the current study may simply have not been able to afford joining.

Perhaps a more accurate assessment of the correlation between moral reasoning and professional membership could be ascertained by studying currently practicing school counselors as opposed to interns. Professional school counselors are not mandated to join organizations and are typically not pressured by their directors or principals to join. Despite making a steady income, they are frequently overwhelmed with the responsibilities of the profession, and may find it difficult to take on additional tasks such as presenting and attending workshops. It seems that those who still choose to join professional organizations would be doing so for the previously stated reasons that reflect higher moral judgment. Future research is necessary to substantiate this possible correlation.

Hypothesis 5

The fifth hypothesis assumed that those with more multicultural education would perceive themselves to be more multiculturally competent, and this was confirmed by the results. The finding replicates results from previous studies that have investigated the impact of diversity training on multicultural competence (Constantine, 2001; Constantine & Gushue, 2003; Constantine & Yeh, 2001; Sodowsky, Kuo-Jackson, Richardson & Corey, 1998). Constantine (2002) suggests that those who complete multicultural training may be better prepared to address the needs of diverse clients, and so it is necessary for school counselor education to provide sufficient amounts of exposure to multicultural issues, including self-awareness, knowledge of diverse groups of people, and specific multicultural skills. Further, it may be necessary for practicing school counselors to engage in continued multicultural education in order to remain efficacious with diverse students. However, Steward, Morales, Bartell, Miller, and Weeks (1998) investigated the impact of multicultural coursework on counselor trainees' acceptance and valuing of multicultural issues and found that successful completion of multicultural coursework and favorable evaluations of multicultural competence do not always result in a positive reaction to issues of diversity. The participants in their study were 39 White masters and doctoral counseling students from a Midwestern university who had recently completed a course addressing diversity. They were mailed survey packets including a cover letter that included informed consent, and a researcher-developed survey intended to gather demographic information, trainees' reactions to their multicultural coursework, an evaluation of their classmates' reaction to the coursework, and an evaluation of their classmates' multicultural competency. Results indicated that despite having passed the multicultural class and receiving favorable competency ratings by peers, one-third of the participants perceived the diversity

course as "meaningless and unnecessary." Despite the study's limitations (small sample size from one university in one region of the country using an instrument with no established validity and reliability), the implications for these results are great. Diverse clientele could potentially be misunderstood, misdiagnosed, and mistreated if intolerance goes unnoticed in counselor education because students are able to fool faculty into thinking they are competent, sensitive counselors. The authors suggest more stringent expectations, evaluations, and supervision to confront this dilemma.

The results from the present study challenge Steward, et al's (1998) findings. Had the present study only assessed the relationship between amount of multicultural coursework and perceived competency, the significant results should have perhaps been accepted with reservation. Participants having taken a multicultural course may have appeared more competent because they "knew" the answers to the questions, but they may still have lacked real tolerance and openness toward diverse others. However, the present investigation also found significance between racial attitudes and multicultural competence, and racial attitudes and multicultural coursework. In addition to perceiving themselves to be significantly more multiculturally competent, those interns who had completed multicultural coursework were also significantly more tolerant, and those that were more tolerant perceived themselves to be significantly more competent. By correlating tolerance with the other variables, it is possible to deduce that perceived competence and tolerance are fortunate by-products of multicultural education, and that tolerance rather than faking good is the factor impacting interns self-reported competency. Because tolerance is also significantly correlated with moral development, it stands to reason that school counselor multicultural education should incorporate strategies to promote development

and thus promote tolerance and, subsequently, multicultural competence in trainees. Further experimental research determining causality between these variables is necessary.

## Hypothesis 6

The sixth hypothesis was confirmed by the results. No gender differences were found on any of the instruments used in the study. Pertaining to the Defining Issues Test, the results support studies substantiating that, overall, males and females do not differ significantly in moral reasoning. Specifically, Walker (1984) conducted a meta-analysis of 72 studies that had utilized the DIT, and found that the majority of the results indicated no gender differences. Small sex differences have been found at higher educational levels (Bebeau & Thoma, 2003). Females tend to score slightly higher than males at the masters level, and substantially higher at the doctoral level, however, despite all participants being at the masters level in the present study, male and female DIT-2 scores were virtually identical. This may be due to lack of variability in the sample. Since there were only 4 male participants, the reliability of comparative analyses was threatened. Future research with subgroup equality will need to continue to address male and female differences on the DIT-2.

While norm data pertaining to gender differences has not been established for the NRS, no studies using the survey have detected significant gender differences to this date (Carter, Helms, & Juby, 2004; Constantine, 2002; Constantine & Gushue, 2003; Utsey, McCarthy, Eubanks, & Adrian, 2002). It appears that factors other than gender are responsible for differences in racial attitudes. The results from the current study indicate that moral development is one of these factors.

Since the MCCTS-R has not been used extensively, the hypothesis predicting no gender

differences was exploratory in nature. Only one previous study had disaggregated the results of the MCCTS-R by gender, and like the present study, they found no significant differences (Holcomb-McCoy & Myers, 1999). While this study in conjunction with the current findings indicate that males and females do not differ in their perceptions of multicultural competence as indicated on the MCCTS-R, additional research is necessary for confirmation.

# Discussion of Additional Findings

In addition to the research hypotheses, several additional findings related to a number of variables addressed on the Demographic Form yielded significant results and are worth noting. Some of these results were exploratory and thus need additional investigation, while others further confirmed previous research. In reference to the gender and racial makeup of the entire sample of 57 respondents, 91.2% (52) were females and 93.0% (53) were White trainees. This finding is consistent with previous studies indicating that the majority of school counselors and school counselor trainees are White females (Constantine, 2002; Constantine and Gainor, 2001; Holcomb-McCoy & Day-Vines, in press; Lambie, 2002). In these studies, Whites tend to represent between 87 to 90 percent of the school counselor/trainee population, and females tend to account for between 83 to 89 percent. The percentages of females and Whites in the current study were actually somewhat higher than in these previous studies. This may be due to where the study was conducted. Perhaps the particular schools at which the participants attended either attracted more White female counseling trainees or admitted more White female counseling trainees than average. The current homogeneity of school counselor trainees illuminates the need for counselor education programs to recruit more males and racially diverse individuals to better represent the students they serve.

113

In reference to responses on the New Racism scale, the majority (74%) of the respondents selected the most tolerant view for 5 of the seven items. These items address issues such as having an African American move into your neighborhood, having your child attend school with African Americans and electing an African American president. In contrast, over half of the respondents (62.3%) selected the second most intolerant view for the final two items, which address hiring practices and admissions practices. It may be assumed that since the majority of the participants were college students between the ages of 20 and 30, the first five issues did not seem as personally relevant as the last two. It is unlikely that many of these participants were married homeowners with children, and 2003 was not an election year. However, all of the interns were students who were directly impacted by admissions policies, and the majority were looking for school counseling jobs as they neared the end of their program and thus would be impacted by hiring policies. Racial attitudes may be better reflected in issues that respondents can personalize. For college students, an instrument addressing social interactions, membership in diverse organizations, preference for work settings, and confidence in diverse faculty in addition to admissions and hiring policies may better gauge the racial attitudes of this population. Further support for this supposition may be found by noting that participants between the ages of 40 and 50 received significantly (p = .004) higher scores on the NRS, thus reflecting less tolerant attitudes than those between the ages of 20 and 30. It can be assumed that 40 to 50 year old interns were more likely to be married homeowners with children who were also impacted by both admissions and hiring practices. Consequently, the NRS may be addressing issues that are much more personally relevant for older interns, and thus a more accurate assessment of their racial attitudes. Certainly further research is needed to substantiate this assumption. An opposing view may be that younger interns are simply less racist than older interns. From the perspective of social constructivism (Mahoney, 1995), it is possible that the 40 to 50 year olds who hold less tolerant views were shaped by segregation and anti-Black sentiment of the South in the 1950's and 60's, and have not yet reconstructed their views of African Americans despite exposure to multicultural education. Further research is needed to explore this possibility as well.

In addition to substantiating the hypothesis that those with more diversity training would perceive themselves to be more multiculturally competent, it was found that those with more diversity training were also significantly more tolerant. This result was also found by Constantine (2002) using the NRS and the Multicultural Counseling Knowledge and Awareness Scale (MCKAS) which measures respondents' perceived multicultural competence. These findings indicate that, "White school counselor trainees who harbor racist attitudes may be less aware of cultural issues in the context of counseling" (p. 170-171). Consequently, these counselors may be ill prepared to adequately counsel African American students. Instead they may pathologize normal behavior and become inappropriately defensive as a result of misinterpreting resistance or aggressiveness. They may remain oblivious to White privilege and thus ignorant of the social inequality impacting these students' progress, and they may utilize ineffective strategies that don't account for cultural differences. Because causality was not established in either the present research or the Constantine (2002) study, it is impossible to determine whether tolerance was a bi-product of diversity education, or whether those that are more tolerant take more multicultural coursework. Either way, since tolerance was found to correlate with multicultural competence, it becomes critical to ensure that the pedagogy of counselor education is designed to promote tolerance for all trainees. Multicultural classes that aim to promote cognitive development would

likely produce even more tolerant trainees. And those that are more tolerant may be more inclined to take additional multicultural coursework, thus further preparing them to be effective with diverse populations. Studies that address causality would be needed to assess this presumption.

## Limitations of the Study

Several limitations existed with the present study's research design, sample, and measurement instruments that may have impacted the results. A discussion of these factors follows.

# Research design

The primary design limitation was in reference to the type of analysis used. Correlational research can only indicate linear relationships, and cannot establish causality (Gall, Borg & Gall, 1996). A significant correlation between two variables may actually have resulted from the influence of a third extraneous variable (Jaeger, 1993). In fact, very rarely in research is something caused solely by a single factor (Jaeger, 1993). True causality can only be determined through an experimental design where all variables are controlled (Gall, Borg, & Gall, 1996).

The manner in which the data was collected posed an additional design limitation. The researcher attended group supervision sessions at seven different universities. While measures were taken to ensure consistency in administration procedures, other factors may have influenced the participants' responses. For example, the rooms in which the study was conducted varied greatly from school to school. Two of the sessions took place in very small lab rooms where students were in close proximity to one another, two sessions were in classrooms with desks arranged in rows facing the front of the room, and three sessions were in conference style rooms

where students were arranged around one large table. Participants may have felt that response confidentiality was compromised in the small rooms, and consequently may have answered in a more socially acceptable manner. Furthermore, the time of day in which the study was administered differed from school to school based on when the group supervision session was held. Times ranged from early afternoon to late in the evening. Trainees expected to participate late in the evening may not have invested as much effort into their responses due to being tired. It is also important to note that room temperature and lighting varied, and the weather outside varied. The researcher wonders how a cold room, rainy day, or harsh lighting could have influenced interns' responses. Finally, data was collected over the course of a month from mid-November to mid-December. It is difficult to ascertain how the pressure of finals may have impacted the responses of those who participated in the study just before the end of the semester. While conducting the study face-to-face likely improved the rate of participation, the above mentioned factors must be considered when interpreting the results.

Sampling

Financial and time constraints made it impossible to survey a purely random sample.

Therefore, the current study was conducted at just seven school counselor education programs in one region of the United States. Consequently, the generalizability of the results may be limited.

Participants from these programs may not be representative of all White school counselor interns in the country. Likewise, no norm data exists to date on the demographic profile of school counselor trainees nationwide. CACREP is attempting to generate data profiling students of accredited institutions across the country, however this data was not yet available at the time the present study was conducted. If information such as this were available, comparative analyses

would have indicated if the sample in the current study was representative of the national sample, and thus more generalizable. An additional sampling limitation is due to the fact that it was not possible to ascertain the impact of other training and supervision experiences obtained in their counselor education programs on the interns' participation. Perhaps ethics education and individual supervision, both of which have been correlated with tolerance (Guthrie, 1997; Cook, 1978), actually impact racial attitudes and multicultural competency more than the variables identified in the present study. Experimental research is needed to expand the present study and determine causality. Furthermore, participation in the study was voluntary; interns were presented with the option to opt out of the study without penalty. While most educational research allows for subjects to decide whether or not to participate, this may impact the results (Gall, Borg, & Gall, 1996). Those that choose to participate may respond differently to the study than those who choose to opt out. However, it should be noted that only one intern out of all who were present during the administrations chose not to participate.

#### Instrumentation

The measurement instruments utilized in the present study had either very strong or acceptable reliability and validity. The weakest instrument was the New Racism Scale with alpha coefficients ranging from .60 to .70 (Constantine & Gushue, 2003; Silvestri & Richardson, 2001; Utsey, McCarthy, Eubanks, & Adrian, 2002). The reliability in the current study was a bit lower at .56. Measurement error may have resulted from inconsistent testing conditions, variations in administration, and participants' problems (such as being sick or tired) (Gall, Borg, & Gall, 1996). An additional limitation to the NRS is the ability to answer items in a socially acceptable manner. In the present study, the faculty supervisors and the researcher were present throughout

the administration of the survey, and student participants accustomed to being evaluated may have hesitated to respond to questions in a truthful manner for fear of appearing insensitive and not "good" despite being told by the researcher that answers would be kept completely confidential and that no one from their institution would have access to the results. This possibility seems justified when noting that the mean of 19.7 in the current study is so much higher than the mean of 12.60 obtained by averaging the calculated means from four previous studies that utilized the NRS (Carter, Helms, & Juby, 2004; Constantine, 2002; Constantine & Gushue, 2003; Utsey, McCarthy, Eubanks, & Adrian, 2002). A replication of the current research may attempt to further ensure confidentiality and reduce the evaluative nature of the task by having participants complete the instruments in a private environment away from their peers, faculty supervisors and the researcher.

The Multicultural Counseling Competency and Training Survey-Revised, on the other hand, had very high reliability in the present study. Its full-scale coefficient alpha was .93, and reliability coefficients for the four factors were as follows: Knowledge = .940; Terminology = .939; Awareness = .754; and Skill = .780. These Cronbach Alpha coefficients were consistent with previous research that found the reliability of the factors to range from .74 to .97 (Holcomb-McCoy , 2000; Holcomb-McCoy & Myers, 1999; Holcomb-McCoy & Day-Vines, in press). However, as in the NRS, it is quite possible to answer questions on the MCCTS-R in a socially desirable manner. Respondents have a tendency to want to present themselves in a positive light, and without items built into an instrument to identify this behavior, results may be biased (Gall, Borg, & Gall, 1996). Since the MCCTS-R has no such items, it is quite possible that participants chose to present themselves as more multiculturally competent than is actually true. Furthermore,

as discussed earlier when exploring the results related to hypothesis two, since the survey assesses perceived versus actual competence, scores may be a reflection of one's ability to self-assess rather than one's competency when working with diverse populations. The Center for Technology in Government (2000) describes several additional limitations inherent in the use of self-assessment instruments. Specifically, when using a self-assessment instrument, one must realize that participants may distort the results by responding in a manner to promote their own interests. They may provide inaccurate responses based on erroneous memories or flawed perceptions, and they may be influenced by others. Despite finding it reliable, a self-assessment instrument may not be a valid or accurate assessment of the intended construct. Also, self-assessment instruments may be designed to produce a desired outcome or to favor a particular point of view (Center for Technology in Government, 2000). For future investigations, a more accurate assessment of multicultural competency may be gauged through live performance assessments, supervisor evaluations, or perhaps through review of participants' portfolios.

The Defining Issues Test-2, the third instrument used in the current study, has well-established validity and reliability. In fact, it is the most widely used measure of moral reasoning in scientific research allowing for a wealth of comparative data (Gielen & Lei, 1992). By 1992 over 600 studies had utilized the DIT-1 (Gielen & Lei, 1992), and by 2003, 176 studies had used the DIT-2 since its development in 1998 (Bebeau & Thoma, 2003). The DIT-2 consists of updated dilemmas, utilizes a shorter form, and has clearer directions. These changes improved the test and did not sacrifice its validity. The correlation between the DIT-2 and DIT-1 is virtually identical (.79) to the test-retest reliability of the DIT-1 (.80). Furthermore, the P score has been found to be a good single-number indicator of development. As the P score goes up, the

lower level scores go down, therefore, for research purposes it becomes redundant to report all of the stage scores obtained from the DIT (Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau, & Thoma, 1999).

In the current study, respondents' scores passed all of the built-in reliability checks, and participants received P-scores almost identical to the norm data for masters students that has been produced for the DIT-2. However, it should be noted that an inherent limitation to the DIT exists in that it is a recognition test rather than a production test. Participants who otherwise could not formulate principled thoughts are able to choose responses reflecting principled reasoning from the multiple choice options. Ultimately, despite reliability checks, when utilizing a multiple choice format, the possibility exists for respondents to choose items they do not fully endorse. The interview format of Kohlberg's Moral Judgment Interview (MJI) provides a more accurate and valid assessment of moral development (Gielen & Lei, 1992). However, it lacks practicality. Given an ample amount of time and money, it would be interesting to assess the correlations between moral development as measured by the MJI, racial attitudes as measured by the NRS and multicultural competence as measured by live performance assessments.

The current study produced an appreciable amount of significant correlations between the variables under investigation. However, in light of the study's limitations, it is necessary to use caution when considering these relationships. Additional research that takes the limitations into account should be conducted to verify the current study's findings.

# **Implications**

The National Model for School Counseling Programs (ASCA, 2003) clearly state that a primary goal for school counselors is to close the persisting achievement gap that exists based primarily on ethnicity and socioeconomic status (Education Trust, 2002). The model asserts that

school counselors must take the initiative to provide services aimed at ensuring academic achievement for the under-represented and under-served population. Traditional counseling methods may be insufficient and school counselors must be willing to modify practices, take on the role of advocate, and persistently challenge an ethnocentric system (ASCA, 2003).

The results of these interventions, designed to close the gap, can be documented with student-achievement and achievement-related data. These types of program results move school counseling from the periphery of the school's mission to a position where the educational community views it as critical to student success. (p. 53)

Essentially, they are being asked to reinvent their role within the school and accept the responsibility to ensure equal access to education for those that continue to be thwarted by the system. To date, African American students are overrepresented in special education and suspensions, underrepresented in gifted and talented programs, and frequently passed from one grade to the next despite failing grades (Clark, Petras, & Kellam, 2000; Indiana Educational Policy Center, 20000; Thomas B. Fordham Foundation, 1999). Additionally, these students are still negatively impacted by White privilege, are judged by stereotypes, and are impacted by a history of oppression and abuse (Kiselica, 1998; Lee, 1982; Sandhu, 2001). Only an extraordinary school counselor is able to address the unique academic, career and personal/social needs of African American students in addition to confronting the systematic barriers to these students' success.

Unfortunately, as discussed in Chapter 2, school counselors appear to be deficit in meeting African American students' needs. Georges (1997) found that school counseling

programs are not as effective for African American students as they are for others. Similarly, Lapan, Gysbers, and Sun (1997) found that African American students felt inadequately informed of post secondary options and that they had difficulty establishing a relationship with their counselors significantly more often than did White students. In addition, they found that that African American students were more frequently tracked into non-college preparatory course work, were seen by a counselor less frequently, and had a lower rate of return to see the counselor than their White peers. However, the results from the present study indicate that those at higher levels of moral development exhibit more tolerance toward African Americans. Furthermore, it was found that those who are more tolerant also perceive themselves to be more multiculturally competent. Additionally, the current study's results indicate that those with more multicultural education are both more tolerant and perceive themselves to be more competent. The results from the current study lend support to previous research, which has indicated that those functioning at higher levels of cognitive development are more effective as counselors and advocates, better able to perspective take and understand the worldview of those different from oneself, and more empathic and flexible (Borders, 1986; Brendel, Kolbert, and Foster, 2002; Foster & McAdams, 1995). Furthermore, research has indicated that post conventional reasoning correlates significantly with minority rights, the Equal Rights Amendment, and social welfare (Letchworth & McGee, 1981; Lonky, Reihman, & Serlin, 1981). These findings in combination with the findings from the present study suggest the need for school counselor education to modify existing pedagogy and incorporate additional multicultural coursework to specifically focus on promoting moral development as a means to promote tolerance and subsequently, multicultural competence. This may be achieved through implementation of Deliberate

123

Psychological Education (DPE). As described in Chapter 2, DPE programs require the following five components: 1) a significant role-taking experience; 2) guided reflection; 3) balance between reflection and experience; 4) balance between support and challenge; and 5) continuous exposure to the DPE for preferably one year (Foster & McAdams, 1998; Sprinthall, 1994). Counselor education and multicultural counselor training that applies a DPE format would not only address the specific multicultural competencies delineated in the ASCA code of ethics, but would also promote the moral development of school counselors, thus better enabling them to meet diverse students' needs. Consequently, higher functioning White school counselor trainees would be able to adequately explore their personal values and biases toward working with African American students, develop empathy through enhanced knowledge of specific issues facing this population, and apply appropriate cultural skills and techniques.

Deliberate psychological education was developed by Sprinthall and Mosher to promote developmental growth toward more formal operations, advanced levels of moral reasoning, and further identity development (Foster & McAdams, 1998). "Active practice in moral problem solving, related to an actual role-taking experience and augmented by interactive exchanges with peers, seems to speed up the natural development of moral judgment with gains that are maintained and cumulative" (p. 8). The DPE program needs to use case studies, dilemma discussions, journaling, and role-taking experiences to challenge the counselor trainees to explore the multicultural competencies, and all activities must be thoroughly processed through guided reflection. A supportive environment to balance the challenges must also be provided in a continuous manner throughout the program (Brendel, Kolbert, & Foster, 2002; Foster & McAdams, 1998; Sprinthall, Peace, & Kennington, 1999). Two particularly important areas in

counselor education to specifically promote multicultural competence through deliberate psychological education are the diversity course and supervision.

In the multicultural course, the role-taking experience for the DPE would be accounted for through participation in the class and homework assignments. Initially, the focus of the course needs to be on building a helping relationship with the trainees. A description of the course and participant expectations can be delineated in a syllabus and discussed with the students. Plenty of time should be allowed for icebreakers and discussion of feelings related to participation. Activities must be revised throughout the course to appropriately match the trainees' developmental levels. Specifically, toward the beginning of the course, complex tasks are broken down into small, clear steps. The trainees need to be offered ideas and suggestions, and should not be expected to be self-directed. Support, encouragement, and feedback needs to be offered frequently and consistently. As a result, their competence will likely increase and they will become more emotionally aware. As they gain experience and competence throughout the course, the facilitator can start to challenge the trainees by asking them to question absolutes. They can be encouraged to consider others' ideas and evaluate possible alternative solutions to problems, which include employing techniques from various theories. At this point, the trainees will be encouraged to become more independent. This would be challenging to the participants because the tasks would stem from higher stages than where they are currently functioning. As mentioned before, it is important to constructively mismatch the learning experience in order to promote developmental growth. As a result they would become more autonomous. In doing this, the instructor's approach would be neither too simplistic nor too advanced.

As the course continues, trainees will become more comfortable with the instructional

format and should be further challenged to develop. Assignments can then be presented in a less structured format. Fewer suggestions need to be provided, and the trainees are encouraged to think on their own. Higher expectations for self-directedness would be set. It is not as necessary to provide continual encouragement and feedback. As they progress through the course, their assignments continue to be constructively mismatched to stimulate growth. The school counselor trainees are challenged to integrate alternatives into a solution. They should be encouraged to recognize the need to vary techniques to fit specific situations. This would require the trainees to continue thinking at a level higher than where they currently function, thus further challenging them. As a result, they are learning how to better compromise and would likely become more flexible in their formulation of solutions to fit various problems. Given that the curriculum is appropriately designed to match current developmental levels, individuals will be much more likely to understand the material presented, maintain interest, and feel motivated to assimilate and accommodate the material, thus further developing.

Dilemma discussions need to be an integral part of the DPE program. Specific topics to be addressed include the following: challenges of joining, African American victimization, unintentional racism, poverty, discrimination, mistrust perceived as resistance, disempowerment, fear, misdiagnosing, cultural beliefs and norms, courage, connectedness, extended family and community connections, developmental tasks, and systemic hurtles (Carter & McGoldrick, 1999; Paniagua, 1994; Ridley, 1995; Walsh, 1993). These discussions would challenge the participants to confront their own biases and assumptions, grow to respect differing values and beliefs, and recognize strengths and assets in those different from themselves. Role-play is used to work through dilemmas and to practice skills. The participants would be more likely to assimilate and

accommodate knowledge and skills when practiced in role-plays with peers while directly supervised. Much learning would occur through modeling as well. Trainees would be aware of how their peers behave and they would also be aware of the instructor's behavior and thought processes. Most important, the instructor needs to model verbalizing difficult issues pertaining to African Americans as they arise so that the White school counselor trainees will learn to do so with their clients. All of these activities would provide a great deal of challenge to the participants.

In order to balance the challenge, considerable support needs to be provided in two distinct ways. First, after every activity, ample time needs to be allowed for group processing and guided reflection, which would further enhance consciousness-raising. Participants would be encouraged to discuss their thoughts and concerns, and the instructor should respond in a supportive and empathic manner. Second, the counselor trainees would be asked to keep a journal throughout the course. Each week they are asked to reflect on the topic of the class. Much focus should be on the dilemma discussions, so an example of a journal topic may be, "Discuss your reaction to your group's role-play of unintentional racism being expressed in a counseling session? How would this affect your relationship with the student? How might you avoid this as a school counselor working with an African American student?"

While the journals would be a primary source of reflection, the instructor's written responses to each entry would be a cogent source of support as well. One further source of reflection comes through reading assignments intended to provoke thought and emotion, and challenge values and beliefs. Trainees need to be provided with the opportunity to discuss these materials during class. Guided reflection, both within the class discussions and through

journaling would balance their experiences.

The school counselor trainees' challenging role-taking experience would be obtained through use of modeling, dilemma discussions, role-plays, and reading assignments. Their guided reflections would occur through journaling, reading assignments, and group discussions. Support would be provided through journal responses and group discussions. Thus, a balance would exist between experience and reflection, and support and challenge. Because the DPE would last for the duration of the course, continuity of experience would be assured.

The internship experience provides an additional opportunity to apply the DPE framework. Participants would be able to systematically apply what they learned in the multicultural course, as it should be required that interns have counseling interactions with African American students. Actually implementing new techniques and approaching them from a multicultural perspective is not easy; this would be their challenging role-taking experience. In order to provide them with support to balance the challenge, the interns would attend weekly group supervision sessions. This allows for the opportunity to hear others' successes and difficulties, and would supply them with the forum for discussing their own experiences. Group supervision provides the interns with the additional experience of vicarious learning through others' cases, exposure to a broader range of clients, and greater quantity and quality of feedback. The supervisor encourages reflection through these discussions.

Further reflection is encouraged through journaling. The supervisor provides supportive written feedback that also encourages the interns to consider varying opinions, options, and feelings. Journaling needs to be specific to their experiences applying new skills and approaching situations contingent upon their clients' needs. They should be asked to focus on their feelings

and reactions, and on the process rather than the content of their counseling sessions with African American students.

In individual supervision sessions, the supervisor further explores each intern's feelings, and reflects upon the process in a supportive manner. At this time, the participants should be encouraged to discuss any issues that they feel uncomfortable discussing in the group.

Personalized time with each counselor would provide the opportunity to address specific areas of weakness and strength. It would also be beneficial for the interns to videotape several counseling sessions for review during individual supervision. The videotaping and presenting would provide a great deal of challenge to the participants. To balance this challenge, the supervisor needs to provide an ample amount of verbal and nonverbal support while viewing and discussing tapes.

The trainees' challenging role-taking experience during the internship would include counseling African American students and videotaping sessions to be presented in individual supervision. The interns would reflect upon their experiences in both group and individual supervision, as well as through journaling. Support would be provided by the supervisor throughout the entire experience. Thus, there would be a balance between their experience and reflection, and the challenge and support. Since the supervision would last for a minimum of one semester, continuity of the experience is assured. A positive experience in supervision that results in growth may prompt the interns to continue seeking supervision once the DPE program has concluded and they have become professional school counselors; this is a necessary component to reducing stress and burnout, and further stimulating development (Davis, Savicki, Cooley, & Firth, 1989).

The DPE framework directly addresses the four necessary components to produce moral

120

action identified by Rest (1984) and described in Chapter 1. Moral sensitivity, moral judgment, moral motivation, and moral character work in combination to produce moral behavior (Rest, narvaez, Bebeau, & Thoma, 1999). These four processes have been found to be stimulated through application of ethical decision making to real clinical experiences, and individual and group supervision (Duckett & Ryden, 1994). Through use of dilemma discussions, role-plays, supervision, group interactions, self-reflection and feedback, it may be assumed that individuals will develop awareness of how their actions affect others, the ability to determine the most moral action to take in a given situation, an appreciation of moral values, and the ego strength to behave morally. Essentially, in addition to promoting moral judgment in reference to multicultural counseling, the DPE has the potential to enhance multicultural consciousness. Not only may White school counselor interns develop the ability to judge whether something is right or wrong, but they may also develop the sensitivity to self-evaluate one's ethnocentric and racist thoughts and actions. In addition, they may develop the necessary courage and persistence to follow through with moral actions that best meet diverse students' needs despite socioeconomic and systemic challenges.

Moral educational interventions for college and adult groups have produced greater changes in DIT scores than for middle and high school students, indicating that morality is not fixed by adolescence (Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau, & Thoma, 1999). Since DPE has been found to effectively impact developmental growth (Foster & McAdams, 1998; Peace, 1995), which in turn has been linked to more effective counseling and greater levels of tolerance (Polovy, 1980; Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau, & Thoma, 1999; Steward, Boatwright, Sauer, Baden, & Jackson, 1995; Vogt, 1997), it seems most logical to implement a DPE model throughout counselor education.

Significant growth best occurs from exposure to this model for a minimum of one year.

Consistent exposure to this framework from program entry to graduation would provide trainees with approximately two years of deliberate psychological education. There's no telling the

multicultural counseling that would ensue. Research to substantiate these notions is needed.

developmental gains that could be achieved and the quality counseling and specifically,

#### Recommendations for Future Research

The results from the current study provide valuable information about the impact of moral development on White school counselor interns' racial attitudes and perceived multicultural competency. However, since no previous studies have directly addressed this topic, the results remain tentative until the findings can be replicated by further research that accounts for this study's limitations. Throughout Chapter 5, the researcher provided multiple suggestions for future research. Specifically, future research should attempt to generate a much larger sample in order to enhance the reliability of sub-group analyses. However, this may be challenging considering the low percentage of males in school counseling programs as indicated in the present study and past research (Constantine, 2002; Constantine and Gainor, 2001; Lambie, 2002). A larger sample would also be needed to improve the generalizability of the results to all White school counselor interns.

Since it is quite possible to fake-good on the NRS and MCCTS-R, future research should attempt to use methodology and/or instrumentation that would limit participants' ability to respond in a socially desirable manner. Efforts should be taken to provide a test environment that ensures complete confidentiality, and instruments with reliability checks should be used to assess racial attitudes and multicultural competency.

Also, because the present study found older interns to be less tolerant than younger interns, it becomes necessary to conduct further examination of this phenomenon in order to determine if older graduate school counseling students need to devote additional time to multicultural education. However, the findings in the current study may have been due to measurement error. In this case, in order to determine if the NRS is a valid measure of graduate students' racial attitudes despite age, it would be interesting to develop an instrument that addresses racial issues that reflect situations directly experienced by college-aged respondents. The results from this instrument could be compared to the results on the NRS to determine if personalization of issues results in a more accurate determination of racial attitudes.

To determine the impact of moral development on one's ability to accurately self-assess multicultural competency, it would be necessary to administer both the DIT-2 and the MCCTS-R, as well as conduct live performance evaluations to gauge actual competency. As mentioned earlier, because it specifically addresses self-awareness, a measure of ego development may also be administered for comparison with results on the other instruments. If the performance evaluations are found to be equivalent to the self-assessments regardless of developmental level, one would be able to conclude that the MCCTS-R is a valid measure of multicultural competency for comparison with levels of moral development. However, if self-assessments and performance evaluations diverge based on developmental level, it would be necessary to use alternative measures of competency in order to obtain a true indication of the link between moral development and multicultural competency.

It may also be necessary to measure the impact of other relevant developmental domains on one's racial attitudes and multicultural competence. Specifically, ego development, which

addresses interpersonal relationship development, may provide insight into the manner in which school counselor trainees conceptualize multicultural awareness, knowledge and skill. Specifically, an awareness of one's values, beliefs and perspectives in relation to self and others has been described as being an important component to competent multicultural counseling (Arredondo, 1999; Herring, 1998; Kiselica, 1998). As described earlier, individuals at lower stages of ego development are less able to distinguish themselves from others and to differentiate among various aspects of self. As a result, they would likely not see a need for multicultural competencies because they are unable to recognize the necessity to respond differentially to diverse clients. They would describe themselves and others based on the characteristics deemed important to the group with whom they identify: "The way people are and they way they ought to be are not sharply differentiated" (p. 5; Hy & Loevinger, 1996). In addition, individuals at this stage are unable to differentiate between their actions and their feelings and thus may lack the capacity to interject tolerance prior to acting on prejudicial feelings. Those with a culturally encapsulated worldview would likely be functioning at these stages of ego development. This inability to self-assess would limit their ability to recognize the impact that their values, beliefs and perspectives have on diverse others.

On the other hand, those at higher levels of functioning develop an ability to distinguish self from others. They begin to develop a greater sense of self and an awareness of individual differences. This leads to further differentiation of self from others while allowing for tolerance of dissimilarities. The individuality which typifies an integrated person also allows for greater tolerance of others and recognition of others' inner selves. This is primarily achieved through self-evaluation and reflection over time. The ability to explore alternative possibilities, recognize

the values of oneself and others, and accept diverse others connotes a high degree of adaptability (Hy & Loevinger, 1996). An assessment of the link between ego development, racial attitudes and multicultural competence may shed light on the impact of interpersonal relationship development on multicultural competence. If a link is found, efforts to incorporate educational strategies in school counselor training to promote ego development should be considered.

To assess the impact of moral development on professional membership, it may be more telling to use a sample of practicing school counselors who are not in an environment that expects or promotes professional membership as opposed to counselor interns who are in the academic setting in which professional membership is lauded. It may be found that practicing school counselors who still choose to become active in professional organizations despite their environment are doing so because they value professional development and are committed to contributing to the field, both indications of higher level processing. Continued professional development is critical to counselor efficacy (Neukrug, 2003), and becoming an active member of professional organizations is one way in which to stay abreast of current issues in counseling, get involved in advocacy efforts, and learn updated counseling skills and approaches. Further support for the need to promote development among trainees would be generated from results showing that those at higher levels of development are more likely to be members of professional counseling organizations and thus are more committed to professional development.

Additional research may wish to determine whether the significant correlations found in the present study also have a causal relationship. One step toward determining causality may be to conduct path analysis to determine the contribution of levels of moral development on racial attitudes and the consequential contribution of racial attitudes on multicultural competence.

134

Moreover, the implementation of an experimental study utilizing a pretest-posttest control group design in which an attempt is made to control all variables other than the ones under investigation may best determine causal relationships (Gall, Borg, & Gall, 1996). For example, all participants could initially be administered the DIT-2, NRS and MCCTS-R. The participants could then be separated into two groups. The experimental group could be exposed to a DPE in a diversity class, and the control group could take a diversity class that utilizes traditional multicultural teaching methodology. Following completion of the classes, the entire sample could again be administered the DIT-2, NRS and MCCTS-R. Comparisons could be made within and between groups to determine if a DPE effectively promotes moral development, racial tolerance and multicultural competency.

Because morality has been found to be a multiplicity of processes (Rest, 1983), in addition to assessing moral judgment in relation to racial attitudes and multicultural competence, examining the impact of other aspects of morality would contribute a richness to further research. As discussed earlier, Rest (1984) described four necessary components to produce moral action including moral judgment, moral sensitivity, moral motivation and moral character. The DIT-2 is a measurement of moral judgment; however, when considering the nature of multicultural counseling, it may also be useful to examine the impact of moral sensitivity. This process includes "interpreting the situation, role taking how various actions would affect the parties concerned, imagining cause-effect chains of events, and being aware that there is a moral problem when it exists" (Rest, Narvaez, Bebeau & Thoma, 1999; p. 101). Overall, moral sensitivity addresses one's awareness of how personal actions impact others (Rest & Narvaez, 1994). We are better able to predict moral behavior when more than one process of morality is

measured (Rest, 1983). Thus, by combining measures of moral judgment and moral sensitivity, we may better be able to predict competent multicultural counseling and tolerant racial attitudes in relation to diverse students. Unfortunately, to date there are no valid and reliable measures of moral sensitivity pertaining to counseling. Bebeau, Rest and Yamoor (1985) developed an assessment of moral sensitivity applied to the profession of dentistry. Dental students watch on video an interaction with ethical implications. The students are then asked to verbally respond to the incident as though they were the professional involved in the situation. Transcribed responses are then rated according to the extent that the student recognized the professional responsibilities of the dentist in the depiction. Results indicated that those with more education in medicine and dentistry had higher levels of sensitivity. Furthermore, ethical sensitivity scores increased significantly following instruction aimed at promoting development (Baab & Bebeau, 1990). The Dental Ethical Sensitivity Test (DEST) has sufficient validity and reliability (Bebeau & Rest, 1990), but it is specific to the field of dentistry. A measure of moral sensitivity using the same format was developed by McNeel, Fredrickson, Talbert and Lester (1992); however its videodepicted interactions are specific to undergraduate college students' experiences. Professionspecific cases need to be developed to measure moral sensitivity in school counselor trainees.

While the present study addressed the cognitive development of trainees, it may also be necessary to assess counselor educators' levels of moral development to explore their impact on the effectiveness of a DPE program and students' multicultural competency. Since the present study substantiated a significant correlation between cognitive development and tolerance for diversity, how do instructors' racial attitudes impact student multicultural competence and development? Counselor educators and counselors "must do self-evaluative inventories to

prevent projection, transference, and counter-transference onto those we intend to teach/help" (p. 6; Jackson, 1999).

Furthermore, it would be interesting to assess the impact of the counselor educators' ethnicity on White students' perceptions of multicultural coursework. Would White students prefer to address issues of diversity with a White instructor, or would they prefer to learn from an ethnic minority? These students may feel more comfortable openly discussing ethnocentric values, racist attitudes and misunderstanding of diversity issues with a White instructor whom they may feel they wouldn't offend. However, they may feel that an African American instructor could provide them with insight about multicultural issues, model effectively addressing cultural differences, and challenge their ethnocentric perspectives. Rothschild (2003) discussed the need to vary race pedagogy based on the ethnicity of the instructor and the students. She emphasized the impact of individual and group perceptions of race on multicultural counseling instruction, and the need to openly discuss these beliefs in class.

Currently, approximately 88% of college professors are White (Nettles, Perna, & Bradburn, 2000). While this statistic speaks to the need for recruiting and retaining diverse faculty (Holcomb-McCoy & Bradley, 2003), it also presupposes that multicultural courses are primarily taught by White instructors. As a White professor teaching diversity courses to primarily White students, Rothschild (2003) found that these students typically attempted to avoid discussions of race. She identified the following reasons for this lack of participation: White students are part of a dominant social structure that does not discuss race as a problem; White students question why a White professor would be invested in issues of race; and White students fear their remarks would be viewed as racist. How then do these instructors adequately

provide insight into the experience of minorities? How do they challenge students to effectively address cultural differences with clients? How do they challenge students' ethnocentric views? Finally, how does moral development impact instructors' ability to address these issues? Research examining the impact of moral development and race on counselor educators' multicultural instructing needs examination.

#### Conclusion

Multicultural issues have received a lot of attention in our society in the past ten years, and they continue to be an area of interest. The demand for research to address the needs of diverse others and the dissension of our culture is still prevalent. There is a particular need for continued research that addresses African Americans existing in a White society. This group has been the long-time recipients of both intentional and unintentional racism, even by counselors. Current counselor training approaches have been unsuccessful at ameliorating this problem. Their focus on teaching multicultural information and skills fails to consider individual characteristics of the counselors. The present study offered suggestions for addressing and combating White school counselor interns' limitations for adequately serving African American students by presenting significant results which link cognitive development to counselor tolerance and competency.

An examination of the results of the current study provide the reader with insight into the ways in which White school counselor interns address the needs of African American students based on their levels of moral development. The domain of moral development was chosen because of its focus on morality and human rights- both of which must be considered when working with diverse others. By promoting the moral development of counselor trainees, they

may become more self-aware, more open to learning about diverse others, and better able to implement multicultural counseling skills. Ultimately, higher is better, thus White school counselors at higher levels of moral development may more effectively counsel African American students. This is necessary for African Americans' success, and the overall development of our society. The present study's results lend support to this theory, and thus lend credence to the need for further research on this topic.

#### References

- Adams, M. (2002, Fall/Winter). Charting cognitive and moral development in diversity classes.

  \*Diversity Digest [On-line]. Available:

  http://www.diversityweb.org/digest/fw02/cognitive.html
- Adams, C. R., & Singh, K. (1998). Direct and indirect effects of school learning variables on the academic achievement of African American 10<sup>th</sup> graders. *Journal of Negro Education*, 67(1), 48-66).
- American Counseling Association (1995). ACA code of ethics and standards of practice (rev. ed.). Alexandria VA: Author [On-line]. Available:

  <a href="http://www.counseling.org/site/DocServer/ACA\_Code\_of\_Ethics.pdf?docID=361">http://www.counseling.org/site/DocServer/ACA\_Code\_of\_Ethics.pdf?docID=361</a>
- American School Counselor Association (2003). The ASCA national model: A framework for school counseling programs. Alexandria, VA: Author.
- American School Counseling Association (2002, March). Ethical standards for school counselors [On-line]. Available: <a href="http://www.schoolcounselor.org.html">http://www.schoolcounselor.org.html</a>
- Anti-Defamation League (2002, April). School vouchers: The wrong choice for public education [On-line]. Available: <a href="http://www.adl.org/vouchers/youchers/youchers/">http://www.adl.org/youchers/y
- Armor, D. J. (1997). Why the gap between Black and White performance in school? (Testimony of David James Armor, March 5,6, & 22, 1996). *Journal of Negro Education*, 66(3), 311-319.
- Arredondo, P. (1999). Multicultural counseling competencies as tools to address oppression and racism. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 77, 102-108.
- Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2002, April). Multicultural

- competencies and standards [On-line]. Available: www.edap.bgsu.edu/AMCD/
- Baab, D.A. & Bebeau, M.J. (1990). The effect of instruction on ethical sensitivity. *Journal of Dental Education*, 54(1), 44.
- Baker, S. B., & Gerler, E. R., Jr. (2001). Counseling in schools. In D. C. Locke, J. E. Myers, & E. L. Herr (Eds.), *The handbook of counseling* (pp. 289-318). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Banks, W. M. (1972). The differential effects of race and social class in helping. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 28 (1), 90-92.
- Bankston, C., III, & Caldas, S. J. (1996). Majority African American schools and social injustice:

  The influence of de facto segregation on academic achievement. *Social Forces*, 75 (2),
  535-555.
- Baruth, L.G., & Manning, M.L. (1999). *Multicultural counseling and psychotherapy: A lifespan perspective* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Baruth, L. G., & Manning, M. L. (2000). A call for multicultural counseling in middle schools. Clearing House, 73(4), 243-246.
- Bebeau, M.J., Maeda, Y., & Tichy-Reese, M. (2003). DIT-2: Moral schema norms by level of education, gender and political orientation. Paper presented at the Association for Practical and Professional Ethics, March, 2003, Charlotte, NC.
- Bebeau, M.J. & Rest, J. R. (1990). *The Dental Ethical Sensitivity Test*. Minneapolis Division of Health Ecology, School of Dentistry, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis.
- Bebeau, M.J., Rest, J.R., & Yamoor, C.M. (1985). Measuring dental students' ethical sensitivity. *Journal of Dental Education*, 49(4), 225-235.
- Bebeau, M.J., Rodriguez, M., & Maeda, Y. (2002). Using DIT moral schema profiles to evaluate

- educational intervention effects. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Association for Practical and Professional Ethics, March, 2002, Cincinnati, OH.
- Bebeau, M.J., & Thoma, S.J. (2003). *Guide for DIT-2*. Minneapolis, MN: Center for the Study of Ethical Development, University of Minnesota.
- Beckett & Dungee-Anderson (1996). A framework for agency-based multicultural training and supervision. *Journal of Multicultural Social Work*, 4(4), 27-48.
- Blasi, A. (1980). Bridging moral cognition and moral action: A critical review of the literature.

  \*Psychology Bulletin, 88(1), 1-45.
- Bleuer, J. C., & Walz, G. R. (1983). *Counselors and computers*. Ann Arbor: ERIC/CAPS, The University of Michigan.
- Blum, L. (2002). I'm not a racist, but...: The moral quandary of race. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, Sage House.
- Bolton-Brownlee, A. (1987). *Issues in multicultural counseling*. (Report No. BBB02305). Ann Arbor, MI: ERIC Clearinghouse on Counseling and Personnel Services. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED279995).
- Borders, L. D. (1998). Ego development and counselor development. In P. M. Westeberg, A.

  Blasit, & L.D. Cohn (Eds.). Personality development: Theoretical, empirical, and clinical investigations of Loevinger's concept of ego development, (pp. 331-346). Mahwah, NJ:

  Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Borders, L.D., & Drury, S.M. (1992). Comprehensive school counseling programs: A review for policymakers and practitioners. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 70, 487-498.
- Brendel, J.M., Kolbert, J.B., & Foster, V.A. (2002). The relationship between counselor

- education and moral development, conceptual development, and self actualization.

  Journal of Adult Development, 9(2).
- Burnham, J. J., & Jackson, C. M. (2000). School counselor roles: Discrepancies between actual practice and existing models. *Professional School Counseling*, 4 (1), 41-49.
- Caldas, S. J., & Bankston, C. L., III (1997). The effect of school population socioeconomic status on individual student academic achievement. *Journal of Educational Research*, 90(5), 269-277.
- Campbell, C.A., & Dahir, C.A. (1997). The national standards for school counseling programs.

  Alexandria, VA: American School Counselor Association.
- Carter, R. T. (1990). The relationship between racism and racial identity among White

  Americans: An exploratory investigation. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 69, 46-50.
- Carter, R.T., Helms, J.E., & Juby, H.L. (2004). The relationship between racism and racial identity for White Americans: A profile analysis. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 32(1), 2-17.
- Carter, B., & McGoldrick, M. (1999). The expanded family life cycle: Individual, family, and social perspectives (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). Needham Heights, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Center for the Study of Ethical Development (2003, Winter). *Information about the DIT and DIT-2* [On-line]. Available: <a href="http://www.coled.umn.edu//CSED/htlm">http://www.coled.umn.edu//CSED/htlm</a>
- Center for Technology in Government (2000, May). And justice for all: Designing your business case for integrating justice information [On-line]. Available: <a href="http://www.ctg.albany.edu">http://www.ctg.albany.edu</a>
- Clark, M. D., Petras, H., & Kellam, S. (2000, August). Suspended: Girls in trouble. Paper

- presented at the Annual Conference of the American Psychological Association, Washington, DC.
- Cohen, J. (1988). Statistical power analysis for the behavioral sciences. New York: Academic Press.
- Cohen, J. (1977). Statistical power analysis for the behavioral sciences. San Diego: CA:

  Academic Press.
- Colby, A.; Kohlberg, L., Gibbs, J., & Lieberman, M. (1983). A longitudinal study of moral judgment. Monographs of the Society for Research in Child Development, 48(1-2, Serial No. 200).
- Constantine, M. G. (2002). Racism attitudes, White racial identity attitudes, and muticultural counseling competence in school counselor trainees. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 41 (3), 162-174.
- Constantine, M. G., & Gainor, K. A. (2001). Emotional intelligence and empathy: Their relation to multicultural counseling knowledge and awareness. *Professional School Counseling*, 5 (2), 131-137.
- Constantine, M.G. & Gushue, G.V. (2003). School counselors' ethnic tolerance attitudes and racism attitudes as predictors of their multicultural case conceptualization of an immigrant student. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 81(2), 185.
- Constantine, M.G. & Yeh, C.J., (2001). Multicultural training, self-construals, and multicultural competence of school counselors. *Professional School Counseling*, 4, 202-207.
- Cook, D.W. (1978). Counselor anxiety and tolerance of ambiguity: Critical variables in rehabilitation counseling. (Report No. BBB00268) Washington, DC: Rehabilitation

- Services Administration (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED158177).
- Council for the Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs [CACREP]

  (2002, December). The 2001 standards [On-line]. Available:

  <a href="http://www.counseling.org/site/PageServer?pagename=cacrep\_2001standards700">http://www.counseling.org/site/PageServer?pagename=cacrep\_2001standards700</a>
- D'Andrea, M., Daniels, J., & Heck, R. (1991). Evaluating the impact of multicultural counseling training. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 70, 143-150.
- Davidson, F.H. (1976). Ability to respect persons compared to ethnic prejudice in childhood. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 34(6), 1256-1267.
- Davis, A. H., Savicki, V., Cooley, E. J., & Firth, J. L. (1989). Burnout and counselor practitioner expectations of supervision. *Counselor education and supervision*, 28(3), 234-241.
- Davison, M. L. (1979). The internal structure and the psychometric properties of the Defining Issues Test. In J. R. Rest (Ed.), *Development in judging moral issues* (pp. 223-261).

  Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Day-Vines, N. L. (In-press). Relationships among racial identity attitudes, womanist identity attitudes, and moral development in African American graduate women.
- Day-Vines, N. L. (In-press). African American adolescents: The impact of race and middle class status on the counseling process.
- Dewey, J. (1963). *Experience and education*. New York, NY: Collier (Original work published in 1938).
- Diver-Stamnes, A. C. (1991). Assessing the effectiveness of an inner-city high school peer counseling program. *Urban Education*, 26(3), 269-284.

- Duckett, L.J., & Ryden, M.B. (1994). Education for ethical nursing practice. In J. R. Rest & D. Navarez (Eds.), Moral development in the professions: Psychology and applied ethics.

  Hillsdale: NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Dumont, F., & Lecomte, C. (1987). Inferential processes in clinical work: Inquiry into logical errors that affect diagnostic judgments. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 18, 433-438.
- Education Trust (2002). National school counselor initiative: Met Life Foundation. Washington, DC: Author.
- Evans, K. M., & Foster, V. A. (2000). Relationships among multicultural training, moral development, and racial identity development of white counseling students. *Counseling and Values*, 45(1), 39-48.
- Faust, D. (1986). Research on human judgement and its application to clinical practice.

  Professional Psychology: Research and Practice, 17, 420-430.
- Foster, V., & McAdams, C. (1998). Supervising the child care counselor: A cognitive developmental model. *Child and Youth Care Forum*, 27(1), 5-19.
- Foster, V. A. & Sprinthall, N. A. (1992). Developmental profiles of adolescents and young adults choosing abortion: Stage sequence, decalage, and implications for policy. *Adolescence*, 27, 655-673.
- Gall, M. D., Borg, W. R., & Gall, J. P. (1996). Educational research: An introduction (6<sup>th</sup> Ed.).

  White Plains, NY: Longman Publishers.
- Georges, A. (1997). Effects of access to counseling and family background on at-risk students. (Report No. CG028036). Chicago, IL: Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the

- American Educational Research Association. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED412441)
- Gerler, E. R. Jr. (1991). The changing world of the elementary school counselor. (Report No. BBB02305). Ann Arbor, MI: ERIC Clearinghouse on Counseling and Personnel Services. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED328824)
- Gielen, U. (1992). Kohlberg's moral development theory. In L. Kuhmurker (Eds.), *The Kohlberg legacy for the helping professions* (pp.18-38). Birmingham, AL: R.E.P. Books.
- Gielen, U. (1992). Research on moral reasoning. In L. Kuhmurker (Eds.), *The Kohlberg legacy* for the helping professions (pp.39-60). Birmingham, AL: R.E.P. Books.
- Gielen, U., & Lei, T. (1992). The measurement of moral reasoning. In L. Kuhmurker (Eds.), *The Kohlberg legacy for the helping professions* (pp.61-81). Birmingham, AL: R.E.P. Books.
- Glassberg, S., & Sprinthall, N. (1980). Student teaching: A developmental approach. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 31, 6-11.
- Green, A., & Keys, S. (2001). Expanding the developmental school counseling paradigm:

  Meeting the needs of the 21<sup>st</sup> century student. *Professional School Counseling*, 5(2), 84-95.
- Greenberg, M. T., & Bumbarger, B. K. (1999, May). Suspensions and expulsions aren't always the answer [On-Line]. Available: <a href="http://www.psu.edu/dept/ur/oped/greenberg.html">http://www.psu.edu/dept/ur/oped/greenberg.html</a>
- Guthrie, V.L. (1997). Cognitive foundations of ethical development. *New Directions for Student Services*, 77, 23-44.
- Haase, R. F., Waechter, D. M., & Solomon, G. S. (1982). How significant is a significant difference? Average effect size of research in counseling psychology. *Journal of*

- Counseling Psychology, 29, 58-65.
- Hanna, F. J., Hanna, C. A., & Keys, S. G. (1999). Fifty strategies for counseling defiant, aggressive adolescents: Reaching, accepting and relating. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 77, 395-404.
- Harvey, O. J., Hunt, D. E., & Schroder, H. M. (1961). Conceptual systems and personality organization. New York: John Wiley and Sons.
- Haycock, K., Jerald, C., & Huang, S. (2001, Spring). Closing the gap: Done in a decade.

  Thinking K-16, 5(2), 3-21.
- Hayes, R. L. (1994). The legacy of Lawrence Kohlberg: Implications for counseling and human development. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 72, 261-267.
- Herring, R. (1997). Counseling diverse ethnic youth: Synergetic strategies and interventions for school counselors. Orlando, FL: Harcourt Brace and Company
- Herring, R. (1997). Multicultural counseling in schools: A synergetic approach. Alexandria, VA:

  American Counseling Association.
- Herring, R. (1998). The future direction of multicultural counseling: An assessment of preservice school counselors' thoughts. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 26, 2-12.
- Hoare, C. H. (1991). Psychosocial identity development and cultural others. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 70, 45-53.
- Holcomb-McCoy, C.C. & Day-Vines, N. (In-press). Exploring school counselor multicultural competence: A multidimensional concept.
- Holcomb-McCoy, C. C. (2001). Exploring the self-perceived multicultural counseling

- competence of elementary school counselors. *Professional School Counseling*, 4(3), 195-201.
- Holcomb-McCoy, C. C. (2001). Multicultural counseling competencies: An exploratory factor analysis. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 28, 83-97.
- Holcomb-McCoy, C.C. (2000). Multicultural counseling competencies: An exploratory factor analysis. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 28(2), 83-97.
- Holcomb-McCoy, C. C. (1999). *Multicultural counseling training: A preliminary study*. (Report No. CG029111). Reports- Research (143), Tests/Questionnaires (160). (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED428301)
- Holcomb-McCoy, C. C. (1998). School counselor preparation in urban settings. (Report No. CG028358). Guides- Non-Classroom, Information Analyses. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED418343)
- Holcomb-McCoy, C. C., & Bradley, C. (2003). Recruitment and retention of ethnic minority counselor educators: An exploratory study of CACREP-accredited counseling programs.

  Counselor Education and Supervision, 42(3), 231-243.
- Holcomb-McCoy, C. C. & Myers, J. E. (1999). Multicultural competence and counselor training:

  A national survey. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 77, 294-302.
- Holloway, E. L., & Wampold, B. E. (1986). Relationship between conceptual level and counseling- related tasks: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 33, 310-319.
- Howard-Hamilton, M. F., & Behar-Horenstein, L. S. (1995). Counseling the African male adolescent. *Elementary School Guidance and Counseling*, 29, 198-205.

- Hunt, D. E. (1975). Person-environment interaction: A challenge found wanting before it was tried. *Review of Educational Research*, 45(2), 209-230.
- Hunt, D. E. (1971). Matching models in education: The coordinating of teaching models with student characteristics. Ontario, Canada: The Ontario Institute for Studies in Education.
- Hy, L. X., & Loevinger, J. (1996). *Measuring Ego Development* (2<sup>nd</sup> edition). Mahwah, New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers.
- Indiana Education Policy Center (2000). Safe and Responsive Schools Project at the Indiana Education Policy Center [On-line]. Available: <a href="http://www.indiana.edu/%7Esafeschl/">http://www.indiana.edu/%7Esafeschl/</a>
- Jacobson, C. K. (1985). Resistance to affirmative action: Self-interest or racism? *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, 29(2), 306-329.
- Jackson, R. L. (1999). "Mommy, there's a nigger at the door." *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 77(1), 4-6.
- Jaeger, R.M. (1993). Statistics: A spectator sport (2<sup>nd</sup> ed). Newbury Park: CA: Sage Publications.
- Jennings, W, S., Kilkenny, R., & Kohlberg, L.(1983). Moral-development theory and practice for youthful and adult offenders. In W.S. Laufer, & J.M. Day (Eds.), *Personality theory, moral development, and criminal behavior* (pp.281-355). Toronto: Lexington Books
- Kagen, D. M. (1986). Cognitive level and self-evaluations of preservice teachers. *Teacher Educator*, 22(1), 18-27.
- Kalyanpur, M., & Harry, B. (1999). Culture in Special Education: Building Reciprocal Family-Professional Relationships. Baltimore, MD: Brookes.
- Kegan, R. (1982) The evolution of moral meaning making, in the evolving self: Problem and process in human development. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

- Kesler (1990). Burnout: A multimodel approach to assessment and resolution. *Elementary School Guidance and Counseling*, 24(4), 303-311.
- Kiselica, M. S. (1998). Preparing Anglos for the challenges and joys of multiculturalism. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 26 (1), 5-21.
- Kohlberg, L. (1974). The psychology of moral development. New York: Harper.
- Kohlberg, L. (1975). The cognitive-developmental approach to moral education. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 56(10), 670-677.
- Kohlberg, L. (1976). Moral stages and moralization: The cognitive-developmental approach. In T. Lickona (Ed.), *Moral development and behavior* (pp.31-53). New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston.
- Kohlberg, L. (1984). Essays on moral development: Vol 2: The psychology of moral development. San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row.
- Labouvie-Vief, G., Hakim-Larson, J., & Hobart, C.J. (1987). Age, ego level, and the life span development of coping and defense processes. *Psychology and Aging*, 2(3), 286-293.
- LaFleur, N. K., Rowe, W., & Leach, M. M. (2002). Reconceptualizing White racial consciousness. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 30(3), 148-152.
- Lambie, G. W. (2002). The contribution of ego development level to degree of burnout in school counselors. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, The College of William and Mary, Williamsburg, VA.
- Lapan, R., Gysbers, N., & Sun, Y. (1997). The impact of more fully implemented guidance programs on the school experiences of high school students: A statewide evaluation study. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 75, 292-302.

- Lee, C. C. (1995). Counseling for diversity: A guide for school counselors and related professionals. Boston, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Lee, C. C. (1982). The school counselor and the Black child: Critical roles and functions. *Journal of Non-White Concerns*, 10 (3), 94-101.
- Lee, R.S. (1993). Effects of classroom guidance on student achievement. Elementary of classroom guidance on student achievement. *Elementary School Guidance & Counseling*, 22, 241-245.
- Lee, V.E., & Ekstrom, R.B., (1987). Student access to guidance counseling and high school.

  American Educational Research Journal, 24(2), 287-310.
- Letchworth, G. A., & McGee, D. (1981). Influence of ego-involvement, attitude and moral development on situational moral reasoning. Unpublished manuscript, University of Oklahoma.
- Locke, D. C. (1989). Fostering the self-esteem of African-American children. *Elementary School Guidance and Counseling*, 23, 254-259.
- Loevinger, J. (1976). *Ego development*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Loevinger, J. (1977). Ego maturity and human development. In G. D. Miller (Ed.),

  Developmental theory and its application in guidance programs: Systematic efforts to

  promote personal growth (pp. 164-190). St. Paul, MN: Pupil Personnel Services Section

  Minnesota Department of Education.
- Loevinger, J. (1987). Paradigms of Personality. New York, NY: W.H. Freeman and Company.
- Lofaro, G. A. (1982). Disability and counselor education. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 21(3), 200-207.

- Lonky, E., Reihman, J. M., & Serlin, R. C. (1981). Political values and moral judgment in adolescence. *Youth and Society*, 12(4), 423-441.
- Mahoney, M.J. (1995). Theoretical developments in the cognitive and constructive psychotherapies. In M.J. Mahoney (Ed.), Cognitive and constructive psychotherapies:

  Theory, research, and practice (p. 3-19). New York: Springer.
- Manners, J., & Durkin, K. (2000). Processes involved in adult ego development: A conceptual framework. *Developmental Review*, 20, 475-513.
- Markstrom-Adams, C., & Adams, G. R. (1995). Gender, ethnic group, and grade differences in psychosocial functioning during middle adolescence? *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, 24 (4), 397-417.
- McConahay, J.B. (1982). Self interest versus racial attitudes as correlates of anti-busing attitudes in Louisville: Is it the buses or the Blacks? *Journal of Politics*, 44, 692-720.
- McKibbon, M., & Joyce, B. (1981). Psychological states and staff development. *Theory Into Practice*, 19, 248-255.
- McNeel, S.P., Fredrickson, J., Talbert, B., & Lester, B. (1992, November 12-14). Understanding difficult situations: Preliminary report of a moral sensitivity test for college students.

  Paper presented at the annual conference of the Association for Moral Education,

  Toronto.
- Mercer, P. (1981). Stress and the guidance counselor. *The School Guidance Worker*, 37 (2), 13-16.
- Midgette, T E., & Meggert, S. S. (1991). Multicultural counseling instruction: A challenge for faculties in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 70, 136-141.

- Miller, L. S. (1995). An American imperative: Accelerating minority educational advancement.

  New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Muller, L. E. (2000). A 12-session, European-American-led counseling group for African American females. *Professional School Counseling*, 3, 264-269.
- National Association of School Psychologists (2002). Fair and effective discipline for all students: Best practice strategies for all educators [On-Line]. Available: http://www.naspcenter.org/factsheets/effdiscip\_fs.html
- Neukrug, E. (1999). The world of the counselor: An introduction to the counseling profession.

  Pacific Grove, CA: Brooks/Cole.
- Neukrug, E. (2003). The world of the counselor: An introduction to the counseling profession (2<sup>nd</sup> Ed.). Pacific Grove, CA: Brooks/Cole.
- Nettles, M.T., Perna, L.W., & Bradburn, E.M. (2000). Salary, promotion, and tenure status of minority and women faculty in U.S. colleges and universities: National study of postsecondary faculty, 1993 statistical analysis report. Washington, DC: National Center for Education Statistics.
- Oja, S., & Sprinthall, N. (1978). Psychological and moral development for teachers: Can you teach old dogs? *Character Potential: A Record of Research*, 8(4) 218-225.
- Paniagua, F. A. (1994). Assessing and treating culturally diverse clients: A practical guide.

  Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Parker, W. M., & McDavis, R. J. (1989). A personal development model for Black elementary students, *Elementary School Guidance and Counseling*, 23, 244-253.
- Peace, S. D. (1995). Addressing school counselor induction issues: A developmental

- counselor mentor model. Elementary School Guidance & Counseling, 29, 177 189.
- Peace, S. D. & Sprinthall, N. A. (1998). Training school counselors to supervise beginning counselors: Theory, research and practice. *Professional School Counseling*, 1(5), 2-8.
- Pederson, P. (1990). A culturally diverse world. Alexandria, VA: American School Counseling Association.
- Pederson, P. (1988). A handbook for developing multicultural awareness. Alexandria, VA:

  American Association for Counseling and Development.
- Piaget, J. (1963). The origins of intelligence in children. New York, NY: Norton. (Original work published 1936).
- Polovy, P. (1980). A study of moral development and personality relationships in adolescents and young adult Catholic students. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, *36*, 752-757.
- Pope-Davis, D. B., & Ottavi, T. M. (1994). The relationship between racism and racial identity among White Americans: A replication and extension. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 72, 293-297.
- Praport, H. (1993). Reducing high school attrition: Group counseling can help. *The School Counselor*, 40, 309-311.
- Reiman, A.J., & Thies-Sprinthall, L. (1993). Promoting the development of mentor teachers:

  Theory and research programs using guided reflection. *Journal of Research and Development in Education*, 26(3), 179-85.
- Reschly, T. A. (1997). Diagnostic and treatment utility of intelligence tests. In D. Flanagan, J. L. Genshaft, & P. L. Harrison (Eds.), *Contemporary intellectual assessment* (pp. 437–456). NY: Guilford.

- Rest, J. (1979). Development in judging moral issues. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Rest, J. (1983). Morality. In P.H. Mussen (Series Ed.) & J. Flavell & E. Markman (Vol. Eds.),

  Handbook of child psychology: Vol. 3, Cognitive Development (4<sup>th</sup> ed., pp. 556-629).

  New York: Wiley.
- Rest, J. (1984). The major components of morality. In W. Kurtines & J. Gewirtz (Eds.), *Morality*, moral behavior, and moral development (pp. 24-40). New York: Wiley.
- Rest, J. (1986). Manual for the Defining Issues Test. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Rest, J. R. (1994). Background: Theory and research. In J.R. Rest & D. Narvaez (Eds.), *Moral development in the professions: Psychology and applied ethics* (p. 1-26). Hillsdale, NY: L. Erlbaum Associates.
- Rest, J.R. (1988). Report on DIT data analysis, account no. 5808. University of Minnesota:

  Center for the Study of Ethical Development.
- Rest, J., & Narvaez, D. (1994). Moral development in the professions: Psychology and applied ethics. Hillsdale, NY: L. Erlbaum Associates.
- Rest, J., Thoma, S., & Edwards, L. (1997). Designing and validating a measure of moral judgment: Stage preference and stage consistency approaches. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 89(1), 5-28.
- Rest, J., Narvaez, D., Bebeau, M. J., & Thoma, S. J. (1999). Postconventional moral thinking: A Neo-Kohlbergian approach. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Rest, J. Narvaez, D., Thoma, S. J., & Bebeau, M. J. (1999). DIT-2: Devising and testing a revised

- instrument of moral judgment. Journal of Educational Psychology, 91(4), 644-659.
- Ridley, C. R. (1995). Overcoming unintentional racism in counseling and therapy: A practitioner's guide to intentional intervention. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Rock, D. L., Bransford, J. D., Maisto, S. A., & Morey, L. (1987). The study of clinical judgment: An ecological approach. *Clinical Psychology Review*, 7, 645-661.
- Rodney, L.W., Rodney, H. E., Crafter, B., & Mupier, R. M. (1999). Variables contributing to grade retention among African American adolescent males. *Journal of Educational Research*, 92(3), 185-190.
- Rose, C.C. & Rose, S.D. (1992). Family change groups for the early age child. *Special Services* in the schools, 6, 113-127.
- Rothschild, T. (2003). "Talking race" in the college classroom: The role of social structure and social factors in race pedagogy. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 31(1), 31-38.
- Rubenstein, A., & Zager, K. (1995). Training in adolescent treatment: Where is psychology?

  \*Psychotherapy, 32(1), 2-6.
- Sanchez, W. (1995). Working with diverse learners and school staff in a multicultural society.

  (Report No. BBB30992). Greensboro, NC: ERIC Clearinghouse on Counseling and

  Student Services. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED390018)
- Sandhu, D. S. (2001). Elementary school counseling in the new millennium. Alexandria, VA:

  American Counseling Association.
- Sears, S. J. (1993). The changing scope of practice of the secondary school counselor. *The School Counselor*, 40, 384-388.

- Sears, S. J. & Navins, S. L. (1983). Stressors in school counseling. Education, 103, 333-337.
- Seligman, M. (1983). The family with a handicapped child: Understanding and treatment.

  Orlando, FL: Grune and Stratton.
- Seligman, M., & Darling, R.B. (1989). Ordinary families, special children: a systems approach to childhood disability. New York: The Guilford Press.
- Sidanius, J., Pratto, F., & Bobo, L. (1996). Racism, conservatism, affirmative action, and intellectual sophistication: A matter of principled conservatism or group dominance?

  \*\*Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 70, 3, 476-490.
- Silvestri, T. J. & Richardson, T. Q. (2001). White racial identity statuses and NEO personality constructs: An exploratory analysis. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 79(1), 68-76.
- Skiba, R. J., Michael, R. S., Nardo, A, C., & Peterson, R. L. (2000). The color of discipline: Sources of racial and gender disproportionality in school punishment. *Urban Review*, 34(4), 317-42.
- Snarey, J.R. (1985). Cross-cultural universality of social-moral development: A critical review of Kohlbergian research. *Psychological Bulletin*, *97*, 202-232.
- Sodowsky, G.R., Kuo-Jackson, P.Y., Richardson, M.F., & Corey, A.T. (1998). Correlates of self-reported multicultural competencies: Counselor multicultural social desirability, race, social inadequacy, locus-of-control racial ideology, and multicultural training. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 45, 256-264.
- Sprinthall, N.A. (1978). A primer on development. In N.A. Sprinthall and R.L. Mosher (Eds.),

  Value Development as the Aim of Education. New York, NY: Character Research

Press.

- Sprinthall, N. A. (1994). Counseling and social role-taking: Promoting moral and ego development. In Rest, J., and Narvaez, D. (Eds.), *Moral development in the professions:*\*Psychology and applied ethics (pp. 85-100). Hillside, NJ: L. Erlbaum Associates.
- Sprinthall, N.A., & Bernier, J. (1979). Moral and cognitive development of teachers. In T.C. Hennessy (Ed.). *Value and moral education* (pp. 119-145). New York: Paulist Press.
- Sprinthall, N. A., & Collins, W.A., (1984). Adolescent psychology: A developmental view.

  Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.
- Sprinthall, N. A., & Mosher, R. L. (1978). Value development as the aim of education. New York, NY: Character Research Press.
- Sprinthall, N.A., Peace, S.D., & Kennington, P.A.D. (1999). Cognitive developmental stage theories for counseling.
- Steward, R. J., Boatwright, K. J., Sauer, E., Baden, A., & Jackson, J. D. (1995). Examining the relationships between the stages of racial identity, cognitive development, and multicultural training. Paper presented at the American Psychological Association Annual Conference, New York, NY.
- Steward, R.J., Morales, P.C., Bartell, P.A., Miller, M., & Weeks, D. (1998). The multiculturally responsive versus the multiculturally reactive: A study of perceptions of counselor trainees. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 26, 13-27.
- Stickel, J. D. (1991, February). A study of burnout and job satisfaction among rural school counselors. Paper presented at the Annual Conference of the Eastern Educational Research Association, Boston, MA.

- Strohmer, D. C., Biggs, D. A., Haase, R. F., & Purcell, M. J. (1983). Training counselors to work with disabled clients: Cognitive and affective components. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 23(2), 132-141.
- Sue, D. W., & Sue, D. (1990). Counseling the culturally different: Theory and practice (2<sup>nd</sup> ed).

  New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Thoma, S. (1985). On improving the relationship between moral reasoning and external criteria:

  The utilizer/nonutilizer dimension. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of

  Minnesota.
- Thoma, S. (1994). Trends and issues in moral judgment research using the Defining Issues Test.

  Moral Education Forum, 19(1), 1-7.
- Thoma, S., & Rest, J. R. (1986). *Moral judgement, behavior, decision making, and attitudes*. In J. R. Rest (Ed.), Moral development: Advances in research and theory (pp. 133-175).

  New York: Preager.
- Thomas B. Fordham Foundation, (1999). A nation still at risk. (Report No. BBB35085).

  Washington, DC: ERIC Clearinghouse on Assessment and Evaluation. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED429988)
- U.S. Department of Commerce (2002, March). *Bureau of Census* [On-Line]. Available: <a href="http://www.census.gov/">http://www.census.gov/</a>
- U.S. Department of Education/Civil Rights Office (2000). Fiscal Year 2000: Annual Report to Congress [On-line]. Available: <a href="http://www.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/AnnRpt2000/">http://www.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/AnnRpt2000/</a> edlite-index.html.
- U. S. Department of Education (2001). The nation's report card: Fourth grade reading

- highlights, 2000: National assessment of educational progress (OERI Publication No. 2001-499). Washington, DC: OERI.
- U.S. Department of Education/No Child Left Behind (2002, January). *No Child Left Behind* [Online]. Available: <a href="http://www.ed.gov/nclb/landing.jhtml">http://www.ed.gov/nclb/landing.jhtml</a>.
- Utsey, S. O., McCarthy, E., Eubanks, R., & Adrian, G. (2002). White racism and suboptimal psychological functioning among White Americans: Implications for counseling and prejudice prevention. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 30(2), 81-95.
- Utsey, S. O., Ponterotto, J. G.; Reynolds, A. L.; Cancelli, A. A. (2000). Racial discrimination, coping, life satisfaction, and self-esteem among African Americans. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 78, 72-80.
- Verduyn, C.M., Llord, W., & Forrest, G.G. (1990). Social skills training in schools: An evaluation study. *Journal of Adolescence*, 13, 3-16.
- Vogt, W. P. (1997). Tolerance and education: Learning to live with diversity and difference.

  Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Walker, L. (1984). Sex differences in the development of moral reasoning: A critical review.

  Child Development, 55, 677-691.
- Walsh, F. (1993). Normal family processes (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). New York: Guilford Press.
- Watkins, C. E., Terrell, F., Terrell, S. L., & Miller, F. S. (1989). Cultural mistrust and its effects on expectational variables in Black client-White counselor relationships. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 36 (4), 447-450.
- Whiston, S.C., Sexton, T.L., & Lasoff, D.L. (1998). Career-intervention outcome: A

- replication and extension of Oliver and Spokane. *Journal of Counseling*Psychology, 45, 150-165.
- Whitfield, D. (1994). Toward an integrative approach to improving multicultural counselor education. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 22, 227-238.
- Wilsman, M. (1979). Students' conceptual systems as a predictor of modes of self-evaluation.

  (Report No. TM008814) San Francisco, CA: Paper presented at the Annual

  Meeting of the American Educational Research Association (ERIC Document

  Reproduction Service No. ED171745)
- Wirth-Bond, S., Coyne, A., & Adams, M. (1991). A school counseling program that reduces dropout rate. *School Counselor*, 39(2), 131-137.
- Wittmer, J. (1992). Valuing diversity in the schools: The counselor's role. (Report No. BBB02305). Ann Arbor, MI: ERIC Clearinghouse on Counseling and Personnel Services.

  (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED347475)
- Zakharova, A. V. (1990). A structural-dynamic model of self-assessment. *Soviet Education*, 32(4), 6-23.

Appendices

### Appendix A Informed Consent

I understand that I am voluntarily participating in research that is examining the possible relationships among school counselors' levels of moral development and multicultural counseling. Tammi Milliken is conducting this research as part of the requirements for a doctoral degree in counselor education at the College of William and Mary. My participation includes completion of three surveys and a demographic form. I understand the importance of answering all questions as honestly as possible and leaving no questions unanswered. Participation will take approximately one hour.

Involvement in the study is completely voluntary, and refusal to participate will not result in any penalty. Volunteers may choose to withdraw from the study at any time. Anonymity for each participant is highly valued. Participants in this study will remain anonymous and obtained information will remain confidential. No risk of harm greater than that encountered in daily life is expected as a result of participation.

I am aware that I may report dissatisfactions with any aspect of this experiment to the Chair of the Protection of Human Subjects Committee, Dr. Stanton Hoegerman (757-221-2240).

| My signature indicate the study. | es that I have read and | understand the infor | mation provided ab | ove and consent to | participate in |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|--------------------|--------------------|----------------|
|                                  |                         |                      |                    |                    |                |
| Signature                        |                         | 1                    |                    |                    |                |
|                                  |                         |                      |                    |                    |                |
| Data                             |                         |                      |                    |                    |                |

The results will be available to participants upon request by contacting: Tammi Milliken, College of William and Mary, School of Education, Jones Hall, Williamsburg, Virginia 23187. Also, the final dissertation will be made available on Dissertation Abstracts Online-Access via various computerized database and information services. Summarized findings may be published in professional counseling literature.

If you have any questions or concerns, please do not hesitate to contact me at (757) 721-6472 or <a href="mailto:txmil2@wm.edu">txmil2@wm.edu</a> or <a href="mailto:txmil2@wm.edu">txmil2@wm.edu</a>. Please keep one copy of this informed consent form as a record of your rights as a participant.

I greatly appreciate your time and effort, and am committed to use the information you provide to enhance the field of school counseling.

Thank you for your assistance,

Tammi F. Milliken Doctoral Candidate

This project was found to comply with appropriate ethical standards and was exempted from the need for formal review by the college of William and Mary protection of human subjects committee (phone: 757-221-3901) on May 14, 2003 and expires on May 14, 2004.

## Appendix B Demographic Form

| Race (please check only one group):                                     |
|---|
| (1) Asian, Asian American   |
| (2) Black, African American   |
| (3) Latino, Hispanic, Mexican American                                  |
| (4) Native American, American Indian                                    |
| (5) White, Caucasian, European American                                 |
| (6) Other (please specify)  |
|   |
| Gender:   |
| (1) male (2) female   |
|   |
| Age:  |
| (1) 20-30   |
| (2) 30-40   |
| (3) 40-50   |
| (4) 50-59   |
| (5) 60-70   |
|   |
| Degree's attained:  |
| (1) Bachelors in  |
| (2) Masters in  |
| (3) Specialist in   |
| (4) Doctoral in   |
| (5) Other not specified in  |
|   |
| Present status in current program (check all that apply):               |
| (1) First Year(2) Second Year(3) Internship                             |
| (4) Other (please specify)  |
|   |
| Years of experience as a school counselor (if any):                     |
| years   |
|   |
| Current level position as a school counselor intern:                    |
| (1) Elementary (2) Middle/Junior High (3) High School                   |
| (4) Combination of Elementary & Middle (5) Combination of Middle & High |
| (6) Other (please specify)  |
|   |
| Have you taken a course in multicultural counseling?                    |
| (1) no, I've not yet taken a multicultural course                       |
| (2) I'm currently enrolled in a multicultural course                    |
| (3) yes, I've completed a multicultural course                          |

#### Impact of Cognitive Development

165

#### Appendix C

#### New Racism Scale

| DIRECTIONS: For the following items, respond by giving a number to each statement.                                   |
|--|
| 1. Do you feel blacks in this country have tried to move (3) too fast, (2) too slow, or (1) at about the right pace? |
| 2. Would it upset you personally (4) a lot, (3) some but not a lot, (2) only a little, or (1) not at all if blacks   |
| moved into this neighborhood?  |
| 3. It's been said that if black children all went to school with white children, the education of white children     |
| would suffer. The reason given is that the black children would hold back the white children. Do                     |
| you believe that or not? (1 = don't believe, 2 = not sure, 3 = believe)  |
| 4. Blacks are more likely to make progress in the future by being patient and not pushing so hard for change. (1     |
| = disagree, 2 = not sure, 3 = agree)   |
| 5. If a fully qualified black whose views were acceptable to you were nominated to run for president, how likely     |
| do you think you would be to vote for that candidate? (please rate from 1 = very likely to 4 = not at                |
| all likely)  |
| 6. Whether you agree or not with the idea of affirmative action, do you think blacks are given special               |
| consideration and hired before whites for jobs (4) frequently, (3) occasionally, (2) hardly ever, or                 |
| (1) never at all?  |
| 7. How about in higher education institutions - that is, colleges and universities? Do you think blacks are given    |
| special consideration and admitted before whites in higher education institutions (4) frequently, (3)                |
| occasionally, (2) hardly ever, (1) or never at all?  |

#### Appendix D

#### **Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Survey**

#### **Multicultural Counseling Competence Component**

(School Counselor Version)

Developed by Cheryl Holcomb-McCoy, Ph.D.

University of Maryland at College Park

<u>Directions</u>: Listed below are competency statements based on AMCD's Multicultural Counseling Competencies and Explanatory Statements. Please read each competency statement and evaluate your multicultural competence using the following 4-point scale.

- Not competent (Not able to perform at this time)
- Somewhat competent (More training needed)
- Competent (Able to perform competently)
- Extremely competent (Able to perform at a high level

| 1.   | I can discuss my own ethnic/cultural heritage.  | 1       | 2 | 3, | 4 |
|--|---|---------|---|----|---|
| 2.   | I am aware of how my cultural background and experiences have influenced my attitudes about psychological processes.    |         | 2 | 3  | 4 |
| 3.   | I am able to discuss how my culture has influenced the way I think.   | 1       | 2 | 3  | 4 |
| 4.   | I can recognize when my attitudes, beliefs, and values are interfering with providing the best services to my students. | 1       | 2 | 3  | 4 |
| 5.   | I can discuss my family's perspective regarding acceptable and non-acceptable codes-of-conduct.                         | , party | 2 | 3  | 4 |
| 6.   | I can discuss models of White Racial Identity Development.  | 1       | 2 | 3  | 4 |
| 7.   | I can define racism.  | 1       | 2 | 3  | 4 |
| 8.   | I can define prejudice.   | 1       | 2 | 3  | 4 |
| 9.   | I can define discrimination.  | 1       | 2 | 3  | 4 |
| 10.  | I can define stereotype.  | 1       | 2 | 3  | 4 |
| person to the second se | I can identify the cultural bases of my communication style.  | 1       | 2 | 3  | 4 |
| 12.  | I can identify my negative and positive emotional reactions toward persons of other racial and ethnic groups.           | posed   | 2 | 3  | 4 |

- Not competent (Not able to perform at this time)
- Somewhat competent (More training needed)
- Competent (Able to perform competently)
- Extremely competent (Able to perform at a high level)

| 13. | I can identify my reactions that are based on stereotypical beliefs about different ethnic groups.   | 1              | 2   | 3 . | 4 |
|-----|--|----------------|-----|-----|---|
| 14. | I can give examples of how stereotypical beliefs about culturally different persons impact the counseling relationship.  | 1              | 2   | 3   | 4 |
| 15. | I can articulate the possible differences between the nonverbal behavior of the five major ethnic groups (i.e., African/Black, Hispanic/Latino, Asian, Native American, European/White). | <b>Special</b> | 2   | 3   | 4 |
| 16. | I can articulate the possible differences between the verbal behavior of the five major ethnic groups.   | grand<br>g     | . 2 | 3   | 4 |
| 17. | I can discuss the counseling implications for at least<br>two models of racial/ethnic identity development.  | 1              | 2   | 3   | 4 |
| 18. | I can discuss within-group differences among ethnic groups (e.g., low SES Puerto Rican student vs. high SES Puerto Rican student).   | quant          | 2   | 3   | 4 |
| 19. | I can discuss how culture affects a student's vocational choices.  | . passed       | 2   | 3   | 4 |
| 20. | I can discuss how culture affects the help-seeking behaviors of students.  | Passag         | 2   | 3   | 4 |
| 21. | I can discuss how culture affects the manifestations of psychological disorders.   | breed          | 2   | 3   | 4 |
| 22. | I can describe the degree to which a counseling approach is appropriate for a specific group of people.  | promp          | 2   | 3   | 4 |
| 23. | I can explain how factors such as poverty, and powerlessness have influenced the current conditions of at least two ethnic groups.   | gressed        | 2   | 3   | 4 |
| 24. | I can discuss research regarding mental health issues among culturally/ethnically different populations.   | January        | 2   | 3   | 4 |
| 25. | I can discuss how the counseling process may conflict with<br>the cultural values of at least two ethnic groups.   | heresi         | 2   | 3   | 4 |
| 26. | I can list at least three barriers that prevent ethnic minority students from using counseling services.   | hemak          | 2   | 3   | 4 |

- Not competent (Not able to perform at this time)
- Somewhat competent (More training needed)
  - Competent (Able to perform competently)
- Extremely competent (Able to perform at a high level)

| 27. | I can discuss the potential bias of two assessment instruments frequently used in the schools. | · ·    | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|-----|--|--------|---|---|---|
| 28. | I can discuss family counseling from a cultural/ethnic perspective.                            | Manage | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 29. | I can anticipate when my helping style is inappropriate for a culturally different student.    |        | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 30. | I can help students determine whether a problem stems from                                     | 1      | 2 | 3 | 4 |

THANK YOU FOR YOUR PARTICIPATION!

# Appendix E New Racism Scale and Multicultural Counseling Competence and Training Survey- Revised As Presented to Participants

|       | ECTIONS: For the following 7 items, please read each statement and reber. Write the number in the space provided to the left of the item.  | espond by   | / choo | sing a    | corresp  | oonding     |
|-------|--|-------------|--------|-----------|----------|-------------|
|       | <ol> <li>Do you feel African Americans in this country have tried to slow, or (3) at about the right pace?</li> <li>Would it upset you personally (1) a lot, (2) some but not a African Americans moved into this neighborhood?</li> </ol> |             |        |           |          |             |
|       | 3. It's been stated that if African American children all went education of White children would suffer. The reason give would hold back the White children. Do you believe that o believe   | n is that t | he Afr | ican A    | merica   | n children  |
|       | 4. African Americans are more likely to make progress in the so hard for change. (3) disagree, (2) not sure, (1) agree   | future by   | being  | , patier  | nt and i | not pushing |
|       | 5. If a fully qualified African American whose views were ac president, how likely do you think you would be to vote fo somewhat likely, (2) somewhat unlikely, (1) not at all likel   | r that can  |        |           |          |             |
|       | 6. Whether you agree or not with the idea of affirmative action given special consideration and hired before Whites for job hardly ever, or (4) never at all?  | •           |        |           |          |             |
|       | 7. How about in higher education institutions - that is, college Americans are given special consideration and admitted be institutions (1) frequently, (2) occasionally, (3) hardly even  | fore Whi    | tes in | higher    | •        |             |
| and I | ECTIONS: Listed below are competency statements based on AMCD's Explanatory Statements. Please read each competency statement and e g the following 4-point scale. Circle the number that most corresponds                                 | valuate yo  | our mu | ılticultı | ural co  | mpetence    |
|       | <ul> <li>Not competent (Not able to perform at this time)</li> <li>Somewhat competent (More training needed)</li> <li>Competent (Able to perform competently)</li> <li>Extremely competent (Able to perform at a high level)</li> </ul>    |             |        |           |          |             |
| 1.    | I can discuss my own ethnic/cultural heritage.   | 1           | 2      | 3         | 4        |             |
| 2.    | I am aware of how my cultural background and experiences have influenced my attitudes about psychological processes.   | Personal    | 2      | 3         | 4        |             |
| 3.    | I am able to discuss how my culture has influenced the way I think.  | Personal    | 2      | 3         | 4        |             |
| 4.    | I can recognize when my attitudes, beliefs, and values are interfering with providing the best services to my students.  | - Personal  | 2      | 3         | 4        |             |
| 5.    | I can discuss my family's perspective regarding acceptable and non-acceptable codes-of-conduct.  | jennesk     | 2      | 3         | 4        |             |
| 6.    | I can discuss models of White Racial Identity Development.   | 1           | 2      | 3         | 4        |             |

- Not competent (Not able to perform at this time)
- Somewhat competent (More training needed)
  - Competent (Able to perform competently)
- Extremely competent (Able to perform at a high level)

| 7.           | I can define racism.  | 1        | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|--------------|---|----------|---|---|---|
| 8.           | I can define prejudice.   | 9        | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 9.           | I can define discrimination.  | 1        | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 10.          | I can define stereotype.  | 1        | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| <b>1 1 .</b> | I can identify the cultural bases of my communication style.  | 1        | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 12.          | I can identify my negative and positive emotional reactions toward persons of other racial and ethnic groups.   | <b>T</b> | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 13.          | I can identify my reactions that are based on stereotypical beliefs about different ethnic groups.  | 11.      | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 14.          | I can give examples of how stereotypical beliefs about culturally different persons impact the counseling relationship.   | bound    | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 15.          | I can articulate the possible differences between the nonverbal behavior of the five major ethnic groups (i.e., African/African American, Hispanic/Latino, Asian, Native American, European/White). | ęmowi    | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 16.          | I can articulate the possible differences between the verbal behavior of the five major ethnic groups.  | latenak  | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 17.          | I can discuss the counseling implications for at least two models of racial/ethnic identity development.  | parmet   | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 18.          | I can discuss within-group differences among ethnic groups (e.g., low SES Puerto Rican student vs. high SES Puerto Rican student).  | hazay    | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 19.          | I can discuss how culture affects a student's vocational choices.   | and a    | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 20.          | I can discuss how culture affects the help-seeking behaviors of students.   | prival   | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 21.          | I can discuss how culture affects the manifestations of psychological disorders.  | proces   | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 22.          | I can describe the degree to which a counseling approach is appropriate for a specific group of people.   | <b>V</b> | 2 | 3 | 4 |

|     | <ul> <li>Not competent (Not able to perform at this time)</li> <li>Somewhat competent (More training needed)</li> <li>Competent (Able to perform competently)</li> <li>Extremely competent (Able to perform at a high level)</li> </ul> |             |   |   |   |
|-----|---|-------------|---|---|---|
| 23. | I can explain how factors such as poverty, and powerlessness have influenced the current conditions of at least two ethnic groups.  | T T         | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 24. | I can discuss research regarding mental health issues among culturally/ethnically different populations.  | 1           | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 25. | I can discuss how the counseling process may conflict with<br>the cultural values of at least two ethnic groups.  | 1           | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 26. | I can list at least three barriers that prevent ethnic minority students from using counseling services.  | 1           | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 27. | I can discuss the potential bias of two assessment instruments frequently used in the schools.  | <b>1000</b> | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 28. | I can discuss family counseling from a cultural/ethnic perspective.   | Yearn .     | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 29. | I can anticipate when my helping style is inappropriate for a culturally different student.   | 1           | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| 30. | I can help students determine whether a problem stems from racism or biases in others.  | passed .    | 2 | 3 | 4 |

THANK YOU FOR YOUR PARTICIPATION!