

# James Blair Historical Review

---

Volume 6 *James Blair Historical Review, Volume 6*

Article 1

---

2015

## Volume 6

The James Blair Historical Review

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.wm.edu/jbhr>



Part of the [History Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

The James Blair Historical Review (2015) "Volume 6," *James Blair Historical Review*: Vol. 6 , Article 1.

Available at: <https://scholarworks.wm.edu/jbhr/vol6/iss1/1>

This Journal is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at W&M ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in James Blair Historical Review by an authorized editor of W&M ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact [wmpublish@wm.edu](mailto:wmpublish@wm.edu).

: Volume 6



# THE JAMES BLAIR HISTORICAL REVIEW

Published by W&M ScholarWorks, 2015

VOLUME VI ~ 2015

WILLIAMSBURG, VA.



# The James Blair Historical Review

## EDITORIAL BOARD

Chris Phillibert, *Editor-in-Chief*  
Abby Gomulkiewicz, *Managing Editor*  
Carter Lyon, *Submissions Editor*  
Sloane Nilsen, *Layout Editor*  
Gus Tate, *Publicity Manager*  
Jacob Jose, *Business Manager*

## PEER REVIEWERS

Mary Andino	Cody Grogan
Jackie Borman	Noella Handley
Phoebe Brannock	Lauren Jean
Bill Cussen	Keon Sahidi
Fiona Fimme	Margaret Strolle
Ryan Zito	

## FACULTY ADVISOR

Dr. Jeremy Pope

---

**Online:** *In addition to this printed issue, the James Blair Historical Review can also be accessed online at [publish.wm.edu/jbhr](http://publish.wm.edu/jbhr)*

**Cover:** *Detroit Photographic Co., William and Mary College, Williamsburg, VA. c1902. 1 photomechanical print : photochrom, color. From: Library of Congress Prints and Photographs Division Washington, D.C. 20540 USA*

## EDITOR'S NOTE:

When I first applied to be Editor-in-Chief of the James Blair Historical Review, I knew little about it aside from the fact that it existed. My heart swells with pride when I think of the passionate students and brilliant Professors that make up William & Mary's history department, so it should be only fitting that the work produced by those students be put on display in front of as wide an audience as possible. While I had not been involved in running this historical journal, I was fueled by the challenge and the opportunity to serve the department that had given me so much. Above all, we as undergraduates are so lucky to have a journal that not only encourages research, but provides a space to publish that research for an audience. When I became Editor-in-Chief, one of my primary concerns was making the vision of a wider audience a reality.

With this vision in mind, I helped establish and implement a new site for JBHR. If you'll excuse the shameless plug: [publish.wm.edu/jbhr](http://publish.wm.edu/jbhr) is our new site that has both expanded awareness and viewership. With our first baby steps into cyberspace, we have made copies of the review available online in the same place for increased public consumption and given aspiring authors the option to submit their work through the site. We believe that the establishment and use of the site along with other methods will help facilitate the idea of a collective undergraduate historical community, and I'm excited to see what will be done in the future. Furthermore, I hope that JBHR can serve as a shining example of what is possible for history undergraduates with enough desire and initiative to implement their vision within their own institutions.

With all this said, of course this Herculean effort was not achieved alone. We would be nothing without all of the courageous authors, published and unpublished, who displayed the bravery to be judged by strangers all while endowing us with their trust in safeguarding their work. Our peer review-

ers deserve undying gratitude from all involved for both expressing patience in dealing with the growing pains of a new site and carrying out their duties with the utmost professionalism and commitment. I am also indebted to our faculty advisor, Dr. Jeremy Pope, and the other members of the Editorial Board: Carter Lyon, Abby Gomulkiewicz, Sloane Nilsen, Jacob Jose, and Gus Tate.

On behalf of the entire 2014-2015 Editorial Board, I am so glad you decided to read a copy of the James Blair Historical Review. We have taken meticulous care to create it for your liking and hope you will continue to pursue historical knowledge.

Sincerely,

Chris Phillibert  
Editor-in-Chief



---

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS:

<b>Our Little Orient:</b> Deviance in Inquisitional Borderlands <i>Emma Kessel</i>	<b>11</b>
<b>Violence, Empire, and the Narration of Travel</b> <b>in <i>The World Encompassed</i></b> <i>Madeline Grimm</i>	<b>35</b>
<b>Burdened by Excellence:</b> Rahel Varnhagen's Struggle <i>Mary Andino</i>	<b>53</b>
<b>The Yugoslav Campaign for Trieste:</b> <i>A Case of Divergent Deals and Actions</i> <i>Justin Williams</i>	<b>63</b>
<b>Article 121, The Other, and The Iron Closet:</b> LGBT Life in Soviet and Post-Soviet Russia <i>John Snouffer</i>	<b>77</b>

---

---

## ABOUT THE AUTHORS:



Emma Hall Kessel is a junior at the College of William and Mary from Raleigh, North Carolina double majoring in History and Hispanic Studies. Her research interests include medieval Iberian and Italian history, pilgrimage studies and gender history. Emma has served as a research assistant in the Hispanic Studies department, and in her free time she works in animal husbandry at Colonial Williamsburg and rides dressage.



Madeline Grimm is a senior at the College of William and Mary majoring in history. She is completing an honors thesis on early modern English histories of America and English perceptions of Native American history. On campus, Madeline is a member of Lafayette Kids, a tutoring and mentoring service organization, and she has worked as a student researcher in the English Department. She developed her interest in British history while studying abroad in St Andrews, Scotland during her junior year.



Mary Andino is a second year history major at The College of William and Mary. Her concentration is women in the Italian Renaissance. Her honors thesis, "Politics, Patronage, and Prophecy," explores the nuns of the Corpus Domini convent in 15th century Venice. She plans on attending graduate school to attain a Ph.D. in history and hopes to become a professor in the future.



Justin Williams is a senior at The College of William & Mary double majoring in History and Finance. His career interests include museum studies and financial modeling. He currently writes articles for the Hampton Roads Naval Museum, which are incorporated into new exhibits or published in the Museum's magazine "The Daybook." He hopes to work at the Smithsonian Institution following his internship there this summer.



John Snouffer is a senior at the College of William & Mary majoring in public policy and minoring in history. He is also enrolled in the accelerated Master of Public Policy Program at the College. He comes from Baltimore, Maryland.



## Our Little Orient

### Deviance in Inquisitional Borderlands

*Emma Kessel*

When describing the borderlands of the Spanish Inquisition, scholars are looking at an ethnically, religiously, and socially complex group of people that is often overlooked in studies on the period. Indeed, perhaps because these groups were so difficult to categorize, they hardly register as being “Spanish” in any way, but they were lawfully considered so. By looking at Sicily, Sardinia, and northern Spain under the Inquisition during the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> centuries, this paper asks whether the borderlands were extraordinarily prone to heresy in comparison with each other and the interior of the country, as well as how the Spanish tribunals treated the inhabitants of these areas. Was the Spanish Inquisition prone to seeing heresy where it did not exist, or were the heresies on trial by the tribunals unique to the borderlands? I look first at the political climate and history surrounding Sicily, Sardinia, and the Basque lands in order to ascertain into what environment the Inquisition entered in the late 15<sup>th</sup> and early 16<sup>th</sup> centuries. Moving from the political, I then trace the types of heresies commonly found over time in the areas highlighted, beginning at the arrival of the Inquisition. Oddities in culture and language notwithstanding, the Spanish Inquisition in the 15<sup>th</sup> and 16<sup>th</sup> centuries saw their borderlands as both an inalienable part of Iberian domain and as permeable and possibly prone to heresy both from outside Spanish purview and within their borders.

In order to explore the borderlands of the Inquisition, it is imperative first to understand them. In Sicily it becomes clear that the “problem” with borderlands was often seen as insurmountable, with Luigi Firpo, a Venetian ambassador to the island proclaiming that, “Without prejudice to the good Sicilians, all people who live on islands are bad, but Sicilians are the worst.”<sup>1</sup> Sicily’s past as a contested area between Christians and Muslims meant that its people had a somewhat skewed idea of what the Inquisition should look like and what they would accept as heretical.

---

1 William Monter, *Frontiers of Heresy* (Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 1990), 180.

Because of its proximity to North Africa, Sicilian communities were diverse and included large African slave populations who often lived and worked together, isolating them and making the possibility of backsliding into Islam very common after conversion.<sup>2</sup> The Sicilian dialect, still somewhat in use today on the island, serves to throw into stark contrast the task ahead of the Spanish when they annexed the island in 1412: that of controlling a populace who spoke an outdated and, to their mind, incomprehensible language.<sup>3</sup> Spanish regency on the island resembled an early attempt at colonialism in which the island was controlled entirely, and perhaps unsuccessfully, by a foreign occupation against the wishes of the inhabitants.

Spain's conquest of Sicily was an ongoing affair throughout the 15<sup>th</sup> century, but with the 1412 Compromise of Caspe, Sicily's rule fell to Ferdinand of Antequara, the king of Aragon, after years of being a contested island, but with certain semi-autonomous powers such as local governance by Sicilians.<sup>4</sup> The Spanish Inquisition only arrived on Sicily's borders in 1487, however, and the first inquisitors wrote back to Spain complaining of a perceived "plague of *neofiti*" on the island.<sup>5</sup> Sicilian newly-Christianized *neofiti*, called *conversos* on the mainland, were "generally present in every social sector other than fishing and military service, but there did not exist a single activity that could be defined as typically 'Jewish.'"<sup>6</sup> It is unclear why they were not allowed in the fishing industry, but the exclusion from military service was common throughout the Spanish empire. Their assimilation into Sicilian life would prove to be an issue for inquisitors, who sought to convert a formerly Jewish population whom the Sicilian populace generally thought of as entirely benign and indeed often almost indistinguishable from Christian residents.<sup>7</sup> Until 1500,

---

2        Monter, *Frontiers of Heresy*, 171.

3        Nadia Zeldes, *The Former Jews of this Kingdom: Sicilian Converts after the Expulsion, 1492-1516* (Leiden: Koninklijke Brill, 2003), 3, 26, 133.

4        Zeldes, *Former Jews*, 26.

5        Francesco Renda, *L'inquisizione in Sicilia: i fatti, le persone*. (Palermo: Nuova Graphica, 1997), 276.

6        Renda, *L'inquisizione in Sicilia*, 280.

7        Renda, *L'inquisizione in Sicilia*, 281.

however, there does not seem to be a concerted effort on the part of the Spanish Inquisition to convert Sicilian Jews *en masse*.<sup>8</sup> Once the tribunal did engage in this task, however, it would serve only to enrage the Sicilian populace into open rebellion.

The Edict of 1500, published in November of that year, was widely circulated on the island and signaled the true beginning of the Sicilian Inquisition.<sup>9</sup> The document announced plainly the first heretics destined to be prosecuted on the island: the newly converted *neofiti* still holding to Jewish traditions.<sup>10</sup> Between the rhetoric which promised to “inquire, extirpate, punish and castigate or return and reconcile all heretics, apostates and all kinds of suspects,” the Edict specifically mentioned any “person of any position, rank and condition who is in any way and by any means a descendant of the Hebrew Nation.”<sup>11</sup> These people were expressly prohibited from leaving Spanish-controlled territory without the permission of an inquisitor, and the Edict attempted to incite the cooperation of Sicily’s Old Christian population with promises of confiscated Jewish property going to people who informed on them to the Inquisition.<sup>12</sup> The Edict’s confrontational language, exhorting Christians to “not give them [*neofiti* fleeing the island] any help, indulgence, council or favour in word or deed, direct or indirect; and they must reveal [their knowledge] to the lords Inquisitors under pain of excommunication” did little to impress the Christian population of Sicily, who in large part saw the Edict as simply another way to repress business in metropolitan centers and infringe upon the rights of the free population on the island.<sup>13</sup> Spain’s handling of Sicilian Jews, of which the Edict is the earliest announcement, demonstrates its utter misunderstanding

---

8 Ibid., 276.

9 Nadia Zeldes, “The account books of the Spanish inquisition in Sicily (1500–1550) as a source for the study of material culture in a Mediterranean country,” *Mediterranean Historical Review* 14 (1997): 67.

10 Giovanni Sgalambro and Reverend Bishop of Cefalù, “Edict of 1500” in *The Former Jews of this Kingdom: Sicilian Converts after the Expulsion, 1492-1516*, Nadia Zeldes, (Leiden: Koninklijke Brill, 2003), 144-145.

11 Sgalambro and Cefalù, “Edict of 1500,” 144-145.

12 Ibid., 145-146.

13 Sgalambro and Cefalù, “Edict of 1500,” 145.

of Sicilian culture and the assimilation of these Jews into Sicilian life.

By June 1510 the Spanish Inquisition's Sicilian problem had reached a turning point with the first *auto da fé* held on the island. Over the next six years resentment against the authorities grew until it boiled over in 1516. An account of the 1510 *auto* survives, written by a Venetian travelling on the island and writing to his sister of the events.<sup>14</sup> Piero Venier writes of those punished at the *auto*, who run the gamut of *neofiti*-related heresies: many "confessed that they had mostly done things according to the laws of Moses," performing Jewish prayers and celebrating the Sabbath, but there also appears a mother and daughter who had attempted to flee Sicily to live as Jews outside of Spanish control.<sup>15</sup> These women, by disobeying the Edict of 1500, "were not spared their life" and were relaxed to the secular arm in order to be executed.<sup>16</sup> The punishments of the nine *neofiti* burned at the stake continued into proceeding generations, with the Inquisition denying their children and grandchildren from holding office or engaging in certain professions reserved for Old Christians.<sup>17</sup>

It is evident from the Sicilian reaction to such punishments, however, that they were completely inappropriate to the delicate social balance on the island. Recalling the social structure of Sicily before and during the early years of Spanish reign, with an almost universal assimilation of cultures across the island, it becomes perhaps not so shocking that Sicilians did not take kindly to the burning of nine of their own by what they saw as a foreign power. Venier writes of "A Dominican friar, a talented preacher... demonstrating the errors of the Jews. And he preached for more than two hours before a great crowd composed of people of every condition."<sup>18</sup> The 1510 *auto* was the first real spectacle of the Inquisition held on the island, and the

---

14        Zeldes, *Former Jews*, 173.

15        Piero Venier, "Copia de una lettera di sier Piero Venier, quondam sier Domenego, data im Palermo, a di 8 zugno, et ricevuta qui a di... luio 1511 drizata a soe sorele," in *The Former Jews of this Kingdom: Sicilian Converts after the Expulsion, 1492-1516*, Nadia Zeldes, (Leiden: Koninklijke Brill, 2003), 175.

17        Ibid.

18        Venier, "Copia de una lettera," 174.

tribunal wanted to make it an effective one by giving the spectators as much moral instruction as possible while providing entertainment. Nadia Zeldes writes of how the preacher, whose origins are unclear, addressed the penitents before their death, making sure that they could seek spiritual assistance before being burned.<sup>19</sup> The other reason for the friar's impressive speech was likely the public space afforded him. This *auto* was intended not only to reconcile the penitent Jews of the island but also the island itself, including its rebellious Old Christians. The public nature of the event would have provided the perfect excuse to offer spiritual assistance to the huge audience gathered to watch the spectacle, as well as to castigate those being punished for their heresies.

The climate of resentment that Sicily experienced in the years immediately after the 1510 *auto da fé* culminated violently in 1516 with what some have called a popular uprising against Spanish rule as represented by the Inquisition. With the death of Ferdinand of Aragon, Spanish territories suffered a political and infrastructural crisis, but in this case it was further exacerbated by Sicilians' fury over Spain's tight control of the island.<sup>20</sup> Zeldes describes the uprising as "a more or less organized group of nobles and members of the Sicilian Parliament, who conspired... to regain some constitutional rights."<sup>21</sup> However, the semi-successful uprising had roots in the ubiquitous *neofiti* problem; some accounts described the involvement in the revolt by Sicilian *neofiti*.<sup>22</sup> Sicilian logic suggested, as evidenced by Girolamo da Verona's Lenten sermon of 1516, that former Jews should not be made to wear penitents' outfits and sewn crosses, and that they furthermore deserved sympathy from their accusers.<sup>23</sup> Da Verona, a Sicilian friar and preacher who was described in a letter as being somewhat radical, incited the crowd on the day of his sermon to physically remove the *sanbenitos* from prisoners being paraded in

---

19 Zeldes, *Former Jews*, 178.

20 Vittorio Russi, "Carlo V e l'inquisizione di Sicilia," in *Sardegna, Spagna e Stati italiani*, ed. Bruno Anatra and Francesco Manconi, (Urbino: Comune di Villamar, 2001), 415.

21 Zeldes, *Former Jews*, 208.

22 Ibid., 210.

23 Ibid.

front of them and to demand their release.<sup>24</sup> The problems of the Jews had become the problems of everyone else on the island who felt that Spanish rule had gone too far, and the popularly-supported but nobly-led uprising succeeded in both expelling the tribunal from the island for three years and thus allowing many *neofiti* to escape their punishments.<sup>25</sup> This type of open rebellion against a ruling country represented by a tiny oligarchy of theocratic power sheds light on the huge task facing Spanish inquisitors sent to the island. Sicily under the Inquisition included a populace ruled by an unwanted intruder, and thus is an example of Spain's early "colonialism," wherein the judicial system imported directly from Spain was completely, and openly, rejected by Sicilians.<sup>26</sup> When the Inquisition returned to the island in 1519, it began a much larger and more involved prosecution of heretics, expanding to include crimes other than that of Judaizing.<sup>27</sup>

The next wave of heretics that Spanish authorities sought to stamp out on the island was Sicily's *morisco* population, and it is here that Sicily's place at the center of the Mediterranean, and therefore the center of the Christian-Muslim conflict of the 16<sup>th</sup> century, becomes obvious. Sicily's *Santo Oficio* contains the fourth largest population of *moriscos* prosecuted in Spanish territory after northern Spain, Zaragoza, and Granada, mainly due to the enormous slave population on the island and its contacts with Muslim lands.<sup>28</sup> This population of slaves, unlike in other Spanish areas, was often confined to certain spaces due to their slave status and therefore less integrated into Sicilian society than Sicilian Jews prior to the expulsion.<sup>29</sup> Their isolation with respect to the rest of Sicilian society, as well as their status as slaves, mostly captured during campaigns in Muslim territories, meant that the majority of cases that survive today deal with recently converted *moriscos* attempting to travel back to Muslim lands in order to live openly and freely as Muslims, and there are relatively few cases of Sicilian Christians attempting to return to Sic-

---

24        Zeldes, *Former Jews*, 211.

25        Ibid.

26        Monter, *Frontiers of Heresy*, 179.

27        Ibid., 181.

28        Louis Cardaillac, "El problema morisco en Sicilia," *Nueva Revista de Filología Hispánica* 30 (1981): 638.

29        Renda, *L'inquisizione in Sicilia*, 342.

ily from Muslim lands.<sup>30</sup>

The case of Margherita Cherubina, a *morisca* slave owned by a citizen of Palermo, demonstrates the great problem of having a large slave population that had been forcibly converted to Christianity.<sup>31</sup> Cherubina, promised her freedom by her master if she would convert to Christianity, in 1615 was brought before the Palermo tribunal because, after her master reneged on his promise of freedom, she denied ever turning Christian.<sup>32</sup> Though she had not attempted to flee Sicily as so many other unhappily converted Christians did, the fact of her baptism was enough for her to be convicted of adhering to her former Muslim beliefs in place of Christian ones.<sup>33</sup> Although her conviction stood in court, Cherubina, after admitting to having lived as a Muslim after her baptism and keeping holidays such as Ramadan, Zalat, and Guadoc, changed her tune entirely. She said “that God had touched her heart, convincing her to leave the Mohammedan sect and making her realize that she had been walking a wrong road.”<sup>34</sup> Her confession and subsequent reversal of faith in the middle of her trial notwithstanding, Cherubina’s case demonstrates the problem inherent in combining forcible baptisms and a slave population with little choice in the matter. She may have been spared galley service—the penalty most often imposed upon *moriscos* found guilty of Mohammedan heresy—due to her sex, but her obvious reluctance to convert is symptomatic of the larger *morisco* problem within Sicily’s borders: that of keeping a population enslaved and Christianized against their will on an island so tantalizingly close to Moorish lands.<sup>35</sup>

As the 16<sup>th</sup> century ground on and both *neofiti* and *moriscos* became scarcer on the island, the Sicilian Inquisition’s worries over the threat of Protestantism on the island increased. It is an important distinction to make that the “Protestantism” ascribed to Sicilians

---

30 Cardaillac, “El Problema morisco en Sicilia,” 640, Renda, *L’inquisizione in Sicilia*, 350.

31 “La storia di Margherita Cherubina schiava turca rilasciata in persona al braccio secolare,” in *L’inquisizione in Sicilia: i fatti, le persone*, Francesco Renda, (Palermo: Nuova Graphicadue, 1997), 373.

32 “La storia di Margherita Cherubina,” 374.

33 *Ibid.*, 374.

34 *Ibid.*, 375.

35 Cardaillac, “El Problema morisco en Sicilia,” 641.

was often just a deviation from accepted Spanish Catholic doctrine, and not actually the practice of truly “Lutheran” ideas. Monter describes Sicilian Protestants as “not immigrants from France, as in northern Spain, but local men plus a sprinkling of Neapolitans and northern Italians.”<sup>36</sup> Between 1542 and 1591, around thirty Protestants, accused of holding Lutheran ideas, suffered the death penalty at Sicilian *autos*, but of those heretics only three were not Italian.<sup>37</sup> Statistically, towards the 1580s the numbers of Sicilian Protestants mentioned in *autos da fé* decreased as foreigners visiting the island were more often found as being authentic Protestant heretics.<sup>38</sup> However, Charles V’s tightening of Inquisitorial power in 1546 and the subsequent repression of island beliefs only exacerbated the fever over perceived Protestantism on the island in the middle of the 16th century.<sup>39</sup> Vittorio Russi describes the reaction to the prosecution of Protestants in Sicily as reflecting the number of people who were “critical against ecclesiastical and political institutions... and the relaxed morals of an ignorant and corrupt clergy.”<sup>40</sup> Sicilians, he argues, were at heart reformers angry about their treatment by the Spanish Inquisition’s foreign presence amongst them, and the reported numbers of Protestants demonstrate their unwillingness to conform to traditional Church doctrine.<sup>41</sup>

In the often-strict world of Spanish theological law, Sicilian beliefs, described as “freethinking,” struck an odd chord. In contrast to that Protestantism practiced by Sicilians on the island brought over through inhabitants’ travels, Sicilians’ deviations from Catholic doctrine often simply included oddities not found in any other European context. Sicilian “Materialism,” a complete disbelief in the afterlife but under the auspices of Christian doctrine, was a common deviation held by islanders who still professed to believe in God throughout the 16<sup>th</sup> century, a notion hardly ever found in mainland Spain.<sup>42</sup> Various trials having to do with these deviants demonstrate

36        Monter, *Frontiers of Heresy*, 167.

37        Ibid.

38        Monter, *Frontiers of Heresy*, 168.

39        Russi, “Carlo V e l’inquisizione,” 418.

40        Ibid., 420

41        Ibid., 421.

42        Monter, *Frontiers of Heresy*, 173.

the complete confusion that Spanish inquisitors faced in attempting to sentence these heretics, who otherwise accepted Christian doctrine and the belief in God. Sentences ranged from years of galley service to burning in effigy or spending years in prison, and their heresy was often erroneously called “necromancy” despite having nothing to do with witchcraft.<sup>43</sup> The fact that this brand of materialism was almost entirely organically Sicilian and yet was often classified as “Protestantism” demonstrates the Spanish Inquisition’s lack of knowledge about their populace. They simply lumped materialists in the same category as Lutherans without regard to how these ideas were formed and spread in an area so far from Lutheran lands.

The always-worrying prospect of insidious Protestants aside, and after dealing extensively with Sicilian *moriscos* and *neofiti*, inquisitors followed the general Spanish trend of looking for moral offenses within Sicilian ranks. Unsurprisingly when considering the contrary nature of Sicilians under Spanish rule, they were quite successful in finding deviants of many stripes, but principally they discovered sexual offenses. Anal intercourse, practically unheard of in Spain and certainly frowned upon, was something of a Sicilian specialty towards the beginning of the 17<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>44</sup> Monter describes how Sicily “had extremely few cases of “simple fornication;” however, the Holy Office confronted the erroneous but widespread Sicilian belief that sodomy was an unimportant type of sin.”<sup>45</sup> Heterosexual sodomy was considered the best kind of birth control among even the highly educated Sicilian elite brought before the Palermo tribunal, and many used Biblical support to defend themselves during their trials, going so far as to say that if God was not in favor of anal sex, it would be impossible to commit.<sup>46</sup> The fact that sodomy, both heterosexual and even homosexual, was so widely spread, and especially widely accepted, on the island suggests that the disconnect between Sicilians and Spaniards was somewhat deeper than simple confusion over Inquisitional jurisdiction. Sicilians were using fully fleshed-out Biblical arguments to defend their “deviance,” as the Spaniards called it, and thus showed a complete unwillingness to com-

---

43 Ibid., 174.

44 Ibid.

45 Ibid., 175.

46 Monter, *Frontiers of Heresy*, 175.

mit to the Spanish idea of propriety both in and out of the bedroom.

Sardinia's political history mirrors Sicily's somewhat in that it includes periods of dramatic change in leadership, though Sardinia's populace was never as rebellious towards their rulers as Sicily's. Unlike Sicily, control over Sardinia in first millennium CE was not a linear progression from empire to empire. Instead, Sardinia's control fluctuated from Christian to Muslim and back to Christian leadership. Originally part of the Eastern Roman Empire, in the eighth, ninth, and tenth centuries' Muslim attacks on the island forced it from Papal control.<sup>47</sup> Under Muslim control, a pattern of Sardinian leadership began to emerge, wherein factions of families, called *giudici* or "judges," marked by nepotism, incestuous relationships, and political strife, grew to control certain areas of the island and were in a state of almost constant warfare.<sup>48</sup> Throughout the Middle Ages Sardinia's status as a dependent island, claimed by every emerging empire in the Mediterranean, remained a constant theme, with the Papal States and the northern Italian city-states arguing over Sardinian dominion well into the 13<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>49</sup> Pope Innocent III's assertion that, "all of Sardinia belongs to the lordship, right, and property of the Apostolic See" was echoed by every nation looking for control of Sardinia's strategic geography and exports of grain, wool, pelts, salt, and silver.<sup>50</sup> Absent in the records of contests of power is any mention of Sardinian *giudici* staging any sort of rebellion against foreign rule, as was painfully evident in Sicily. Instead, the lords on the island actively participated in playing one city-state against another, with some backing Spanish control, others Papal control, and still others Pisan or Tuscan control over the island.<sup>51</sup> After centuries of contest over who was to rule Sardinia, in 1297 Pope Boniface VIII finally ceded control of Sardinia to the king of Aragon, James II.<sup>52</sup> Due to the stranglehold of power that Sardinian nobles held over their subjects and their history of working alongside, rather than against, a foreign power to control the island, Sardinia's legacy under

47        John C. Moore, "Pope Innocent III, Sardinia, and the Papal State," *Speculum* 62 (1987): 82.

48        Moore, "Pope Innocent III," 83.

49        *Ibid.*, 88.

50        Moore, "Pope Innocent III," 89.

51        *Ibid.*, 93.

52        *Ibid.*, 96.

Spanish rule continued for centuries relatively uninterrupted by power struggles.

The scholarship on Sardinia under the Spanish Inquisition is incomplete and almost entirely in Italian and Spanish, but what has been compiled for this paper paints a picture of an island completely foreign to Spanish authorities. Following the same path of gradual imposition as Sicily, the Spanish Inquisition only truly arrived in Sardinia in 1492, although Ferdinand of Aragon and Isabella of Castille authorized it in 1478.<sup>53</sup> The first seat of the Inquisition was in Cagliari, and the first inquisitor was Sancho Marin, appointed by the famous Tomás de Torquemada, although the Sardinian tribunal was particularly poor and inactive for the first 70 years of its operation.<sup>54</sup> One of the reasons behind the lack of activity within the Sardinian tribunal during the first half of the 16<sup>th</sup> century was continuing battles for power between the *giudici*, especially in Cagliari where both the Inquisition and the main seats of power were based.<sup>55</sup> In 1563, as part of a larger reforming effort on the part of the Spanish Inquisition as a whole, the Sardinian tribunal was transferred to Sassari and Diego Calvo, followed by a succession of fiercely anti-Protestant inquisitors, took over control of the tribunal.<sup>56</sup> Calvo immediately began turning the Inquisition's attention to "Lutherans" on the island, surprisingly "coming from the pulpits and the churches."<sup>57</sup> This fear of the spread of Lutheranism from the Church hierarchy was almost certainly an overreaction, but it spurred the *Suprema* into the move from corrupt Cagliari to Sassari.<sup>58</sup> This move was designed to both centralize the Inquisition and to stop the infiltration of reformers from the French Corsica and Provence.<sup>59</sup>

One of the largest thematic elements of Sardinian politics during the 16<sup>th</sup> century is the idea of fighting "barbarism" in the area, whether it came in the form of religious minorities or Turkish pirates

---

53 Tomasino Pinna, *Storia di una strega: L'inquisizione in Sardegna: il processo di Julia Carta*, (Sassari: EDES, 2000), 13.

54 Pinna, *Storia di una strega*, 14.

55 Pinna, *Storia di una strega*, 14.

56 Ibid.

57 Ibid., 15.

58 Ibid.

59 Ibid.

threatening the island.<sup>60</sup> Charles V's approach to the dangers posed towards Sardinia came in the form of military fortifications in order to protect the island's important strategic value, a crackdown on uniquely Sardinian heresy, and what could be termed a huge missionary approach to the "conversion" of the island.<sup>61</sup> With only two or three inquisitors in the tribunal at a time, the tribunal in Sardinia was woefully understaffed, but the island made up for the inquisitors' lack of interest in living there by the use of *familiars*.<sup>62</sup> Following the tradition of mainland Spanish expulsion of Jews in their territories, communities of *conversos* at Cagliari and Alghero were very much suspected by the Inquisition in the early 16<sup>th</sup> century of keeping Jewish beliefs and acts in secret.<sup>63</sup> Although not the focal point of Sardinian Inquisitional actions in the way that they were in Sicily, Sardinian *conversos* were subjected to the same types of *limpieza de sangre*, or "purification of blood," laws on the island that they were in mainland Spain.<sup>64</sup> The *limpieza de sangre* laws became a symbol of "purity ideology," or the affirmation of Old Christians' status above New Christians on the island.<sup>65</sup>

Under the supervision of a backwards and understaffed tribunal, it is easy to imagine that heresies abounded on the island, and Sardinia was no disappointment in this area. The first Sardinian *auto da fé*, held in 1545, largely focused on burning people accused of *stregoneria*, or witchcraft, deemed by local lawyer Giacomo Mercer "the greatest malady, falsity, and treason that has ever been thought of."<sup>66</sup> This *auto*, much like the Sicilian ones happening concurrently, did not go quite as planned by Spanish authorities, demonstrating if not disobedience by the Sardinian public as a whole to the Inquisi-

---

60        Anna Deidda, "Cultura artistica in Sardegna nell'età di Carlo V," in *Sardegna, Spagna e Stati italiani*, ed. Bruno Anatra and Francesco Manconi (Urbino: Comune di Villamar, 2001), 457.

61        Deidda, "Cultura artistica in Sardegna nell'età di Carlo V," 460.

62        Pinna, *Storia di una strega*, 17.

63        Angelo Rundine, *L'inquisizione Spagnola: Censura e libri proibiti in Sardegna nel '500 e '600*, (Sassari: Università di Sassari, 1996), 61.

64        Rundine, *L'inquisizione Spagnola*, 64.

65        Ibid., 65.

66        Bruno Anatra, "I conti dell'Inquisizione sarda nell'età di Carlo V," in *Sardegna, Spagna e Stati italiani*, ed. Bruno Anatra and Francesco Manconi, (Urbino: Comune di Villamar, 2001), 426.

tion, then certainly a lack of repentance by the convicted heretics. Some heretics during the ceremony proceeded to shout accusations against the inquisitors present in a way that certainly undermined the goal of demonstrating the importance of good Christian faith that the *auto* attempted to instill.<sup>67</sup>

It is after this *auto da fé* that a middle-aged Sardinian woman, Julia Carta, was introduced as exemplifying the prosecution of witchcraft on the island. Carta, from the small town of Siligio, was accused of being a “heretic against our sainted Catholic faith” in the form of practicing witchcraft, and though her trials spanned only the course of about a year each, they continued to show up in texts after 1606, including a 1614 manuscript that describes her wearing a *sanbenito*.<sup>68</sup> Julia Carta came from a humble background, as indeed most Sardinians did. She was married at the time of her trial and had borne seven children, was illiterate, and had a very informal religious education, knowing the *Pater Noster*, *Ave Maria*, *Credo*, and *Salve Regina*.<sup>69</sup> The witnesses called to testify against Carta, tried once in 1596 and then again in 1604 for the same crime of witchcraft, form a clear picture of a woman practicing traditional superstition whose heresy ran parallel to the heresy inherent on the island: that of mistrust of Spanish authority.<sup>70</sup> Carta’s first trial ended with a conviction of demonic idolatry and the performance of witchcraft on a sick child whose mother accused Julia of “giving to the sick boy to drink a beverage which did not benefit him” and indeed resulted in the boy’s death.<sup>71</sup> She was reconciled with the Church during a 1597 *auto da fé*.<sup>72</sup> Her punishment included wearing the *sanbenito*, participating in mass every Sunday and on feast days, confessing at least three times a year, reciting the rosary every Saturday, and, most importantly, detention in prison for three years.<sup>73</sup> Her removal from society for multiple years, as well as her very public confession during the

67 Ibid., 426.

68 Pedro Folargio, “Copia del processo primero que se causó en la Inquisición del Reyno de Cerdeña contra Julia Carta,” in *Storia di una strega*, Tomasino Pinna (Sassari: EDES, 2000), 219.

69 Pinna, *Storia di una strega*, 19.

70 Folargio, “Copia del processo primero, 223.

71 Ibid., 220.

72 Pinna, *Storia di una strega*, 55.

73 Ibid., 57.

*auto da fé*, demonstrates the Inquisition's desire to stamp out both her witchcraft and likely others' witchcraft through her example.

Unlike Sicily's relatively metropolitan population, at least near the tribunal in Palermo, Sardinia's population was thought to be in need of religious guidance, and so throughout the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> century Spain often sent missionaries, mostly Jesuits and Dominicans, to the island.<sup>74</sup> Sardinia's position as being less of a physical borderland of Spanish power than Sicily meant that the Inquisition's methods in policing heresy were often much more delicate there than on the other island. One of the largest fears of the Sardinian Inquisition during the 16<sup>th</sup> century was the diffusion of Protestant ideas onto the island, especially due to Sardinia's proximity to mainland France.<sup>75</sup> In 1546, the Italian L'università di Lovanio published a catalogue of heretical books, and over the next few years branches of both the Roman and Spanish Inquisition published new Indexes, culminating in the 1551 Index of Charles V, which represented a new instrument of control for Inquisitors farther afield from mainland Spain.<sup>76</sup> The Sardinian tribunal obtained a copy of the Index in 1552, when the inquisitor Andrea Sanna was put in charge of making it available in the cathedral of Cagliari and other cities on the island.<sup>77</sup> It is immediately apparent from the lists of prohibited books in the mid-16<sup>th</sup> century what types of heresy were proposed as most insidious both in Spain and its outlying territories; 75% of the books prohibited by the Index in the first years of censorship were religious texts.<sup>78</sup> The *Suprema's* fear of the texts produced specifically in Sardinia, which often involved some sort of misunderstanding of Catholic theology, was mainly about the use of sacred scripture by Protestants in order to defend their own interpretation of Biblical passages.<sup>79</sup>

The Basque lands, or *el país vasco*, have a history unlike either Sardinia or Sicily, but one which is indispensable in a discussion on how a borderland interacts with an interior. The four traditionally Spanish Basque areas—Alava, Viscaya, Guipúzcoa, and Na-

74        Rundine, *L'inquisizione spagnola*, 44.

75        Ibid., 122.

76        Ibid., 125.

77        Ibid.

78        Ibid., 126.

79        Ibid., 128.

varre—straddle the northernmost border with France and thus have a connection to French as well as Spanish culture.<sup>80</sup> Instead of the relatively isolated geographic positions of Sardinia and Sicily, the Basque lands are borderlands in the sense that they form a border between Spain and France, not a border between a civilization and the perceived heathen, as was the case of the two islands. However, culturally the Basque people during and after the Middle Ages were an entirely foreign entity, speaking *Euskara* and clamoring for their own autonomous country called *Euskadi*.<sup>81</sup> The political history of the Basque lands does, however, follow trends especially similar to those of Sicily. Both regions spoke a completely foreign language from the surrounding areas and suffered under centuries of foreign occupation. In *el país vasco*, this foreign occupation took the form of the Romans in the first centuries CE, Goths, Arabs after the year 714, and eventually the ruler Charlemagne in 778, before enjoying a few centuries of Navarrese independence and then control by the Kingdom of Castile in 1512.<sup>82</sup> The one constant theme throughout invasion after invasion of the Basque lands is that, unlike in Sicily, *el país vasco* was more of a thoroughfare than a destination to hold.<sup>83</sup> When they were utilized strategically, as by Charlemagne, the Basque lands formed a buffer between Arab-controlled Spain and Christian Europe, meaning that the Basque people were not fully “Christianized” until long after the turn of the first millennium CE.<sup>84</sup> In the twelfth century, Aimeric de Picaud, a French pilgrim on his way to Santiago de Compostela, spoke of the barbarian Basques saying, “The impious Navarrese and Basques would plunder the pilgrims who were on their way to Santiago.”<sup>85</sup> Paganism was only truly abolished in the late 15<sup>th</sup> and early 16<sup>th</sup> centuries in the Basque lands under the Spanish Inquisition.<sup>86</sup>

The Basque lands had a much different relationship with Spanish rule than either Sardinia or Sicily. Navarre as well as Vizcaya

80 William A. Douglass, *Amerikanuak: Basques In The New World*, (Nevada: University of Nevada Press, 2005), 14.

81 Douglass, *Amerikanuak*, 13.

82 Ibid., 41, 62.

83 Ibid., 42.

84 Ibid., 44.

85 Ibid.

86 Douglass, *Amerikanuak*, 45.

and Guipúzcoa enjoyed a certain amount of choice in their political alliances, in 1472 even going so far as to reject king Enrique IV in favor of his sister, Isabel of Castille.<sup>87</sup> Even before the Basque lands were finally annexed in 1512, much later than both Sicily and Sardinia, they were enthusiastic supporters of the Spanish *Reconquista*, lending a significant number of troops to conquer the last Moorish stronghold of Granada.<sup>88</sup> However, despite similarities in culture between Basque nobles and their Spanish counterparts, Basque culture remained foreign to the Spanish beyond its annexation. Most Basque spoke *Euskara* instead of Spanish well into the 17<sup>th</sup> century, as evidenced by the Logroño witchcraft trials. The accused in these trials, all peasants from various villages, needed an interpreter to translate their dialect.<sup>89</sup> While educated Basques often left the region in order to make lives for themselves outside Basque borders, often those within Basque country saw themselves as living in a region separate from Spain, which also happened to hold friendly allegiances to Spain.<sup>90</sup>

Although Logroño was not a Basque city, it was the location of the seat of the Spanish Inquisition in all of northern Spain, including the Basque region.<sup>91</sup> Surprisingly due to its location at the very northernmost part of the country, throughout the 16<sup>th</sup> and early 17<sup>th</sup> centuries it was *moriscos* who suffered the most in Inquisition trials, with two communities in the district of Logroño providing 90% of martyrs in *autos* in the area.<sup>92</sup> This pattern was repeated throughout northern Spain and the Basque lands, and while Valencia as a region produced more *moriscos* convicted in Inquisition trials, the *moriscos* of the Basque lands were often punished in much harsher ways, with 30% more being sent to the galleys in northern Spain than in Valencia.<sup>93</sup> The timeline of *morisco* persecution in the Basque lands falls in a relatively similar pattern to that of other parts of Spain, Sicily,

87 Ibid.,65.

88 Ibid.,66.

89 Gustav Henningsen, *The Salazar Documents: Inquisitor Alonso De Salazar Frias and Others on the Basque Witch Persecution*, (Leiden: Brill, 2004), 23.

90 Douglass, *Amerikanauk*, 44.

91 Ibid.,65.

92 Monter, *Frontiers of Heresy*, 200.

93 Ibid.,190.

and Sardinia, with many prosecutions falling after 1550 and then all *moriscos* being expelled from northern Spain in 1609.<sup>94</sup> One of the peculiarities of *morisco* prosecution before the expulsion, however, was the documentation available describing the *moriscos*' escape routes and where they went when confronted with persecution. One of these escape routes ran north into France via Somport and had been the most important all-weather pass across the Pyrenees since Roman times.<sup>95</sup> It was often the simplest escape route for Aragonese and Basque *moriscos* fleeing to Africa, since they were much safer once they had crossed the border.<sup>96</sup> The Navarrese Inquisition discovered an escape path from Ebra west to the French Atlantic ports in 1579, leading to the arrest and trials of two Frenchmen accused of smuggling Navarrese *moriscos* to freedom and, presumably, to Africa, in 1584.<sup>97</sup> Unfortunately for the Inquisitors, the *Suprema* told them that they had no jurisdiction over these men and were forced to free them to continue their illicit business.<sup>98</sup> The solution to the problem of *moriscos* within Spanish borders appeared in 1609 with the blanket expulsion of all those designated *moriscos* from the country.<sup>99</sup>

The Logroño witch trials in Navarre occurred in the early 17<sup>th</sup> century, immediately after the final expulsion of *moriscos* from Spanish borders in 1609. The dates of the trials appear incongruous at first, as they followed so closely after the Inquisition wrapped up the insidious *morisco* problem in northern Spain. However, the witch trials in 1609-1611 follow much more of the typical "witch-craze" phenomenon witnessed at various points throughout the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> centuries throughout Spain, though mostly concentrated in the northern areas of the country.<sup>100</sup> Gustav Henningsen defines two types of witch procedures: those of "witch beliefs," wherein

---

94 Ibid.,191.

95 Ibid.,207.

96 Ibid.

97 Ibid.,208.

98 Ibid.,208.

99 Henningsen, *The Salazar Documents*, 23.

100 Ibid.,47.

“harm has to be done (maleficium) to individuals if a trial is to be initiated, but in witch-craze this aspect becomes insignificant, the important thing being to identify people as belonging to the group of witches, for instance because they have been seen at the sabbat, or have been found to have the Devil’s mark.”<sup>101</sup>

Henningsen’s classification of “witch belief” versus “witch craze” procedures is useful in that it highlights what is noteworthy about the Logroño trials: that they included a vast number of defendants, many of whom in the eyes of judge Alonzo de Salazar y Frías were tried in a way antithetical to justice.<sup>102</sup> This is in stark contrast to Julia Carta’s first trial in the late 16<sup>th</sup> century, wherein she was proven to have conducted *maleficium* versus simply bearing a Devil’s mark, showing vast differences between the Sardinian and Basque witch trials in a very short span of time. The fact that Salazar was so shocked by the way that the Logroño trials were handled demonstrates both his own personal dedication to the fairness of the law and also the oddity of the Logroño trials versus trials conducted in other parts of Spain.

The letters from the Basque Inquisitors to the *Suprema* during the last months of 1610 are useful to determine if the witch trials demonstrate whether the Spanish Inquisition treated the inhabitants of the Basque lands any differently from those in the interior. The Inquisitors had at this point been charged with describing their daily goings-on to Madrid, and in their preliminary description of the perceived witch covens, they said, “When the kingdom fell under control of the Catholic kings, Don Ferdinand and Doña Isabella, great pains were taken to suppress the sect and even greater efforts were made in the years 1534 to 1540 in the reign of the Emperor Charles of glorious memory.”<sup>103</sup> They believed that a witch coven, or sect, had existed

---

101      Ibid.

102      Douglas Gifford, “Witchcraft and the Problem of Evil in a Basque Village,” *Folklore* 90 (1979): 15.

103      “I. Secta de brujos,” in *The Salazar Documents: Inquisitor Alonso De Salazar Frías and Others on the Basque Witch Persecution*, Gustav Henningson, (Leiden: Brill, 2004), 105.

quietly for years in the Basque lands, and they proceeded to describe the oddity of the word *aquejarre* in Basque, meaning “the meadow of the he-goat” and implying a union with the Devil during a ceremony.<sup>104</sup> The fact that *aquejarre* had entered easily into the Basque language is demonstrative, according to the Inquisitors, of the insidiousness of witchcraft to the region, whereas in other regions witch covens had not the extensive history peculiar to the Basque lands.<sup>105</sup> This dedication to the idea that witchcraft was a cross-generational concept is also reflected in the Inquisitors’ description of how villagers became witches; they could either “start after having reached the age of discretion and ‘malice,’” thus knowingly enter into the coven or, more tellingly, “others begin their careers before they have arrived at the age of discretion. Those under six are taken from their cots and cradles by the witches and borne away to the *aquejarre* where they are presented to the Devil.”<sup>106</sup> This indoctrination recalls a baptismal ceremony wherein a child is presented to God, and it implies a tradition that is passed on from generation to generation. Perhaps this is a cultural aspect of all witches’ covens, but it is presented in the letter as new information vital to the understanding of the Basque witches’ culture.

The Inquisition’s approach to its borderlands was methodical as they attempted to impose a standard judicial procedure throughout Spain’s territories. However, the reactions to the Spanish Inquisition ranged from an enthusiastic welcome, as in the Basque lands, to a more reluctant and repressed approach to the Inquisition’s presence in Sardinia, and finally to open rebellion in Sicily. The variations in reactions are surprising due to the similar methods in imposing the Inquisition in each area, but the diversity in region, as well as the vast differences in political and social histories before the advent of Spanish rule was the defining factor in the reception that the tribunals received in each region. As borderlands, there was always bound to be a higher rate of ethnic diversity in Sicily, Sardinia, and *el país vasco*, but my research reveals that this diversity, both ethnically and in religious beliefs—such as the tendency to allow witchcraft to thrive in the Basque lands—tended to create if not a rebellious at-

---

104 Ibid.,107.

105 Ibid.,109.

106 Ibid.,112.

titude among the populace, then at least a laxness in their approach to the Inquisition.

The other prong of this research was the type of heresies that the tribunals faced in dealing with their borderlands. For the most part, the heresies that the borderlands' tribunals faced were standard and followed the trends of the time; in Sicily, there was a linear progression from trying relapsed Jews to *moriscos* and then finally to moral offenses, just as on the mainland of Spain.<sup>107</sup> However, certain offenses were magnified beyond their occurrence in mainland Spain, such as the moral offense of quasi-materialism in Sicily, the hyper-vigilant policing of banned Protestant texts in Sardinia, and the extreme number of *moriscos* punished in Navarre and the Basque lands before their expulsion.

The offenses that were most common in each location, the research shows, closely correlate to the threats faced by the borderlands' physical positions, something that I had not expected upon beginning the research. Sicily, an island isolated entirely from mainland Spain and subject to the whims of Mediterranean travellers and invaders, created its own unique culture, which, apart from the sheer ethnic diversity of the island, contributed to the "foreignness" associated with it by Spanish Inquisitors. Sicily's isolation also created an environment primed for rebellion as its inhabitants chafed at living under Spanish rule.<sup>108</sup> Sardinia's location, on the other hand, as a hub between Spain, northern Italy, and France, promoted a different fear in the Spanish Inquisition: that of liberally-defined "Lutheranism" and the host of heresies that went along with it, as well as home-grown witchcraft among the peasants of the island.<sup>109</sup> With no armed rebellions as in Sicily, Sardinia's reaction to the Spanish Inquisition is much harder to gauge, but what we do see is the Spaniards' opinion that Sardinia was a backwards and poor island, with little to worry the *Suprema* other than the odd heretical text. The Basque lands, on the other hand, due to their position as a busy thoroughfare between French and Spanish territory, were unique in the sheer numbers of heretics found and prosecuted within their borders. Both *moriscos* and witches underwent periods of intense attention by the Spanish

107     Renda, *L'inquisizione in Sicilia*, 278.

108     Monter, *Frontiers of Heresy*, 173.

109     Pinna, *Storia di una strega*, 17.

tribunals, and the Inquisitors' approach to the trials often was overzealous, with arrests numbering in the hundreds and the Inquisition even overstepping its authority to prosecute foreigners who helped the fleeing *moriscos* within their borders.

At first glance, the borderlands of the Spanish Inquisition seem to be a homogenous group of islands and frontiers, with tribunals imposed upon them in much the same way that they were imposed on the rest of the Iberian Peninsula. In fact, these regions were each unique culturally, which in turn contributed to their disparate treatments under the Inquisition when it was brought to their borders. Sardinia, Sicily, and *el país vasco* were neither fully Spanish nor fully foreign during their time as Spanish territories (which for the Basque country has never ended). In studying the legacy left by Spanish rule on its frontiers, the full shape of the Spanish Inquisition, with its strengths and weaknesses, becomes visible.

### *Bibliography*

- Anatra, Bruno. "I conti dell'Inquisizione sarda nell'età di Carlo V." In *Sardegna, Spagna e Stati italiani*, edited by Bruno Anatra and Francesco Manconi, 425-432. Urbino: Comune di Villamar, 2001.
- Cardaillac, Louis. "El problema morisco en Sicilia." *Nueva Revista de Filología Hispánica* 30 (1981): 638-644.
- Deidda, Anna. "Cultura artistica in Sardegna nell'età di Carlo V." In *Sardegna, Spagna e Stati italiani*, edited by Bruno Anatra and Francesco Manconi, 457-468. Urbino: Comune di Villamar, 2001.
- Douglass, William A. *Amerikanuak: Basques In The New World*. Nevada: University of Nevada Press, 2005.
- Gifford, Douglas. "Witchcraft and the Problem of Evil in a Basque Village," *Folklore* 90 (1979): 15.
- Henningsen, Gustav. *The Salazar Documents: Inquisitor Alonso De*

*Salazar Frías and Others on the Basque Witch Persecution.*  
Leiden: Brill, 2004.

“La storia di Margherita Cherubina schiava turca rilasciata in persona al braccio secolare.” In *L’inquisizione in Sicilia: i fatti, le persone*, written by Francesco Renda, 373-375. Originally published in *libro 902, f. 118r, anno 1640*.

Montor, William. *Frontiers of Heresy*. Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 1990.

Moore, John C. “Pope Innocent III, Sardinia, and the Papal State.” In *Speculum* 62 (1987): 81-101.

Morales, Ana Isabel. “‘Father, I Accuse Myself’: Basque Women’s Self-Depiction in 17th Century Witchcraft Confessions.” *Lapurdum* 8 (2003): 359-373.

Pérez Escohotado, Javier. *Proceso inquisitorial contra el Bachiller Antonio de Medrano, Logrono, 1526-Calahorra, 1527*. Logroño: Instituto de Estudios Riojanos, 1988.

Pinna, Tomasino. *Storia di una strega: L’inquisizione in Sardegna: il processo di Julia Carta*. Sassari: EDES, 2000.

Renda, Francesco. *L’inquisizione in Sicilia: i fatti, le persone*. Palermo: Nuova Graphicadue, 1997.

Rossi, Vittorio. “Carlo V e l’inquisizione di Sicilia.” In *Sardegna, Spagna e Stati italiani*, edited by Bruno Anatra and Francesco Manconi, 415-424. Urbino: Comune di Villamar, 2001.

Rundine, Angelo. *Inquisizione Spagnola: Censura e libri proibiti in Sardegna nel ‘500 e ‘600*. Sassari: Università di Sassari, 1996.

Sgalambro, Giovanni and Reverend Bishop of Cefalù. “Edict of 1500.” In *The Former Jews of this Kingdom: Sicilian Converts after the Expulsion, 1492-1516*, written by Nadia Zel-

- des, 144-145. Leiden: Koninklijke Brill, 2003. Originally published by La Mantia, Biblioteca Comunale di Palermo.
- Selwyn, Jennifer D. *A Paradise Inhabited by Devils: The Jesuits' Civilizing Mission in Early Modern Naples*. Vermont: Ashgate Publishing Company, 2004.
- Venier, Piero. "Copia de una letera di sier Piero Venier, quondam sier Domenego, data im Palermo, a di 8 zugno, et ricevuta qui a di... luio 1511 drizata a soe sorele." In *The Former Jews of this Kingdom: Sicilian Converts after the Expulsion, 1492-1516*, written by Nadia Zeldes, 173-176. Originally published in Sanuto, *I Diarii*, 12:310-14.
- Vigiano, Valentina. "Politiche del 'centro' e ideologia cittadina nella Palermo di Carlo V." In *Sardegna, Spagna e Stati italiani*, edited by Bruno Anatra and Francesco Manconi, 289-306. Urbino: Comune di Villamar, 2001.
- Zeldes, Nadia. "The account books of the Spanish inquisition in Sicily (1500–1550) as a source for the study of material culture in a Mediterranean country." *Mediterranean Historical Review* 14 (1997): 67-94.
- Zeldes, Nadia. *The Former Jews of this Kingdom: Sicilian Converts after the Expulsion, 1492-1516*. Leiden: Koninklijke Brill, 2003.
- "I. Secta de brujos," in *The Salazar Documents*, written by Gustav Henningson. Leiden: Brill, 2004. Originally published in Lib. 835, 340r–v, 345r–350v.



Violence, Empire, and the Narration of Travel  
in *The World Encompassed*

Madeline Grimm

Until the seventeenth century, England lagged behind other European powers in exploration and colonialism abroad. English efforts to find the Northwest Passage and fishing expeditions in North America began in the late fifteenth century, however these journeys were inconsequential in comparison to the vast colonial holdings and navigational discoveries of Spain and Portugal. By the end of the sixteenth century, England was on a path to reverse this trend and counter Iberian hegemony over the oceans. English travelers began attacking Spanish and Portuguese ships and colonies, precipitating the build-up in hostilities that would result in the failed invasion of England by the Spanish Armada. Simultaneously, English writers, led by Richard Hakluyt, were inventing a heroic past for English travelers, framing travel as a noble and godly enterprise. Sir Francis Drake and *The World Encompassed* embodied these two trends in English travel abroad. Drake was charged by Queen Elizabeth I to advance English military and commercial interests. His extralegal attacks on the Spanish and the Portuguese would lead to labels of pirate and privateer. Despite his violent methods, Drake was portrayed in England as a national hero and his travels were seen as sanctioned by God. This image was encouraged through the expanding genre of travel literature. Published almost fifty years following the completion of Drake's most famous voyage, his circumnavigation of the globe, *The World Encompassed* described Drake as an intrepid and dynamic leader, traveling to increase the English empire and broaden knowledge about the rest of the world. *The World Encompassed* negotiated the complex boundaries of violence, benevolence, and commercial profit to promote a Protestant, Anglicized view of travel and English dominion over the world.

Sir Francis Drake's circumnavigation of the world was the culmination of several earlier voyages to the West Indies and the Spanish Main for the purpose of attacking Spanish and Portuguese colonial settlements. During the sixteenth century reign of Queen Elizabeth I, mounting tensions with Spain played out far from Europe. Drake's

career as a sailor began in voyages to the West Indies to destroy and steal from Spanish fortifications and ships. During his journey in 1572 to plunder Spanish holdings in Panama, Drake famously climbed a tall tree and became the first Englishman to see the Pacific Ocean.<sup>1</sup> This incident is commonly cited as Drake's moment of inspiration for circumnavigating the world, as he was, "'so vehemently transported with desire to navigate the sea, that falling down there on his knees, he implored with Divine assistance that he might, at some time or other, saile thither and make a perfect discovery of the same.'" <sup>2</sup> Despite this glorified image, Drake's eventual circumnavigation was more likely spurred by his skirmishes against the Spanish and Portuguese.<sup>3</sup>

Drake would be memorialized as an explorer and discoverer in accounts such as *The World Encompassed*; however, the immediate motivation for his voyage was to continue undeclared hostilities against Spain and Portugal abroad. For Drake, hatred of the Spanish stemmed from his early experiences in the West Indies and fit into an anti-Catholic worldview built on national pride.<sup>4</sup> His motivations for travel were martial, rather than exploratory. Drake's circumnavigation was not explicitly intended to expand English knowledge of the world, nor was it part of a publicized campaign. Despite a number of rumors, only Drake, his patron, Sir Francis Walsingham, and the queen were aware at the outset of the journey that Drake's intention was to travel along the coast of South America and plunder Spanish settlements. Drake's voyage occurred in an environment of secrecy and unofficial war, which would be reflected in accounts of his journey.

The first account of Drake's circumnavigation was published in Richard Hakluyt's *Principall Navigations, Voiages and Discoveries of the English Nation*, in which Hakluyt focused on first-person nar-

---

1        Boies Penrose, *Travel and Discovery in the Renaissance, 1420-1620* (New York: Atheneum, 1962), 229.

2        Sir Francis Drake, *The World Encompassed: Being his next Voyage to that to Nombre de Dios. Collated with an Unpublished Manuscript of Francis Fletcher, Chaplain to the Expedition*, ed. W. S. W. Vaux (London: Hakluyt Society, 1854), ix.

3        *Ibid.*, ii.

4        Penrose, *Travel and Discovery*, 226.

rative accounts and the diversity of English travel around the globe. Hakluyt was one of the first proponents of English travel literature as a genre and published his massive compilation of English travel accounts in 1589. Hakluyt's text emphasized the need for English exploration to advance English commercial and military interests abroad and fulfill a sense of national destiny. In his dedication to Walsingham, patron to both Hakluyt and Drake, Hakluyt describes travel as biblically ordained in the Psalms: "where I read, that they which go downe to the fea in fhyps, and occupy by the great waters, they see the works of Lord, and his wonders in the deepe."<sup>5</sup> This quote is repeated at the conclusion of *The World Encompassed*, as Drake remarks on, "seeing the wonders of the Lord in the deep, in discovering so many admirable things, in going through with so many strange adventures."<sup>6</sup> Similarly to Drake's revelation in Panama, the motivation to travel is portrayed by Hakluyt and Drake as a desire to gain knowledge and receive the divine. In his collection, Hakluyt focused on direct and eyewitness accounts, positioning the traveler as responsible for both making a journey and representing that journey to others.<sup>7</sup> *The World Encompassed* similarly narrated travel through a first-person perspective. The information communicated in the account was based on supposedly direct experience and observation, concealing how Drake, Francis Fletcher, and later Drake's nephew would manipulate the recording of travel for their own objectives.

In *Principall Nauigations*, Hakluyt chose to highlight Drake's discoveries on the coast of modern-day California and his descriptions of native peoples. Arguably, the similarities between the report in *Principall Nauigations* and *The World Encompassed* reflect that the authors used the same source material, although nearly forty years apart. *The World Encompassed* was based on the notes of Francis Fletcher, the chaplain on board the *Golden Hind*, therefore Hakluyt likely used Fletcher's log as well. Hakluyt chose to focus

---

5 Richard Hakluyt, *The principall nauigations, voyages and discoveries of the English nation* (George Bishop and Ralph Newberie: London, 1589), Early English Books Online, 2.

6 Drake, *The World Encompassed*, 155.

7 Peter Hulme and Tim Youngs, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Travel Writing* (Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 2002), 3.

on commercial possibilities within Fletcher's notes, indicating his editorial interest in economic profits. He summarized the journey across the Atlantic and through the Straits of Magellan, devoting the most space in the account to Drake's stop in the modern-day Bay of San Francisco. Hakluyt included details relating to interactions between the English travelers and the Native Americans, how the Native Americans built their homes, and the quality of the land, predicting: "There is no part of earth here to bee taken up, wherein there is not some probable shew of gold or silver."<sup>8</sup> By publishing narratives of English travel around the world, Hakluyt was arguing that England had a right to claim a global empire, comparable to Spain and Portugal.<sup>9</sup> Hakluyt was positioning Drake in a long history of English travelers and thereby elevating his voyage to godly tradition. Drake's discovery of the Californian coast established the theoretical right to an English colony, including both the natural and material benefits and the ability to evangelize the Native Americans, rather than allowing them to be catholicized by the Spanish.

Despite the promise of bounty and spreading English values in new lands, Hakluyt's account also reflected in part the violence and hostility fundamental to Drake's voyage. While sacking the port of Valparizo in South America, one of Drake's company verbally abused the Spaniard he was attacking: "one of our company called Thomas Moore began to lay about him, and stroke one of the Spanyards, and sayd unto him, Abaxo Perro, that is in English, Goe downe dogge."<sup>10</sup> This detail was omitted from *The World Encompassed*, demonstrating that the relationship between violence and travel was complex, particularly when reconciling Drake's position as a national hero and the inherent hostility of his journey.

---

8            Anthony Payne, "'Strange, remote and farre distant countreys': the travel books of Richard Hakluyt," in *Journeys through the Market: Travel, Travellers and the Book Trade*, ed. Robin Myers and Michael Harris (Oak Knoll Press, 1999), 123.

9            *Ibid.*, 17.

10          Richard Hakluyt, *The Principal Navigations, Voyages, Traffiques and Discoveries of the English Nation: Made by Sea or Over-land to the Remote and Farthest Distant Quarters of the Earth at any time within the compasse of these 1600 Yeeres* Vol. XI (New York: AMS Press INC., 1965), 113.

Drake and his crew likely viewed Spaniards as naturally inferior to the English. The primary object of the circumnavigation was attacking the Spanish, and gaining new information about the world was a secondary goal. For example, Pedro Sarmiento de Gamboa, in an account gathered from the inhabitants of Valparizo, described how Drake seized a sea chart from *La Capitana*, a ship in Valparizo's harbor.<sup>11</sup> This map was not intended to help Drake in navigating the coasts of modern-day Chile and Peru; rather, he used the chart to locate Spanish ports where treasure might be found.<sup>12</sup> Anti-Spanish aggression was fundamental to the purpose of Drake's voyage and had to be re-interpreted to fit into a narrative of Drake's heroism.

*The World Encompassed* balanced a chronicle of the circumnavigation and reflective lessons on travel, godliness, and the evils of the Spanish and Portuguese. After Hakluyt's publication of a summary in *Principall Navigations*, Samuel Purchas would publish an identical account of Drake's voyage in his expanded collection of travel accounts: *Purchas His Pilgrimage: or Relations of the World and the Religions observed in all Ages and Places discovered, from the Creation unto this Present*, published in 1613.<sup>13</sup> There was no complete account of Drake's journey in the literary marketplace until the publication of *The World Encompassed* in 1628. In this text, Drake's nephew used the notes of Francis Fletcher to extensively augment the accounts published by Hakluyt and Purchas.<sup>14</sup> The official cause of the delay in publication is not known, although the tight control of the English government over the information about Drake's voyage could have contributed to the wait. Fletcher's notes were carefully edited and in some cases details omitted if "considered by him as in some degree derogating from his uncle's memory,"

---

11 George Sanderlin, *The Sea-Dragon: Journals of Francis Drake's Voyage Around the World* (New York: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1969), 105.

12 *Ibid.*, 106.

13 Samuel Purchas, *Hakluytus Posthumus or Purchas His Pilgrimes: Contayning a History of the World in Sea Voyages and Lande Travells by Englishmen and others* Vol. II (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1905), 119.

14 Drake, *World Encompassed*, xi.

as described by a later editor of the text.<sup>15</sup> The selective editing of Fletcher's account was particularly salient in descriptions of violent or criminal acts committed by Drake and his crew. From the outset of *The World Encompassed*, Drake was presented as a national hero in the style of Jason from classical history: "that right rare and thrice worthy Captaine, *Francis Drake*, atcheiued, in first turning up a furrow about the whole world, doth not onely ouermatch the ancient Argonautes, but also outreacheth, in many respects, that noble mariner *Magellanus*."<sup>16</sup> Drake was described as the first to circle the globe, surpassing the Portuguese Magellan's earlier expedition because of the excellence of Drake's English voyage. Regardless of the elevation of Drake to the status of a classical hero, his nephew, also named Francis Drake, claimed to be telling a "true and whole history of that his voyage, with as great indifferency of affection as a history doth require."<sup>17</sup> Despite this claim of impartiality, Drake used *The World Encompassed* to create a narrative glorifying his uncle as a legend and travel as an essential national enterprise.

In *The World Encompassed*, Drake deflected the readers' attention from the violent details of Drake's voyage while simultaneously suggesting that robbing the Spanish of the profits from their colonies was justified by their brutal treatment of the native peoples. In *Principall Nauigations*, Hakluyt explicitly described Drake's extralegal acts against the Spanish, indicating either his comfort with crimes committed against national enemies or a dedication to preserving original accounts. At Valparizo, Hakluyt related how Drake's crew "rifled it, and came to a small chappell which wee entred, and found therein a silver chalice, two cruets, and one altar-cloth, the spoyle whereof our Generall gave to M. Fletcher his minister."<sup>18</sup> The detail of Fletcher receiving the stolen treasure of a church was not included in *The World Encompassed*. This account suggests Fletcher's complicity, despite his status as a preacher, in the violence of Drake's voyage. Fletcher may have justified these actions through the virulent anti-Catholic sentiment of Elizabethan England, or Drake's mission to

---

15 Ibid., xi.

16 Ibid., 6.

17 Ibid., 6.

18 Hakluyt, *Principal Navigations*, 114.

undermine the Spanish and Portuguese in their formerly protected positions on the Pacific. Drake's nephew downplayed any possible criminality in *The World Encompassed*, often using euphemisms to describe acts of theft and attack. For example, upon viewing a sleeping Spaniard surrounded by thirteen bars of silver, he described:

we would not (could wee haue chosen) haue awakened him of his nappe: but seeing we, against our wills, did him that injury, we freed him of his charge, which otherwise perhaps would haue kept him waking, and so left him to take out (if it pleased him) the other part of his sleepe in more security.<sup>19</sup>

Throughout the account, Drake elected to portray his uncle's crew as 'relieving' the Spanish of their spoils. This narrative strategy emphasized that Drake and his men were not committing illegal acts.

Drake's avoidance of violence did not extend to depictions of the Portuguese and the Native Americans, whose ferocity is often exaggerated for a moral lesson. Fletcher, and subsequently Drake, represented the Spanish and the Portuguese as brutal and godless, while their depictions of Native Americans ranged from savage cannibals to passive assistants. The Spanish and Portuguese served as the antagonists of the narrative, practicing brutal colonialism rather than the supposed benevolence of the English. The cruelty of the Spanish was credited as causing any violent acts on the part of the native inhabitants. In Patagonia, the Spanish "cruelties there vsed, haue made them more monstrous in minde and manners, then they are in body, and more inhospitable to deale with any strangers that shall come hereafter."<sup>20</sup> The Native Americans were represented as susceptible to the control and influence of Europeans, implying that the English could 'reform' them to better ways. When Native Americans attacked Drake's crew, Fletcher usually attributed the cause of the assault to the native peoples mistaking them for Spanish or Portuguese. In New Albion, the name Drake gave to the San Francisco Bay area, the Native Americans, who had previously never come in contact with Europeans, worshiped the English as gods and provide

---

19 Drake, *World Encompassed*, 105.

20 Ibid., 61.

them with full knowledge of their homes, the surrounding land, and their customs. Throughout the voyage, Drake's company relied on native peoples to trade for food and for knowledge of the landscape and navigation. In New Albion, the relationship was reversed, as described by Fletcher: "our Generall (of whom they made account as of a father) was faine to preforme the office of a father to them, relieuing them with such victualls as we had prouided for our selues, as Muscles, Seales, and such like."<sup>21</sup> The ideal exchange between the English and native peoples presented the Native Americans as providing the essential commercial knowledge and vital supplies to the English, while the English could offer their superior knowledge of philosophy and religion to better the Native Americans.

The dangers presented by the Native Americans and the Spanish in *The World Encompassed* suggest that exploration requires those who are committed to following English objectives and capable of any necessary actions. Drake's role as a privateer or pirate was never questioned in either *The World Encompassed* or *Principall Nauigations*. From the sixteenth century, English writers and politicians used Spanish and Portuguese brutality to justify English violence and opposition. This portrayal continued in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. For example, in *The History of the Bucaniers*, (1674), Alexandre Esquemeling suggested that: "'how...real soever may be the Accusations of our Bucaniers' Inhumanity and Barbarism...they are but meer Infants, meer Novices in Cruelty, in comparison of the Spaniards.'"<sup>22</sup> According to Drake and Walsingham, the magnitude of Spanish and Portuguese power required that all actions be taken to undercut their control and prevent Catholic dominance. Sir Francis Drake became an ideal of the capable and forceful captain. In his dedication to *Principall Nauigations*, Hakluyt remarked how he was inspired to learn of the "chieft Captaines at fea, the greateft Merchants, and the best Mariners of our nation."<sup>23</sup> Hakluyt encouraged the recognition of sailors as symbols of national glory. Drake's authority during the voyage was most strongly shown in the execution of Thomas Doughty, a high-ranking officer and gentleman in the company, for speaking mutinously and encouraging others to

---

21        Ibid., 131.

22        Hulme and Youngs, *Travel Writing*, 28.

23        Hakluyt, *The principall nauigations*, 2.

join him. Drake and Fletcher skimmed over Doughty's crimes and execution in their narratives, and Drake chose not to include Doughty's name in *The World Encompassed*.<sup>24</sup> Boies Penrose suggests that by executing an officer who would not comply with his command, Drake "established his authority once and for all, and established likewise a new tradition of naval discipline."<sup>25</sup> On an unofficially sanctioned mission that was inherently violent in its goals, Drake positioned himself in charge and created a model for English exploration and naval command. Drake's control over the course of and information about the circumnavigation was demonstrated in the writing and publication of *The World Encompassed*.

The editing of Francis Fletcher's travel account for publication in *The World Encompassed* suggests how information about travel was controlled and manipulated in order to establish credibility, extend certain knowledge gained from travel, and reflect on the position of England globally. Drake's nephew left no record of his edits to Fletcher's notes, while the existing manuscript copy of Fletcher's travel log only covered Drake's journey until their arrival in Patagonia.<sup>26</sup> In a comparison of the existing manuscript to the published text, Drake appears to have heavily summarized Fletcher's lengthy descriptions and simplified his language throughout *The World Encompassed*. There are several examples of omitting information or rephrasing. Counterintuitively, Fletcher's notes tended to be more dramatic and exuberant than Drake's final product. For instance, in narrating their time at the Island of Moucho on the western coast of South America, Fletcher described an incident in which the native inhabitants kidnapped two of Drake's men and, "working with knives upon their bodies, cut the flesh away by gubnets, and cast it up into the ayer, the which falleing downe, the people catched in their dancing, and like doggs devoured it in the most monstrous and unnatural manner."<sup>27</sup> Drake elected not to include this description of cannibalism in *The World Encompassed*, instead only noting that Drake's identity as an Englishman, not a Spaniard, "would rather haue been a patron to defend them, then any way an instrument of the least wrong

---

24 Drake, *World Encompassed*, xvii.

25 Penrose, *Travel and Discovery*, 231.

26 Drake, *World Encompassed*, xii.

27 *Ibid.*, 95.

that should haue beene done vnto them.”<sup>28</sup> Featuring an account of cannibalism could have drawn public attention to the text and confirmed the view that the Spanish were forcing Native Americans to commit the worst kinds of brutality. However, Drake was likely concerned about the perceived credibility of *The World Encompassed*. By using and preserving oral and written travel accounts, Richard Hakluyt emphasized the verity and importance of first-person narratives, which were perceived as the best means of gathering factual information about locations previously unknown to Europeans.<sup>29</sup> Travel writing as a genre claimed to rely on truthful accounts in order to assemble knowledge about the world and communicate that knowledge to those unable to make the same journeys. If the veracity of Drake’s account was doubted, Sir Francis Drake’s position as a heroic English explorer could be placed in jeopardy. Information about his travels was controlled and manipulated both during Drake’s voyage and within the account of his voyage in *The World Encompassed*.

Assembling commercial and geographical knowledge about the world to better exercise power was a central goal of Drake’s circumnavigation. At the time of the journey, most of South America and the Pacific were unvisited by the English, leaving the Portuguese and Spanish a monopoly on geographical and cultural information about these areas. In his log, Fletcher frequently commented on the discrepancies between the knowledge publicized by the Spanish and Portuguese and what Drake and his crew discovered during their voyage. The journey became a process of verifying data for the English and loosening Iberian control over information, enabling future English voyages. Fletcher reflected that by “following the directions of the common mapps of the Spanyards were utterly deceived, for of maitious purpose they had set forth the mapp false.”<sup>30</sup> Travel during the early modern world was a contest for knowledge for the purpose of commercial gain and imperial strategy. That information could be extracted by force in order to gain profit, as described by Nicolas Jorje, who was captured while on board a Spanish ship by Drake and claimed that Drake “took me with him by force... and threated to kill me many times... For he said that I had deceived him by not informing him that in the port of Arequipa there was a vessel

28        Ibid., 99.

29        Hulme and Youngs, *Travel Writing*, 22.

30        Drake, *World Encompassed*, 77.

laden with much silver.”<sup>31</sup> Knowledge was essential to travel and constantly modified. For example, Fletcher revised ancient theories in his notes, commenting that in the torrid zone, or the region surrounding the Equator, although “Aristoll, Pythagoras, Thales, and many others, both Greeks and Latins, have that *torrida zona* was not inhabitable for the exceeding heat and intolerable burneing reflection of the sonn,” he found this area to be full of natural life.<sup>32</sup> The data gathered by Drake and Fletcher during the voyage was intended to provide a more accurate geographical image of the world, improved understanding of different regions and cultures, and a foundation for future journeys.

In *The World Encompassed* and *Principall Nauigations*, Drake and Hakluyt attempted to communicate new knowledge, gained from local contacts and interactions, which could be of commercial importance to English investors and future explorers. Drake’s voyage fulfilled the military and mercantile intentions of Queen Elizabeth and his patrons. Beyond Drake’s secret task of raiding South America, investors charged him with searching for the Northwest Passage from the Atlantic to the Pacific and seeking out the Southern Continent, which the Spanish were looking for in the South Pacific.<sup>33</sup> Drake failed to discover either the Northwest Passage or a Southern Continent, however his journey up the coast of North America led to his landing in modern-day California, which both Drake and Hakluyt advertised as a “goodly country, and fruitfull soyle, stored with many lessings for the vse of man.”<sup>34</sup> In the competition for international trade routes, the English lagged far behind the Spanish and Portuguese, necessitating that Drake’s journey focus on new commercial possibilities.<sup>35</sup> In the East Indies, Drake used the shared enemy of the Portuguese to negotiate a trading agreement with the leader of Terenate, one of the Moluccas islands. Additionally, Fletcher described Drake’s encounter with a Chinese man in the East Indies, who suggested that if Drake were to visit China he would “carrie home the description of one of the most an-

---

31 Sanderlin, *Sea-Dragon*, 116.

32 Drake, *World Encompassed*, 27.

33 Penrose, *Travel and Discovery*, 229-230.

34 Drake, *World Encompassed*, 132.

35 Hulme and Youngs, *Travel Writing*, 18-19.

cient, mightiest, and richest kingdoms in the world.”<sup>36</sup> This interaction demonstrates how the information that Fletcher recorded and Drake published was dependent on local exchanges and relationships. At the conclusion of the Drake narrative in *Principall Navigations*, Hakluyt included a list of words, “of the naturall language of Java, learned and observed by our men there.”<sup>37</sup> Drake’s journey indicates how knowledge was gathered from locals and packaged for both commercial and exploration purposes. The information detailed by *The World Encompassed* was not neutral or unmediated.

Publishing accounts of Drake’s circumnavigation was intended to bring distant locations into the minds of the English as sites for colonialism, commercial extraction and evangelizing. Through *Principall Navigations*, Hakluyt attempted to spur English exploration and travel to amass a colonial empire equal to those of Spain and Portugal.<sup>38</sup> This massive collection of English travel literature would provide the foundational knowledge and justification for England to colonize the world. In some cases, this knowledge could be highly specific. Following the account taken from Fletcher’s notes, Hakluyt included a report from Edward Cliffe, who accompanied Drake on the circumnavigation. Cliffe’s report contained similar information as Fletcher’s, however Cliffe noted particular geographic and nautical directions from the voyage. For Hakluyt, gathering knowledge about the world met a definite nationalistic and expansionary purpose. Organizing both Cliffe and Fletcher’s logs chronologically provided the most explicit evidence for how to travel, what knowledge to gather and how to advance English interests. According to Drake, the veracity of their accounts was established by the action of traveling. He deflected criticism by suggesting: “wherein if any will not be satisfied, nor belieue the report of our experience and ey-sight, hee should be aduised to suspend his iudgement, till he haue either tried it himself by his owne truall.”<sup>39</sup> In *The World Encompassed*, Drake’s nephew worked to balance experiential information and a glorified portrayal of Drake. The circumnavigation marked the beginning of an age of expansion for the English em-

36 Drake, *World Encompassed*, 147.

37 Hakluyt, *Principal Navigations*, 132.

38 Paye, “Travel Books,” 17.

39 Drake, *World Encompassed*, 91.

pire.<sup>40</sup> *The World Encompassed* captured both an idealized image of Drake and how the English might impose their values on others.

The portrayal of Sir Francis Drake as a heroic and intrepid explorer was essential to the narrative of *The World Encompassed* and its message about the glory of English exploration. The opening paragraph of the text presented Drake as following a biblically ordained path: “Ever since Almighty God commanded Adam to subdue the earth, there have not wanted in all ages some heroicall spirits which, in obedience to that high mandate... have expanded their wealth, imployed their times, and adutentured their persons, to finde our the true circuit thereof.”<sup>41</sup> Discovery and exploration was connected both to gaining power and fulfilling a divine calling. Describing Drake as ‘encompassing the world’ implied that through this act he, and the English, had extended their control globally. Images and literary responses to the circumnavigation presented Drake as achieving mastery over the world through his travels.<sup>42</sup> In *The World Encompassed*, Drake acted as a representative of English sovereignty. In New Albion, Drake was ‘crowned’ by the native peoples, who, according to Fletcher, attempted to make Drake their king, by setting “the crowne vpon his head, inriched his necke with all their chaines, and offering vnto him many other things, honoured him by the name of *Hyoh*.”<sup>43</sup> Outside of England, Drake became the literal representation of Queen Elizabeth’s authority, and he accepted the deference of the Native Americans on her behalf. Drake claimed New Albion for the queen, as justified by the Native Americans accepting his sovereignty, and therefore, English sovereignty. Travel allowed for

---

40 Penrose, *Travel and Discovery*, 238.

41 Francis Drake, *The World Encompassed, Being his next Voyage to that to Nombre de Dios formerly imprinted; Carefully collected out of the Notes of Master Francis Fletcher, Preacher in this employment and divers others his followers in the same; Offered now at last to publique view, both for the honour of the actor, but especially for the stirring up of heroic spirits, to benefit their Countrie, and eternize their names by like noble attempts*. Special Collections Research Center. Swem Library, College of William and Mary. Williamsburg, VA. Relevant entry is G420 .D7 A3 1635.

42 Hulme and Youngs, *Travel Writings*, 18.

43 Drake, *World Encompassed*, 128.

the transmission of authority, but also the blurring of clear power structures. Drake was allowed to represent the queen because he was operating in a space ungoverned by Europeans. In this role, Drake expressed both English sovereignty and the English ideal of an Anglicized, Protestant world.

In *The World Encompassed*, Drake represented travel as capable of altering a disorderly world to fit the model of English cultural values and Protestantism. Drake and Fletcher manipulated their account to present the English as divinely guided and protected. The success of the voyage was perceived as a sign of God's favor and approval for the English, for "God, giuing men leaue to purpose, reserueth to himself the disposition of all things; making their intents of none effect, or changing their meanings oftimes cleane into the contrary, as may best serue for his owne glory and their profit."<sup>44</sup> For Drake, raised as a combative anti-Catholic, violence against the Spanish and Portuguese was sanctioned both by his government and by his religion.<sup>45</sup> Religion would become a point of conflict in the East Indies, when their ship ran aground on reef in shoals close to the island of Celebes. Fletcher apparently harbored doubts over the execution of Thomas Doughty and perceived this disaster as a sign of God's disapproval, preaching to the crew that God had condemned their mission. After the *Golden Hind* was free of the reef, Drake excommunicated Fletcher in an episode described in anonymous notes about the voyage: "Drake caused a poesy to be written and bound about Fletcher's arm, with charge that if he took it off he should then be hanged. The poesy was, 'Frances Fletcher, the falsest knave that liveth.'"<sup>46</sup> Fletcher's religious challenge was an attack on Drake's authority as captain and God's sanction for the voyage. This incident demonstrates the violent dimensions of Drake's Protestantism, and Fletcher's unclear position as a narrator who both praised Drake and apparently severely doubted him.

In his notes, Fletcher argued that evangelizing native peoples was an essential component for establishing English hegemony and chal

---

44 Ibid., 82.

45 Penrose, *Travel and Discovery*, 226.

46 Sanderlin, *Sea-Dragon*, 201.

lenging Iberian power. Fletcher directly attributed the evil influence of the Spanish and Portuguese on Native Americans to Catholicism, positioning Protestantism as capable of saving them from brutality and violence. In New Albion, Protestantism supposedly reformed the Native Americans from their ‘savage’ cultural traditions. The Native Americans had prepared sacrifices to mourn the departure of Drake’s crew, in response the crew, “fell to prayers and singing of Psalmes, whereby they were allured immediately to forget their folly, and leaue their sacrifice vnconsumed.”<sup>47</sup> According to this account, Protestantism had a transformative power to ‘better’ the native peoples. In reality, the Native Americans likely believed that they were exchanging ceremonial performances with the English, not ascribing to any new religion.<sup>48</sup> The imposition of religion allowed Drake’s crew to view themselves as doing the work of God, rather than as pirates or thieves. Through interactions with Native Americans, which were then published for readers in England, Drake created a template for how to travel based on English goals and how to intervene in the non-European world to create conformity to these goals. *The World Encompassed* encapsulated the type of travel the English were hoping to accomplish and the world they wanted to create, built on Anglican, Protestant principles.

Circumnavigation involved both circling the world and opening the world to further English exploration, trade, and knowledge procurement. This process was not peaceful, built on free exchange or a steady progression of information. The gathering of knowledge depended on a range of previously written accounts, local interactions, and observations. The information was then corrected, edited, and altered for publication. In practice, assembling knowledge was predicated on violence and the belief in the right of England to control and reform the world. *The World Encompassed* articulated the vision of English imperialism and cultural dominance that would define English foreign policy until the end of the twentieth century. Drake’s circumnavigation of the globe was inspired by commercial gain and international competition. His voyage was intended to un-

---

47 Drake, *World Encompassed*, 138.

48 Robert F. Heizer, “Francis Drake and the California Indians,” in *American Archaeology and Ethnology*, ed. Ralph L. Beals et al. Vol. XLII (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1951), 264.

dermine Spanish and Portuguese power in the Pacific. In *The World Encompassed*, this journey was redefined as an extension of English benevolence, revenging the Native Americans against the Spanish and Portuguese and offering these peoples a chance for English patronage. Therefore, the narrative reflects the layers of control and coercion operating in travel. Drake's voyage existed in multiple environments and was affected by many motivations and actors. However, in its publication, his travels were presented as furthering specific national objectives, developed in a context of international competition and war. The intersection of ideology and reality during Drake's travels led to several paradoxes, such as a supposedly Christian mission whose mechanism was theft and violence. The success of Drake's voyage and the importance of the commercial and military information in Fletcher's logs necessitated that Fletcher's account be sanitized and edited for publication, as information was again manipulated for maximum ideological gain. Drake's circumnavigation reflected the violent, informational, and monetary possibilities of travel, and how travel could propagate a set of English cultural values and a national narrative.

### *Bibliography*

- Drake, Sir Francis. *The World Encompassed, Being his next Voyage to that to Nombre de Dios formerly imprinted; Carefully collected out of the Notes of Master Francis Fletcher, Preacher in this employment and divers others his followers in the same; Offered now at last to publique view, both for the honour of the actor, but especially for the stirring up of heroic spirits, to benefit their Countrie, and eternize their names by like noble attempts*. Special Collections Research Center. Swem Library, College of William and Mary. Williamsburg, VA. Relevant entry is G420 .D7 A3 1635.
- Drake, Sir Francis. *The World Encompassed: Being his next Voyage to that to Nombre de Dios. Collated with an Unpublished Manuscript of Francis Fletcher, Chaptain to the Expedition*. Edited by W. S. W. Vaux. London: Hakluyt Society, 1854.

- Hakluyt, Richard. *The principall nauigations, voiages and discoveries of the English nation*. George Bishop and Ralph Newberie: London, 1589. Early English Books Online.
- Hakluyt, Richard. *The Principal Navigations, Voyages, Traffiques and Discoveries of the English Nation: Made by Sea or Over-land to the Remote and Farthest Distant Quarters of the Earth at any time within the compasse of these 1600 Yeeres*. Vol. XI. New York: AMS Press INC., 1965.
- Heizer, Robert F. "Francis Drake and the California Indians." In *American Archaeology and Ethnology*, edited by Ralph L. Beals, Harry Hoijer, Franklin Fearing, G. W. Brainerd, J. B. Birdsell, and W. R. Goldschmidt, Vol. XLII, 251-302. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1951.
- Hulme, Peter and Youngs, Tim, ed. *The Cambridge Companion to Travel Writing*. Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 2002.
- Payne, Anthony. "Strange, remote and farre distant countreys: the travel books of Richard Hakluyt." In *Journeys through the Market: Travel, Travellers and the Book Trade*, edited by Robin Myers and Michael Harris, 1-37. Oak Knoll Press, 1999.
- Penrose, Boise. *Travel and Discovery in the Renaissance, 1420-1620*. New York: Atheneum, 1962.
- Purchas, Samuel. *Hakluytus Posthumus or Purchas His Pilgrimes: Contayning a History of the World in Sea Voyages and Lande Travells by Englishmen and others*. Vol. II. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1905.
- Sanderlin, George. *The Sea-Dragon: Journals of Francis Drake's Voyage Around the World*. New York: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1969.



## Burdened by Excellence

### Rahel Varnhagen's Struggle

*Mary Andino*

German Jews at the turn of the 18<sup>th</sup> century faced a complex world of conditional and limited acceptance. Rahel Varnhagen experienced an added level of difficulty as a female Jew. From a moderately wealthy background, Varnhagen grew to run two influential salons in Berlin, interacting with intellectual and societal elites. Her writings demonstrate her inner struggle with her identity and her outer struggle with social norms. Her experiences and perceptions caused her to turn away from Judaism, while her feeling of social isolation led her to create her salons. Public reception appropriated and displayed her as an example of proper female behavior, indicating societal values about women. As an “exceptional” woman, Varnhagen recognized her uniqueness, but also struggled to accept its consequences for herself and women as a whole. Ultimately, Varnhagen presented herself as an empowered woman within the constraints of her time.

In her letters, Varnhagen promoted female independence. She was born Rahel Levin in Berlin in 1771 and spent most of her life there. Her first salon ran from 1789 to 1806 and her second ran from 1819 to her death in 1833.<sup>1</sup> She saw herself as an influential supporter of German salon culture.<sup>2</sup> Most other female salonnières, like Henrietta Herz and Dorothea Schlegel, married influential men.<sup>3</sup> Varnhagen felt societally isolated throughout her life as a single woman; she did not marry until 1814 at the age of forty-three.<sup>4</sup> Varnhagen reacted against this pressure to be dependent and urged a friend not to be “a homey little wife, caressing and kissing your husband.”<sup>5</sup> Varnhagen did not explicitly oppose marriage, as she did eventually enter into a happy, long lasting one, but was against the confinement of women

---

1 Jeannine Blackwell and Susanne Zantop, ed., *Bitter Healing: German Women Writers* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1990), 405.

2 Ibid., 404.

3 Ibid., 297.

4 Ibid., 405.

5 Ibid., 412.

to solely to domestic responsibilities. Varnhagen stated that women had to actively pursue knowledge because they did not gain the sense of progress that men derived from their professions.<sup>6</sup> In a letter to her sister she stated, “It’s ignorance of human nature when people imagine our intellect to be different...and that we could live, for example, totally off the lives of our husbands or sons.”<sup>7</sup> Varnhagen argued for equality of the mind, which justified her and other women’s involvement in the intellectual centers of the salons. She encouraged women to find their intellectual purpose outside male influence.

Due to her background and the culture of the time, Varnhagen believed women’s minds were their source of strength. She stated, “Anyone who can reason...has the power.”<sup>8</sup> Varnhagen thus empowered women; even if they were under the control of their fathers or husbands, as long as they could think, they could have influence. She defined an educated person as someone who “uses his talents benevolently...in the highest manner...this is a duty and not a gift.”<sup>9</sup> Thus, her definition of “educated” could apply to anyone, regardless of gender. In *Rahel Levin Varnhagen*, a biographical analysis, Heidi Tewardson states that Jewish girls would have learned domestic tasks, literacy, and a few languages, but that “formal education for girls, however, was still out of the question.”<sup>10</sup> Varnhagen had a similarly limited education and her broad use of the term “educated” legitimized the female presence in the salons. Her expansive definition of “educated” included all classes, which was likely due to her economic status. While she came from a relatively wealthy family, after her father died she was financially insecure and dependent on her brother for support.<sup>11</sup> Varnhagen advocated for women’s academic aptitude in the face of their limited education.

In addition to supporting female intellectual capability, Varnhagen

---

6        Blackwell, *Bitter Healing*, 415.

7        Ibid., 415.

8        Ibid., 411.

9        Ibid., 411.

10       Heidi Tewardson, *Rahel Levin Varnhagen* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1998), 24.

11       Hannah Arendt, *Rahel Varnhagen*, ed. Liliane Weissberg (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997), 87.

herself attempted to gain autonomy. She declared, “No one can comfort me: no such wise man exists: I am my own comfort; now that’s still good fortune!”<sup>12</sup> Margaret Daley, in her study of female writers, *Women of Letters*, states that Varnhagen broke off two engagements with upper class Christian men.<sup>13</sup> Perhaps a lack of stable male support in her life due to the death of her father, dismissal by her brothers, and failure with lovers, caused her to withdraw from relationships and rely on herself. In response to men who failed to commit to her, she asserted, “That is *not* enough for me. *Not anymore*. Whomever I love must want to live with me; stay with me.”<sup>14</sup> Members of salons, especially men, were often transient, coming and going. Varnhagen likely grew tired of these types of men who saw her as praise-worthy, but due to her social status or Jewishness, eventually left. Daley states that in response to these experiences, Varnhagen took steps to become independent, including moving into her own apartment and publishing her first work.<sup>15</sup> Due to her position as an outsider, Varnhagen championed female independence.

Although she believed in women’s ability, Varnhagen also recognized the consequences of such agency, revealing the societal limitations women faced. She maintained, “We exist at the margins of human society. For us there is no place, no office, no vain title.”<sup>16</sup> As an unmarried salonniere, Varnhagen certainly was a rare woman who did not fit within the societal frame of female dependency and domesticity. Writing to a similarly minded female friend, Varnhagen explained the effect of their empowerment, “We are shut of society, you because you insulted it... I, because I can’t sin and *tell lies* with it.”<sup>17</sup> In her study of Varnhagen, Hannah Arendt argues that Varnhagen saw herself as special and was constantly trying to come to terms with this in her complex world.<sup>18</sup> Varnhagen recognized that society would condemn any step she took towards independence or auton-

---

12 Blackwell, *Bitter Healing*, 409.

13 Margaret Daley, *Women of Letters* (Columbia: Camden House, 1998), 49.

14 Blackwell, *Bitter Healing*, 414.

15 Daley, *Women*, 51.

16 Blackwell, *Bitter Healing*, 412.

17 *Ibid.*, 412.

18 Arendt, *Rahel*, 81.

omy. She stated, “According to applauded convention they (women) have no room for their own feet, they must put them wherever the husband just stood or wants to stand.”<sup>19</sup> She further maintained that any time a woman deviated from male control, society deemed it “frivolity, or... punishable behavior.”<sup>20</sup> Varnhagen realized the complexities of her role in society, and that although her influence brought personal satisfaction, it conflicted with societal norms. She knew that most women, due to a lack of economic or social independence, could not defy convention like herself.

While Varnhagen’s personal experiences reflected her struggle with autonomy, they also prompted her turn away from Judaism. She described her loathing for pedantry, or slavery to established rules, maintaining it “is proud, and boasts of its emptiness, from utter ignorance of anything substantial.”<sup>21</sup> She further stated that the worst kind of pedantry was “pharisaical morality,” or blindly following strict religious and moral law.<sup>22</sup> As someone who valued her independence and failed to fit in, Varnhagen disliked those who easily functioned in society by obeying its dictates without question. Additionally, Arendt explains that in terms of Judaism, Varnhagen “learned nothing, neither her own history nor that of the country in which her family dwelt.”<sup>23</sup> She witnessed Jewish customs, but like many other contemporary Jews, was not taught the religiosity or deeper meaning behind them.<sup>24</sup> This deficient education stemmed from the secular influence of Haskalah and the upper middle class Jews’ focus on assimilation. Her lack of knowledge and understanding of Judaism caused her to see it as a type of false “pharisaical morality.” The effects of her Jewish background influenced her conversion to Protestantism and rejection of Judaism. She maintained, “I can trace every

---

19 Blackwell, *Bitter Healing*, 415.

20 Ibid., 415.

21 “Stray Thoughts: From the German of Rahel Levin,” *The New Yorker* (1836-1841), May 8, 1841, 114. American Periodicals.

22 Ibid.

23 Arendt, *Rahel*, 86.

24 Ibid., 86.

evil, every misfortune, every annoyance back to,” being a Jewess.<sup>25</sup> Already limited by her gender, for Varnhagen, Judaism was another source of inferiority. She compared herself to a cripple, who people ignored and considered ugly.<sup>26</sup> Daley argues that Varnhagen recognized that people used her Jewishness to exclude her from the salon culture she was such an integral part of. Often her guests would not invite her to their salons because of her background, or would refer to her with sexist and Anti-Semitic language.<sup>27</sup> She felt extraordinary pressure, “magnified by her condition as a Jewish woman, an outsider in contemporary German society,” to overcome this prejudice.<sup>28</sup> Due to her shallow understanding of Judaism and the discrimination she encountered, she turned to a more personally defined morality. She stated, “Can any philosophy, any thinking bring us beyond ourselves? We must...yield ourselves up to a personal God.”<sup>29</sup> Varnhagen thought that belief should come from each individual’s own moral nature. Her sense of personal autonomy clashed with Judaism’s strictness, a religion she saw as empty and one that had scarred her for life.

Varnhagen’s identity as a female Jew also caused her to feel conflicted and divided, which in turn prompted her involvement in the salons. She felt excluded in society due to her gender, stating that it was unescapable.<sup>30</sup> Arendt maintains that “beauty in a woman can mean power, and Jewish girls were frequently not married for their dowries alone.”<sup>31</sup> Other Jewish salon women, like Henrietta Herz, gained fame and respect for their beauty.<sup>32</sup> Varnhagen, on the other hand, saw herself as plain, stating, “I regret all the beauty that one

---

25 Ritchie Robertson, ed., *The German Jewish Dialogue* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), 61.

26 Ibid., 61.

27 Daley, *Women*, 46.

28 Ibid., 46.

29 “Stray Thoughts: From the German of Rahel Levin,” *The New Yorker* (1836-1841), May 8, 1841, 114. American Periodicals.

30 Robertson, *Dialogue*, 62.

31 Arendt, *Rahel*, 87.

32 Blackwell, *Bitter Healing*, 297.

lacks when one thinks one has taste.”<sup>33</sup> Arendt affirms that she was aware that others saw her as inferior because of her appearance.<sup>34</sup> For Varnhagen, not only did she face the obstacles of her gender, background, and economic status, but she lacked one of the few weapons available to women: beauty. Varnhagen also struggled with her Jewish identity, stating, “I’ll never quite grasp that I’m... a Jewess, since I haven’t realized it after long years spent thinking about it, I’ll never really know it... that’s why I’m still alive.”<sup>35</sup> Had she truly to come to terms with her Judaism, Varnhagen believed it would have been her destruction, as she would have lost all hope. Tewarson maintains that “although... all of her difficulties seemed to crystallize in the fact that she was a ‘Jewess,’ Rahel was still reluctant to admit to herself the extent to which this stood in the way of her acceptance.”<sup>36</sup> Due to the rise in German nationalism in the 1790s, Varnhagen felt more and more isolated. She believed, “Everything is different. Never was I so alone. Absolutely.”<sup>37</sup> Her deep seated inferiority as a Jewess caused her to turn inwards, and she wrote heavily introspective letters.<sup>38</sup> Her role in the salons was perhaps also an effort to come to terms with herself as a Jewess. By inviting people to her salon, she made connections and friendships, which could remedy her isolation. Furthermore, Daley argues that she was very focused on herself and used letters to friends as a way to discern her identity.<sup>39</sup> Daley states that in her letters, “She subverts or silences her partners’ response and converts the theme of friendship into speculation of herself.”<sup>40</sup> In addition to providing connection and support, the friendships she acquired in the salons gave her an outlet to express her struggles and inferiority. Varnhagen’s involvement in the German salons partly grew from a need to understand her identity as a Jewess. The salons

---

33        Robertson, *Dialogue*, 59.

34        Arendt, *Rahel*, 87.

35        Robertson, *Dialogue*, 58.

36        Tewarson, *Rahel*, 102.

37        *Ibid.*, 93.

38        *Ibid.*, 81.

39        Daley, *Women*, 66.

40        *Ibid.*, 66.

allowed her influence and freedom, but also reminded her of her demarcation as “exceptional” and different.

While Varnhagen struggled with self-perception, her public reception illustrates the societal context under which women functioned. Varnhagen always felt pressure as an exceptional woman and a Jew; she understood her special qualities, but also questioned them. She shied away from the expectations that came with exceptionalism,<sup>41</sup> yet, ironically, about thirty years after her death, newspapers portrayed her as just that: exceptional. *The Pall Mall Gazette* stated, “She exerted an uncommon influence on the intellectual life of her age. Without wealth, without beauty...she excited the admiration or won the love of such men.”<sup>42</sup> They showed her as remarkable, given all her faults, and indicated that they did not expect any more Rahel Varnhagens in the future who could overcome their limitations as women. Critics also tried to downplay her influence by showing her as unreasonable or emotional, when rationalism was a key component of Varnhagen’s self-concept. They viewed her focus on herself as a “morbid introspectiveness” that harmed her development.<sup>43</sup> *The Preston Guardian* mocked her demand not to be interred until thirty years after her death, comparing her to a woman in a Greek myth who made a similar request. The paper stated, “Ages pass, but human hearts remain the same...all the wit and philosophy of Goethe’s brilliant time did not steel Rahel Levin...against the same feeling of dread and lethal loneliness.”<sup>44</sup> The paper utilized this one odd moment of behavior as an example of female irrationality and Varnhagen’s inability to reason. Critics also saw her as a way to promote proper female behavior. *The Ladies Repository* described her as “all embosomed in an atmosphere of goodness and benevolence; all guided by an energetic sense of duty, and heightened by a noble

---

41 Arendt, *Rahel*, 81.

42 “Rahel,” *The Pall Mall Gazette*, November 10, 1876. 19<sup>th</sup> Century British Newspapers.

43 Ibid.

44 “Literary Selections,” *The Preston Guardian*, October 23, 1869. 19<sup>th</sup> Century British Newspapers.

self-forgetfulness in the presence of the joys and griefs of others.”<sup>45</sup> While these are all positive traits, they are also all traits society exclusively desired of women. The article further stated, “she strikingly possessed the best traits of her sex- purity, tenderness, modesty, patience, and self-sacrifice.”<sup>46</sup> Thus, critics imposed characteristics on Varnhagen that she may or may not have possessed, in a desire to make her a model to other women. The documents also reveal that Varnhagen’s struggle with her Judaism was grounded in reality. *The Ladies Repository* maintained, “We must remember that hers was a mind for a large part...groping in the darkness of Judaism. If Christ had but the center and source of her illumination, what light would have shone upon (her)!”<sup>47</sup> Even though Varnhagen converted to Protestantism, her inherent Jewishness clearly still marked her as somehow inferior both for herself and others. Although Jews were assimilating and advancing into German society, they still faced prejudices and limitations.<sup>48</sup> Overall, the public reception of Varnhagen indicates the real obstacles she and other women encountered.

Varnhagen was seen as a remarkable woman, and struggled with the burden of exceptionality. She embodied the image of an empowered woman, but recognized the limits of her autonomy. Her experiences and difficulties caused her to resist her Jewish roots and led to her involvement in the salons. The public interpreted her in almost the opposite way of how she saw herself, using her to demonstrate proper female behavior. The public view of Varnhagen reveals often how society combats those that threaten its norms and traditional values. Like Varnhagen, other influential women, such as Christine de Pizan or Margaret Cavendish, were marked as “exceptional.” Rather than focusing on their accomplishments, society transformed these women into beacons of virtue and morality, without individuality. Ironically, these women became ways to reinforce the very societal norms they challenged.

---

45        “Rahel Levin,” *The Ladies’ Repository: a Monthly Periodical, Devoted to Literature, Art and Religion (1849-1876)*, June 1879, 429. American Periodicals.

46        Ibid., 429.

47        Ibid., 429.

48        Tewarson, *Rahel*, 145.

*Bibliography*

Ardent, Hannah. Rahel Varnhagen. Edited by Liliane Weissberg. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997.

Blackwell, Jeannine and Susanne Zantop, ed. Bitter Healing: German Women Writers. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1990.

Daley, Margaret. Women of Letters. Columbia: Camden House, 1998.

“Literary Selections.” The Preston Guardian, October 23, 1869. 19th Century British Newspapers.

“Rahel.” The Pall Mall Gazette, November 10, 1876. 19th Century British Newspapers.

“Rahel Levin.” The Ladies’ Repository: a Monthly Periodical, Devoted to Literature, Art and Religion (1849-1876), June 1879. American Periodicals.

Robertson, Ritchie, ed. The German Jewish Dialogue. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.

“Stray Thoughts: From the German of Rahel Levin.” The New Yorker (1836-1841), May 8, 1841. American Periodicals.

Tewarson, Heidi. Rahel Levin Varnhagen. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1998.



The Yugoslav Campaign for Trieste  
 A Case of Divergent Ideals and Actions  
*Justin Williams*

**Introduction**

Located in the northwest corner of the Istrian Peninsula, Trieste and its hinterland mark an invisible borderland of Italian and Slavic cultures. In the aftermath of World War II, Trieste stood stateless, the city's future dependent upon international arbitration. Trieste was both a local-level dispute between Italy and Yugoslavia for control of the city and a critical battleground for the emerging bipolar political alignment of Europe. With Great Britain, the United States, and the Soviet Union all having a major political stake in the area, the contestation between the Yugoslav and Italian states over Trieste and the Istrian Peninsula is most commonly viewed "through the lens of an emerging Cold War discourse."<sup>1</sup> However, the campaign for control of Trieste did not suppose a Europe hopelessly divided between "Communist" and "Capitalist" states. The Yugoslav government did not appeal to Moscow to gain control of the city, but rather to the western Anglo-American states. Through its propaganda campaigns, the Yugoslav government used population politics to stress the idea of a nation's right to self-determination, thereby attempting to bridge the European political divide. Through the employment of this strategy, Yugoslavia sought to gain increased sympathy and Western international approval for its annexation of Trieste and Istria as a whole.

Trieste's story contests widely held notions about the static nature of postwar Europe. Winston Churchill's famous "Sinews of Peace" address in 1946 declaring that Belgrade and its population lay "in what I must call the Soviet sphere" behind the "Iron Curtain" occurred years before the Trieste dispute was settled.<sup>2</sup> Despite Churchill's assessment, Yugoslav leaders did not con-

1 Ballinger, *History In Exile: Memory and Identity at the Borders of the Balkans*, 78.

2 Winston Churchill, March 5<sup>th</sup>, 1946, "Sinews of Peace", NATO Online Library, [http://www.nato.int/docu/speech/1946/s460305a\\_e.htm](http://www.nato.int/docu/speech/1946/s460305a_e.htm).

sider themselves irrevocably beholden to the Soviet Union or cut off from the West. They actively attempted to sway the outcome of the Trieste dispute by connecting Yugoslav nationalism to the purported ideals of the liberal democracies and, when convenient, distanced themselves from other communist states.

In 1948, the Tito-Stalin split became official with Yugoslavia's expulsion from the Cominform, or Communist Information Bureau, which organized Communist parties under Soviet influence with directives from Moscow.<sup>3</sup> The split was immensely significant because it freed Yugoslavia from carrying Soviet foreign policy objectives. Without Joseph Stalin's shadow over Yugoslavia, its leader Josip Broz Tito and his associates could uninhibitedly act in what they saw as the best interest of the Yugoslav state. For Yugoslav leaders, annexing the Istrian Peninsula and Trieste was of paramount importance to the national agenda, despite Stalin's vocal opposition. Therefore, after the split Yugoslavia operated on a chiefly nationalist platform with communist underpinnings. Using nationalism as a bridge, Tito sought to link the Yugoslav version of communism with liberal democracy thereby ideologically separating Yugoslavia from the Soviet Bloc. Through this ideological separation the Yugoslav government attempted to win Western approval and realize its goal of annexing Trieste and the Istrian Peninsula.

In 1947, the Italian-Yugoslav Peace Treaty resulted in the creation of The Free Territory of Trieste, which was partitioned into two zones.<sup>4</sup> British and American forces administered Zone A, while the Yugoslav National Army administered Zone B.<sup>5</sup> However, this treaty only offered a temporary solution to the question of whether The Free Territory of Trieste would become Italian or Yugoslav. Considering the emergence of the Cold War and the British and American occupation of Zone A in the early 1950s, the Yugoslav government realized that without the sympathy of the Western international community, Trieste and most of Istria could easily end up in Italian hands.

---

3        Ivo Banac, *With Stalin Against Tito: Cominformists Splits in Yugoslav Communism* (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1988), ix.

4        *Encyclopædia Britannica Online*, s. v. "Free Territory of Trieste," accessed March 17, 2014, <http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/749532/Free-Territory-of-Trieste>.

5        *Ibid.*, "Free Territory of Trieste."

Although they would not have physical control of Istria and Trieste, Great Britain, the Soviet Union, and the United States all had a stake in whether Italy or Yugoslavia was to be awarded the territory because of their respective foreign policy stances. Britain desired to maintain its “imperial lifeline through Suez” and strengthen its position relative to the Soviet Union.<sup>6</sup> The Soviet Union wanted to prevent a third world war and teach Marshall Tito a lesson for acting on Yugoslav irredentist desires rather than listening to Stalin’s directives.<sup>7</sup> And the United States wished to have hands-on economic and political influence in the region through the creation of a loyal client state in order to exert maximum control over the western half of Europe. With Belgrade and Moscow on turbulent terms and Italy positioning itself to aid Western international interests, Yugoslavia faced an uphill battle in annexing both the Istrian Peninsula and Trieste.

Recognizing the influence of power politics and foreign agendas in determining the outcome of the dispute, the Yugoslav government sought to gain Western sympathizers through producing works of propaganda to convince international audiences to see the issue from its perspective and support its effort to absorb the area into Yugoslavia. This appeal was not to the Western governments themselves, but rather to the people of the democratic states in an attempt to spur a grassroots level campaign to alter the Western powers’ foreign policy stances. Knowing that Great Britain and the United States sought to establish an Italian puppet state, Belgrade solicited sympathy through stressing the need for self-determination and government by consent in Trieste and the Istrian Peninsula. In connecting its plight to supposed democratic ideals, the Yugoslav government could then construe Trieste’s incorporation into an Italian puppet state as the Western powers’ renegeing on their values.

Yugoslav propaganda works published from 1945 to 1953 provide insight into how the Yugoslav government framed its arguments about Trieste to an international audience. These arguments for a Yugoslav Istrian Peninsula can be broken down into three interrelated categories: Yugoslavia’s acceptance of multi-ethnic peoples; the need

6 Richard DiNardo, “Glimpse of an Old World Order? Reconsidering the Trieste Crisis of 1945,” *Oxford Journals: Diplomatic History* 21 (1997): 368, 379, accessed April 16, 2014, <http://dh.oxfordjournals.org/content/21/3/365.short>.

7 Ibid., 377.

to punish Italy for its discriminatory policies towards Slavs before and during World War II; and the indisputable connection between Trieste and its hinterland's historical Slaviness and economic success.<sup>8</sup> Equally important to these arguments is the information the propaganda chose to omit, including Yugoslav-led atrocities against the Italian population of the area. Ultimately, the Yugoslav government's propaganda framed its arguments around the Slavic make-up of Istria and the population's right to self-determination in order to validate its annexation attempt in the eyes of the Western powers.

### Propaganda

Yugoslav propaganda first stressed the state's success in supporting minority communities in order to justify its annexation of Trieste. Government documents underscored the fact that nearly the entire Italian minority of Yugoslavia lived almost exclusively in towns within Istria, while the Slavs made up the vast majority of the surrounding countryside.<sup>9</sup> Throughout its propaganda, the Yugoslav government emphasized the fact that its minorities received indispensable government aid in the crucial fight against backwardness. Thanks to the creation of "cultural and educational societies, libraries, and reading rooms, people's universities" in conjunction with "radio, the press, and publishing activity," minorities could enhance their cultural aptitude.<sup>10</sup> For example, according to the propaganda, Shqiptars, or Albanians, living in Yugoslavia were 73.73% illiterate based upon 1948 census data, but by 1952 approximately 175,000 had learned to read thanks to the Yugoslav government's creation of literacy courses in the Shqiptars' own language.<sup>11</sup> To further Hungarian cultural growth, the government helped cultivate 120 cultural and educational societies, 86 libraries, and even 174 orchestras for Hungarians in Yugoslavia as of 1950.<sup>12</sup> This data attempted to convince

---

8            For more on the Yugoslav perspective on Trieste, see Gabrovšek, *Yugoslavia's Frontiers with Italy: (Trieste and its hinterland)*; Sedmak and Mejak, *Trieste; the problem which agitates the world*; Stojković, *National Minorities in Yugoslavia*.

9            Stojković, *National Minorities in Yugoslavia*, 24-25.

10          Ibid., 144-145.

11          Ibid., 124-125.

12          Ibid., 145.

Western powers that because the Yugoslav government enhanced its minorities' education and societal position its annexation of Trieste and the Istrian Peninsula was well grounded.

The minority argument that the propaganda made is particularly intriguing when considering Yugoslavia's standing as a state socialist entity. In theory, classifications such as "minority" should be eliminated within civil society in a socialist state. If everyone has the same rights, beliefs, and access to physical goods, then the government should theoretically view them all exactly the same. Yet, clearly this is not the case with Yugoslavia because its government used acculturation of minorities as an argument to attempt to fulfill its nationalist agenda of annexing both Istria as a whole and Trieste.

However, upon closer scrutiny, Yugoslavia's acculturation of minorities reflected Vladimir Lenin's Affirmative Action strategy, formulated after the Bolshevik Revolution in the Soviet Union, which was "aimed at disarming nationalism by granting what were called the 'forms' of nationhood."<sup>13</sup> Therefore, although it may appear to Westerners that the Yugoslav government simply treated its minorities well, the government actually attempted to enhance Yugoslav nationalism among the minority groups through providing opportunities for cultural advancement. By supporting minorities for its own self-benefit, the Yugoslav government did not allow for bottom-up governance like it purported, but instead governed from the top-down via influence. This contradicts the democratic ideal of self-determination just as much as the establishment of a puppet state and serves to undermine the propagandist argument. Yet, this hypocrisy does not invalidate the Yugoslav point that Western powers' contradicted their purported democratic values in Trieste and the Istrian Peninsula, but merely adds another layer to the dispute.

Another critical part of the Yugoslav appeals to Western sympathy was an attempt to discredit Italian counter-claims to Trieste and the Istrian Peninsula by highlighting the depravities of Italian rule. According to the works of propaganda, the origin of Italian fascism was grounded in the unflinchingly irredentist nature of Italians and

---

13 Terry Martin, *The Affirmative Action Empire: Nations and Nationalism in the Soviet Union, 1923 - 1939* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2001), 3.

the 1915 Treaty of London.<sup>14</sup> In an attempt to avoid combat in World War I and still fulfill its irredentist desires, Italy sought concessions from the Western Allies in order to secure its switch from the Central Powers to that of the Entente.<sup>15</sup> Eager to gain a leg up on the Central Powers, the Allies quickly acquiesced to Italian demands granting Italy Trieste and other Austro-Hungarian lands of “the greatest strategic priority on her eastern frontier” following the end of the War.<sup>16</sup> Therefore, the propaganda highlighted the fact that Italy could claim Trieste solely due to fascism and its irredentist nature.

With fascism the cornerstone for Italian rule in Trieste and the Istrian Peninsula, the works addressed the predictably anti-Slav Italian policies enacted immediately following World War I. In the newly Italian Province of Gorizia, located just to the northwest of Trieste, inhabitants received compensation for war damage in the form of bonds rather than cash, which allowed the Italian banks to issue loans up to fifty-percent of their nominal value and to choose the building contractors themselves.<sup>17</sup> Due to this war compensation construction, the propaganda asserted that many living within the Province sold their property to the authorities via auction and subsequently immigrated to the Americas.<sup>18</sup> Considering the majority of the Province of Gorizia consisted of Slovenes, the compensation policy was in fact designed to clear out Slavs and in their stead settle Italians.<sup>19</sup> Essentially, the government documents accentuated that Italian fascist policies intended to make the natively Slavic Istrian Peninsula artificially Italian.

The sources made it known that early anti-Slav discriminatory policies paled in comparison to those policies enacted by Benito

---

14        Sedmak and Mejak, *Trieste; the problem which agitates the world*, 11.

15        Ibid.

16        Sedmak and Mejak, *Trieste; the problem which agitates the world*, 12.

17        Gabrovšek, *Jugoslavia's Frontiers with Italy: (Trieste and its hinterland)*, 36.

18        Ibid., 37.

19        Ibid.

Mussolini after his rise to power in 1922.<sup>20</sup> Under Mussolini's rule from 1923 to 1927, all Slavic names for towns and villages were officially changed to Italian; the use of the Slovene and Croatian languages was abolished in the courts and administration; Slovenes were subjected to the forcible Italianization of their surnames; and all Slovene and Croatian educational and gymnastic societies were disbanded and had their property confiscated.<sup>21</sup> Then, from 1928 to 1930, the last Slovene and Croatian schools were closed; Slovene newspapers, books, enterprises, and monetary institutions were banned; and, in theory, the Slavic minorities in Italy entirely ceased to exist.<sup>22</sup> According to the works, these policies implemented under Mussolini not only attempted to artificially Italianize the Istrian Peninsula and Trieste, but also attempted to eradicate the Slavic people altogether. Therefore, the propaganda established a connection between the Allied-backed Italian successor state and genocide, which highlighted the contradiction of the Western states' supposed values and actions.

With the onset of World War II and subsequent fascist invasion of Yugoslavia, the assimilationist policies evolved into outright violence against Slavs. According to Yugoslav propaganda, Italian forces used the excuse that they had been attacked by Slavs to burn down Slovene villages and "it soon became clear that this was to be their normal method. They did not think of order, but only of terrorism. The destruction of villages became more and more frequent, and was always accompanied by the killing of several villagers."<sup>23</sup> Additionally, Italian soldiers stationed in Province of Lubiana (Ljubljana in Slovene) dragged out young Slovenian girls from honorable families, raped them, and cut their breasts with razors.<sup>24</sup> From the propaganda's perspective, the violent and oppressive fascist Italians clearly did not deserve to annex Trieste and the Istrian Peninsula, particularly when taking the heritage of the region and their opposition to democratic ideals into account. In

20 Ballinger, *History In Exile: Memory and Identity at the Borders of the Balkans*, 53.

21 Sedmak and Mejak, *Trieste; the problem which agitates the world*, 20.

22 Ibid.

23 Gabrovšek, *Jugoslavia's Frontiers with Italy*, 47.

24 Ibid.

this capacity, the Yugoslav government sought to swing Western public favor regarding the Trieste dispute from Italy to Yugoslavia.

Apart from the arguments based upon Italian oppression, the works further built upon the ramifications of the historical Slavicness of Istria by stressing the economic ties between Trieste and its Slavic hinterland. In order for Trieste to achieve its full economic potential, Yugoslav publications argued, it needed to be linked with the Slavic areas that surrounded the city. In the late fifteenth century, “Trieste surrendered itself to the Hapsburgs from fear of Venice, and from that time its fate was linked with that of its hinterland, under Hapsburg control.”<sup>25</sup> As a result, “two thirds of the trade of Trieste either came from or was directed to Austria.”<sup>26</sup> Centuries later, the trend continued given the layout of the rail-lines in 1913, “97% of the entire railway goods traffic to and from Trieste . . . connect Trieste to its Yugoslav hinterlands, while the Trieste—Cervignano line, leading to Italy . . . carried only 3% of it.”<sup>27</sup> The works belabored the fact that the Yugoslav hinterland was vitally important to Trieste due to its intricate transportation network and consequently acted as the lifeline for the city, which served to underline the area’s tie to Yugoslavia.

According to the Yugoslav propaganda, Trieste experienced its economic booms in 1913 and from 1951-1952, first under the control of the Austro-Hungarian Empire and then under joint American-British military control of Zone A.<sup>28</sup> During the interwar period, when Trieste was under Italian control, the port city saw a substantial dip in the tons of its through traffic on a yearly basis.<sup>29</sup> The documents indicated this was because although Italians made up a fairly large percentage of the population of Trieste itself, the Yugoslav hinterland provided both the indispensable materials that built the city and the laborers and seamen who ensured its successful operation.<sup>30</sup> Thus, when the Italians gained control of Trieste and the city was

25        Gabrovšek, *Jugoslavia’s Frontiers with Italy*, 11-12.

26        *Ibid.*, 17.

27        Sedmak and Mejak, *Trieste; the problem which agitates the world*, 50.

28        *Ibid.*

29        *Ibid.*, 50-51.

30        Sedmak and Mejak, *Trieste; the problem which agitates the world*, 49.

subsequently severed from its hinterland, economic suffering proved inevitable:

The decline of Trieste after 1918 can be explained only by its divorce from its hinterland, Central Europe or the Austria Hungary, which naturally sought new outlets to the sea when Italy took control of Trieste. Although their economic life was bound to suffer through the loss of their nearest and most natural outlet, these Central European states abandoned Trieste and opened new channels for their sea trade. Gdynia and other ports prospered while Trieste languished.<sup>31</sup>

Ultimately, the propaganda accentuated Trieste's economic inseparability from its Yugoslav hinterland and even used a statement from an Italian official to bolster its point. One of the works quoted former Italian Prime Minister Alfonso Lamarmola who, in front of the Italian Senate in 1866, conjectured "I never thought of Trieste [as Italian]. The town itself is surrounded by a Slav population . . . If by any chance Trieste became Italian, it would prove a source of great troubles and interminable dangers."<sup>32</sup> According to the Yugoslav nationalist government propaganda, if the fate of Trieste's Slavic hinterland and Istria as a whole were to be decided by self-determination, then the region would inevitably become a part of Yugoslavia rather than Italy. However, this failed to account for larger macroeconomic factors that played compelling roles in Trieste's decline following World War I, such a restructuring of infrastructure and the Great Depression. Yet, because these factors would take away from the legitimacy of its arguments, Belgrade instead reinforced and focused on its connection to the democratic ideal of self-determination in order to influence Westerners' to view the dispute from its perspective.

### Omissions

Given the government documents' standing as Yugoslav propaganda, it is critical to also note what failed to appear in the works. The most obvious and prevalent of the omissions are of the *foibe*

31 Gabrovšek, *Jugoslavia's Frontiers with Italy*, 19-20.

32 *Ibid.*, 61.

killings and, as Pamela Ballinger termed it, the Italian-Istrian Exodus between 1943 and 1954.<sup>33</sup> Beginning in 1943, the anti-fascist Italian National Liberation Committee, or NLC, began claiming that Slavic Istrian peasants threw still-living members of the Italian fascist administration into limestone chasms known as *foibe*.<sup>34</sup> Additionally, the NLC claimed that not all of the victims were fascists; rather, the anti-Italian Croatian communists incited the perpetrators and encouraged them to target Italian-speakers more generally.<sup>35</sup> In 1945, British and American investigators concluded that the executions of Italians had occurred and were indeed still taking place.<sup>36</sup> The news of these killings helped spur the Istrian Exodus, which consisted of four waves of Italian migration from Istria into the heart of Italy.<sup>37</sup> The Yugoslav government's omission of the *foibe* killings from its propaganda is significant, considering its critical view of Italian atrocities committed against Slavs. To admit that Slavs also committed atrocities against Italians would substantially weaken the Yugoslav government's argument for the annexation of Trieste and the Istrain Peninsula in the eyes of the West.

The first wave of Italian migrants left Istria following the collapse of the Italian regime in 1943.<sup>38</sup> A second wave of migration occurred after the end of World War II with Yugoslav forces taking control of the Peninsula and intimidating the Italian population in part through the *foibe* killings.<sup>39</sup> The third wave of migration was a direct result of the 1947 Italian-Yugoslav Peace Treaty, the same treaty that established The Free Territory of Trieste.<sup>40</sup> The fourth wave occurred in

---

33        Ballinger, *History In Exile: Memory and Identity at the Borders of the Balkans*, 77.

34        Glenda Sluga, *The Problem of Trieste and the Italo-Yugoslav Border: Difference, Identity, and Sovereignty in Twentieth Century Europe* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2001), 77.

35        Ibid.

36        Ibid., 90.

37        Ballinger, *History In Exile: Memory and Identity at the Borders of the Balkans*, 77.

38        Ibid.

39        Ibid.

40        Ibid.

1954 after the final settlement of the Istrian question.<sup>41</sup> Clearly, based on these migration patterns, the Italians living on the Istrian Peninsula did not wish to be governed by Yugoslavs out of both fear and a desire to live within the borders of Italy. While interviewing Italian *esuli*, or exiles, from Istria for her work *History In Exile: Memory and Identity at the Borders of the Balkans*, Ballinger makes it apparent that even though many *esuli* “were not directly affected by the tragedy of the *foibe*, it figured into many oral histories, revealing how intimidation combined with rumor, created a climate of pervasive fear and insecurity” amongst the Istrian Italians.<sup>42</sup> This feeling of fear and insecurity directly contradicts and undermines the Yugoslav government’s claim to its Anglo-American audience that Italians enjoyed acceptance while temporarily under Yugoslav control.

The omissions themselves are particularly revealing because in combination with the propagandist arguments they illuminate the fact that Yugoslavia and Italy’s borders were far from set. Therefore, the “Iron Curtain” dividing the East from the West and communism from democracy was more pliable than Churchill believed. The interaction of the two ideologies was an integral component of the Trieste dispute as the interpretations of what democracy and communism meant significantly differed on each side.

## Conclusion

Tito’s split from Stalin in 1948 released Yugoslavia from Soviet fetters, which had served to reign in Yugoslav nationalism for the benefit of international state socialism. Freed from Stalin’s control, the Yugoslav government pursued a nationalist agenda above all else and chief on the list was the annexation of Trieste and the Istrian Peninsula as a whole into Yugoslavia. The annexation attempt centered on the creation of propaganda designed to gain Western sympathy at a grassroots level regarding Yugoslavia’s plight through discrediting Italian annexation attempts in the form of the contradiction between the Western powers’ actions in Trieste and its professed democratic ideals.

Unfortunately for Tito and Yugoslav nationalism, their attempts

---

41 Ballinger, *History In Exile: Memory and Identity at the Borders of the Balkans*, 77.

42 *Ibid.*, 193.

fell short, allowing for uninfluenced power politics and foreign agendas to carry the day. This ultimately led to the Yugoslav and Italian governments signing a “Memorandum of Understanding” regarding The Free Territory of Trieste at London in 1954.<sup>43</sup> The “Memorandum of Understanding” stipulated that Zone B would remain in Yugoslav control, but that the majority of the highly contested Zone A would be given to the Italians.<sup>44</sup> This officially gave Italy control over Trieste, much to the chagrin of Yugoslav officials. However, in a gesture of appeasement and to help to ensure affable Yugoslav-Italian relations, the fifth article in Annex I in the “Memorandum of Understanding” states, “[t]he Italian Government undertakes to maintain the Free Port at Trieste,” stressing that Trieste would not be entirely devoid of Yugoslav influence in the future, despite the city belonging to Italy.<sup>45</sup>

Although the outcome of the dispute was never really in doubt due to Great Britain and the United States’ tremendous economic stake in the region, the Yugoslav propagandist arguments are not devoid of legitimate observations. Did the Yugoslav government have its own agenda? Yes. Were its arguments biased to achieve its agenda? Yes. However, its claim that that the democratic states were acting counter to their values regarding population politics and self-determination is valid. This observation paired with the idea of Yugoslav nationalist communists and their clear occupation of an “in between” space readily questions the validity of a static “Iron Curtain”. Thus, the dispute serves as an intriguing case study of shifting ideological boundaries in the midst of a perceived stark contrast between liberal democracy and communism.

### *Bibliography*

Ballinger, Pamela. *History in Exile: Memory and Identity at the Borders of the Balkans*. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2002.

---

43        “Memorandum of Understanding (with annexes and exchange of notes) regarding the Free Territory of Trieste,” October 5, 1954, *Treaties and Other International Acts Series* 3099, Annex 1 art. 1.

44        *Ibid.*, Annex 1 art. 2.

45        *Ibid.*, Annex 1 art. 5.

- Banac, Ivo. *With Stalin Against Tito: Cominformists Splits in Yugoslav Communism*. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1988.
- Churchill, Winston. March 5<sup>th</sup>, 1946. "The Sinews of Peace" (speech). NATO Online Library. [http://www.nato.int/docu/speech/1946/s460305a\\_e.htm](http://www.nato.int/docu/speech/1946/s460305a_e.htm).
- DiNardo, Richard. "Glimpse of an Old World Order? Reconsidering the Trieste Crisis of 1945." *Oxford Journals: Diplomatic History* 21 (1997): 365-381. Accessed April 16, 2014. <http://dh.oxfordjournals.org/content/21/3/365.short>.
- Encyclopædia Britannica Online*, s. v. "Free Territory of Trieste." 2014. <http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/749532/Free-Territory-of-Trieste>. (accessed March 17, 2014).
- Gabrovšek, Francis. *Jugoslavia's Frontiers with Italy: (Trieste and its hinterland)*. New York: Yugoslav Information Center, 1945.
- Martin, Terry. *The Affirmative Action Empire: Nations and Nationalism in the Soviet Union, 1923 – 1939*. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 2001.
- "Memorandum of Understanding (with annexes and exchange of notes) regarding the Free Territory of Trieste." October 5<sup>th</sup>, 1954. *Treaties and Other International Acts Series* 3099, Annex 1 art. 1-5.
- Sedmak, V. and J. Mejak. *Trieste; the problem which agitates the world*. Beograd: Edition "Jugoslavia", 1953.
- Sluga, Glenda. *The Problem of Trieste and the Italo-Yugoslav Border: Difference, Identity, and Sovereignty in Twentieth Century Europe*. Albany, New York: State University of New York Press, 2001.
- Stojković, Ljubiša, and Milos Martić. *National Minorities in Yugoslavia*. Beograd: Publishing and Editing Enterprise "Jugoslavia", 1952.



## Article 121, The Other, and The Iron Closet

### LGBT Life in Soviet and Post-Soviet Russia

*John Snouffer*

The international media quickly paid attention to the St. Petersburg Duma in March 2012 when it passed a law prohibiting “public acts aimed at the propaganda of sodomy, lesbianism, bisexualism, and transgenderism amongst minors.”<sup>1</sup> Shortly afterward, Russia’s parliament unanimously passed federal law banning gay “propaganda” to minors on June 11, 2013.<sup>2</sup> Virtually unnoticed were the Kostroma Oblast and Arkhangelsk dumas passing similar amendments in 2011, or Ryazan Oblast’s дума in 2006.<sup>3</sup> Despite the backlash against LGBT individuals in Russia during the post-Soviet period, much of their treatment during the Soviet era has remained largely ignored until recently. As the gay and lesbian movements taking place across Western Europe and the United States during the 1960s and 1970s had almost no impact on Soviet life, 1991 was considered for many as their “Russian Stonewall.”<sup>4</sup> There are conflicting historiographies

---

1 Cai Wilkinson, “Russia’s Anti-Gay Laws: The Politics and Consequences of a Moral Panic,” *The Disorder of Things*, June 23, 2013, available at: <http://thedisorderofthings.com/2013/06/23/russias-anti-gay-laws-the-politics-and-consequences-of-a-moral-panic/>.

2 Miriam Elder, “Russia Passes Law Banning Gay ‘propaganda,’” *Guardian*, June 11, 2013, available at: <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/jun/11/russia-law-banning-gay-propaganda>. This decision was passed 436-0. The bill includes fines of up to 100,000 rubles for using the media or internet for such purposes. Organizations face a fine of 1 million rubles and can be closed down for up to 90 days, severely hindering the fledging LGBT groups still operating in Russia. Appeals to nationalism are also evident by its application to foreigners, who may be detained for up to 15 days and deported in addition to their fine of 100,000 rubles.

3 Wilkinson, “Russia’s Anti-Gay Laws,” <http://thedisorderofthings.com/2013/06/23/russias-anti-gay-laws-the-politics-and-consequences-of-a-moral-panic/>.

4 Laurie Essig, *Queer in Russia: A Story of Sex, Self, and the Other*, Duke University Press, 1999, 66.

in this field; one popular assumption is that the Russian Orthodox Church is the dominant force behind historical and continued anti-LGBT measures in Russia.<sup>5</sup> However, I will argue that most of the continued resistance to LGBT acceptance in Russia stems from the lingering influence of Soviet law and institutions. Furthermore, while the situation in Russia seems grim for many “sexual minorities,” they have endured far worse just twenty to thirty years prior.

Before 1976, no preeminent historian existed on the subject of homosexuality in Russia. The late Simon Karlinsky (1924-2009) entered the scene with *The Sexual Labyrinth of Nicolai Gogol* that year, apparently the first historian to broach the subject in officially sexless Russia. Karlinsky became the first to focus on homosexual treatment during the Soviet 1920s and 1930s, under a totalitarian interpretation, and almost all authors on the subject are entirely dependent on his original work. Karlinsky was born to Russian immigrants in Manchuria, but came to the U.S. in 1938 and became a U.S. citizen in 1944.<sup>6</sup> While an American citizen, he was the only author at the time writing on historical Russian homosexuality.

When the tsarist legal code was abolished with the October Revolution of 1917, the prohibition on sodomy was swept away as well. Karlinsky implies that sodomy decriminalization in 1922 was not due to revolutionary ideals but merely oversight or neglect when fashioning the vast Soviet legal code.<sup>7</sup> The foremost opposing historiography to this position comes from Oxford historian Dan Healey, author of *Homosexual Desire in Revolutionary Russia*, certainly the

---

5        For more information on how the Orthodox Church’s fears shape such views, see Robert Blitt, “Russia’s ‘Orthodox’ Foreign Policy: The Growing Influence of the Russian Orthodox Church in Shaping Russia’s Policies Abroad,” *University of Pennsylvania Journal of International Law* 33, no. 2 (2011): 363-460..

6        Kathleen Maclay, “Simon Karlinsky, scholar of Russian classic and émigré literature, dies at 84,” Berkeley, July 28, 2009, available at: [http://www.berkeley.edu/news/media/releases/2009/07/28\\_karlinsky.shtml](http://www.berkeley.edu/news/media/releases/2009/07/28_karlinsky.shtml).

7        Simon Karlinsky, “Russia’s Gay Literature and Culture: The Impact of the October Revolution,” in Martin B. Duberman, Martha Vicinus, and George Chauncey, eds. *Hidden from History: Reclaiming the Gay and Lesbian Past*. New American Library, 1989.

most detailed text to date on the subject.<sup>8</sup> Healey argues that the scarcity of sources available before 1991 hindered study of these issues, which mainly focused on the “Great Retreat” from social progressivism accompanying the rise of Stalinist policies during the 1930s, including the 1933-34 recriminalization of sodomy between males.<sup>9</sup> While not claiming to fully understand the reasons for state interest in male homosexuality,<sup>10</sup> Healey was the first to publish research on a wide range of sources, including Imperial Russian and Soviet medical and legal research, court cases between 1862 and 1959, archives from the Justice and Health Commissariats from 1917 to 1929, and other Soviet files up to 1991. This reliance on government records in addition to the prevalence of anecdotal history provides a more complete picture of homosexual subcultures than other works.

Healey describes a fairly robust gay male life during the late tsarist period, developing from indigenous patterns of “mutual masculine sexuality” during the mid-19<sup>th</sup> century to a full-blown urban, male homosexual subculture by the turn of the century. Much of his evidence relies on reports of prostitution by *bania* (bathhouse) attendants, cabdrivers, soldiers, etc.<sup>11</sup> Russia’s rapid urbanization would result in the creation of well known cruising scenes, including the *Passazh* (Passage) connecting Nevskii with Mikhailovskaia/Iskusstvo Square, areas around the modern Winter Stadium, and Konnogvardeiskii/Profsoiuznyi Boulevard in St. Petersburg; as well

---

8 Dan Healey, *Homosexual Desire in Revolutionary Russia: The Regulation of Gender and Sexual Dissent*, University of Chicago Press, 2001.

9 Ibid, 5-7.

10 Ibid, 14.

11 Ibid. Most records indicate practices were fairly common between gentry landlords and servants or peasants, in addition to patron/client relations or among authority figures. Healey’s primary sources even indicate the varying prices for prostitution among different workers, ranging from fifty kopeks for mutual masturbation from cabdrivers, a ruble for anal intercourse with *bania* attendants, or three to five rubles for the same act with a soldier.

as the Nikitskie Gates and Boulevard Ring in Moscow.<sup>12</sup> The *tetkis* (literally aunts) were referred to in writings as mainly upper class and effeminate, while “woman haters” were generally middle to lower class workers emulating masculine norms. Both descriptions were used specifically to identify male homosexuals in contemporary correspondence and writing, and indicated a fairly large range in homosexual subcultures that Healey argues were native to Russia and not the result of Western influence. Perhaps the most public recognition of homosexual scandal at the time involved Grand Duke Konstantin Romanov, relative of Tsar Nicolas II, and his sexual encounters with bath attendants around 1906.<sup>13</sup> In contrast to the reports on gay men, lesbian women were largely ignored by contemporaries and discussed almost entirely in medical studies, as they were forced to see psychiatrists or sent to mental asylums rather than given criminal sentences.<sup>14</sup> However, the rare woman with economic independence had a unique way to explore such desires, yet did not take control of public space to do so.<sup>15</sup> This general division of treatment by gender would later continue from 1934 to 1991.

With the upheaval of tsarist government and society, the Communist regime in the 1920s brought a brief period when the lives of gays and lesbians would be temporarily shifted by treatment of their particular acts. Commentary of the committee drafting the 1922 Russian Soviet Federative Socialist Republic criminal code was mixed, yet many viewed removing the sodomy ban as a progressive

---

12        Ibid, 31-37. Nevskii Prospect is still a popular cruising spot today, according to David Tuller.

13        Ibid, 35.

14        Ibid, 50. Similar to other European countries at the time, same-sex relations among licensed female prostitutes but conditions in Russia's brothels were particularly squalid, see Laurie Bernstein, *Sonia's daughters: prostitutes and their regulation in Imperial Russia*, University of California Press, 1995. However, beyond anecdotal evidence of beaten wives, treatment of gay women in tsarist Russia in particular is still largely unknown.

15        Ibid, 75.

measure.<sup>16</sup> Health Commissar Semashko was quoted on a 1923 trip to the Hirschfeld's Institute of Sex Research (ISR) in Berlin by the institute's journal that "no unhappy consequences ... resulted from the elimination of the offending paragraph, nor has the wish that the penalty in question be reintroduced in any quarter."<sup>17</sup> These sentiments were also echoed by social hygienist Grigorii Batkis at Moscow University, who spoke at conferences of the World League for Sexual Reform (WLSR) at the ISR along with Aleksandra Kollontai, the leader of Bolshevism's short-lived sexual revolution.<sup>18</sup> While homosexuals now had a measure of legal protection, their ability to meet in groups was largely prevented with the new premium on private space.<sup>19</sup>

The introduction of Article 121 was the defining feature for gay men's lives during most of the Soviet period, yet Healey believes that much of the motivation behind the statute up for interpretation.<sup>20</sup>

16 Ibid, 128-131. One jurist writing on the subject that sodomy with "adults infringes no rights whatsoever, that [adults] should be free to express sexual feeling in any form, and that such intrusions was a hold-over of church teachings and of the ideology of sinfulness." However, an obscure jurist published "The Trial of Homosexuals" arguing that it should still be illegal under the new code and that forensic psychiatric expertise provided medical justification for prosecution, floating the supposed influence of perversion on "normal" persons and mirroring the present Russian fear that homosexuality is contagious by nature.

17 *Jahrbuch fur sexuelle Zwischenstufen* 23 (1923): 211-12, cited in Healey.

18 Healey, 133.

19 Ibid, 46-49. Rental of any halls for events was increasingly difficult during New Economic Policy, as was the availability of private apartments for most citizens. Mikhail Kuzmin, author of *Wings* and the bourgeois leader of Russia's homosexual literary tradition, gradually saw membership of his organization decrease yet had the means to continue his "prerevolutionary escapades."

20 See Healey Chapter 7, "Can a Homosexual be a Member of the Party?" 181-204. Healey mentions the German SPD's disclosure of German SA leader Ernst Rohm's scandal. The Communist KPD joined in soon afterward, in addition to disassociating the Dutch ex-Communist Marinus van der Lubbe (arrested for the Reichstag fire) from the left due to his homosexuality. Proscription of homosexuality in the USSR happened

Section 1 prohibited even consensual acts, stipulating that “sexual relations between men are punishable by prison terms of up to five years.”<sup>21</sup> Following the collapse of the Soviet Union in 1991, many within Russia felt emboldened to live more openly, despite the continuation of Article 121 into 1993.<sup>22</sup> The most comprehensive English texts available for this period are the “travelogues” of two gay Americans, David Tuller and Laurie Essig. Essig had been traveling between the New York and Moscow periodically between 1989 and 1994, while Tuller had set out in the summer of 1991 and returned from his last trip in the summer of 1995.

Tuller describes his book *Cracks in the Iron Closet: Travels in Gay and Lesbian Russia* as “part travel memoir, part social history, part journalistic inquiry... about the nature of difference in a land where conformity is prized and individuality censured.”<sup>23</sup> Tuller initially went to a gay and lesbian conference in Moscow and Leningrad as a reporter for the *San Francisco Chronicle*, eventually befriending a group of gay Russians that would keep convincing him to return. One friend, Lena, recounted her own childhood experience and coming to terms with her sexuality under Soviet rule. After her first same-sex experience at sixteen with another girl, she finally married at twenty-seven, explaining how many entered “fictive

---

without public discourse, compared to the public campaigning in Nazi Germany. However, based on the few remaining documents, it is believed that homosexuality was construed in many ways; as a fascist tendency, a vice of “bourgeois degenerates,” remnants of Russia’s own backwardness, or mental infection.

21        Jill J. Barshay, “Russia’s Gay Men Step Out of Soviet-Era Shadow,” *New York Times*, February 10, 1993, available at: <http://www.nytimes.com/1993/02/10/world/russia-s-gay-men-step-out-of-soviet-era-shadows.html?pagewanted=print>.

22        President Boris Yeltsin signed the repeal of the first section, concerning consensual relations between adults, in April before publishing such reforms on May 27, 1993.

23        David Tuller, *Cracks in the Iron Closet: Travels in Gay and Lesbian Russia*, University of Chicago Press, 1996, 7.

marriages” to obtain a *propiska* for Moscow or a separate apartments.<sup>24</sup> She met her current partner, Sveta, when they were both teaching school, though later they both transferred to a large publishing company and bought themselves their dacha (small country house). Sveta indicated her position, and those of women like her, were likely different from that of many gay men in the Soviet system, saying that “if anyone began to make an allusion to it [their relationship], she cut them off sharply. This was her private life, her intimate life—and she preferred to keep it that way.”<sup>25</sup> Tuller’s friend, journalist Masha Gessen, also expressed this sentiment, saying that “the law said nothing about women, so the irony was that it was probably the only law in the whole book I couldn’t violate, no matter how hard I tried.”<sup>26</sup>

While discussing this issue, Essig floats the Soviet psychiatrist Andrei Snezhnevski’s (1904-1987) term of “sluggishly manifesting schizophrenia,” developed during the height of Stalinism, as the diagnosis given to many lesbians until the USSR’s collapse. Her interviews with eight women between 1989 and 1994 found such prescriptions as forced hospitalization with drug or shock therapies, lifetime supervision with curtailment of legal rights, or confinement to a psychiatric institution for the chronically ill.<sup>27</sup> The most radical fate for these women stemmed from Soviet medical culture: all women deemed to be “primary” homosexuals were, in fact, men and may have been recommended for sex change operations. Healey describes one such case in psychiatrists Elizaveta Derevinskaia’s study.<sup>28</sup> Essig cites the Russian psychologist Isaev’s 1989 study finding that “primary” homosexual women “manifest . . . male behavior . . . accompanied by marked sexual role deviations and high levels of intelligence

---

24 Ibid, 183-184. Although not exclusively homosexual, she mainly entered the marriage to keep her dog, which her mother hated, and separated from her husband after a few months.

25 Ibid, 185-186.

26 Ibid, 138.

27 Essig, *Queer in Russia*, 29.

28 Healey, 240. In this case Deverinskaia examined ninety-six women at the Karaganda corrective labor camp and various clinics between 1954 and the early 1960s, arguing for classification of lesbians into “active” and “passive” roles. One couple had managed to register their marriage officially as the “active” partner was passing as a man.

and ambivalent attitudes towards the same sex.”<sup>29</sup> Tuller lists a host of theories for the reason that many doctors reported four to ten times more women wanting to become men than the other way around.<sup>30</sup>

The situation for men under the Soviet regime was much better documented and analyzed due to Article 121. According to Healey, sodomy convictions per year in the post-WWII USSR generally ranged between 700 and 1,300.<sup>31</sup> Convictions for voluntary and aggravated sodomy increased rapidly during the late 1960s and remained steady until 1981 at a rate of around 1, 200 a year, until the next available data in 1987 evidenced a decline from 831 to only 482 during 1991.<sup>32</sup> Healey posits that the early rise was due to a modernized routine of surveillance policies including raids on subculture territories and the use of entrapment. Tuller seems to support this notion; during his interview with Karlinsky, he mentions a similar entrapment to turn a British naval attaché into a Soviet agent.<sup>33</sup> Tuller later expands on the sense of paranoia felt by Russian gay men that any lover could be current or former KGB. His friend Sergei described Tuller’s American roommate Kevin as KGB: “a friend of my friend, who is also gay and himself works for the KGB, called my friend and

---

29        D.D. Isaev, “Psychosomatic Relationships in the Etiology of Homosexuality,” 1989, cited in Essig, 32.

30        Tuller, 158. He and his friends posited that Russian women have such a hard life that it was simply more pleasant to be a man. Essig interviewed a number of lesbian couples who affirmed that one was making the sacrifice to make their relationship easier to be recognized on pages (39-45). However, Tuller mentions an uncited journal article in *Gay Slavanye* which published a letter from a 19 year old lesbian pressured by her doctor and mother to receive a sex change operations “if, according to the results, I am a man,” on page 159.

31        Healey, 262, Table 2- Sodomy Convictions in the USSR and RSFSR, 1961-81.

32        Ibid, 262, Table 3- Sodomy Convictions, 1987-1991.

33        Tuller, 97. John Vassel accepted an invitation to a private party of local gay men in 1954. He was then “caught by the camera, enjoying every possible sexual activity,” and complied with KGB demands to turn over thousands of classified documents in London from 1957 until his arrest in 1962.

said they had gotten a list of the names of people at the meeting...”<sup>34</sup>

Such fears seem less tenuous when considering the conditions of that *opushchenniye* (“the degraded ones”) faced in Soviet prison camps. Various prison memoirs detailed those who fell into this category (mainly gay men), who made up roughly 10% of all prisoners held. Such trials included the constant threat of rape, the most vile prison jobs (i.e., cleaning latrines), and being forced to “eat mice, take light bulbs up their asses—any means of degrading them... You cannot take anything from them.”<sup>35</sup> Tuller describes the imprisonment of Leningrad poet Gennady Trifinov, chronicled by Karlinsky, smuggling out an open letter for Western publication. Trifinov described being beaten daily during preliminary investigation and subsisting solely on the scraps and garbage of others, as homosexuals were forbidden from eating in the camp cafeteria.<sup>36</sup> Both Tuller and Gessen attempted to explore one prison camp in Nizhnokamsk in August 1993 with the intent of releasing any prisoners sentenced under Article 121.1 still being held. Colonel Arbuzov initially denied that any such prisoners were still present, yet then decided to tell them before leaving that two prisoners would have their sentences adjusted as they had been convicted for those consensual relations “among other crimes.”<sup>37</sup>

The AIDS crisis presented another challenge to gay men living in Russia. Andrei Plotnikov was arrested in 1990 for infecting his boyfriend with HIV, then held for fifteen days in a basement with an iron bed sans mattress, kasha and bread once a day, and no water for several days.<sup>38</sup> The Tomsk AIDS Center, visited by Tuller in May 1995, was according to its director Aleksandr Chernov an incredibly expensive project, with tens of thousands of dollars spent for its conference. He expressed dismay that most local gays had avoided the event, glossing over the former KGB policy of keeping a list of

---

34 Ibid, 102. Tuller also mentions his brief affair with a man named Boris on pages 271-273, immediately followed by an American acquaintance mentioning that Boris was an informer.

35 Ibid, 130-131.

36 Ibid, 129-130.

37 Ibid, 140.

38 Ibid, 211.

known homosexuals to test annually for STIs.<sup>39</sup>

The future of LGBT individuals in Russia remains uncertain. Masha Gessen has now emerged as the dominant voice of gay Russians for the West. A Jewish-Russian émigré, she currently has two children and multiple partners. Her take on Russia's current path is ominous, as evidenced by her recent book criticizing Vladimir Putin as an autocrat and dictator.<sup>40</sup> Since its publication in 2012, she has been prolific in the Western press. To Gessen, Putin's bid for power and new brand of conservatism relies on creating Russia's image as leader of the "anti-Western world," both through aggressive international posturing as well as gay bashing.<sup>41</sup> Putin's embrace of "our position on defending traditional values," is, in her opinion, conflated with hostility towards the Ukraine. "The West is literally taking over, and only Russian troops can stand between the Slavic country's unsuspecting citizens and the homosexuals marching in from Brussels."<sup>42</sup> An earlier article describes Moscow Pride 2013, where LGBT activists were attacked by "shaved heads" while the "police swooped in, pushing attackers aside to get to the protestors, whom they then hauled into prisoner transport vehicles."<sup>43</sup> When asked by a reporter when efforts to legalize gay pride might succeed, she responded "no sooner than efforts to topple the regime."<sup>44</sup>

Gessen's observation that homosexuality is viewed in Russia as

---

39 Ibid, 219-224. Tuller heard fears from those present at the conference that the only motivation behind the event was to form a new database of gay men for future government use.

40 Masha Gessen, *The Man Without a Face: The Unlikely Rise of Vladimir Putin*. Granta Books, 2012.

41 Masha Gessen, "Russia is Remaking Itself as the Leader of the Anti-Western World," *Washington Post*, March 30<sup>th</sup>, 2014, available at: [http://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/russia-is-remaking-itself-as-the-leader-of-the-anti-western-world/2014/03/30/8461f548-b681-11e3-8cc3-d4bf596577eb\\_story.html](http://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/russia-is-remaking-itself-as-the-leader-of-the-anti-western-world/2014/03/30/8461f548-b681-11e3-8cc3-d4bf596577eb_story.html).

42 Ibid.

43 Masha Gessen, "Moscow's Gay-Bashing Ritual," *New York Times*, May 27, 2013, available at: [http://latitude.blogs.ny-times.com/2013/05/27/moscows-gay-bashing-ritual/?\\_php=true&\\_type=blogs&\\_r=0](http://latitude.blogs.ny-times.com/2013/05/27/moscows-gay-bashing-ritual/?_php=true&_type=blogs&_r=0).

44 Ibid.

a corrupting western influence conforms to most literature on post-Soviet Russia. Brian James Baer in *Other Russias* views the treatment of homosexuality within three cultural backdrops, “(1) the predicament of the Russian male in post-Soviet society; (2) the problem of Russian identity in a post-Soviet world; and (3) the search for a post-Soviet aesthetics.”<sup>45</sup> He also echoes Healey’s observation that to most Russians homosexuality has two opposite poles: either imported from an overdeveloped, decadent West or a backwards, primitive East.<sup>46</sup> Furthermore, both Healey and Essig find precedent for associating Russian homophobia with Stalin’s anti-western stance during the 1930s.<sup>47</sup>

Despite these observations on the origins of anti-gay movements, western intervention has not been greatly beneficial to the struggles of Russian LGBT individuals. Both Tuller and Essig were highly critical of the conferences they attended in 1994.<sup>48</sup> Essig cites a chilling mistake on her part when her friend “decided to follow my advice and come out to her family. Her husband raped her and almost killed her. Her mother told her she deserved it, and so did the police.”<sup>49</sup> This is not to say that the world should stand idly by, nor does it mean that Russians as a whole are opposed to homosexuality.

---

45 Brian James Baer, *Other Russias*, Palgrave Macmillan, 2009, 4.

46 Ibid, 5. Baer later describes the Russian precedent of associating such male relations with both the Caucasus and ethnic minorities.

47 In chapter seven, Healey describes Stalin’s spokesman Maksim Gor’kii responding to the British columnist Whyte’s Marxist criticisms of sodomy prohibition. Gor’kii depicted the issue as an overdeveloped west and capitalism relying on fascism to destroy and demoralize the very culture of Russia, with homosexuality as a means of corrupting youth, 189. Essig, on the other hand, posits that post-Soviet nationalism is also supported by many “queers”, citing historian Frank Rector and his link between fascistic aesthetics and homosexuality on pages 153-155. She concludes that such support will be their undoing, although her link seems fairly tenuous.

48 Tuller recounts the weekend workshop he attended with Essig hosted by American activists Adam and Alma. He described their efforts as “naïve in the extreme and pathetically ineffective” (page 118), while Essig equated the workshop with “cultural imperialism” (page 131).

49 Essig, 126.

The number of Russians believing that homosexuals should be “liquidated” fell from 39% in 1989 to 22% in 1994 and was a mere 5% in 2013. This was despite 40% disagreeing that homosexuals should enjoy the same rights as others in Russia.<sup>50</sup> Lena expressed such sentiments to Tuller after he asked for her thoughts on same-sex marriage, “I suppose there could be a legal issue about whether lesbians can leave things to each other, but as a rule Soviet lesbians don’t own anything, so they have nothing to leave anyone anyway... problems for lesbians only start when they fight for their rights.”<sup>51</sup> While it may rely on broad cultural stereotypes to suggest that many Russian gays and lesbians simply keep their heads down, imposing Western notions of identity and liberties may be similarly reproachable.

### *Bibliography*

- Barshay, Jill J. “Russia’s Gay Men Step Out of Soviet-Era Show.” *New York Times*, February 10, 1993, <http://www.nytimes.com/1993/02/10/world/russia-s-gay-men-step-out-of-soviet-era-shadows.html?pagewanted=print>.
- Baer, Brian James. *Other Russias*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- Blitt, Robert. “Russia’s ‘Orthodox’ Foreign Policy: The Growing Influence of the Russian Orthodox Church in Shaping Russia’s Policies Abroad.” *University of Pennsylvania Journal of International Law* 33, no. 2 (2011): 363-460.
- Essig, Laurie. *Queer in Russia: A Story of Sex, Self, and the Other*. Duke University Press, 1999.

---

50        Wilkinson, “Russia’s Anti-Gay Laws,” <http://thedisorderofthings.com/2013/06/23/russias-anti-gay-laws-the-politics-and-consequences-of-a-moral-panic/>.

51        Tuller, 61.

Gessen, Masha. "Moscow's Gay-Bashing Ritual." *New York Times*, May 27, 2013, [http://latitude.blogs.nytimes.com/2013/05/27/moscows-gay-bashing-ritual/?\\_php=true&\\_type=blogs&\\_r=0](http://latitude.blogs.nytimes.com/2013/05/27/moscows-gay-bashing-ritual/?_php=true&_type=blogs&_r=0).

Gessen, Masha. "Russia is Remaking Itself as the Leader of the Anti-Western World." *Washington Post*, March 30<sup>th</sup>, 2014, [http://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/russia-is-remaking-itself-as-the-leader-of-the-anti-western-world/2014/03/30/8461f548-b681-11e3-8cc3-d4bf596577eb\\_story.html](http://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/russia-is-remaking-itself-as-the-leader-of-the-anti-western-world/2014/03/30/8461f548-b681-11e3-8cc3-d4bf596577eb_story.html).

Gessen, Masha. *The Man Without a Face: The Unlikely Rise of Vladimir Putin*. Granta Books, 2012.

Healey, Dan. *Homosexual Desire in Revolutionary Russia: The Regulation of Sexual and Gender Dissent*. University of Chicago Press, 2001.

Tuller, David. *Cracks in the Iron Closet: Travels in Gay and Lesbian Russia*. University of Chicago Press, 1996.

Wilkinson, Cai. "Russia's Anti-Gay Laws: The Politics and Consequences of a Moral Panic." *The Disorder of Things*, June 23, 2013, <http://thedisorderofthings.com/2013/06/23/russias-anti-gay-laws-the-politics-and-consequences-of-a-moral-panic/>.