

University Book Production and Courtly Patronage in Thirteenth-Century France and Spain

George D. Greenia

The growth of the book industry in the thirteenth century, both in terms of its sheer volume and its artistic refinement, is one of the most dazzling accomplishments of that period. The causes of this muscular advance in the manufacture and sale of manuscripts have generally been attributed to the combined effects of the nascent medieval universities—and the *studia generalia* around which they were built—and of courtly patronage and commissions, reawakened on a grand scale.

Although problems of manuscript production and patronage are more often associated with art history than with literary studies or intellectual history, the specific histories of France and Spain, and their respective patrons of the arts, Louis IX and Alfonso X, reveal curious contrasts which have been underutilized to date in research on literature, the book arts and the structures of their social supports in the thirteenth century. The configuration of education and patronage in these two countries provides substantive collateral data about the subtle pressures on the types of literature generated in the medieval courts of France and Spain, especially in the light of a superb monument of the book arts that was a triumph of one of the countries and merely a treasured, but not emulated, possession of the other.

The Bible Moralisée

This inquiry grew from a simple historical datum into a series of complex questions involving factors beyond those of the styles of illumination that originally prompted this investigation. The historical incident was that sometime during the thirteenth century the famous *Bible Moralisée* or Moralized Bible in three volumes, illuminated during the life of King Saint Louis IX and still preserved as a major treasure of the Cathedral of Toledo, arrived in Spain.

The astonishing lavishness of the work and its length would lead inevitably to its association with the royal court in Paris, but what

incontrovertibly ties the Toledo *Bible Moralisée* to King Louis is a portrait of the youthful king, seated next to his mother, Blanche (or Blanca) of Castile, on the last folio of the last gathering. This final quire of the last volume (one of the very few imperfections in the Toledo set) had already been detached from its binding by the beginning of the fifteenth century and currently forms part of the holdings of the Pierpont Morgan Library in New York (M. 240).¹

Other moralized bibles, a French fashion that lasted into the fifteenth century,² done in the Parisian style are also linked to the same royal atelier. There is only one other three-volume set, now divided between Oxford (Bodley 270b=vol. I),³ Paris (BN lat. 11560=vol. II) and London (BL Harley 1526-7=vol. III); and two other one-volume moralized bibles which include mostly parts of the Old Testament: Vienna Nationalbibl. MS 2554 (Genesis through Kings) and MS 1179 (historical books, Job, Daniel and Apocalypse).⁴

Diplomatic and dynastic ties between Spain and France were especially strong in the early thirteenth century. Blanche of Castile, daughter of Alfonso VIII of Castile, had married the future Louis VIII (the betrothal took place in 1200), which made her son, Louis IX, and Alfonso X cousins. The more important marriage for the Spanish side was that of another Blanche, or Blanca, daughter of Louis IX, to Fernando de la Cerda, Alfonso's firstborn son in 1269. Since Louis IX and Blanche of Castile are shown in the closing illumination of the Morgan fragment as equals, the *Moralized Bible* now in Toledo must have been executed during her regency while Louis was still a minor, that is between 1226 and 1236.⁵ It is not unreasonable to suppose, then, that this masterwork of illumination would have subsequently made a fitting coronation present for the young Spanish scholar and prince, Alfonso X, in 1252, or perhaps as one of the dynastic exchanges when Alfonso's eldest son and heir married into the French royal family, betrothing Blanca in 1266 and marrying her in 1269.⁶

This *Bible Moralisée* is almost certainly singled out in Alfonso's testament of January 21, 1284 which specified his bequests:

Furthermore, we command that should our body be buried in Seville, that the tablet we had made with relics in honor of Holy Mary be given there, and that

they carry it in procession at the solemnities of Holy Mary, and place it on the altar, and the four books called the *Espejo historial* [probably Vincent de Beauvais's *Speculum historiale*] that King Louis of France had made, and the rich cloth that our sister the Queen of England gave us, which is to be placed on the altar, and the chasuble, and the dalmatic, which are richly embroidered with images, and a large tablet of images in which there are many scenes in ivory of the deeds and the tales of the deeds of Holy Mary, they should place on the altar of Holy Mary for Mass. And furthermore we command that the two bibles and the three books in heavy lettering with silver covers, and the other bible illustrated in three volumes that King Louis of France gave us, and our tablet with the relics, and the crowns with the gemstones and the cameos, and the rings, and other noble objects that belong to the king, that he have them whoever inherits from us by right our lordship over Castile and Leon.

And furthermore we command that all the vestments in our chapel with all the other books should be given to the great church of Holy Mary of Seville, or to the church of Murcia if our body is buried there, excepting those vestments which we explicitly commanded for the church of Seville, and the two bibles that we command to be given to whomever inherits our possessions.⁷

It is not atypical of Alfonso to conflate royal and devotional objects. With his convergent visions of his roles as spiritual and political leader, he plausibly considered "the other bible in three historical books" (*la otra [biblia] en tres libros hestoriada*) both a personal, devotional possession as well as a royal one pertaining to the dynastic patrimony.

The next undisputed mention of the great moralized French bible is in an inventory of the cathedral of Toledo from 1539,⁸ although there are apparent witnesses as early as 1466 and perhaps earlier.⁹

The Book Arts in France and Spain

The art of manuscript illumination had not been flourishing in Spain in the decades prior to 1252, but did subsequently blossom under the patronage of Alfonso the Learned. The style of these Alphonsine Spanish illuminations is frequently classified as an early form of international Gothic with French influences predominating, but any cursory inspection of the actual miniatures will show marked divergences of styles and taste.¹⁰ Given the meager local traditions in book painting, and a prestigious, not to mention enormous, exemplar of French gothic craftsman-

ship held in the bosom of the Castilian court with the arrival of the *Moralized Bible*, why are Spanish miniatures of this period so clearly different—in color, composition, use of blank space, attempts at perspective, social realities represented, and heightened narrative character—from their French contemporaries?

Attempting to answer this initial inquiry leads to a whole list of related questions that emerge from problems of national stylistic divergences, questions pertaining to the nature of patronage for the book arts in France and Spain, the interplay of market forces and literacy, the revolution in book format in the thirteenth century, and the matrix of controlling influences and esthetics surfacing during the reigns of Louis IX and Alfonso X. We cannot give full solutions to these problems or perhaps even a satisfactory survey of what we would like to know in order to plot the fields that need to be explored, but one can sketch at least something of what delineates the configuration of energies at play and how they compare on either side of the Pyrenees.

Christopher De Hamel's *Glossed Books of the Bible and the Origins of the Paris Booktrade*¹¹ amplifies our appreciation of a fact that was already cogently explored by Robert Branner in *Manuscript Painting In Paris During the Reign of Saint Louis*¹² and by Otto Pächt and others several decades earlier, namely how the rise of the University in Paris created an economic and artistic explosion in the art of book illumination. More recently the studies collected in *La production du livre universitaire au moyen âge: exempla et pecia*¹³ have helped sharpen our focus on trends in production and distribution in centers of the *studium generale* outside of Iberia.

For the first time in the Middle Ages, a new critical mass was reached in terms of the demand for books and the commercial organization for their production and distribution. As students assembled from across Europe to study theology under the brilliant tutelage of masters like Albertus Magnus and Thomas Aquinas, the scattered semi-rural cottage industries related to the book arts began to relocate to the tight urban environment of the Île de la Cité and the Left Bank. Tax records for the *taille* levied on merchants and incidental documents such as the oaths the universities naggingly imposed on *librarii* and *stationarii* from that period indicate that book merchants began to specialize in

aspects of their trade. By turns they devoted themselves to the manufacture and sale of parchment, the maintenance of official lists of required texts and university-certified copies of them, the sale of second-hand books (closely monitored by the Parisian university authorities so that it would not be excessively profitable for the dealers)¹⁴, or the sale of other books prepared on commission and, occasionally, on speculation, and finally the leasing out of *pecia* or single chapters or quires for reproduction by customers. Finally there were special shops too for illumination and binding.

This trade was not only lucrative for the merchants involved, it also served the needs of those who wrote the books and who admired them from afar. Well known authors, in particular those belonging to institutionalized communities of scholars such as the Dominicans at St. Jacques or the Franciscans at Cordeliers, collaborated with book dealers for the prompt and accurate publication of their works. The astonishing rapidity with which Thomas Aquinas became the dominant authority in scholastic theology throughout Europe, for example, has to be credited in large measure to the mechanisms in place to produce tidy, portable (but usually not illuminated) editions of his works. Many other intellectual pilgrims displaced themselves to this French nerve center for theological study and returned home with their illuminated French textbooks in their baggage. And in the opposite direction, Bolognese legal manuals were purchased in Italy and sent north, ample spaces having been reserved in the text blocks to be filled with miniatures by Parisian craftsmen. Finally, the university's role in assuring accurate copies and uniform pricing gave it unique and almost complete control over the sector of the book market that they subsumed for their educational enterprise.

This enterprise required one very significant alteration in the book format: a reduction in size. The newly reduced dimensions of the early thirteenth century came about because of several factors, among them the need to generate more individual copies from a relatively limited quantity of parchment and the preference of customers for readily portable tomes. This was an understandable need for students who would be returning to their relatively distant homes. It was a stronger desideratum for itinerant preachers such as the Dominicans. The book most important to them was

not the learned commentaries or other core texts of the university curriculum, like the *Sentences* of Peter Lombard or the works of Aristotle, but the Bible, newly formulated by scholars associated with the University of Paris in what soon became a canonical arrangement of books and formatted for the first time in a single volume of elegantly minute script.¹⁵

The French monarchs under whose benevolent auspices all this occurred have not been mentioned for a simple reason: much of it happened without them. The reigns of Louis VIII and Louis IX (along with his regent mother during his minority) embrace the period of major expansion for the book trades in Paris, but the reigning monarch is no longer the principal, much less the sole, patron for the production of books. Many individuals were involved in the commissioning and production of small, cheap books, and not only bibles by any means. Even the monasteries were displaced from center stage because the monumental (i.e., lavishly decorated and oversized) copies of liturgical and scriptural books were no longer the mainstay of the book industry. The earlier cathedral schools—so famous in the twelfth century—had more limited reading lists than the universities established in Paris and elsewhere in the thirteenth century, and more tightly-knit communities of students who came and shared copies of primary works for longer periods of time. The newly consolidated tradesmen in book supplies and labor in Paris were still available for lateral commissions, both monastic and royal, but their attention was turned toward their academic clientele above all.¹⁶

Thus, to speak of manuscript illumination in the court of Louis IX is to discuss the commissions of an admittedly major patron who nonetheless hired his artisans and derived his artistic styles from the independent mainstream thriving around him. We should suppose a labor force of copyists and illuminators not permanently assigned to the *scriptorium* of the king but drawn from the private sector. The opulence of a finished product would have marked it as royal, but the character of its design was essentially that found in many far more modest works produced simultaneously on all sides.

The great *Moralized Bible* of Toledo is a good example. It contains an astonishing volume of miniatures, some 13,000 in the three volumes.

Although the expansiveness of the product stretched the limits of the iconographic repertoire of its artists, in many ways it was merely an industrious extension and amplification of the styles and canons common to its diminutive cousins. Its columns of historiated medallions are clearly related to those of the popular design used in many standard bibles to adorn the opening of the Book of Genesis and in a similar fashion the Tree of Jesse column at the opening of Matthew.¹⁷ The modeling of the drapery and hunched posture of the figures parallel those in the pocket bibles of the same period. The palette of colors employed gravitates toward the same jewel-toned blues and reds seen in countless French gothic illuminations produced in Paris around that time and probably draws its chromatic preferences from those of the stained glass of the same period.¹⁸

There are aspects of this *Moralized Bible* of Toledo that harken back to earlier, more romanesque, styles, such as the full-page image of the *Christus Pancrator* (fol. 1v) enthroned within a lobed mandorla, symmetrically framed by a tetrad of almost identically sculpted angels superimposed on a swirling stream of heavenly ether. The *Christus* is drafting the forms for the bowels of the earth and the course of the planets within the open womb of the universe perched on his lap. But this set piece (compare almost identical compositions in the Oxford and Vienna MS 2554 *Bibles Moralisées* reproduced by Mezquita Mesa¹⁹) deliberately seeks its majesty in its appeal to what were, by then, slightly archaic formal models. The facing page of this codex (fol. 2r), tracing the events of the days of creation already alluded to in the previous image, displays a movement toward more contemporary styles with their more vibrant color scheme, use of gold backgrounds within tighter frames, Gothic postures and gestures.

The fortunes of the book market to the south in the kingdoms of León and Castile, united under the authority of Alfonso, was markedly different. The society and culture he helped nurture were less integrated into the pan-European currents of power and prestige flowing in and out of Paris. There were universities, indeed perhaps the first in Europe, that founded in Palencia by Alfonso VIII shortly before the university in Paris, and other courses of study established by Fernando III, Alfonso's father, and by Alfonso X himself, in Salamanca, Valladolid and Sevilla.

One of the most notable characteristics of the Spanish *studium generale* is direct patronage by the Crown and its dependence on royal care.²⁰ The *Siete Partidas*, Alfonso's great legal compendium, takes great care to lay out how schools should be encouraged and fairly governed, both for general education but especially to produce fair masters and judges of laws. The mostly theoretical provisions of the *Siete partidas* however include a rather specific section on the management of book shops:

How the *Studium Generale* should have stationers who have shops for exemplar books.

There should be stationers for every *Studium Generale* to be fully furnished, and it should have in its shops good books, and legible, and faithful in text and gloss so that students can rent them out as exemplars to make new books from them or correct the ones they already have. And no one should have such a shop or stationer's like this without permission from the rector of the *Studium*; and before the rector gives his license for this he should first have the books examined of whoever wants to have the stationer's shop to see if they are good and legible and faithful: and whoever is found not to have such books should not be permitted to be a stationer or to rent his books to students unless they be thoroughly corrected first.

Furthermore the rector ought to take counsel with others in the *Studium* about how much the stationer should receive for every quire he lends out to students for making copies or correcting their own books; and furthermore he should receive faithful witnesses who will guard well and loyally all the books that are given to him to sell, and that he should not commit any fraud.²¹

When these lines were drafted (1256-65) the role of the *stationarii* had barely emerged in Paris; the Spanish maecenas had already gathered information about them and codified their position within an ideal university system. There is no documentary citation of stationers in Paris before 1275²² and indeed Alfonso seems to be the first to employ the word in any vernacular tongue (let alone in Latin), already in 1254 in the founding charter of the University at Salamanca.²³

The overall theoretical cast of the *Siete Partidas* holds true here as well: the law cited above makes no reference to the control of the physical production side of the book market. It is not even necessarily supposed that fresh copies would be executed by the stationers and sold to customers who might order copies made for them. The book dealers'

role here was apparently that of keeper of reliable authorized master copies for rent. They perhaps did not even run copy shops of their own. The same is true of the provisions for the founding of the *studium generale* in Salamanca which only stated that the "the stationers should maintain good and correct copies" (*estacionario. . .tenga todos los exemplarios buenos e chorrechos*).²⁴ Thriving universities outside of Spain, by contrast, did not so much preemptively imagine the role of stationers in the scholarly market or even co-opt the services of existing book tradesmen as create a new role for them by generating a fresh place for them in the market. The number of scholars and students attracted to Spanish academic programs was considerably smaller than in Paris or Bologna, and given the geographic spread of academic programs across the Iberian peninsula, the "critical mass" achieved elsewhere with regard to book manufacture was never reached on Spanish soil. It is not surprising then that the new universities established by Alfonso never reached the same level of fame as their principal rival on the banks of the Seine.²⁵

We should add a further note here on the material culture that might have supported book production. There was already a thriving paper industry in Spain during Alfonso's reign and indeed well before. The detail in the first miniature accompanying *cantiga* 173a is purely coincidental to the miracle story it is intended to illustrate, but what is remarkable about it is that the Christian pharmacist inspecting the urine sample in the specimen flask that has been brought to him by the messenger boy is selling (besides his top shelf potions and herbs in their elegant containers) reams of blank paper. The open notebook to his side is probably meant to signify his literacy and therefore impressive learning; the surface looks blank only by the conventions of representing this object. But he also seems to have an ample supply of bound ledgers and blank filler paper stacked beside him. The one bound volume that looks like it is tumbling down is an icon superimposed on the area to identify this blank paper. So Alfonso should have had plenty of "parchment from rags," as it was called, to use instead of the more expensive real thing. It is a misfortune of political history that Alfonso needed to sign the treaty of Almizra in 1244 which ceded almost all of the paper manufacturing sites in Iberia to his father-in-law, Jaime I of

Aragón. Alfonso limited the use of paper in his realms, at least for transactions with the royal chancery, and perhaps simply to control the scale of the market and the payment of duties.²⁶ There was no way he could predict its eventual utility, although curiously Jaime I, not a patron of learning, used his paper resources to build the first modern document-infested bureaucracy.

Collateral data on book manufacture is generally in short supply but some at least is available. The matter of copies produced through the *pecia* system mentioned earlier is especially instructive. Spanish manuscripts showing direct ties to *pecia* exemplars are rare: those documented by the various contributors of *La Production du livre universitaire au moyen âge* are:

Thomas Aquinas. *In I Sententiarum*.

Barcelona, Biblioteca del Cabildo, 45, 14th cent.

Madrid, BN 516, 13/14th cent.²⁷

Thomas Aquinas. *In III Sententiarum*.

*Pamplona, Catedral 51, 13/14th cent.

Thomas Aquinas. *In IV Sententiarum*.

*Almagro, fragment, 13th cent. (autograph)

*Salamanca, fragment, 13th cent. (autograph)²⁸

Aristotle. *Magna Moralia*

*Madrid, BN 1413, 14th cent.²⁹

*Madrid, BN 2872, 14th cent.³⁰

Valencia, Biblioteca Capitular, 70, 14/15th cent.

Salamanca, Biblio. Universitatis, 2705, 13th cent.

Attributed to Bonaventure. *Super Sapientiam*

Toledo, Biblioteca del Cabildo 5-5, 13th cent.

In every case asterisks mark copies that are undoubtedly French in origin; none of the remainder can be claimed with any certainty to have originated on Spanish soil. To judge from evidence to date, the great exemplar and *pecia* mechanism for book production that carried French and Italian universities may never have been practiced in Spain at all.³¹

A discussion of copies of medieval texts destined for the lecture halls of the universities can be complemented by an analogous consideration of surviving illuminated manuscripts of the thirteenth century. Federico Delclaux produced an interesting (if uneven) summary survey of

illuminated Spanish manuscripts in his study of *Imágenes de la Virgen en los códices medievales de España*.³² Sorting by century through the surviving codices with representations of the Virgin, both from within Spain and from abroad, indicates that manuscripts from the eighth century to those dated in the twelfth total 227; painted books from the twelfth to the thirteenth centuries number 30; from the thirteenth, 168; from the thirteenth to the fourteenth, 46; from the fourteenth, 432; from the fourteenth to the fifteenth, 37; and from the fifteenth, 984.³³

To say that the production and/or acquisition of illuminated books was uneven during this period is an understatement. There were wild swings between exuberant outpourings and sparse growth. To judge from the numbers given by Delclaux, there was a long stretch from the eighth to the twelfth centuries during which there are only about 45 illuminated books per century. Then there was a burst of activity during the renaissance of the twelfth century (87 books with miniatures, 28 done in Spain), a fallow period spanning centuries (30 total, 11 Spanish), a renewed intensification in the thirteenth (168 total, 58 Spanish), and a serious reduction during the unsettled times of Sancho IV, Fernando IV and Alfonso XI (46 total, 6 Spanish). The percentages of books decorated in Spain as opposed to elsewhere works out to 35% (twelfth century), 36% (twelfth-thirteenth), 35% (thirteenth) and 13% (thirteenth to fourteenth). Of course, many other books originally illuminated in Spain were subsequently acquired by institutions in other countries.³⁴

The vigor that Spanish book production shown in the thirteenth century read in these terms may be credited, at least in part, to the prosperity experienced under the leadership of rulers such as Fernando III, Jaime I, Alfonso X. Alfonso alone among them, however, is associated with great literary projects which would have yielded the spin-off benefits necessary to boost the generation of illuminated manuscripts throughout Spain.³⁵

Spain certainly had clear potential for sustaining a voluminous industry since it produced more wool and maintained larger flocks of sheep than any other country in Europe at that time, but there does not seem to have been frequent mechanisms for systematically harvesting and selling parchment to consumers except on a local level, much less through the negotiation of middle men as happened in France. And to

judge from the extant study copies of the classical authors and their principal medieval commentators, the school books used in Spain in the thirteenth century were close copies of French models. The one significant exception that seems to emerge from a study of Spanish holdings for the thirteenth century is pocket bibles for which there seems to have been less demand, perhaps because of the relatively slower inroads the mendicant orders made into Spain. This is especially clear if we study the single-volume Spanish bibles that are in fact produced in that period. Except for their relative size, they imitate their French prototypes in almost every detail, including the styles of the miniatures that decorate them.³⁶

That leads us to the conclusion that Alfonso X, aptly dubbed *el Sabio* "the Learned"—but not university trained—could not depend on a pre-existing book trade. His translators, scribes and illuminators had to be added to the list of royal retainers, on call at their base of operations, such as the translators in Toledo, or traveling with the royal entourage as the mobile court made its way through the socially unsettled and politically restive territories under the king's jurisdiction. That the *scriptorium* was not a totally independent operation, but rather in all likelihood shared staff and scribal practices with the king's chancery, is precisely the point that Anthony Cárdenas sought to make in his article on "Alfonso's Scriptorium and Chancery: Role of Prologue in Bonding the *Translatio Studii* to the *Translatio potestatis*." The Spain of Alfonso X clearly did not provide an atmosphere which could foster a substantial commercial market for books. The generally lower literacy rate in Spain among nobles, and, to judge from the anxious demands of the Fourth Lateran Council, even among clergy,³⁷ made for a more constricted field of potential consumers outside the fledgling academies. The other chief patrons and sustainers of the book arts elsewhere in Europe, the monasteries, were poorer and more widely scattered in Spain than in Northern France. Situated as they were in the north, these Spanish monasteries would hardly have benefitted from the distant and somewhat vagrant troop of artisans associated with a king who preferred to linger in his southern territories, nor could they be expected spontaneously to collaborate with his decidedly secular enterprises and interests.

In the absence, then, of a strong local tradition or industry for the

book arts in Spain, it is all the more telling that the illuminations produced in the Alphonsine workshops are not more strongly influenced by the accomplished French models in the new style available in the *Moralized Bible* and other, more modest exemplars which did exert their sway elsewhere in the peninsula. The decentralized nature of manuscript production in Iberia resulted in more centrifugal tastes and regional styles. Even the authoritative royal style could not impose itself on the nation and has to be considered itself a "regional" (that is localized) fashion.

When there is an attempt at imitation of French models, the contrast shows how distant the Spanish aesthetic was from the original. One need only compare the Tree of Jesse illumination in the *Cantigas* (*cantiga* 20, fol. 32v) to those common in French bibles to see how the Spanish derivative looks cramped and forced in its limited space and unaccustomed color scheme.³⁸ Comparisons with the ubiquitous Tree of Jesse illuminations and the *Christus Pancrator* of the *Bibles moralisées* offer apt points of departure. The inelegant *Christi Pancratores* of the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* (*cantigas* 70, 100, and especially 120, fols. 104r, 145r, 170v) are truthfully inept copies of the superb prototypes of Christ the Creator of All which were designed and executed in Paris with their sinuous mastery of line that merges celestial bodies with their divine space and energizes the swirling forms of the surrounding angels with churning movement, like the one that opens the *Biblia de San Luis* discussed earlier. The attenuation of line and monumental scale in the French moralized bible are just not present in the *Cantigas* illuminations. Explanations for *why* they are not are tentative but perhaps point the way to some initial answers about the nature of courtly letters during his reign.

Consequences of Patronage

First of all, copies of books being made for royal and court use in Spain were few in number and designed for a select readership, principally the king and his team of scholars and collaborators. In Evelyn Procter's vision of their disposition, they were to be "deposited in the

king's chamber" and reserved for a rather exclusive circle of intimates and like minds.³⁹ The standardization that occurs with mass production could never take place. The reduced output also meant that larger formats for books were still viable options, and indeed there seems to be a clear preference on Alfonso's part for the princely dimensions characteristic of the liturgical volumes of the twelfth century.⁴⁰ Historians of Spanish art and letters frequently admit, even with some embarrassment, that most of the illuminated codexes from the Alfonsine *scriptorium* contain unfinished miniatures or more often mere blanks where illuminations were meant to go, but this may merely be a consequence of Alfonso's unwillingness to leave a completed written text behind during his travels just so the illuminations could be completed in an established shop.⁴¹

Second, most of the works generated by Alfonso and his coauthors—their relationship in basic terms was one of a team of writers directed by a fairly engaged editor—were fresh creations, at least in medieval terms, rather than components from an established repertoire of titles. Neither the precedent for the texts themselves nor for the miniatures that explicated and adorned their contents had become standardized as had happened in Paris. There, accepted solutions for marking the openings of various books of the bible, of given treatises of law or commentaries on scripture came into common use and had probably developed, to some extent, into expectations on the part of many of the commissioning patrons of these volumes.⁴² The celebrated products of the Spanish court scholars, however, such as the vast collection of Marian miracle stories known as the *Cantigas de Santa María* in its multiple royal manuscripts, the lavishly designed *Lapidary* Alfonso originally commissioned in his youth, and the vastly (and gratuitously) detailed *Book of Chess, Dice and Backgammon* finished scant months before the monarch's demise, all demanded unorthodox pictorializations. Chico Picaza has aptly noted that:

In effect, the miniaturists follow the template layed out by the dramatic plot of the poem [in the *Cantigas*]; the dependence on the text is undeniable. But they also include a whole world of theatrical precisions and concretizations that pertain exclusively to the genius of their graphic creations. In the [narrative]

poems as much as in the canticles of praise they allow themselves a whole range of artistic licences that are clear proof on the one hand of the artistic possibilities and on the other of the creative liberty that characterized Alfonso's court, stamping the works that emerged from it with a freshness, spontaneity and heterodoxy that is simply fascinating.

As a consequence, the term "illustration" is inaccurate for the *Cantigas*. The realism of its miniatures transcends the references to the adjoining text and erupts into the field of [true] pictorial creation.⁴³

The challenge and freedom that go along with highly original circumstances spawned fresh solutions and, more importantly, an independently configured iconography of visual images. Alfonso's master illuminators broke entirely fresh ground in this field, unquestionably inspired by the aggressive intellectual leadership of their patron.

Third, differences in details of style in the actual execution of the miniatures are sometimes linked to more superficial factors. The broad flat fields of gold, sometimes built up on cushions of gesso—plaster of Paris—are a triumph of techniques nearly forgotten in the west since the days of Byzantine (and Ottonian) manuscript illumination. French artists are among the first to return to gold leaf for backgrounds, while their Spanish counterparts tend to stick to their characteristically more understated use of powdered gold painted onto the surface of their manuscripts. This is not to suggest that technical skill was lacking artistic refinement; just a more sober palette and sense of decorative reserve. Silver, again in modest quantities, was also employed in Spain for book painting, in contrast to France which rarely used this precious metal. Unfortunately this silver has tarnished beyond restoration in the Alfonsoine exemplars, but the effect of the original must have been impressive.

The differences in chromatic range are probably more deeply rooted in the aesthetic preferences of the Iberian illuminators. It is true that there was far less stained glass in Spain than in France—the only outstanding exception from this period is the windows of the cathedral of León, commissioned by Alfonso X, but that cannot be the only reason for the more sparing use of blues and reds in miniatures from the Spanish *scriptorium*. We might note that the color green is somewhat less common in the Spanish king's manuscripts, since it is usually limited naturalistically to vegetation, while shades of brown and tan are an unex-

pected favorite, and are used to good effect.

We should point out yet another aspect of the composition of Spanish book paintings of this period that intimates an aesthetic sensibility different from that of French compositions. One notices in the miniatures of the Alfonsine team a subtle satisfaction with totally uncolored backgrounds for many scenes, allowing the cast of the parchment itself to provide a neutral field for the characters to stand against within their patterned frames. More than just a freedom from the *horror vacui* that prompts other European miniaturists to fill their spaces with inhabited scrolls and dense foliage, the artists of the Alfonsine team designated this blankness to stand for divine or timeless space. While it may only represent a cloudless sky in the distance, in the context of otherworldly events and experiences, or in cases of intervention by the powers of heaven in the affairs of earth below, these expanses of blank vellum function as part of an innovative iconography peculiar to the work of the illuminators of the *Cantigas de Santa María* in particular.⁴⁴

Now if we apply what we have seen for the book arts to the study of literary production, some instructive parallels emerge. The courtly literature of Spain during the second and third quarters of the thirteenth century is directed to an apparently more "popular" audience, in that their exposure to university-style letters and culture is limited. In the case of the *Bible Moralisée*, the intellectual context of the commentaries was intimately linked with the piety and hermeneutics of the authors of the *Glossa ordinaria* and to that of commentators like Walafrid Strabo, Anselm of Laon, Bernard of Clairvaux and Hugh of St. Cher. The subsequent intense philosophical speculations of the professional metaphysicians of Paris that preoccupied university debates of the mid-thirteenth century likewise had no spillover into the ethos of the Alfonsine audience, a middlebrow clutch of readers and listeners drawn into a fairly tight group around the king himself. While the histories and legal codes that he commissioned found subsequent avenues for dissemination and enjoyed true popularity after his death, the texts that display greater refinement in taste or scientific curiosity, such as the *Lapidary*, the *Cantigas* and the *Books of Chess, Dice and Backgammon*, are rarely copied in later times. Both their texts and their illuminations were distinctively Spanish in taste, novel in concept and execution,

independent of outside traditions, almost solely the byproduct of royal patronage, and unsupported by a financial infrastructure or social institution.

Conclusions

So one might effectively challenge the often supposed uniformity of circumstances for the book arts during the Middle Ages by underscoring the unique personal role of Alfonso X in encouraging the fledgling book market in Spain. While one *can* justifiably speak of royal patronage for manuscript illumination in the court of Alfonso X, he cannot speak in the same terms regarding Louis IX. The latter drew his models and craftsmen from a readily available pool of contributors who were making a fine living for themselves already and who were a recognized force in local French economy and in international artistic circles. Alfonso had to work in the opposite direction, assembling and recruiting his artisans and suppliers from across his realm, and creating a "critical creative mass" on his own.

The nascent universities of Spain are often referred to in their charters as well watered gardens which will bear fruit for the entire kingdom.⁴⁵ The seeds Alfonso nurtured in his palace produced stunning blossoms, but, as hothouse flowers, they could not last long after his death. Manuscript illumination in Paris continued and grew into the hardy perennial that continued to bear fruit in the many triumphs of French illumination produced in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. Alfonso died in 1284 and, sadly, so did exuberant native manuscript illumination until the major influx of foreign, French and Italian and Flemish, models in the late fifteenth century. At least while it was in flower, the thirteenth-century genius of Spanish book illumination enjoyed truly monumental scope and bracing originality as a form of courtly art.

Notes

- 1 *The Pierpont Morgan Library: Exhibition of Illuminated Manuscripts Held at the New York Public Library*, introduction by Charles Rufus Morley, Manuscript Catalogue by Belle da Costa Greene and Meta R. Harrsen (New York: Pierpont Morgan Library, 1984), 26. "These eight leaves form the last quire of vol. 3 of the great Moralized Bible (*Biblia Rica*) in the Treasury of the Cathedral of Toledo. The last page of the Morgan portion consists of a full-page picture depicting: above, the youthful King Louis IX, 'St. Louis,' of France, seated beside his mother, Queen Blanche of Castile; and below, an ecclesiastic dictating to a scribe who is inserting the text on the pages, in the space reserved for it, below the outlines for the medallion miniatures which have not yet been drawn in or painted. This representation of King Louis, still under the regency of his mother, dates the manuscript between 1226 and 1234." R. Haussherr, "Drei Texthandschriften der Bible moralisée," in *Festschrift für Eduard Trier zum 60. Geburtstag* (Berlin: Hrsg. von Justus Müller-Hofstede und Werner Spies, 1981), 35-65 has suggested the possibility that this final quire never arrived in Spain with the rest of the *Biblia de San Luis* but royal gifts between monarchs (compare below) are usually presented intact. In any case the final *cuaderno* must have been missing when Biblioteca Nacional MS 10232 was copied from it at the end of the fourteenth or at the start of the fifteenth centuries. For the Toledo *Biblia moralizada*, its history its and its relation to Madrid BN 10232 cf. Mezquita Mesa, no. 19.
- 2 Ana Domínguez-Rodríguez, "Filiación estilística de la miniatura alfonsí." *España entre el Mediterráneo y el Atlántico*, Actas del 23 Congreso Internacional de Historia del Arte, Granada 1973, 2 vols. (Granada: Universidad de Granada, 1976), 1:345-58.
- 3 This volume was reported having been "acquired" by Sir Christopher Haydon during the sack of Cádiz in 1565 [Elías Tormo, "La Biblia de San Luis de la Catedral de Toledo," *BRAH* 82 (1923): 291].
- 4 There is also a Spanish *Biblia moralizada*, BN MS 10232, the *Osuna Bible* in Latin and Castilian. It is a massive shop project without illuminations which includes a vernacular translation of the allegorical interpretations on the scripture passages. Compare with Charles B. Faulhaber, Angel Gómez Moreno, David Mackenzie, John J. Nitti, Brian Dutton, eds., *Bibliography of Old Spanish Texts. Literary Texts, Third Edition*, (Madison, WI: Hispanic Seminary of Medieval Studies, 1984); Margherita Morreale, "Vernacular Scriptures in Spain," in *The Cambridge History of the Bible*, 2 vols. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1969), 465-91, 533-45; Margherita Morreale, "La 'Biblia moralizada' latino-castellana de la Biblioteca Nacional de Madrid (MS 10232)," *Spanische Forschungen der Görresgesellschaft* 29 (1975): 437-56; Alexandre de Laborde, *La Bible Moralisee illustrée et conservée a Oxford, Paris et Londres. Reproduction integrale du manuscrit du XIII^e siècle*, 4 vols. (Paris: Members de la Société Française de Reproductions de Manuscrits et Peintures, 1911-

- 5 She was also regent during Louis' absence in 1247 on crusade, but stylistic evidence suggests an earlier date for the Toledo *Bible moralisée*, and it is doubtful that her portrait would present her as the royal equal of a rather boyish king who was by then thirty-three and in full control. Laborde has suggested that the woman depicted is actually Louis' wife Margarhite of Provence whom he married in 1234 when he was 19 and she was 13, well within the stylistic dates proposed for the work as a whole although they look somewhat older in these portraits.
- 6 I am grateful to Professor Robert MacDonald for this suggestion. The association with Alfonso himself was thought at one time to be more tenuous—there had been debate about whether it was a royal gift from one monarch to the other or if it merely passed through a later succession of ecclesiastical hands. (Luis Pérez de Guzmán, Marqués de Morbecq, "Un inventario del siglo XIV de la Catedral de Toledo. (la Biblia de San Luis)," *BRAH* 90 (1926): 373-419]. But now there is no doubt about his ownership. Historians held that the common name of this bible, the *Biblia de San Luis*, arose from its association either with King St. Louis (ruled 1236-70) or with St. Louis of Anjou (1274-1297), bishop of Toulouse and one-time prisoner of Alfonso III of Aragón and subsequently prisoner of Jaime II of Aragón. If these volumes acquired their name by passing through Bishop St. Louis's hands, then the date of their arrival in Spain would have been considerably later, well after Alfonso's death, which would leave unexplained the avenues of physical transmission.
- 7 Alfonso el Sabio, *Antología*, Colección "Sepan cuantos," 229 (México City: Editorial Porrúa, 1973), 212-13. There are two testaments of Alfonso, one dated Nov. 8, 1283 and the other January 21, 1284; the passage quoted is from the second document, the only one which details the distribution of personal goods:

Otrost mandamos, que si el nuestro cuerpo fuere y enterrado en Sevilla, que sea y dada la nuestra tabla que fecimos facer con las reliquias a honra de Sancta María, e que la trayan en la procesión en las grandes fiestas de Sancta María, e las ponga sobre el altar, e los quatro libros que llaman Espejo historial que mandó facer el rey Luis de Francia, e el paño rico que nos dio la reina de Inglaterra, nuestra hermana, que es para poner sobre el altar, e la casulla, e el almática, que son de paño hestoriado labrado muy ricamente, e una tabla grande hestoriada en que ha muchas imágenes de marfil, fechos e hestorias de fechos de Sancta María que la ponga cada sábado sobre el altar de Sancta María a la misa. E mandamos otrost, que las dos Biblias et tres libros de letra gruesa, cobiertas de plata, e la otra en tres libros hestoriada que nos dio el rey Luis de Francia, e la nuestra tabla con las reliquias, e las coronas con las piedras, e con los camafeos, e sortijas, e otras cosas nobles que pertenecen al rey, que lo haya todo aquel que con derecho por nos heredare el nuestro señorío mayor de Castilla e León.

E otrost mandamos, que todas las vestimentas de la nuestra capilla con todos los otros libros, que los den a la iglesia mayor de Sancta María de Sevilla, o a la iglesia de Murcia, si el nuestro cuerpo fuere y enterrado, sacando las vestimentas que mandamos señaladamente a la iglesia de Sevilla, et las dos biblias que mandamos dar a aquel que heredare lo nuestro. The Latin version of the same text

in the copy held in the National Archives of France (J 106, n° 32) is dated by Daumet January 10, 1284, i.e. before the date of the Castilian version, but still probably a translation of a working copy drafted in the vernacular. Georges Daumet, "Les Testaments d'Alphonse X le Savant, Roi de Castille," *Bibliothèque de l'École de Chartes* 67 (1906): 74. notes that "Les mentions finales inscrites sur les deux pièces de parchemin conservées aux Archives nationales indiquent que transcription et collation à l'original furent faites le 20 avril 1284, c'est-à-dire la veille même de la mort du roi de Castille."

Et similiter mandamus quod si nostrum corpus debuerit in Ispali sepeliri, quod detur ibi nostra tabula quam fieri fecimus cum reliquiis ad honorem Beate Marie et eam deferant in processione in sollempnitatibus Beate Marie et ponatur etiam super altare, et quatuor libri qui appellantur Speculum storiacum quos fieri mandavit rex Francie Ludovicus, et pannus dives quem nobis nostra soror regina Anglie contulit, qui est super altare optimus ad ponendum, et la casulla et dalmatica et casa etiam, quia sunt panni istoriaci diverarum istoriarum ditissime laborati, et quedam tabula magna in qua plures diverse ymagine eburnee continentur facte ad similitudinem istoriarum Virginis Marie, et quod ponantur ibi quodlibet sabato supra altare Beate Marie dum a sacerdote missa fuerit celebrata. Mandamus etiam quod due Bible (sic) quarum una continetur in tribus libris litteram grossam habens, argento cooperte, et alia in tribus libris intus historiis adornata, quas nobis contulit res (sic) Francie Lodovicus, et alia nostra tabula cum reliquiis, et corone cum gemis et camafodis et annulis, et alia dona nobilia ad regem pertinencia, quod hec omnia habeat ille qui de jure pro nobis dominium majus Castelle et Legionis fuit dominatus. Similiter mandamos quod omnia vestimenta nostra cum omnibus aliis libris, quod conferantur ecclesie majori Beate Marie Ispalensis vel ecclesie de Murçia, si ibi sepultum fuerit nostrum corpus, illis vestimentis extractis que signanter confferri mandavimus ecclesie Sancte Marie de Sebilis, et duabus Bibliis (sic) quas confferri mandavimus illi cui nostrum contingerit (sic) heredare. (Daumet, 90-91). There is confusion about the two bibles between the Spanish version which talks about "the two Bibles in three books with large lettering" and the Latin version's "two Bibles of which one is contained in three books of large lettering." One of these is the two-volume bible signed by Pedro de Pamplona and left as a bequest by Alfonso to Sancho IV, who in turn gave to the cathedral of Sevilla where it now resides [*Alfonso X. Toledo, 1984, #99*] with bibliography). They are repeated again as exempted in the bequest of all other books to the cathedrals of Seville or Murcia; the three-volume *Biblia de San Luis* is not specifically exempted but should probably be understood to fall under the same intention. It is not beside the point to underscore that Louis IX had made one other incontrovertible gift of books to Alfonso, the copy of Vincent of Beauvais' *Speculum historiale* specified above. Alfonso intended in his first testament, dated November 8, 1283, to bequeath his throne to the reigning king of France, supposedly to unite piously the two greatest Christian kingdoms, but clearly to frustrate his rebellious (and ultimately successful) son Sancho. Alfonso's abortive attempt to name the lamented Fernando de la Cerda's sons his rightful heirs only prolonged the civil war after Alfonso's death. The younger Fernando de la Cerda, failing to assert his rights to the throne originally intended for his father but never renouncing his own claim to it, fled to France and died there in 1296. Jerry

R. Craddock, "Dynasty in Dispute: Alfonso X el Sabio and the Succession to the Throne of Castile and Leon in History and Legend," *Viator* 17 (1986): 197-219 gives a complete account of the dynastic struggle for succession to the throne of Castile and León noting that Alfonso's will was never executed (which may explain the vagaries of ownership of his possessions) but the text of that will certainly remained available for use and misuse by subsequent historians.

8 *Pierpont Morgan Library*, 26.

9 One pre-1350 inventory may allude to it: cf. Luis Pérez de Guzmán. There are, of course, other cases of gifts of books as diplomatic presents exchanged between Alfonso and other notables. Julia Bolton Holloway, "The Road Through Roncesvalles: Alfonsine Formation of Brunetto Latini and Dante-Diplomacy and Literature," in *Emperor of Culture: Alfonso X, the Learned of Castile and his Thirteenth-Century Renaissance*, ed. Robert I. Burns, SJ (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1990), 117, 121 points out how Brunetto Latini apparently sent Alfonso "two fine thirteenth-century manuscripts. In the first a French *Li Livres dou Tresor* now in the Escorial (L.II.3), the second an Italian *Ethica* [of Aristotle] giving the Taddeo Alderotti text (now Bibl. Nac. 10124). . . . In return it is possible that Alfonso sent to Florence the beautiful *Cantigas de Santa María* (Biblioteca Nazionale there, Banco Rari 20). . . . Thus we may be dealing with a meshwork of presentation manuscripts—given by Alfonso of Castile, Manfred of Sicily, and Brunetto Latini—of the *Cantigas*, the *Ethics*, and the *Tresor*." John Esten Keller, *Alfonso X, el Sabio* (New York: Twayne, 1967)1, 69 for his part suggested, without supporting documentation, that the Florence MS of the *Cantigas* was prepared and presented to Louis IX. Neither possibility seems likely: why send a gift of a book that is in such an incomplete state?

10 A rather unsatisfactory comparison between Alfonsine and contemporary foreign illuminations is attempted in Ellen Kosmer and James F. Powers, "Manuscript Illustration: The *Cantigas* in Contemporary Art Context," in *Emperor of Culture*, 53-4 who find the paintings in the *Cantigas* totally lacking what they perceive as the "elegance and refinement of the French" masters in the "attenuation," "balletic charm" and "linear playfulness" of French miniatures, although they do concede that the Spanish illuminations are superior to French and Italian productions in landscape representation. See instead the observations of Ana Domínguez Rodríguez, "El *Libros de los Juegos* y miniatura alfonsí," in Alfonso X el Sabio, *Libros de ajedrez, dados y tablas* (Madrid: Patrimonio Nacional, 1987) and George D. Greenia, "A New Manuscript Illuminated in the Alfonsine Scriptorium," *Bulletin of the Cantigueiros de Santa María* 2 (1989): 31-42; idem, "The Court of Alfonso X in Words and Pictures: The *Cantigas*," in *Courtly Literature: Culture and Context. Acts of the Fifth Triennial Congress of the International Courtly Literature Society*, Dalfsen, The Netherlands, 9-16, 1986 (Amsterdam: Benjamins, 1990), 227-37.

11 Christopher De Hamel, *Glossed Books of the Bible and the Origins of the Paris Booktrade* (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, 1984).

- 12 Robert Branner, *Manuscript Painting In Paris During the Reign of Saint Louis* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1977).
- 13 *La Production du livre universitaire au moyen âge. Exemplar et pecia*. Actes du symposium tenu at Collegio San Bonaventura de Grottaferrata en mai 1983. Textes réunis par Louis J. Bataillon, Bernard G. Guyot, Richard H. Rouse (Paris: CNRS, 1988).
- 14 Richard H. Rouse and Mary A. Rouse, "The Book Trade at the University of Paris," *La Production du Livre*, 41-114; rpt. Mary A. Rouse and Richard H. Rouse, eds., *Authentic Witnesses: Approaches to Medieval Texts and Manuscripts* (Notre Dame, IN: Notre Dame University Press, 1991), 259-338.
- 15 Laura Light, "The New Thirteenth-Century Bible and the Challenge of Heresy," *Viator* 18 (1987): 275-88.
- 16 Rouse and Rouse, "Book Trade," 48; idem, *Authentic Witnesses*, 267 suggest that this was not universally the case: "[I]t would be far wrong to assume that all of an individual *libraire's* work—or even, necessarily, the most lucrative portion of it—had to do with the university. Provided that they met their university obligations, *librarii* (including *librarii* who were stationers) were otherwise free to produce and sell books, illuminators to illuminate, scribes to write, for anyone else they pleased: the Court, the cathedral, the wealthy laymen of the capital and the provinces." True enough, although we not have sufficient records to judge the relative proportions of these segments of their clientele and the vast majority of surviving codices are inelegant service copies more typical of students' texts. Since book prices for students and masters had legal caps on them, the buying market, when it could get away with it, would have feigned association with the university for the sake of the discount, a practice that is if anything more popular now than ever. Still, school texts tend not to enjoy a wide market outside the classroom in any age and it would have been hard to disguise a request for a antiphonal or evangelium, much less a fine moralized bible, as an academic work.
- 17 Branner, pls. I, XIII, XV, XXI and figs. 3, 20-21, 56, 58, 107, 124-26.
- 18 Virginia Chieffo Raguin, *Stained Glass in Thirteenth-Century Burgundy* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1982).
- 19 Teresa Mezquita Mesa, "La Biblia moralizada de la catedral de Toledo," *Goya. Revista del Arte* 181-182 (1984): 17-20.
- 20 Cándido Ajo González y Sáinz de Zúñiga, *Historia de las universidades hispánicas* 10 vols. (Madrid: CSIC, 1957-75; Anthony J. Cárdenas, "Alfonso X and the *Studium Generale*," *Indiana Social Studies Quarterly* 33 (1980): 65-75.

- 21 Alfonso el Sabio, *Antología de Alfonso X el Sabio*, ed Antonio G. Solalinde, *Colección Austral* 169 (Madrid: Espasa Calpe, 1965), 165, partida II, título XXXI, ley xi: *Cómo los estudios generales deben haber estacionarios que tengan tiendas de libros para exemplarios. Estacionarios ha meester que haya en cada estudio general para seer complido, et que tenga en sus estaciones libros buenos, et legibles, et verdaderos de texto et de glosa, que los loguen los escolares para enxemplarios, para facer por ellos libros de nuevo o para emendar los que tovieren escriptos: et tal tienda o estación como esta non la debe ninguno tener sin ortogamiento del rector del estudio; et el rector ante que le dé licencia para esto debe facer examinar primeramente los libros daquel que quier tener la estación para saber si son buenos, et legibles et verdaderos: et al que fallase que non tenie atales libros non le debe consentir que sea estacionario nin los logue a los escolares, a menos de non seer bien emendados primeramente. Otrosí debe apreciar el rector con consejo de los del estudio quanto debe rescebir el estacionario por cada cuaderno que prestare a los escolares para escrebir o para emendar sus libros: et debe otrosí rescebir buenos fiadores dél, que guardará bien et lealmente todos los libros que a él fueren dados para vender, et que non fará engaño.*
- 22 Rouse and Rouse, "Book Trade," 44-47
- 23 Ajo, 439.
- 24 Curiously, perhaps, the stationer's annual salary of 200 *maravedís* is equal to that of the Masters of Grammar, Logic and Medicine (Cárdenas, 66).
- 25 Anthony J. Cárdenas, "Alfonso's Scriptorium and Chancery: Role of Prologue in Bonding the *Translatio Studii* to the *Translatio potestatis*," in *Emperor of Culture*, 90-108 also suggests that in some ways Alfonso's provisions are more like that in force in Bologna. References in Latin to the roles of both stationer and bookseller also occur in the *Ordenanzas o estatutos de Jaime II el Justo para la Universidad de Lérida* dated Zaragoza, September 2, 1300 (Ajo, 195-240, 256, 258).
- 26 *Siete partidas* partida III, título 18 ley 5; Robert I. Burns S.J., "The Paper Revolution in Europe: Crusader Valencia's Paper Industry—A Technological and Behavioral Breakthrough," *Pacific Historical Review* 50 (1981): 1-30.
- 27 Copied from a stationer's exemplar, probably French. Compare with Edward Booth, OP, "The Three Pecia Systems of St. Thomas Aquinas's Commentary in *I Sententiarum*," in *Production du livre universitaire*, 227 for a complete description.
- 28 Both Almagro and Salamanca are from the same original produced in Paris by Aquinas around 1252-56: compare Booth, 225.

- 29 A copy of *pecia exemplar Plagensis*, Biblio. Monasterii, 22 Cpl. (476^b) 21 (Christine, Pannier, "La Traductione latine médiévale des *Magna Moraliū*. Une Étude Critique de la Tradition Manuscrite," in *La Production du livre universitaire*, 165-204). The border decorations and illuminated initials are decidedly French in overall design, use of gold leaf, tall, thin decorative ascenders and descenders with tendrils and leaves, incidental beasts' heads (fols. 35, 57), patterned gold background to historiated initial (fol. 59).
- 30 A copy of *pecia exemplar Paris BN Lat. 16584*.
- 31 Graham Pollard, "The *pecia* system in the medieval universities," in *Medieval Scribes, Manuscripts & Libraries. Essays Presented to N.R. Ker*, eds. M. B. Parkes and Andrew G. Watson (London: Scholar Press, 1978), 145-61 reports documentation for implementation of the *pecia* system at eleven medieval universities: Bologna, Padua, Vercelli, Perugia, Treviso, Florence (Northern Italy), Salamanca, Naples, Paris, Toulouse and Oxford, but researchers have found evidence of exemplar and *pecia* copies at only four of these, namely Bologna, Paris, Oxford and Naples. The medieval university of Lisbon/Coimbra, modeled on Salamanca, had no statutes on the selling and copying of *peciae* and apparently never employed the system; compare Antonio García y García, "Aspectos de la universidad portuguesa medieval," in *The Universities in the Late Middle Ages*, ed. J. Ijsewijn and J. Paquet (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 1978) 142.
- 32 Federico Delclaux, *Imágenes de la Virgen in los códices medievales de España*, Arte en España, 5 (Madrid: Patrimonio Nacional de Museos, 1973). Delclaux gives MS identifications only through the fourteenth century for Spanish manuscripts, only through the thirteenth for those from elsewhere, and some of his plates are from mss. not in his identification lists. Some plates assigned to Spanish shops are of doubtful accuracy. Important questions, such as Spanish manuscripts that are now in foreign collections, when the foreign manuscripts might have arrived in Spain and just what he classifies as an illumination (only human figures? theriomorphs? zoomorphs? patterned vegetation?), remain unanswered.
- 33 For figures concerning book production in France during the Middle Ages, and as an impressive exercise in quantitative codicology, compare with Carla Bozzolo and Ezio Ornato, *Pour une Histoire du Livre Manuscrit au Moyen Age. Trois Essais de Codologie Quantitative* (Paris: Éditions du Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, 1983).
- 34 Prior to the twelfth century, the overwhelming majority of illuminated holdings cataloged by Delclaux were produced in Spain: for the eighth through ninth centuries, 100%; for the ninth, 88%; for the ninth through tenth, 100%; for the tenth, 96%; for the tenth through eleventh, 14%; for the eleventh, 78%; and for the eleventh through twelfth, 64%.

- 35 Jaime I of Aragón does deserve credit for his heavy investments in the paper industry in the province of Valencia, but the output was almost totally dedicated to bureaucratic record keeping.
- 36 Laura Light, *The Bible in the Twelfth Century: An Exhibition of Manuscripts at the Houghton Library* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University, 1988).
- 37 Francisco Márquez-Villanueva, "The Alfonsine Cultural Concept," in *Alfonso X of Castile the Learned King (1221-1284) An International Symposium*, Harvard University, November 17, 1984. *Harvard Studies in Romance Languages* 43 (Cambridge, MA: Department of Romance Languages, 1990), 76-109.
- 38 Branner, pls. I, figs. 314-15, 355, 368.
- 39 Evelyn S Procter, *Alfonso X of Castile: Patron of Literature and Learning* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1951), 3.
- 40 The average dimensions of the manuscript books catalogued by José M. Millás Vallicrosa, *Las traducciones orientales en los manuscritos de la Biblioteca Catedral de Toledo* (Madrid: CSIC, 1942) are 279 mm x 199 mm containing an average of 148 fols. The royal *scriptorium* products of Alfonso tend to be significantly larger: the two volumes of the *códice rico* of the *Cantigas* are a regal 490 x 326 mm for the Escorial tome and 448 x 315 mm for the now retrimmed second part in Florence, while the *Lapidario* stands at 385 x 290, the *Crónica General de España* 416 x 290 mm, the *Libros del saber de astronomía* [(Madrid, Biblioteca de la Universidad Central), 156] 410 x 300 and so on. The physical bulk of these royal copies is not merely impressive: it also strongly suggests a very wealthy patron who could afford to commission works on parchment folios of that size.
- 41 Ana Domínguez-Rodríguez, "La miniatura del 'scriptorium' alfonsí," in *Estudios alfonsíes: Lexicografía, lírica, estética y política de Alfonso el Sabio* (Granada: Universidad de Granada, 1985), 127-61. María Victoria Chico Pizaca, *Composición pictórica en el Códice Rico de las Cantigas de Santa María*, 2 vols., Colección Tesis doctorales, no 71/87 (Madrid: Editorial de la Universidad Complutense, 1987), 563 takes a somewhat different view, that at least for the *Cantigas*, and perhaps for other major Alfonsine projects as well, we should think in terms of established workshops, most probably in Sevilla and in the latter half of the 1270s: *La itinerancia de los pintores acompañando al rey me parece imposible dada la sistematización del trabajo y la necesidad de una constancia, por lo que me inclino por la localización en Sevilla del escritorio de las Cantigas, coincidiendo temporal y espacialmente con la iluminación del Libro de los Juegos y otras empresas artísticas*. For the major programs of illumination mentioned this is undoubtedly true; these works in their initial stages, however, and other volumes more sketchily illustrated (or intended for reproduction in deluxe volumes later on) surely did travel with the king.
- 42 Compare with plates in Branner.

- 43 Chico Picaza, 564: *En efecto los miniaturistas siguen las pautas marcadas por la trama dramática del poema [en las Cantigas]; la dependencia del texto es innegable. Pero además incluyen todo un mundo de precisiones y concreciones escenográficas que obedecen exclusivamente al genio de su creación pictórica. Igualmente en poemas como los de las Cantigas de Loor se permiten una serie de licencias iconográficas que son prueba evidente por un lado de sus posibilidades artísticas y por otro de la libertad creadora que caracterizó a la corte alfonsti imprimiendo a las obras que de ella salieron un frescura, espontaneidad y heterodoxia absolutamente fascinante.*

Ello justifica el que el término "ilustración" no sea el correcto para las Cantigas. El realismo de sus miniaturas trasciende las referencias del texto anejo e irrumpe en el campo de la creación pictórica. Chico Picaza, 546-47 coincides with John Esten Keller, "The Art of Illumination in the Books of Alfonso X (Primarily in the Canticles of Holy Mary)," *Thought* 60 (1985): 388-406; idem, "Drama, Ritual, and Incipient Opera in Alfonso's *Cantigas*," in *Emperor of Culture*, 72-89. idem and R. P. Kinkade, *Iconography in Medieval Spanish Literature* (Lexington: University of Kentucky Press, 1984) in intuiting a dramatic ethos as background for many of the painted representations of the *Cantigas* stories. Her arguments are more plausible than those of the latter two scholars but can still be regarded as no more than hypothetical.

- 44 The topic of spatial relationships, use of blank space and general design is discussed in greater length in Greenia, "The Court of Alfonso X." Compare with the excellent discussion in Chico Picaza, 328-405. I would like to thank Robert Calkins, Katherine Dyus and Thomas L. Amos for helpful comments on earlier versions of this paper.
- 45 Ajo, 445, 460.

Copyright of *Medieval Iberia: Essays on the History & Literature of Medieval Spain* is the property of Peter Lang Publishing, Inc. and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.